



## Inequality in the Development of the Virtual YouTube Industry in Indonesia Year 2020-2023 As Impact Investment Done by Hololive Production

Respati Pakusadewo\*<sup>1</sup>, Nurmasari Situmeang<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup>Universitas Pembangunan Nasional Veteran Jakarta, Indonesia

---

### Article Info

#### Article History

Submitted 24 January 2024

Revised 25 April 2024

Accepted 7 Mei 2024

#### Keywords

foreign direct investment; multinational corporation; creative economy; virtual youtube

### Abstract

The aim of this research is to find out the impact of foreign corporation investment in the field of Virtual YouTubing in Indonesia and to look at the Virtual YouTubing sector development on the global creative economy and its development in Indonesia. The collection techniques used to gather the data were literature study, documentation study, and conducting interviews. The results of this research show that Hololive Production is superior in several ways compared to local companies in Indonesia, amongst them are resources such as US technology and facilities, and a stark contrast in the mindset of the people of Indonesia and Japan about the reception towards the Virtual YouTube industry. This research found that from the period 2020 to 2023, the VTubing industry in Indonesia only experienced growth but did not experience deeper and more comprehensive development.

---

\* E-mail: [respatip@upnvj.ac.id](mailto:respatip@upnvj.ac.id);

Address: Jalan RS. Fatmawati Raya, Pd. Labu,

Kec. Cilandak, Kota Jakarta Selatan, Daerah Khusus Ibukota Jakarta 12450

P-ISSN : 2549-0737 E-ISSN : 2621-6272

DOI 10.15294/upsj.v8i1.800

## INTRODUCTION

This Covid-19 attack Because condition Which Where public from various cleavage world No can go out home, then people are looking for form *entertainment* For Can fill in very boring time Because No Can everywhere. It's here a global audience began find type content *VTubing* and also *the YouTube algorithm* start Lots bring up *VTubers* to public outside Japan, so content *VTubers* from Japan become more easy searching for, although title content And its contents language Japan. Since moment That industry *VTubing* starts popular in a way global And matter This open opportunity for companies *VTubers*

In Japan For open the market to outside Japan. Hololive Production Company has total subscribers as many as 64 million user in YouTube with numbers *talent*, namely 71 *VTubers* (as of March 2023) (Hololive Production, 2023).

FDI undertaken company Hololive get enthusiasm from public connoisseur type content *VTuber* seen from many emerging communities and also agencies locally formed ; this industry finally become popular in Indonesia. According to IMF and OECD definitions, investment direct is purposeful activities For obtain interest company that is profit sustainable (*sustainable*) or period long from the country of origin company That embed the capital (España, 2003). Entity results from investment direct can form child company, association, or branch. Subsidiary is A company body laws under which foreign investors control in a way direct or No directly (via child company others) more of 50% rights voice holder share (España, 2003). Multinational company industry *Virtual YouTubing* Hololive Production from Japan did it investment to China, Indonesia and America is a ' branch ' form of FDI because in a way ownership Still fully held by Hololive Production JP (Hololive Production, 2023). Based on pattern, Hololive carry out horizontal FDI to these countries Because everything Still is branch company Hololive in the same industry .

This brings up interest For research How how MNC Hololive Production operates can make company the own great success . Especially If talking about Indonesia, interesting For searching for know more in about impact from investment Hololive to channel industry *VTubing* in country. Matter Which want to researcher search know is the implications to development of the *VTubing* industry in Indonesia with the entry of Hololive ; Hololive as company foreign still dominate market *VTuber* in Indonesia (as MNC sector whatever has been invest capital in Indonesia) without There is bait come back in a way direct to economic industrial progress creative *VTubing* in Indonesia.

## METHODS

This research is study qualitative , where research This is done by collecting your own data through inspection documents , observations behavior , or interview. Researched sources For Collecting data also varies like like interviews , observations , studies documents , and information audio visual (recording videos) than depend on One data source only. Because of its shape qualitative , then data the No bound by standard

parameters from instruments that have been specified (like answer closed from questionnaire ). And after the data is collected then researcher will review data And interesting thread red (Creswell & Creswell, 2016).

This research uses data collection by method interview. In Creswell & Creswell (2016) it is said that qualitative data interviews can held in various ways way , in among them that is do interview stare face , interview telephone , or involved in interview focus group , which Creswell said was done with six until eight people who interviewed in every group. Interview on study this is done by going through internet or online network (in network ) via Google Meet.

