

Indonesian Journal of Agrarian Law
ISSN: 3110-6633 (Online)
Vol. 3 Issue 1 (2026) 691-727
DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15294/jal.v3i1.44427>
Available online since: March 10, 2026



<https://journal.unnes.ac.id/journals/jal/index>

Effectiveness Of The Implementation Of The Policy On The Use Of The Ciledug Road Sidewalk In Garut Regency As Urban Space

Syakira Edriamarsha Firdaus
Semarang State University, Indonesia
syakiramrsha@students.unnes.ac.id

□ Corresponding email:
syakiramrsha@students.unnes.ac.id

Abstract

Urban development is fundamentally linked to the issue of space. As the population grows and community activities increase, the need for space also increases. As a result, urban spaces become increasingly crowded as they accommodate various human activities, including sidewalks. On Ciledug Street in Garut Regency, sidewalks that are supposed to be used by pedestrians are also used for economic activities and other purposes. This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of the implementation of sidewalk use policies and identify the factors that influence them, through qualitative research methods with empirical legal analysis, using a legislative approach and a case approach that aims to understand how the law works in the practice of urban space utilization, particularly in relation to the use of sidewalks on

Ciledug Road in Garut Regency. The data in this study were obtained through primary and secondary data. Primary data were collected through in-depth interviews with the Garut Regency Civil Service Police Unit as the authority in charge of supervising and regulating space utilization, as well as with the Ciledug Road users who are directly affected by sidewalk use. The results of the study show that policy implementation has not been effective due to inconsistent supervision, limited coordination, and the economic needs of the community that influence the use of space. This study contributes to broadening the understanding that the effectiveness of urban space policies is not only measured by compliance with regulations, but also by the ability of these policies to adapt to social realities.

Keywords

Policy implementation, Sidewalks, Urban space, Street vendors, Spatial planning law.

A. Introduction

Urban development is fundamentally linked to the issue of space. As the population grows and community activities increase, the need for space also increases. As a result, urban spaces become increasingly crowded as they accommodate various human activities on a daily basis. Roads, sidewalks, parks, and other open spaces are no longer understood as mere physical facilities. These spaces have also developed into social and economic spaces, and in certain conditions, they even have symbolic meaning for the community.¹ In this context, urban space occupies a strategic position because it is a meeting point between the interests of the government, business actors, and the community as

¹ Gunawan, Wawan. "SIDEWALKS: THE PUBLIC SPHERE" PLUNDERED" BY ECONOMIC INTERESTS Study in Bandung City." *CosmoGov: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan* 11, no. 1 (2025): 75-91.

users of the space itself.²

Normatively, sidewalks are positioned as facilities specifically provided for pedestrians. This provision is explicitly stated in Article 34 paragraph (3) of Government Regulation Number 34 of 2006 concerning Roads, which states that sidewalks are intended for pedestrians. With this regulation, sidewalks are essentially intended to ensure safety and comfort, while protecting the mobility rights of people who do not use vehicles. In modern urban planning, sidewalks are considered an important indicator in creating an inclusive and sustainable city. Pedestrian-friendly cities generally have a better quality of life, higher levels of social interaction, and a healthier environment.³ Thus, the existence and management of sidewalks should not be understood merely as a technical issue of construction or physical arrangement. More than that, the regulation of sidewalks is part of public policy whose impact is directly felt in the daily activities of the community, especially for those who depend on pedestrian spaces for their mobility.

In the Indonesian legal system, regulations regarding sidewalks are basically quite clear. Law No. 22 of 2009 on Road Traffic and Transportation emphasizes that sidewalks are part of road space intended for pedestrians. These provisions are further elaborated in various derivative regulations, both at the central and regional levels, which regulate their function, limits of use, and monitoring

² Putra, Rama, and Wilson MA Therik. "ALUN-ALUN PANCASILA, SALATIGA: REPRESENTASI TATA NILAI DI RUANG PUBLIK." *KRITIS* 34, no. 1 (2025): 235-265.

³ Nainggolan, Yehezkiel, Sarintan Efratani Damanik, and Muhammad Ade Kurnia Harahap. "Pengaruh Perencanaan Tata Ruang Kota terhadap Kualitas Hidup Penduduk di Kawasan Perkotaan." *PESHUM: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial dan Humaniora* 4, no. 2 (2025): 2162-2169.

mechanisms.⁴ From a normative perspective, there is actually no ambiguity regarding who has the right to use sidewalks and for what purposes they are provided. The rules are quite clear; the problem more often arises at the stage of implementation in the field. Thus, in theory, the implementation of sidewalk use policies should be relatively straightforward.

The reality on the ground often shows a different picture. In many areas, sidewalks are not fully used as intended. The conversion of sidewalks into trading places, parking areas, and spaces for informal economic activities is a phenomenon that is often found in various regions. This condition shows a tension between established legal norms and social practices that have developed in society.⁵ On the one hand, the state is present through regulations that strictly govern the allocation and function of urban space. On the other hand, the community, especially those in the informal sector, see this space as an economic opportunity that can be utilized to meet their daily needs. It is at this point that tension arises between normative provisions and social realities on the ground.

This situation becomes even more complex when linked to the social and economic situation of the community in the aftermath of the COVID-19 pandemic. The pandemic has not only had an impact on health, but has also left considerable economic pressure, especially for groups of people with irregular incomes. Many individuals who

⁴ As Syifa, Farah Adinda. "Faktor-faktor Penyebab Pelanggaran dan Penegakan Hukum Penggunaan Zebra Cross yang digunakan Sebagai Ajang Peragaan Busana di Kota Jakarta Pusat." PhD diss., Universitas Islam Indonesia, 2023.

⁵ Perdana, Edo. "Penegakan Hukum Oleh Kepolisian Terhadap Perubahan Alih Fungsi Trotoar Sebagai Tempat Usaha." *Unes Journal of Swara Justisia* 9, no. 2 (2025): 310-319.

previously worked in the formal sector have been forced to switch to the informal sector.⁶ In a situation where job opportunities are increasingly limited, urban spaces often become the most feasible option for earning a living. For some people, utilizing existing spaces feels more realistic than waiting for formal job opportunities that may never come. Sidewalks, because of their open location and position in crowded areas, often become the primary choice for vendors to run their businesses.

In the UN-Habitat report (2023), it is stated that in many developing cities, the issue of urban space utilization tends to increase when economic pressure on small communities also increases. This situation puts local governments in a difficult position.⁷ On the one hand, enforcement is necessary as a form of rule enforcement and to maintain the proper function of urban space. On the other hand, such measures can create new problems if they are not accompanied by realistic and sustainable solutions for the affected communities. This shows that the implementation of urban space use policies, including sidewalks, cannot be understood solely from a legal perspective. There are social and economic dynamics involved, as well as the capacity of local government institutions to manage conflicts of interest.

Similar conditions can also be found in various regions in Indonesia, including in Garut Regency, West Java Province. As an area with high economic activity and community mobility, Garut Regency faces its own challenges in managing urban space, especially in the main road area which is the

⁶ Aeni, Nurul. "Pandemi covid-19: Dampak kesehatan, ekonomi, & sosial." *Jurnal Litbang* 17, no. 1 (2021): 17-34.