Research on " Inequality in the Development of the *Virtual YouTube* Industry in Indonesia 2020-2023 As Impact Investments Made by Hololive Production " will retrieve data from article journals , articles periodicals , *conference proceedings* , theses , articles news , internet videos, as well article results interview source person For explain more discussion widely about *VTubers* (part big For *VTubers* in a way general and partial small For Hololive in a way special ). Data secondary from channel official Hololive Production Also will used For see movement Hololive in investment and marketing .

In this research , technique data collection carried out is by study library , study documentation , as well as do interview. Studies References done with

study and filter the captured data from article journals , articles periodicals , *conference proceedings* , theses , and articles news ; which certainly all This literature discusses topic *Virtual YouTuber* And company Hololive Production. Studies References according to Nazir (2009) is technique data collection with techniques read , study , and filter written data contained in books , articles periodicals , articles journal , notes research , magazines , reports research , as well source written others published in a way existing official relationship to the problem at hand researched .

Researcher still will use the method described by Creswell (2016) , namely examine data in audiovisual or digital form such as video. In the research " Inequality in the Development of the *Virtual YouTube* Industry in Indonesia 2020-2023 As Impact Investments Made by Hololive Production " , for complete the data from literature review Which researcher learn , so collection data from media Internet like videos YouTube and Also article news interview Which discuss more in about Hololive. Data which has gather Then will made material study studies case For understand variable study. these ingredients will used For explain and analyze draft *VTuber* from beginning until to analysis Hololive in the investment to outside Japan. For look for know and analyze impact from investment Hololive in Indonesia, researcher do interviews with representatives company *VTubing* industry locale Re:Memories .

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### A. Shift Hololive Production to the market International

Hololive as company non- international taking place start from when Tokino Sora debut is on September 7 through the period August 2019 which started from the 1st

where Generation 3 Hololive announced. Then on September 27 2019 , the first talent from China branch announced For made his debut, and in October 2019 did generation debut First they that is Yogiri , Civia , as well as Spade Echo (Morissy , 2020). Kiryu Coco and Akai Haato, two talent people from Hololive JP (generation 4 and generation 1 in sequence ) ever get great hatred from community Chinese country audience because they Once give saying accept love to Taiwan when see data chart demographics viewer them on YouTube (Sutton, 2021). This causes they together was suspended by the company parent Hololive namely Cover Corporation, and Kiryu Coco himself Finally decide For resign self from his activities as VTuber in lower affiliate Hololive (Sutton, 2021).

Incident follow-up as by-product of incident This politics is Hololive Production is interesting investment they from China and disbandment CN branch at the same time become dismissal of VTuber talent Hololive from China. Since moment That Hololive go out from the Chinese market and the talents below affiliate Hololive No can make content , esp video game content from China (such as Genshin Impact and Muse Dash), as well as Hololive No make cooperation Again with company China (Zheng, 2020). Consequence from incident Which has experienced — or more specifically done - by Haato And Coco, so China forbid total Hololive For do collaboration with brands whatever Which originate from country China (Алок , 2023).

When Hololive China yet experience the highly controversial fallout , Hololive Already decided also to do horizontal expansion to Indonesia for look for talent from Indonesia. Hololive do investment in Indonesia by opening audition For talent VTubers from Indonesian branch. Audition For wave First closed on January 13 2020 (Alfarizy , 2020) which at the time That the information is on the official website <https://www.hololive.tv/indonesia> . Hololive Still used the same strategy in its expansion that is open branch direct from companies in Japan For do market-seeking .

## B. Hololive Production in Indonesia

Based on The pattern is that Foreign Direct Investment is divided into 4, namely horizontal (market-seeking ), vertical (resource-seeking ), conglomerate (Subhanij & et.al., 2016). and platforms (Ekholm, 2007). Horizontal FDI is carried out by replication facility production (establishing branch company or buy companies abroad in the country same industrial field ) for expand the market. Facility production replicated by Hololive No like tool factory or tool general manufacturing found in production MNCs goods , but rather use procedures and facilities use live model (either 2D or semi-3D) for streaming on the YouTube platform.

In the MNC field content creation Virtual YouTube like Hololive Production, technology transfer happened , however only A little. This is because Not yet Of course investments made by the company parent covers establishment building real operations . In the case of Hololive Production in Indonesia, researcher No can find information about location office Hololive ID in Indonesia; and this can be understandable remember that this industry is a full industry confidentiality to identity original the humans behind the Virtual YouTuber model avatars , no less talking about Hololive , for one company

VTubing with policy firm external in problem harassment and human rights violations through online media and potentially leak information private or defiling Name Good all component the company ; Hololive bring things thereby to track law (Hololive Production, 2021).