⁷ Sianturi, Agustina Rahayu, Shika Andari, Putri Anatasya Simanjuntak, and Aristoteles Tekege. "Dinamika Perkembangan Tata Ruang Kota Medan: Analisis Penggunaan Lahan Dan Dampaknya Terhadap Keberlanjutan Kota." *Jurnal Intelek Insan Cendikia* 1, no. 4 (2024): 560-564.

center of community activities. Ciledug Road is one of the points with fairly high activity intensity. Its existence is not only as a traffic route, but it has also developed into a busy space for community economic activities. This condition then places the sidewalks in this area in a dilemma between their normative function as a space for pedestrians and their reality as a space for economic activities. The sidewalks along Ciledug Road have been physically designed for pedestrians. However, in practice, sidewalks often change their function.⁸

Based on the findings in the initial stage of the research, the survey results show that the sidewalks on Ciledug Road have been used by street vendors as a place to sell their goods. Not only that, at several points, the sidewalks are also used as parking areas for both two-wheeled and four-wheeled vehicles. This condition limits the space available for pedestrians. At several points, pedestrians often have to walk on the road, which certainly increases safety risks. This condition shows a discrepancy between the reality on the ground and the formulated policy provisions. What is regulated normatively does not fully work as it should in everyday practice.

If this issue is viewed solely from a normative perspective, the use of sidewalks by street vendors can indeed be categorized as a violation of applicable laws. However, if this issue is viewed solely from a normative perspective, there is a risk of ignoring the social dynamics behind it. In practice, sidewalks are never truly neutral spaces, free from vested interests. Sidewalks exist within real social and economic relationships, shaped by the needs and

⁸ Roja, Rahtia San Khususu, and Ikeu Hikmawati. "Implementasi Kebijakan Pemerintah Daerah Dalam Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima." *Media Hukum Indonesia (MHI)* 2, no. 2 (2024): 132-138.

pressures of daily life. For some groups in society, especially those who depend on the informal sector, the existence of sidewalks in strategic locations is seen as an economically reasonable opportunity. This choice is often not merely a form of violation, but also a reflection of efforts to survive in a situation of limited resources.⁹

At the same time, local governments and their agencies, especially the Civil Service Police Unit, have the authority to maintain public order and ensure that urban spaces function as stipulated in policy. The authorities essentially not only function as enforcers of the rules, but also represent the presence of the state in regulating and organizing urban spaces. Through enforcement and surveillance, the state demonstrates how policies are implemented in the field.¹⁰ It is at this point that we see a convergence, and sometimes a clash, between two different perspectives. On the one hand, there is a demand for administrative order that requires everyone to obey the rules and maintain the certainty of urban space functions. On the other hand, there is the reality of the economic sustainability of small communities, which stems from the real need to survive amid limitations. The tension between the two does not always manifest itself in the form of open conflict, but often takes the form of silent negotiations, temporary tolerance, or situational enforcement.

Facts on the ground show that the Civil Service Police Unit regularly cracks down on street vendors on sidewalks.

⁹ Muhammad, Andi Alief, and Yori Herwangi. "Klasifikasi Sektor Informal Dan Hubungannya Dengan Penggunaan Ruang Pada Jalan Letjend Hertasning–Tun Abdul Razak, Kota Makassar Dan Kabupaten Gowa, Sulawesi Selatan." *Urban and Regional Studies Journal* 7, no. 2 (2025): 181-189.

¹⁰ Ilham, Muhammad, and Abdul Rahman. "Praktik Penyelenggaraan Ketenteraman dan Ketertiban Umum." *AMU Press* (2024): 1-182.

Enforcement operations are carried out, stalls are dismantled, and spaces are cleared. However, within a certain period of time, trading activities resume. This cycle shows that unsustainable law enforcement efforts only solve the problem, not the root cause.¹¹ When the same conditions continue to repeat themselves over time, the question that needs to be asked is no longer whether the rules have been enforced or not, but rather to what extent existing policies are truly capable of addressing the underlying structural problems. If the root of the problem is not addressed, then enforcement will only be temporary and the same pattern is likely to repeat itself.

From a policy implementation perspective, this condition shows that the success of a policy does not only depend on how clearly the norms are formulated or how often the authorities conduct supervision. In practice, implementation takes place in a complex social space, where various interests and needs meet. Policies that have been clearly formulated normatively must face social realities that cannot be fully controlled through an administrative approach alone.¹²

Street vendors view sidewalks as a space that allows them to maintain their economic income. Conversely, local law enforcement officials view sidewalks as part of city management whose function must be maintained in accordance with applicable regulations. For them, keeping sidewalks for their intended purpose is a form of responsibility in realizing order and regularity in urban spaces.

¹¹ Siagian, Annera Armeilia, Annisa Faraz Muzayana, and Annissa Wirapuspita. "Komunikasi Publik Pemerintah dalam Penertiban PKL: Mengapa Trotoar Tetap Dilanggar?." *INOMATEC: Jurnal Inovasi dan Kajian Multidisipliner Kontemporer* 1, no. 03 (2026).

¹² Kristian, Indra. "Kebijakan Publik Dan Tantangan Implementasi Di Indonesia." *Jurnal Dialektika: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial* 21, no. 2 (2023): 88-98.

Between these two interests are road users who need safe, comfortable, and easy access every day when walking. They may not be directly involved in policy debates, but they feel the impact firsthand. These differences in perspective do not always manifest in open conflict, but are more often seen in daily interactions that constantly change according to the situation on the ground.

Thus, the practice of sidewalk use cannot be fully understood solely from the measure of formal compliance with regulations. There are social, economic, and even institutional factors that influence how the community utilizes this space. Therefore, policy implementation analysis needs to be placed in a more comprehensive context in order to explain why a policy that has been formulated normatively may not necessarily be effective when faced with complex social realities.

Academic studies on the use of sidewalks and urban space have actually developed considerably. According to Sihombing (2021), existing studies highlight the lack of consistent supervision as the cause of the continued conversion of sidewalks in a number of large cities. This research illustrates that the existence of regulations without continuous supervision will result in repeated disorder. Meanwhile, a study by Pratama and Yulianto (2024) emphasizes that the relocation of street vendors often fails because the replacement location does not have the same economic appeal as the original space. It is understandable that administrative solutions are not necessarily effective if they do not consider the economic rationality of the actors involved.

In an international context, a study conducted by Nophaket et al. (2024) shows that effective management of sidewalks and pedestrian spaces cannot rely solely on

physical design standards. The study emphasizes that the success of pedestrian space planning is highly dependent on the integration of broader policies, including aspects of mobility, governance, and inter-agency coordination. A study conducted in Bangkok shows the importance of incorporating the perspective of citizen mobility and a participatory planning approach in designing pedestrian networks. By involving various stakeholders and paying attention to the real needs of users, urban spaces can be managed in a more inclusive and interconnected manner.¹³ In addition, a comparative study of two cities in Southeast Asia shows that functional, ecological, social, and economic aspects must be considered simultaneously in designing streetscapes that support mobility and sustainability.¹⁴

Furthermore, recent studies on urban spatial governance show that there are informal tolerance practices in the management of public spaces in various developing cities. In certain situations, officials and informal sector actors establish unwritten understandings regarding the limits of urban space use. Such understandings are often not explicitly written in formal regulations, but rather exist and are formed in daily practice in the field. They arise as a form of adjustment to the actual conditions faced by both officials and the community. This phenomenon shows that policy implementation does not always proceed strictly according to the normative text. In practice, policy implementation often

¹³ Nophaket, Napong, Chamnarn Tirapas, and Wattana Songpetchmongkol. "The Walking Bangkok: Inclusive pedestrian network's integrated design and implementation study on Bangkok's emerging transportation district." *Journal of Architectural/Planning Research and Studies (JARS)* 21, no. 2 (2024): 329-344.