Because principle " anonymous " here it is Which cause transfer technology spelled out A little Because only on the means only 2D and semi-3D features are distributed to company branch Because company No can For build a building that can raise risk For all matters related to the company Hololive leaked to public audience. This is also meaningful No There is means operational big more in branch and Hany company center in Japan has office physique. Researcher Can prove this by confirming a number of statement from para talents VTubers Hololive JP or statement VTuber from company local .

Researcher inspect that every time Hololive talent outside branch held a 3D showcase one generation originating talent from outside branch Japan , them always tell a story that they currently is at in Japan For do session live , at a time go for a walk And Also they tell experience they meeting their seniors in Japan ; And matter This No limited para talents outside Japan That just Which tell a story when live streaming , but their seniors from Japan also often tell experience they meet their juniors from Indonesia who came For makes 3D debut (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bFBdGow6kb0&t=0s> ) (Pekora , 2022). In October 2023 is generation third Hololive Indonesia Which report that they currently in Japan can do it easily concluded that this is preparation they For makes 3D debut; and that's right , on October 15, 20, and 27 2023 Zeta, Kaela, and Kobo streamed the first 3D model which was started by Zeta ([https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6-PIITA\\_VWg](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6-PIITA_VWg) ) (Zeta , 2023).

Interesting is even MNC VTubing which is not Hololive Production in Indonesia, named AKA Virtual (office center in Tokyo) also does matter similar , namely the talents that come from from outside Japan must did a 3D showcase pass by office center , or more specifically only Can from office center in Tokyo, because No technology transfer occurs to branch in Indonesia. This can confirmed from one talent AKA Virtual from Indonesia who made his 3D debut on October 20 2023 and he say Alone that he currently is in Japan when one viewer ask How the difference the atmosphere of Indonesia and Japan (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r-yy2AiYQ68> ) (Gathika, 2023).

Hololive own technology Which very advanced For support activity streaming they. Hololive own technology advanced For enable 3D streaming at home use device like copy And Meta Quest 2 (Hololive Production, 2023). Hololive also has facility facility studio with Vicon, system arrest motion optics , For reach tracking movements with precision high and accurate for Lots talent at a 3D concert. Already enter resourceful with advanced technology the Hololive can push product The content is of very high quality. Matter the is source the power you have Still Hololive Not yet achieved in Indonesia.

## C. Practice VTubing in Indonesia

Researcher in frame look for know as true and close as possible Possible to reality that happened do data collection by method interview. Initially researcher intend For do interviews with company staff local VTubing

industry namely Aspira Project, YumeLive, Re:Memories, GENESIX, and DigiKagi, as well as MAHA5 and MetanoiaLive as reserve. But in practice researcher only get access interview at 1 company that is Re:Memories. Researcher opportunity interviewed Mr. Wendy Antonius as Chief and Executive Officer of Re:Memories. As head from company, Mr. Wendy is also a VTubing industry market analysts who view and analyze market developments in the industry as well moderate supply and demand occurs in climate global and local markets for the VTubing industry in Indonesia. Researcher interview representative from Re:Memories on 20 July 2023. Researcher prepare 7 question interview to resource persons who are researchers give Formerly to the sources through WhatsApp before day interview And researcher ask in a way direct on moment timetable interviews that have been Approved.

Result of interview with Mr. Wendy can describe condition running of the industry Virtual YouTube in Indonesia. All data Which explained on sub- chapter This is results analysis from data provided by Mr. Wendy. According to Mr. Wendy, Indonesia is Wrong One country Which most Lots watch content Hololive. Indonesia is top 3 in the country watching VTuber. Hololive enter to Indonesia based on these considerations and although at the time early in Indonesia itself Not yet There is VTuber, however fans Already Lots. Before hololive Come in, Nijisanji Already enter first to Indonesia, and this is great influence to withdrawal interest Indonesian people for also come in in this VTubing industry. After that's it, it's coming in Nijisanji make increasingly many VTuber, though Can said No as much Now. Entry Hololive become determination, which even ordinary people become know VTuber Because entry This Hololive. These things are according to Mr. Wendy's view during see development VTuber in Indonesia as part market research.

If seen from impact positive or the negative, Father Wendy say that both comes with the entry Hololive to Indonesia. However in a way relative, if compared to when when 2019-2020 (when Covid), more positive Now because the market size is increasing by Hololive. Which plunge in industry VTuber so too Can more known, though this is indeed the case Actually Still luck. The negative is, level difficulty For compete the more tall And competition the more intense. Matter this is what I made affiliate brands That important Because If still indie, will hit by popularity brands like Hololive And Nijisanji.