¹⁴ Fachrudin, Hilma Tamiami, Rahmi Karolina, and Siti Hajar Binti Misnan. "Sustainable streetscape design in commercial area toward green city: comparative study between Indonesia and Malaysia." *City, Territory and Architecture* 12, no. 1 (2025): 14.

takes place in spaces of social compromise. Rules are still recognized as valid, but their application can be adjusted through interaction, situational considerations, and even ongoing negotiations. Thus, policies are not only rigid normative instruments, but also the result of dynamic and contextual social processes. This shows that the success or failure of a policy is greatly influenced by how it is translated into everyday reality.¹⁵

Although these studies have made significant contributions, most of them still focus on large cities with complex metropolitan characteristics. This focus is certainly relevant, but at the same time, it makes the picture of policy implementation reflect more of a large-scale urban context. In fact, the dynamics that occur in regencies or medium-sized cities do not always have the same characteristics. The economic structure, institutional capacity, and patterns of social interaction can be different, so the way policies are implemented is not always identical to what happens in metropolitan cities.

In addition, policy effectiveness is often measured through quantitative indicators, such as the number of violations or the frequency of enforcement by officials. This approach does help to provide an administrative and procedural overview of a policy, but it tends not to fully address how the policy is understood, negotiated, and implemented in everyday practice by the community. In fact, in the context of small or medium-sized cities, closer social relations, limited institutional capacity, and unique local economic dynamics can result in different patterns of

¹⁵ Schapendonk, Frans, Carolina Sarzana, Adam Savelli, Ignacio Madurga-Lopez, Grazia Pacillo, and Peter Läderach. "Are climate and environment-and peace and security-related policy outputs coherent? A policy coherence and awareness analysis for climate security." *International Development Planning Review* 45, no. 4 (2023): 437-467.

implementation.

Garut Regency, especially the Ciledug Road area, provides a context that can be studied in depth. This area is known as a hub of high-intensity economic activity, making its urban space a meeting point for two equally strong needs: smooth mobility and the sustainability of the informal economy. Ciledug Road is not part of a metropolitan city with a highly complex system, but it cannot be categorized as an area completely free from spatial issues either. It is this intermediate condition that gives rise to its own dynamics in urban space management.

In such conditions, the capacity of the local government, both in terms of resource availability and consistency in monitoring, also determines how the policy is actually implemented. Often, limited personnel or other policy priorities mean that implementation in the field is not always optimal. In addition, the relatively close relationship between officials and the community, coupled with local economic conditions that still rely heavily on the informal sector, also influence how the policy is implemented. More personal interactions often make the approach used more flexible and adaptable to circumstances. In other words, the practice of sidewalk use in this area cannot be separated from the existing social and institutional conditions. What happens in the field is ultimately greatly influenced by this context, not merely by the letter of the law.¹⁶

Within this framework, this study does not view policy implementation as something that is complete once the rules

¹⁶ Amanatin, Elsa Lutmilarita, Muhammad Fedryansyah, and Nunung Nurwati. "Implikasi Pembangunan Pedestrian di Jalan Pancasila Kota Tegal: Kontroversi Pemanfaatan Trotoar Pejalan Kaki dan Pedagang Kaki Lima." *RESIPROKAL: Jurnal Riset Sosiologi Progresif Aktual* 5, no. 2 (2023): 225-240.

are established. Instead, implementation is understood as an ongoing and evolving process that follows the dynamics in the field. The effectiveness of a policy is not only measured by the presence or absence of enforcement, but also by the extent to which the policy can actually function in a real social context, whether it is accepted, adapted, or even negotiated by the communities involved. Through a qualitative approach, this study seeks to understand the experiences, perceptions, and reasons behind the actions of the parties involved, so that the resulting analysis does not stop at the formal aspects of the rules, but touches on the realities that occur on a daily basis.

The main objective of this study is to analyze how the sidewalk use policy on Ciledug Road is implemented in daily practice, not just as written in the regulations. This study does not stop at the question of whether the policy is obeyed or violated, but tries to see how the policy actually works in the field. More specifically, this study seeks to understand the dynamics of interaction between government officials, street vendors, and road users who all utilize the same space. In addition, this study also identifies the social and institutional factors that influence policy implementation, and examines how each party perceives sidewalks as part of urban space, whether as a means of mobility, a source of income, or a form of public order. Thus, the results of the analysis are expected to provide a more complete picture of the reality of policy implementation at the local level.

Theoretically, this study is expected to enrich the study of policy implementation by emphasizing that policies never work in a vacuum, but are always influenced by the social context, inter-community relations, and the surrounding institutional conditions. By placing the aspects of context and interrelationships between parties as an important part of the

analysis, this study attempts to broaden the perspective on policy effectiveness, which has often been measured solely from an administrative point of view. Effectiveness is not only seen in terms of the extent to which the rules are implemented, but also in terms of how the policy interacts with the surrounding social conditions. In addition, this study is expected to contribute to the literature on public space management in medium-sized cities, which has not been discussed as extensively as research on large cities with metropolitan complexity.

In practical terms, the results of this study are expected to be taken into consideration by local governments in formulating a more comprehensive sidewalk management strategy. The arrangement should not only rely on formal enforcement of regulations, but also take into account the socio-economic conditions of the community, especially those in the informal sector who have been utilizing this space. By considering these realities, it is hoped that future policies will be more responsive to the situation on the ground, less rigid, and still able to maintain a balance between urban order and community economic sustainability.

Furthermore, fair and inclusive urban space management cannot be separated from the sustainable development agenda. Efforts to strengthen effective and transparent governance, as emphasized in the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), particularly No. 16, require consistent policy enforcement practices that are also capable of adapting to the social realities faced by the community. Enforcement of regulations must not only be firm, but also consider their social impact. At the same time, the importance of building more collaborative relationships between the government, informal businesses, and urban space users is also in line with the spirit of SDG Goal 17,

which emphasizes partnerships in achieving development goals. This means that the management of public spaces, including sidewalks, should ideally not be carried out unilaterally, but through communication and cooperation that allows for a balance between urban planning interests and the economic needs of residents. Thus, the issue of sidewalk management at the local level is actually linked to the global concept of equitable and sustainable governance.

Given these limitations, this study aims to examine the effectiveness of the implementation of the sidewalk use policy on Ciledug Road in Garut Regency by directly linking it to the policy of relocating street vendors. The novelty of this study lies in the use of an empirical juridical approach to assess the extent to which the policy on space use is effective in protecting the function of sidewalks as urban spaces. Thus, this study does not only assess the presence or absence of violations but focuses on answering two research questions: how is the sidewalk use policy implemented on Ciledug Road, and what factors influence the implementation of this policy from a spatial planning law perspective.

This study uses a legal research method with an empirical juridical approach. The juridical approach is carried out by examining laws and regulations as well as local government policies related to spatial planning and sidewalk use. Meanwhile, the empirical approach is carried out through interviews with Satpol PP officers and sidewalk users in the area, as well as direct observation of the reality of sidewalk use in the Ciledug Road area, and through direct observation of the conditions and practices of sidewalk use in the field. The data obtained was then analyzed qualitatively by examining the relationship between the findings in the field and the applicable legal provisions to see the extent to which

the practices were in accordance or not in accordance with the regulations, as well as to assess the level of effectiveness of the policy in its implementation.

B. Effectiveness of the Implementation of the Ciledug Road Sidewalk Policy as Urban Space

The implementation of policies on the use of sidewalks as part of urban space can be used as an indicator to assess the extent to which spatial planning policies are actually being implemented. Sidewalks are not only viewed as a physical part of the road, but also as urban space that has a social function, ensures safety, and supports community accessibility.¹⁷ In an urban context, properly functioning sidewalks indicate that local governments are making real efforts to protect the rights of pedestrians while maintaining orderly and sustainable use of urban space.

Based on interviews with the Garut Regency Civil Service Police Unit (Satpol PP) and users of Ciledug Road, it appears that the implementation of the policy on the use of sidewalks as part of urban space has not been effective. In practice, there are still cases of sidewalk use that are not in accordance with their main function. Normatively, sidewalks are part of public space that is legally designated for pedestrians and should be maintained so that they continue to be used for their intended purpose. This principle is in line with the concept of spatial planning, which places local government as the party responsible for regulating, controlling, and supervising the use of space based on the

¹⁷ Achmad, Ichsan Ashari, Fitriah Kahar Djabal Tira, Riris Anastasia Rudi, Nursyamsi Ichsan, and Citra Nasir. "ANALISIS TATA RUANG TERHADAP AKTIVITAS PEDAGANG KAKI 5 SEBAGAI FASILITAS PEJALAN KAKI DI TROTAR KOTA PALOPO BERDASARKAN PRESPEKTIF HUKUM." *El-Iqthisady: Jurnal Hukum Ekonomi Syariah* 7, no. 1 (2025): 532-547.

established spatial plan.¹⁸

However, in practice, the use of sidewalks on Ciledug Road shows a shift from the function of sidewalks as stipulated in Government Regulation No. 34 of 2006 concerning Traffic and Roads, which states that sidewalks are road space intended only for pedestrians, and further emphasized in Law No. 22 of 2009 on Roads, Article 34 paragraph (3), which states that sidewalks are only for pedestrians. One of the factors influencing this condition is the Garut Regent Decree No. 511.3/Kep.80-DP2ESDM/2017 concerning the Determination of Temporary Locations for Street Vendors in the Garut Kota District. This policy is essentially a step taken by the local government to organize informal trading activities so that they are not scattered in various uncontrolled locations, as well as to maintain order in the city.¹⁹

Conceptually, the policy of regulating street vendors can be understood as a response by the local government to the socio-economic conditions of urban communities, especially since the informal sector is a source of income for some residents. However, in its implementation, this policy is actually contrary to the function of sidewalks as pedestrian paths. In practice, street vendors not only utilize the area around the road, but also use sidewalks as a place to trade and display their merchandise, significantly reducing the

¹⁸ Verliawan, Lucky Reza. "TINJAUAN HUKUM ISLAM TERHADAP PRAKTIK PENYALAHGUNAAN FUNGSI TROTOAR (STUDI KASUS DI KAWASAN KECAMATAN JATINEGARA, JAKARTA TIMUR)." Bachelor's thesis, Fakultas Syariah dan Hukum UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, 2021.

¹⁹ Kania, Ikeu, Lia Juliasih, Sheila Amelia Milano, and Yusup Hermawan. "IMPLEMENTASI KEBIJAKAN PERATURAN KETERTIBAN, KEBERSIHAN DAN KEINDAHAN (K3) DI KABUPATEN GARUT." *Jurnal Pembangunan dan Kebijakan Publik* 13, no. 1 (2022): 36-43.

space available for pedestrians.²⁰

Field findings show that at certain times, the sidewalks on Ciledug Road can no longer be used optimally by pedestrians. Road users have reported that the presence of street vendors on the sidewalks forces them to walk on the road, especially during rush hour and on days with high trading intensity.²¹ This situation not only causes inconvenience but also increases safety risks for pedestrians, given that traffic on Ciledug Road is relatively heavy.

Although some members of the community understand that the Ciledug Road area is designated as a center for economic and commercial activities, they still believe that the use of sidewalks should be limited to their intended function. This view shows that there is actually a normative awareness among the community regarding the function of sidewalks as a space for pedestrians. Many understand that sidewalks are not intended for activities other than their intended function. However, this awareness is not fully supported by conditions that allow sidewalks to be used safely and comfortably. Thus, there is a gap between what is understood normatively and what happens in daily practice. On the one hand, the community knows the ideal function of sidewalks, but on the other hand, the reality on the ground makes it difficult to consistently realize this function.

From a law enforcement perspective, the Garut District Civil Service Police Unit has essentially exercised its authority

²⁰ Baihaqi, Muhammad Hanif Baihaqi, Anggraeny Puspaningtyas, and Muhammad Roisul Basyar. "Implementasi Kebijakan Penyediaan Ruang Bagi Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Pasar Loak Dupak Rukun Kota Surabaya." *Jurnal Publik* 19, no. 01 (2025): 01-12.

²¹ Aziz, Umar Abdul, Isnaeni Rokhimah, and Agung Setiawan. "Analisis Kenyamanan Pejalan Kaki Terhadap Pemanfaatan Trotoar di Perkotaan Kutoarjo Kabupaten Purworejo." *Surya Beton: Jurnal Ilmu Teknik Sipil* 6, no. 1 (2022): 27-37.

in accordance with the duties and functions stipulated in the legislation. Officials routinely monitor and collect data on street vendors, issuing warnings and taking enforcement action against violations of space utilization, including the improper use of sidewalks. Based on interviews with officials, the latest data from March 2005 showed that there were 133 street vendors on Ciledug Street. However, after direct data collection and monitoring in January 2026, there were still around 88 vendors actively selling in the area. This enforcement was carried out with the aim of restoring the function of sidewalks as pedestrian paths and maintaining order in the city. In practice, every time enforcement is carried out, the sidewalks can temporarily be used as intended by pedestrians. However, this condition often does not last long and changes again over time. This pattern shows that violations of space utilization occur repeatedly and tend to recur over time.

This condition shows that law enforcement so far has been temporary and has not been fully able to encourage permanent changes in the use of space. Enforcement tends to be a response to specific situations, rather than part of a sustainable system of control over the use of space. As a result, the function of sidewalks as pedestrian walkways has not been consistently maintained, even though the rules regarding their use are quite clear.²²

From a spatial planning perspective, the effectiveness of a policy is not only measured by the existence of written rules, but also by the extent to which these rules are able to guide public behavior in accordance with the objectives that

²² Hasibuan, Indah Malini. "Penegakan hukum terhadap penyalahgunaan fungsi trotoar bagi pedagang kaki lima di Kota Padangsidempuan." PhD diss., UIN Syekh Ali Hasan Ahmad Addary Padangsidempuan, 2023.

have been set.²³ The discrepancy between spatial utilization policies and practices in the field indicates weaknesses in policy implementation. Existing sidewalk use policies have not been able to respond to the dynamics of urban space use in the Ciledug Road area, which is characterized by high economic pressure on public spaces.

This finding is in line with the theory of legal effectiveness proposed by Soerjono Soekanto, which states that legal effectiveness is influenced by several factors, including legal substance, law enforcement officials, facilities and infrastructure, society, and legal culture.²⁴ In the Ciledug Road area, the existence of legal policies regarding function is relatively clear. However, other supporting factors such as continuous supervision, availability of supporting facilities, and public compliance with spatial utilization regulations have not been working optimally.