Enter talking about production economy creative like music and also merchandise, Mr. Wendy's company in making music usually hire a freelancer or artist musician. Making merchandise also goes through a similar process, where company rent freelancer specifically artist handicrafts Because production merchandise eat time. From This is Mr Wendy's opinion that The large number of freelancers nowadays is very helpful in the production process. However so, it turns out cooperation or collaboration in making product music That Not yet Once involve artists board on Indonesia, Good That singer or composer. Researcher find that this is things that are whole This also happens to companies Local VTubing other.

For services promotions offered by the company VTubing, especially Mr. Wendy's company, other parties often only offer digital products namely video games, and

not There is product daily like food, cosmetics, or other. Most talents used is Chloe Pawapua And Elaine Celestia. He most new This (7 July 2023) do sponsored gacha video game streams takt op. Symphony of DeNA. Overall it's a lot come For requested promote is a video game; ever done promotion for example such as Yakuza and Sonic from Sega, Honkai Impact 3rd from Hoyoverse, Wargaming's World of Warships, etc. The main thing is these companies that reach out to Re:Memories For do sponsored streams with VTuber talent from Re:Memories. When it's done often do promotions like this, that will there are many too come contact, OK from email or from direct message. Product from Indonesia itself No someone uses it service company For promote product they. The product is coming from outside come possibly to Indonesia Because they of course want to promote globally products them and come to Indonesia.

When researchers ask Why only limited to video games only and not There is cooperation promotion from products other like product retail for example, Father Wendy explain that connection this thing exists from lack facet technology and also acceptance Indonesian society (outside circles hobby) on existence Virtual YouTubers. From Indonesia and Japan just Already own different culture. Anime there of course is culture them, meanwhile in Indonesia only is sub- culture Which originate from outside. By Because That VTuber, Which basically format anime design, it's easy accepted public there. In Indonesia culture like this is trivialized and just considered simply cartoon and the result in a way culture of course miss it". For them, content creators are in 'virtual' format Still new to Indonesia. According to Mr. Wendy, this is more toward those who don't know and don't know understand How how to make two types entertainment from these different dimensions can be collaborate.

Lack of information And lack of imagination For imagine How how to get the concept Can Work or walk. Back again to singer with VTuber, them No know The method. Especially in Indonesia technology 3D That Still Not yet become matter Which normal or even difficult For There is. This is because most company VTubing in Indonesia only own office virtual form or in network and not own building, so difficult to install 3D technology. People think funny (in view negative) if draft sing happen between artist original with 'cartoon' Which the format 2D And only own movement limited like puppet. Something else maybe Because appetite. For "normies" (term for people who don't enjoy anime), cartoons seen just next door eye According to Mr Wendy, this is unfortunate Because the market currently moderate big. Even Actually If they want to collaborate, according to Mr. Wendy can become things that expand the initial market they alone and widespread to other markets.

For technology 3D itself, if the standard as good as Hololive, means must has his own studio with several point camera for the 3D for catch or track movement from talents And must own 3D bodysuits so that camera can track movement body. Tools like that's the minimum required around Rp. 70,000,000. Now Already many more cheap but of course the tracking No too nice, like copy (Sony copy 3D Motion Capture System). There are also those who issue webcam with features tracking, but this is only Can face front, no Can catch rotating body. High-budget 3D concerts require around Rp. 500,000,000 to on; Already including marketing and things other. Then tools

For concert, place For concert, as well as para staff And talents when program currently taking place. If pressed Can around Rp. 100,000,000 to Rp. 200,000,000. Because it's difficult implementation 3D in Indonesia, make VTuber in Indonesia only Can limited operate in 2D format. Impact biggest from this thing is how difficult it is roll out 3D concert.

#### D. Parameters Inequality

1. Integration Virtual YouTube with artist or figure world original Which not enough

From the data collected from results interview with Mr Wendy, researcher can concluded a number of matter related impact from entry of foreign MNCs company Virtual YouTube in Indonesia. Researcher conclude that with entry Hololive to Indonesia, raises impact positive and impact negative towards the Virtual YouTube industry in Indonesia. In One side, entry Hololive Production in Indonesia bring impact positive from facet development of this industry practical and technical. Entry Hololive ignite interest public Indonesia to industry Virtual YouTube, so that his community increasingly expansion and market become the more big in Indonesia. This makes VTubing is getting better popular even until true circles No "religiously" follow hobby world movement ACG.

Entry Hololive is also open outlook to Virtual YouTube commercial with the practices that are used example or 'template' in this industrial operation. However, if in this industry the parties are indeed plunge in the VTubing industry, no can compete, then will the more left behind with the company from far outside more hefty in influence in this field of industry. This thing side negative carried come in with the arrival Hololive as an MNC giant in the Virtual YouTube industry. Degree of difficulty For compete the more tall And the loser technology And HR will seen the more Far distance from the owner source lots of power.

Although so, if seen from corner conceptually, the VTubing industry in Indonesia brings Lots impact positive; although of course this has n't happened yet 100% traceable, but this industry also becomes something wheel motion economy creative in Indonesia, especially in field art music, art drawing, even all type work involving art ability exercise digital devices such as rigging or organizing convention events and also video games. Everything related with practice economy creative digital And performance community or contemporary festivals can the more encouraged by the presence of the Virtual YouTube industry in Indonesia. With the presence of this industry, movement economy creative the more open opportunity innovation like commission making music to artist musician For making song VTuber, commission art draw For making model avatars VTuber, VTuber avatar model rigging commission, commission artist hand For making merchandise, and also become expansion on type product content creation in Indonesia.

However so, if We want to compare progress with Hololive Production, then Still seen quite a gap big between Hololive Production as an MNC with a company local; seen from facet operational, HR, as well as level confession public towards industry Virtual YouTube in country Indonesia. Researcher can see 2 (two) matter most striking that makes economic industrial practice creative VTubing in Indonesia still become an industry that is sub-

optimal if compared to Japan or in EN/America; First is openness thought from various circles party, and the second is source Power; Good man or technology.

Based on the data obtained from results interview with Mr. Wendy, he say that closed innovation in product economy creativity in Indonesia that involves Virtual YouTube For let go bulkhead with para artist, or musician world original is Because lack of information And lack imagination For imagine How how to do it the concept Can Work or walk. Matter This return Again to technology Which Not yet Can support too Far direction collaborative content penetrate dimensions like that, especially 3D technology. quote from Mr. Wendy's answer was, "They are Possible think funny (in view negative) if draft sing happen between artist original with 'cartoon' which is in 2D format and only swaying like a puppet".

If we Look method operate Hololive, then seen How flexible and innovative they in promote the content they have. Researcher will mention a number of example like VTuber they Which often collaborate or interview with artist or real world musicians, even interview figure historic. The events that have occurred mentioned for example can seen on Hoshimachi Suisei, Hololive talent from generation 0 branch Japan, which has segment special radio along with Tadokoro Azusa who is singer as well as voice actress anime characters from Japan. Suisei become hosted on channel frequent radio discussing VTuber but also often bringing in Tadokoro Azusa; this radio is called "文化放送V&R" (<https://www.youtube.com/@vr6843>) (VTubers & Radio, 2023). Hoshimachi Suisei has too invited For sing on [THE FIRST TAKE] ([https://www.youtube.com/@The\\_FirstTake](https://www.youtube.com/@The_FirstTake)), a YouTube channel from Inviting Japan singer And musician Japan For sing songs they are popular only once take without can repeat If There is error or mistake.

Not only That's it, Hololive as company Large VTubing is also often the case do segments Which inviting artists popular For talk or do talk shows, like for example Lapus Darkness and Roboco which are respectively talent Hololive JP from generation 6 and 0, ever presented with Ohashi Ayaka, artist, drummer and voice actress for anime characters in Japan October 18, 2023 (Hololive Official Fanclub, 2023).

Site This Also often inviting artists And musician other For do conversation or mini-games with Hololive Production talent. Not only That, this site also has inviting ex-wife President Soekarno was Ratna Sari Dewi Soekarno (Hololive Official Fanclub, 2022). Researcher opinion that This show absence bulkhead between world VTuber, which is basically is 2D, with artists, musicians, even figure history that exists in world original; even No heavy for they For do collaboration or stage project together. For an interview with Mrs. Dewi Soekarno herself Actually Already Once done by VTuber from Indonesia, namely Maya Putri in 2019, however Because reception public to VTuber When That still minimal (plus Again with the facts that of course Hololive at the moment That Not yet enter to Indonesia), making reception content interview No too size and popularity type content like this no too high (Maya Putri, 2019). However when this was done by Hololive in 2022, this became 'explode'.

If reviewed from side artist or musicians, outside Indonesia (Japan and EN) not consider VTuber is just 'cartoon' or '2D' and looking as entertainment that has

community special separately And regardless from aspect other. On Hololive branch EN, Mori Calliope, talent of the 'HoloMyth' units do music label contact with Universal Music Japan (<https://www.universal-music.co.jp/mori-calliope/>) (Universal Music Japan, 2023). Mori Calliope which is a VTuber signed to music label Anisble he For producing singles or albums at high costs, incl collaborate with one musician from band 'THE ORAL CIGARETTES' namely Takuya Yamanaka in The MV is entitled 'Wanted, Wasted' (Calliope, 2022).