Empirically, the conditions on Ciledug Road show that existing spatial planning policies have not been fully implemented and internalized in daily spatial utilization practices. Sidewalks are still viewed as spaces that can be used for economic purposes, rather than as urban spaces that must be consistently protected. This shows that the effectiveness of sidewalk use policy implementation is still low, as it has not been able to create sustainable spatial use order.

Thus, if the effectiveness of the implementation of sidewalk use policies on Ciledug Road in Garut Regency is

²³ Sepuhtra, Ageng Ika, Aris Sunarya, and Sri Roekminiati. "Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Penegakan Hukum dalam Penerapan Izin Kesesuaian Pemanfaatan Tata Ruang di Kabupaten Gresik." *Soetomo Administrasi Publik* 2, no. 3 (2024): 667-680.

²⁴ Armanda, Bagus. "Parkir Liar Dalam Perspektif Teori Efektifitas Hukum." *Jurnal Pelita Nusantara* 1, no. 4 (2024): 477-481.

assessed based on the actual conditions in the field, it can be concluded that these policies are not being implemented effectively. The sustainability of the sidewalk's function as a pedestrian path is not consistently guaranteed, despite efforts to enforce order by law enforcement officials. The relationship between spatial planning regulations and spatial utilization practices illustrates that existing policies still face challenges in responding to the complexity of urban space use, especially in areas with high economic activity such as Ciledug Road.

C. Factors in the Implementation of the Policy on the Use of Ciledug Road Sidewalks as Urban Space

The suboptimal effectiveness of the implementation of the sidewalk use policy on Ciledug Road in Garut Regency cannot be concluded solely as a matter of administrative violations. Referring to the data that has been collected shows that this condition arises from a fairly complex interaction between existing policy designs, institutional capacity in conducting supervision, economic considerations of informal sector actors, and the way the community perceives sidewalks as urban space.²⁵ Thus, the issue of effectiveness is not only related to the presence or absence of violations of norms, but also concerns how these norms are formulated, implemented, adjusted, and even negotiated in everyday social practices. In this context, the law does not stand as a rigid rule, but rather deals directly with constantly changing social dynamics.

In the perspective of the theory of legal effectiveness proposed by Soerjono Soekanto, the success of a rule is not

²⁵ Riswanto, Riswanto, Yuanita FD Sidabutar, Ismail P. Sinaga, and Nurhaida Pohan. "Pengaruh Sektor Informal Terhadap Ruang Publik Di Kecamatan Batam Kota Menuju Pengembangan Wilayah Yang Berkelanjutan." *Jurnal Potensi* 5, no. 1 (2025).

only determined by the existence or absence of norms, but by five interrelated factors, namely legal substance, law enforcement officials, means and facilities, society, and legal culture. When this framework is applied to the context of Ciledug Road, it is apparent that these five factors are not yet fully functioning as expected. Regulations are in place, law enforcement agencies are conducting enforcement, and the community is aware of the rules. However, limited resources, inconsistent law enforcement patterns, and a low legal culture regarding the use of sidewalks for trading indicate that the relationship between these factors has not yet been optimally established.²⁶

On the other hand, when analyzed using Edwards III's policy implementation theory, policy effectiveness is greatly influenced by communication, resources, the disposition or attitude of implementers, and bureaucratic structure. Referring to the data obtained, there are problems in almost all of these variables. Policy communication has not been fully understood by all actors, supervisory resources are still limited, the attitudes of implementers in the field tend to be situational, and the bureaucratic structure does not fully support consistent enforcement.²⁷ Thus, the issue of the effectiveness of the sidewalk use policy on Ciledug Road can be understood as the result of a lack of integration between normative and implementative factors that should work together.

Normatively, sidewalks are positioned as part of urban space specifically designated for pedestrians and are an

²⁶ Hajria, Hajria, Nuraisyah Nuraisyah, and Nawawi Natsir. "Efektivitas Penertiban Pedagang Kreatif Lapangan Oleh Satuan Polisi Pamong Praja di Kota Palu." *SENTRI: Jurnal Riset Ilmiah* 4, no. 12 (2025): 4509-4518.

²⁷ Makmur, Syarif. "Kesalahan Penafsiran Komunikasi, Sumber Daya Disposisi dan Struktur Birokrasi dalam Implementasi Kebijakan." *Lentera: Multidisciplinary Studies* 1, no. 3 (2023): 172-176.

important component in a sustainable urban development system. The existence of sidewalks not only supports mobility but also demonstrates a commitment to the principles of sustainable cities that guarantee accessibility, safety, and comfort for all road users. However, looking at the conditions in the Ciledug Road area, the policy of temporarily relocating street vendors was not accompanied by strict technical regulations regarding the limits of space utilization. The absence of strict regulations has resulted in the loss of the boundary between the function of sidewalks as pedestrian paths and the space used for trading.²⁸

This policy ultimately creates regulatory ambiguity. The Civil Service Police Unit is in a difficult position. On the one hand, they are obliged to enforce local regulations on public order, but on the other hand, they must deal with local government policies that do not allow tolerance for informal economic activities. This difference in perspective has caused legal norms to lose their operational certainty in the field. Without clear boundaries, permanent markings, or spatial designs that clearly separate trading areas and pedestrian walkways, the legitimacy of law enforcement has been weakened.

When viewed from the perspective of SDG No. 16 (Peace, Justice and Strong Institutions), this situation indicates that the strengthening of public institutions at the local level has not been optimal. The targets in SDG No. 16 emphasize the importance of effective, accountable, and transparent governance. When policies are formulated without adequate integration between regulations and without clear technical support, institutional structures

²⁸ Syarifuddin, Nurul Aprilia. "Analisis Yuridis Terhadap Perizinan Pedagang kaki Lima di Kel. Galung Maloang Kec. Bacukiki Kota Parepare." PhD diss., IAIN PAREPARE, 2025.

become vulnerable in responding to social dynamics. Inconsistent implementation in the long term has the potential to reduce public trust in local government authorities as managers of public spaces.²⁹

In addition to the issue of regulatory consistency, oversight is also a determining factor. Based on interviews with officials, enforcement is carried out periodically, often reactively in response to reports from the public or specific events. Once the operation is complete, trading activities on the sidewalks resume. This pattern shows that oversight is not yet based on a sustainable monitoring system.

Limited human resources and the high workload of the Civil Service Police Unit also affect the effectiveness of policy implementation in the field. Officials not only deal with issues related to sidewalk use, but also various other public order issues that demand attention and quick responses. Under these conditions, the focus of supervision on a single issue becomes suboptimal. Without the support of an integrated supervision system and strong coordination between agencies, policy implementation tends to proceed in a sectoral logic, where each regional apparatus works according to its own duties without adequate integration.³⁰

When viewed in the context of SDG 17 (Partnerships for the Goals), this condition shows that institutional partnerships at the local level have not been strategically established. Sidewalk management cannot be resolved by

²⁹ Sulistiyarningsih, Nur, Abdusyahid Naufal Fathullah, and Megafury Apriandhini. "Implementasi Public Trust Doctrine Dalam Pengambilan Kebijakan Di Tingkat Daerah Dan Pusat: Tantangan Dan Peluang Di Indonesia." *Jurnal Esensi Hukum* 5, no. 2 (2023): 70-86.

³⁰ Doorson, Steven, Esa Rahmawati, Dinda Nur Azra, Yosaphat Diaz, and Febby Annisa Qutrunnadaa. "Implementasi Hukum Tata Ruang dalam Konteks Otonomi Daerah." *Al-Zayn: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial & Hukum* 2, no. 2 (2024): 128-140.

one institution alone, but requires the involvement of local government and the participation of street vendors in a collaborative mechanism. Without clear and coordinated cross-sector integration, policy implementation has the potential to be fragmented, making it difficult to address structural and social issues at their root.³¹

Beyond internal factors, there is a fairly dominant external factor, namely the economic rationality of informal sector businesses. For street vendors, the decision to choose a trading location is not solely a matter of proximity to regulations, but is directly related to income-earning opportunities.³² Ciledug Road is known as an area with high mobility and direct access to consumer traffic. These conditions are rationally considered more profitable than the relocation facilities provided by the government, which in some cases are considered less strategic and have few buyers. In this case, street vendors' choice to return to using the sidewalk is not always seen as a form of defiance, but rather as a way of surviving in the face of daily economic pressures.

Interviews with several vendors revealed that after moving to PKL 1 Building, some of them experienced a significant decline in turnover. The location of the building was considered less crowded and did not have as many buyers as Ciledug Street. This condition shows the gap between the relocation policy design and the market reality faced by vendors on a daily basis. For street vendors,

³¹ Widjaja, Gunawan, and Handojo Dhanudibroto. "KOORDINASI ANTAR-LEMBAGA PEMERINTAH DAN EFEKTIVITAS KEBIJAKAN KESEJAHTERAAN." *SIBATIK JOURNAL: Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Sosial, Ekonomi, Budaya, Teknologi, Dan Pendidikan* 4, no. 7 (2025): 1323-1332.

³² Pasyah, Nabila Islami, and Indrawati Indrawati. "PEDAGANG KAKI LIMA PASAR JONGKOK PURWODADI DI KOTA PEKANBARU." *NUSANTARA: Jurnal Ilmu Pengetahuan Sosial* 12, no. 6 (2025): 2301-2315.

business continuity is not just a choice, but a basic necessity directly related to meeting family needs. In the context of the informal economy, urban spaces often function as arenas of production and distribution that determine family income.³³

This condition cannot be separated from the local economic structure, which still relies on the informal sector. When access to formal employment is limited, urban spaces become an alternative source of economic resources. This condition is related to the dimension of social justice in sustainable development.³⁴ Spatial planning policies that do not consider economic aspects have the potential to create social problems. In the context of SDG 16, the development of strong institutions must be accompanied by an inclusive approach so that policies do not create new problems.

The effectiveness of policies is also influenced by the legal culture of the community. Based on direct observation, some road users show tolerance towards street vendors on sidewalks. As long as these activities do not trigger open conflict, the practice is considered part of the dynamics of the city. This permissive culture shows that legal norms have not been fully internalized as collective consciousness. Compliance often arises due to the presence of authorities, not because of a deep understanding of the function of sidewalks. In Soerjono Soekanto's theory, this condition shows that legal culture is a crucial component in determining the effectiveness of rules.

On the other hand, public perception of public space

³³ Nabila, Farrah Eva. "DIALEKTIKA SPASIAL DAN PRODUKSI BEAUTIFIKASI RUANG KOTA TERHADAP PELAKU AKTIVITAS EKONOMI INFORMAL." *Jurnal Analisa Sosiologi* 12, no. 2 (2023).

³⁴ Maulidya, Ade. "Kajian Tentang Kota Berkelanjutan di Indonesia (Studi Kasus di Kota Metro, Lampung)." *Arus Jurnal Sosial dan Humaniora* 5, no. 1 (2025): 850-861.

tends to be flexible and contextual. Sidewalks are not always understood as spaces exclusively reserved for pedestrians, but are often interpreted as shared spaces that can be used pragmatically as needed. This perspective did not emerge suddenly, but was formed through long-standing social practices, in which informal economic activities in urban spaces became something that was considered normal and customary.³⁵

Under these conditions, change is not enough if it is carried out through law enforcement alone. Without a systematic process of education and socialization regarding the functions and rights of urban spaces, efforts to reorganize will find it difficult to produce consistent behavioral change. Law enforcement alone, without accompanying collective awareness transformation, risks creating only temporary or superficial compliance, which easily reverts to old patterns when supervision weakens.

Observations show that internal and external factors do not stand alone but influence each other in a dynamic relationship. Unclear technical regulations open up wider space for social negotiation in the field. On the other hand, the economic pressures faced by the community limit the scope for officials to apply sanctions firmly and consistently. This situation is reinforced by a legal culture that tends to be permissive, so that repeated violations are not always seen as something serious, but rather as part of a habit that continues to be reproduced.³⁶

³⁵ Muhammad, Prince Daffa Shodiq. "Involution of Informal Sector Street Vendors in Jakarta's Secondary Areas." *SASKARA: Indonesian Journal of Society Studies* 5, no. 01 (2025): 357-382.

³⁶ Kadamanta, R. A., Evita Vebrianti Wulandari, and Muslim Muslim. "Membangun Budaya Patuh Hukum Dari Perspektif Law Enforcement." *Jurnal Ekonomi dan Bisnis Digital* 2, no. 3 (2025): 2006-

Ultimately, the effectiveness of sidewalk use policy implementation depends heavily on the local government's ability to develop an integrative approach. Regulatory harmonization needs to be accompanied by clear design-based zoning, consistent monitoring, and economic empowerment strategies for street vendors so that relocation is not merely administrative.³⁷ In addition, community participation in the structuring process is also an important element so that the policy is not perceived as a unilateral action. Without integrated and cross-sectoral policy formulation, sidewalk structuring efforts have the potential to remain in the same cycle without a sustainable solution.

Based on all the data obtained, it can be confirmed that the suboptimal effectiveness of the sidewalk use policy implementation on Ciledug Road is not caused by a single factor. There is a disharmony of policies followed by weak technical regulations at the operational level, limited supervisory capacity of officials, the dominance of economic rationality among informal sector actors, a legal culture that is still permissive towards the use of sidewalks for trading, and the lack of strong cross-sector partnerships in spatial planning. These factors are interrelated and form a pattern of implementation that has not been consistent.

This problem confirms that spatial planning policies cannot be resolved through a repressive approach that focuses solely on enforcement. Law enforcement efforts are important, but without systemic reform, the results tend to be temporary. A collaborative governance-based strategy is needed that can simultaneously integrate legal, social,

2013.

³⁷ Sofia, Latifa. "Implementasi peraturan bupati nomor 13 tahun 2023 tentang penataan dan pemberdayaan pedagang kaki lima di kecamatan situbondo pada dinas koperasi perindustrian dan perdagangan kabupaten situbondo." PhD diss., Universitas abdurachman saleh situbondo, 2024.

economic, and environmental dimensions. Transformation must touch not only on structural aspects such as regulatory harmonization and institutional strengthening, but also on cultural aspects such as building collective awareness of the function and rights of public space. Without change in both of these areas, policies will remain strong in theory but weak in implementation.³⁸

Thus, the effectiveness of sidewalk use as part of urban space is not solely measured by the level of compliance with regulations, but also reflects the capacity of local governments to develop fair, inclusive, and sustainable spatial governance. This is in line with the principles of SDGs No. 16 and 17, which emphasize the importance of responsible environmental management, strengthening effective institutions, and the presence of various parties in achieving development goals. In this context, sidewalk management is part of a broader effort to realize fair and sustainable urban governance.