Things that have been researcher mention is Hololive benefits get it Because big company that, so they own source lots of power For carry out all form activity, in various formats. See matter the researcher provide report financial official Linked Hololive from the researcher's hololive TODAY website get it state that Hololive Production's 2023 revenue will reach 20.415 million Japanese Yen (JPY) or around 150.8 million US Dollars (USD) (hololive TODAY, 2023). From the available data, it can be seen that income biggest from Hololive Production achieved from streaming and merchandise sales, namely 6,342 million JPY or about 42.9 million USD and 8.003 million JPY or around 54.1 million USD.

As of March 2023 (when amount talent VTubers Hololive Still numbering 75 people), total subscribers amounting to 75.58 million people on the YouTube platform, with income per VTuber reached 272 million JPY or around 1.8 million USD. Hololive Production Method in practice economy creative proved very successful from the numbers that have been achieved this. Use method Which Hololive implement on practice economy this is creative is matter which is indeed the most popular and most comfortable For used in look for profit.

## 2. Nothing technology 3D

There is a number of matter Where Hololive own excess Which very indicative his dominance to company VTubing in country develop like Indonesia, two in among them is 3D showcase and 3D concert. From the results interview with Mr Wendy, researcher find that of course For support technology 3D for VTuber models in Indonesia that is is matter Which No easy Because cost And source Power Which needed. Father Wendy say that If want to quality like Hololive, then must has its own studio installed with tools camera special For motion capture And Also bodysuits, Which Where The minimum nominal amount is IDR 70,000,000. Listen Mr. Wendy's explanation, for Re:Memories Alone That No has a studio located outside network, or building original. And researchers find that part Most VTubing companies in Indonesia also operate with the same method; No own building office still.

Researcher can concluded matter This based on search document from Internet, especially YouTube site, where company local already Once do 3D streams only new One company course, that is Maha5 Where even then new happen on 2 generation units ie generations 1 and 2, namely Andi Adinata, Alia Adelia, and Lumi Celestia. If we count Maya Putri who is pioneer VTubing in Indonesia, then There is VTuber the one from beginning Already use format 3D, However For integrated in augmented format reality. Although so, matter This No become trend in Indonesia, Which possibility of course

Because problem cost and sources Power. If technology This 3D support only difficult For obtained and maintained then will be very difficult For roll out kosner 3D, where the cost will even more expensive.

Hololive Alone first time showing 3D concerts are becoming part from series of events Indonesia Comics Con x DG CON on date 4-5 November in Jakarta Conventions Center, which will featuring Ayunda Risu, Moona Hoshinova, Kobo Kanaeru, and Pavolia Reine (Hololive Production, 2023). This appearance was supported by VRChat and the CEO of Cover Corporation that is YAGOO Also present as star visitor (Indonesia Comics Con, 2023). With sources Power Which hololive have, roll out concert 3D in Indonesia, country Which Where its VTubing industry Not yet until to that level, namely easy thing.

## 3. Lack of promotion retail And corporate

Hololive too superior in collaborate with shop retail or product food Which can increase interest public For buy product from the shop concerned. For example like collaboration with 'Family Mart', or promotion product food like instant cup noodles flavor Curry from 'Nissin Curry Meshi', and There are also with a screen printing brand shirt 'OMOCAT' (Cover Corporation, 2023). Hololive has too collaborating with 'Lawson' and also promotions 'e-ma' jelly products. Which has researcher mention is just part of the web of collaboration that has been established Hololive do it with other corporations

If we look at Indonesia, creativity promotion like this yet seen. Results of interviews with Mr Wendy find that promotion Which the most frequently done by VTuber Company local That Still only limited video game products only pass sponsored streams. Return Why this is difficult happened in Indonesia is Because not enough breadth the imagination of the owners interest. According to researchers, limited technology, esp technology support 3D, No become problem For intertwine cooperation promotion. Matter This because 3D isn't it fundamental thing for promotion product or retail. If we see method promotion collaboration performed by Hololive, in part big That just production items by entering artwork or picture art para talents Hololive in product Which in sell, poster promotion with para talents Hololive as mark sell, And other media that No need animation move. Although of course will more interesting customer Again If there is animated ads where the talents promote products, but basically is incorporation mark sell Virtual YouTuber with product Which for sale. Like Which Wendy's father say that lack of information And lack of imagination For imagine and implement the concept Can Work or goes well.

## 4. The loss diversification product digital

The thing that makes Hololive Production has strong foundation in his income is diversification their products have. As Mr. Wendy said and from data that researchers Already also explain in chapter 4 regarding Hololive Production, Hololive of course own background behind struggling in VR and AR fields. Naturally If only depend on concerts and merchandise, Hololive Production does not will This dominant group dominates the industrial market. Moreover Again If We remember that For high-budget 3D concerts require Rp. 500,000,000 to on. Hololive is indeed the company that departed from VR field and AR has other

products, namely metaverse, video games, VRChat, even original comic (Cover Corporation, 2023).