D. Conclusion

Based on the research objectives formulated at the outset, this study concluded that the effectiveness of the implementation of the sidewalk use policy on Ciledug Road in Garut Regency has not been as expected. The problem is not only related to the existence or absence of regulations, but also lies in how the policy is implemented in the field and accepted by the community. The implementation of the policy still faces obstacles in terms of consistent supervision, clarity of spatial arrangements, and the economic needs of the community that encourage the use of sidewalks beyond their main function. Thus, the effectiveness of the policy cannot be judged solely by the enforcement actions taken, but by the

³⁸ Khoirunnisa, Nazla. "Penegakan hukum terhadap penyalahgunaan ruang publik trotoar di pasar Ciputat." Bachelor's thesis, Fakultas Syariah dan Hukum UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta.

policy's ability to create lasting order that is consistently obeyed.

From these findings, this study shows that improvements in implementation need to be directed at strengthening coordination between the Transportation Agency, the Cooperative and UMKM Agency, and the Garut Regency Civil Service Police Unit in clarifying the boundaries and technical regulations for the use of space, as well as a more communicative approach to informal businesses and the community. The local government can consider strategies that not only involve enforcement but also provide realistic solutions so that the function of sidewalks is maintained without neglecting the socio-economic conditions of residents. With these steps, sidewalk use policies are expected to be not only administratively effective but also sustainable and acceptable in everyday practice.

E. References

- Aeni, Nurul. "Pandemi covid-19: Dampak kesehatan, ekonomi, & sosial." *Jurnal Litbang* 17, no. 1 (2021): 17-34.
- Amanatin, Elsa Lutmilarita, Muhammad Fedryansyah, and Nunung Nurwati. "Implikasi Pembangunan Pedestrian di Jalan Pancasila Kota Tegal: Kontroversi Pemanfaatan Trotoar Pejalan Kaki dan Pedagang Kaki Lima." *RESIPROKAL: Jurnal Riset Sosiologi Progresif Aktual* 5, no. 2 (2023): 225-240.
- Armanda, Bagus. "Parkir Liar Dalam Perspektif Teori Efektifitas Hukum." *Jurnal Pelita Nusantara* 1, no. 4 (2024): 477-481.
- As Syifa, Farah Adinda. "Faktor-faktor Penyebab Pelanggaran dan Penegakan Hukum Penggunaan Zebra Cross yang digunakan Sebagai Ajang Peragaan Busana di Kota

Jakarta Pusat." PhD diss., Universitas Islam Indonesia, 2023.

Aziz, Umar Abdul, Isnaeni Rokhimah, and Agung Setiawan. "Analisis Kenyamanan Pejalan Kaki Terhadap Pemanfaatan Trotoar di Perkotaan Kutoarjo Kabupaten Purworejo." *Surya Beton: Jurnal Ilmu Teknik Sipil* 6, no. 1 (2022): 27-37.

Baihaqi, Muhammad Hanif Baihaqi, Anggraeny Puspaningtyas, and Muhammad Roisul Basyar. "Implementasi Kebijakan Penyediaan Ruang Bagi Pedagang Kaki Lima Di Pasar Loak Dupak Rukun Kota Surabaya." *Jurnal Publik* 19, no. 01 (2025): 01-12.

Doorson, Steven, Esa Rahmawati, Dinda Nur Azra, Yosaphat Diaz, and Febby Annisa Qutrunnadaa. "Implementasi Hukum Tata Ruang dalam Konteks Otonomi Daerah." *Al-Zayn: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial & Hukum* 2, no. 2 (2024): 128-140.

Fachrudin, Hilma Tamiami, Rahmi Karolina, and Siti Hajar Binti Misnan. "Sustainable streetscape design in commercial area toward green city: comparative study between Indonesia and Malaysia." *City, Territory and Architecture* 12, no. 1 (2025): 14.

Gunawan, Wawan. "SIDEWALKS: THE PUBLIC SPHERE" PLUNDERED" BY ECONOMIC INTERESTS Study in Bandung City." *CosmoGov: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan* 11, no. 1 (2025): 75-91.

Hajria, Hajria, Nuraisyah Nuraisyah, and Nawawi Natsir. "Efektivitas Penertiban Pedagang Kreatif Lapangan Oleh Satuan Polisi Pamong Praja di Kota Palu." *SENTRI: Jurnal Riset Ilmiah* 4, no. 12 (2025): 4509-4518.

Hasibuan, Indah Malini. "Penegakan hukum terhadap penyalahgunaan fungsi trotoar bagi pedagang kaki lima di Kota Padangsidempuan." PhD diss., UIN Syekh Ali Hasan Ahmad Addary Padangsidempuan, 2023.

- Ilham, Muhammad, and Abdul Rahman. "Praktik Penyelenggaraan Ketenteraman dan Ketertiban Umum." *AMU Press* (2024): 1-182.
- Kadarmanta, R. A., Evita Vebrianti Wulandari, and Muslim Muslim. "Membangun Budaya Patuh Hukum Dari Perspektif Law Enforcement." *Jurnal Ekonomi dan Bisnis Digital* 2, no. 3 (2025): 2006-2013.
- Kania, Ikeu, Lia Juliasih, Sheila Amelia Milano, and Yusup Hermawan. "IMPLEMENTASI KEBIJAKAN PERATURAN KETERTIBAN, KEBERSIHAN DAN KEINDAHAN (K3) DI KABUPATEN GARUT." *Jurnal Pembangunan dan Kebijakan Publik* 13, no. 1 (2022): 36-43.
- Khoirunnisa, Nazla. "Penegakan hukum terhadap penyalahgunaan ruang publik trotoar di pasar Ciputat." Bachelor's thesis, Fakultas Syariah dan Hukum UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta.
- Kristian, Indra. "Kebijakan Publik Dan Tantangan Implementasi Di Indonesia." *Jurnal Dialektika: Jurnal Ilmu Sosial* 21, no. 2 (2023): 88-98.
- Makmur, Syarif. "Kesalahan Penafsiran Komunikasi, Sumber Daya Disposisi dan Struktur Birokrasi dalam Implementasi Kebijakan." *Lentera: Multidisciplinary Studies* 1, no. 3 (2023): 172-176.
- Maulidya, Ade. "Kajian Tentang Kota Berkelanjutan di Indonesia (Studi Kasus di Kota Metro, Lampung)." *Arus Jurnal Sosial dan Humaniora* 5, no. 1 (2025): 850-861.
- Muhammad, Andi Alief, and Yori Herwangi. "Klasifikasi Sektor Informal Dan Hubungannya Dengan Penggunaan Ruang Pada Jalan Letjend Hertasning–Tun Abdul Razak, Kota Makassar Dan Kabupaten Gowa, Sulawesi Selatan." *Urban and Regional Studies Journal* 7, no. 2 (2025): 181-189.

Muhammad, Prince Daffa Shodiq. "Involution of Informal Sector Street Vendors in Jakarta's Secondary Areas." *SASKARA: Indonesian Journal of Society Studies* 5, no. 01 (2025): 357-382.

Nabila, Farrah Eva. "DIALEKTIKA SPASIAL DAN PRODUKSI BEAUTIFIKASI RUANG KOTA TERHADAP PELAKU AKTIVITAS EKONOMI INFORMAL." *Jurnal Analisa Sosiologi* 12, no. 2 (2023).