In the field of metaverse and video games, Hololive own the 'Hololive' project which is videos games Which produced by Hololive so that Can played by public global in world virtual Which big And themed adventure; naturally with idols or talent that they yearn for (Cover Corporation, 2023). Hololive Also own 'Hololive Alternative' which is spin-off setting fantasy Which poured to in animation make music And also original manga. Hololive Production also has 'Hololive' which is application AR based Where owner application can bring up favorite talent they're in camera and take Photo or video together with they as if they is at in world original (Hololive Production, 2023). Hololive Production is also encouraging its performance in VRChat, a video game from the 'Steam' platform where player can enter the virtual server with the tool specifically so you can communicate with humans from various all over the world with various virtual avatars type appearance And form. Hololive pointing talents from Hololive English generation 2, namely Hakos Baelz as a virtual navigator for VRChat (Hololive Production, 2023).

Researcher see diversity product like this in the VTubing industry in Indonesia yet happen, and maybe Still will difficult happen Because limitations source power to the company Local VTubing, incl technology and especially location a permanent and owned office building. On the current state of the VTubing industry in Indonesia, for creeping diversification as done Hololive That still very difficult.

##### 5. No There is cooperation with government city

Virtual YouTube even can made instrument in autonomy area. In Japan, the Tokyo government appointed Sakura Miko (JP gen 0), Mori Calliope, and Gawr Gura (both EN gen 1) for become ambassador Tokyo tourism on date February 8 2023 and them will on duty For explain Power pull city Tokyo as Ambassador Tourist Tokyo (Harding, 2023). Seen from here that even party government area with No difficult utilise trend as business For push tourist area. It means depends How method take advantage of it, the VTubing industry is not only can boost the sub-sector economy creative others, however can also be boosted tourist regional and regionally potential, tourism national. It means potency Which owned by industry VTubing in Indonesia This very big If sector Want to recognized or at least identified by the Indonesian government and other stakeholders.

On the main thing is is that with presence industry Which unique This in Indonesia No as well as immediately the operation become something that is effective integrated For become something binder or sub-sector drivers economy creative other For become more mixed up again with the progress of time and innovation in produce product. Matter This No only become something obstacle in economic world creative Virtual YouTube only, but also become something challenge in development technology and stakeholder insights for Can utilise presence Virtual YouTube in Indonesia has become thing that can be obtain profit more.

##### 6. Growth in Indonesia without exists development

Although in aspect progress and development of

Indonesian industry lagging behind, however in growth VTubing in Indonesia is matter Which very popular; at least to circles hobbies With many appearance companies VTubing in Indonesia becomes proof that industry VTubing becomes matter Which interested And interesting For try. Because the popularity of this industry, even JKT48, a girl an idol group with an idol concept Japan (sister group of AKB48 in Japan) launched a new, completely virtual unit with concept VTuber namely JKT48V (V Which represent 'Virtual') (JKT48, 2023). Third its members that is Tana

Nona, Kanaia Asa, as well Pia Meraleo do debut on date 23, 24, and 25 August 2023 and sub-unit from JKT48 This is sub-unit virtual First time Which owned from affiliate idol group 48 (AKB48 in Japan No has virtual sub-units like this). By natural, though interaction between the virtual unit and the main JKT48 unit already happened, however so, because unavailable facility 3D models And also facilities support concert 3D For Now, sub-unit virtual JKT48V Still only do activity Which No There is the difference with para VTuber other that is do livestreaming play games, Zasadun, karaoke, talk shows, and form content others who don't need requires a 3D avatar model.

Researcher think that this is the point just A movement by to popular world trend without own support source Power or very open environment For Can reach potency maximum in the operation. As a result the operation in Indonesia still in only limits can browse surface just from what can VTubing do. Whereas Hololive branch Indonesia Already more get exposure Which more wide Again in Indonesia because it is wrong One his talent Already become commentator match e-sports in Indonesia on match 'FFML Seasons 8 Grand Finals Free Fire Tournaments' on date October 8, 2023 and also be star guest at the 'Mobile Legends Championship 2023' which was held by PLN ICONNET And sponsored by BUMN in Sleman City Hall Yogyakarta on October 26 2023.

Researcher opinion that inequality that occurs between MNCs and companies domestic within this same industrial field is case inequality that occurs consequence globalization. This is because globalization make distribution technology communication and information become No evenly which affects digital infrastructure and flows, as well exists capitalism is carried out by the owning party power (Mackay, 2004). Hololive No carry out technology transfer Good to branch the company is in Indonesia, let alone to company local, although Hololive Indonesia does not I rarely do either collaboration with companies local. However of course collaboration Which done still only until limited collaboration that is not requires 3D.