Nainggolan, Yehezkiel, Sarintan Efratani Damanik, and Muhammad Ade Kurnia Harahap. "Pengaruh Perencanaan Tata Ruang Kota terhadap Kualitas Hidup Penduduk di Kawasan Perkotaan." *PESHUM: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sosial dan Humaniora* 4, no. 2 (2025): 2162-2169.

Nophaket, Napong, Chamnarn Tirapas, and Wattana Songpetchmongkol. "The Walking Bangkok: Inclusive pedestrian network's integrated design and implementation study on Bangkok's emerging transportation district." *Journal of Architectural/Planning Research and Studies (JARS)* 21, no. 2 (2024): 329-344.

Pasyah, Nabila Islami, and Indrawati Indrawati. "PEDAGANG KAKI LIMA PASAR JONGKOK PURWODADI DI KOTA PEKANBARU." *NUSANTARA: Jurnal Ilmu Pengetahuan Sosial* 12, no. 6 (2025): 2301-2315.

Perdana, Edo. "Penegakan Hukum Oleh Kepolisian Terhadap Perubahan Alih Fungsi Trotoar Sebagai Tempat Usaha." *Unes Journal of Swara Justisia* 9, no. 2 (2025): 310-319.

Putra, Rama, and Wilson MA Therik. "ALUN-ALUN PANCASILA, SALATIGA: REPRESENTASI TATA NILAI DI RUANG PUBLIK." *KRITIS* 34, no. 1 (2025): 235-265.

Riswanto, Riswanto, Yuanita FD Sidabutar, Ismail P. Sinaga, and Nurhaida Pohan. "Pengaruh Sektor Informal Terhadap Ruang Publik Di Kecamatan Batam Kota Menuju Pengembangan Wilayah Yang Berkelanjutan." *Jurnal Potensi* 5, no. 1 (2025).

Roja, Rahtia San Khususnu, and Ikeu Hikmawati. "Implementasi Kebijakan Pemerintah Daerah Dalam Penataan Pedagang Kaki Lima." *Media Hukum Indonesia (MHI)* 2, no. 2 (2024): 132-138.

Romi, Ahmad, Zennis Helen, and Laurensius Arliman. "Efektivitas Penegakan Peraturan Daerah Tentang Ketertiban Umum di Kabupaten Pasaman Barat (Studi Kasus Penertiban Izin Tempat Makan)." *Jurnal Sakato Ekasakti Law Review* 4, no. 3 (2025): 181-190.

Sepuhtra, Ageng Ika, Aris Sunarya, and Sri Roekminiati. "Evaluasi Pelaksanaan Penegakan Hukum dalam Penerapan Izin Kesesuaian Pemanfaatan Tata Ruang di Kabupaten Gresik." *Soetomo Administrasi Publik* 2, no. 3 (2024): 667-680.

Sianturi, Agustina Rahayu, Shika Andari, Putri Anatasya Simanjuntak, and Aristoteles Tekege. "Dinamika Perkembangan Tata Ruang Kota Medan: Analisis Penggunaan Lahan Dan Dampaknya Terhadap Keberlanjutan Kota." *Jurnal Intelek Insan Cendikia* 1, no. 4 (2024): 560-564.

Siagian, Annera Armeilia, Annisa Faraz Muzayana, and Annissa Wirapusita. "Komunikasi Publik Pemerintah dalam Penertiban PKL: Mengapa Trotoar Tetap Dilanggar?." *INOMATEC: Jurnal Inovasi dan Kajian Multidisipliner Kontemporer* 1, no. 03 (2026).

Schapendonk, Frans, Carolina Sarzana, Adam Savelli, Ignacio Madurga-Lopez, Grazia Pacillo, and Peter Läderach. "Are climate and environment-and peace and security-related policy outputs coherent? A policy coherence

and awareness analysis for climate security." *International Development Planning Review* 45, no. 4 (2023): 437-467.

Syarifuddin, Nurul Aprilia. "Analisis Yuridisi Terhadap Perizinan Pedagang kaki Lima di Kel. Galung Maloang Kec. Bacukiki Kota Parepare." PhD diss., IAIN PAREPARE, 2025.

Sofia, Latifa. "Implementasi peraturan bupati nomor 13 tahun 2023 tentang penataan dan pemberdayaan pedagang kaki lima di kecamatan situbondo pada dinas koperasi perindustrian dan perdagangan kabupaten situbondo." PhD diss., Universitas abdurachman saleh situbondo, 2024.

Sulistiyaningsih, Nur, Abdusyhid Naufal Fathullah, and Megafury Apriandhini. "Implementasi Public Trust Doctrine Dalam Pengambilan Kebijakan Di Tingkat Daerah Dan Pusat: Tantangan Dan Peluang Di Indonesia." *Jurnal Esensi Hukum* 5, no. 2 (2023): 70-86.

Verlliawan, Lucky Reza. "TINJAUAN HUKUM ISLAM TERHADAP PRAKTIK PENYALAHGUNAAN FUNGSI TROTOAR (STUDI KASUS DI KAWASAN KECAMATAN JATINEGARA, JAKARTA TIMUR)." Bachelor's thesis, Fakultas Syariah dan Hukum UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta, 2021.

Widjaja, Gunawan, and Handojo Dhanudibroto. "KOORDINASI ANTAR-LEMBAGA PEMERINTAH DAN EFEKTIVITAS KEBIJAKAN KESEJAHTERAAN." *SIBATIK JOURNAL: Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Sosial, Ekonomi, Budaya, Teknologi, Dan Pendidikan* 4, no. 7 (2025): 1323-1332.

Acknowledgment

This section is written as a form of gratitude to those who have helped in the research process. The author would like to thank the supervising lecturer who, from the beginning, provided guidance and support, especially when the author was still confused in determining and conducting this research. The input and corrections provided were very helpful in enabling the author to better understand the writing of this research. The author would also like to thank the Garut Regency Satpol PP and the informants who were willing to spare their time for this research. Without their openness and willingness, this research would not have gone well. Finally, the author would like to express his deepest gratitude to his parents, family, and friends who have always provided support and prayers during the writing process, especially when it felt like it was taking too long.

Funding Information

This research did not receive funding support from any government agencies, private entities, or other organizations. The entire research and writing process was carried out independently by the author.

Conflicting Interest Statement

In writing and publishing this article, the author declares that there are no conflicts of interest, either personal or professional, that could influence the research process. This research was conducted independently and was not under pressure or in the interests of any particular party.

Publishing Ethical and Originality Statement

The author declares that this article is the result of the author's own research. This manuscript has never been published in any form and is not being submitted to any other journal. All references used have been clearly listed in accordance with scientific writing rules. The author realizes the importance of maintaining academic integrity, so every quotation and idea that does not originate from the author has been given the appropriate source.

Generative AI Statement

In the process of writing this article, the author used Generative AI technology to a limited extent as a supporting tool. It was mainly used to get an initial idea of the writing structure, enrich perspectives, and help provide alternative ideas when I experienced a block in developing arguments. However, the entire content, analysis, and conclusions in this article remain the result of the author's own understanding and thought process. All data and references used were independently reviewed by the author to ensure they were appropriate to the research context and applicable academic standards. The author recognizes that the use of AI must be disclosed openly to avoid misunderstandings about the writing process. Therefore, the author emphasizes that AI only serves as a tool to broaden perspectives and enhance creativity, not as a substitute for the scientific analysis process, which remains the author's responsibility.