From the results interview with Mr Wendy, actually necessary requirements For roll out the 3D Already unknown, however still just difficult accomplished Because absence office physical cause No there is a studio that makes technology installations as well as source Power capable human being For do 3D; added Again Hololive ID itself No own technology 3D in Indonesia Which make collaboration content creation with company local No Once there is 3D, so local HR No Once feel 3D with coming to the Hololive ID studio for collaboration. This is not yet including take into account necessary costs For roll out 3D, create The movement of the Virtual YouTube industry in Indonesia is difficult For guessed development, esp the integration to in economy creative Indonesia, and in a way

potency, tourist in Indonesia. However so it should opportunity For utilise element art at a time mark sell VTuber That Can just carried out by retail parties or corporation other. This can at a time help economy creative the art of poster design or graphic design. It should be possible too done collaboration composition music between VTuber with the artist or composer famous, Because matter This No need 3D, However still No held. It's back Again researcher emphasize Because lack of imagination various party holder interests and patterns think no Want to explore all possibilities and opportunities.

## CONCLUSION

Industry Virtual YouTube in Indonesia is industry Which own potency Which very large For jack economy creative and even business in a way common in Indonesia. Although I see, industry this is an industry which has not been get support full and have Lots obstacle. Obstacle most main originate from lack of source Power, especially technology, And Also pattern think the Indonesian people Alone towards industry Virtual YouTube (esp business stakeholders and also government).

If compared to with performance MNC Hololive Production Which enter to Indonesia, Virtual YouTube industry in Indonesia is lagging behind on many aspect. Aspects the rooted of 2 obstacles main that has been mentioned; start from lack of involvement non-2D actors in content creation (including artists or artist board on Indonesia), utilization marketing by corporations or stakeholders in other industrial fields, involvement government in identified the VTubing industry as a sub-sector economy creative in Indonesia, as well diversification product.

In essence, the VTubing industry in Indonesia only experience growth numbers with entry MNC Hololive Production, However No accompanied with development Which deep and expansive in a way significant in aspect network economy creative. Even with the entry of MNCs bring impact positive on expansion market industry Virtual YouTube in Indonesia and at a glance No seen like impact A huge negative, however if the industry doesn't experience development to front, so Indonesia will experience case Where industry in country will sink And consumed by company multinational Which his strength and its influence more big.



With the things that have been observed these, and the evidence findings that have been made explained in discussion, then seen inequality that occurs between the local VTubing industry and the company multinational like Hololive Production is from reception party holder interest like government cities and regions, allocation the potential is not It is also well utilized by profit companies such as retail business, increasingly left behind technology operation domestic industry, domestic industry is lagging behind in innovation diversification product (which can drawn also as impact from left behind technology), and limited operating media economy creative in a way general If compared to effectiveness and efficiency Hololive in doing business. These things bring impact where the Virtual YouTube industry is a domestic company or local in Indonesia "just exists" but No There is movement that arrives apda "breakthrough" stage.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

Respati Pakusadewo as writer First as compiler draft discussion and determination direction research, as well write manuscript and search for data according to the existing method determined.

Dr. Nurmasari Situmeang as writer the second one directs writing as well as determine boundaries and doing data reduction as well correct diction, structure sentences, as well arrangement discussion For look for cohesiveness.

## REFERENCES

- Alfarizy, N. (2020, January 13). *Audition First VTuber Hololive Indonesia Officially Closed*. Retrieved from Newsletter Intention: <https://nawalakarsa.id/pop-kultur/audition-pertama-vtuber-hololive-indonesia-resmi-diklik/>
- Алок. (2023, March 7). *What happened to Hololive China? and where are they now?* Retrieved from YouTube: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=XdCVnvd4LBI>
- Calliope, m (2022, December 16). *[MV] Wanted, Wasted - Mori Calliope x Takuya Yamanaka (THE ORAL CIGARETTES)*. Retrieved from YouTube: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=XEHbF1PsLI4>
- Cover Corporation. (2023, October 26). *Hololive Alternatives*. Retrieved from Hololive Alternative: <https://alt.hololive.tv/en/>
- Cover Corporation. (2023, October 26). *Media Mix*. Retrieved from COVER: <https://cover-corp.com/en/business/mediamix>
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2016). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approach (Fifth Edition)*. Los Angeles, United States of America: SAGE Publications, Inc.
- España, M.D. (2003, July 31). *Definitions of Foreign Direct Investment (FDI): a methodological note*. Retrieved from BIS: <https://www.bis.org/publ/cgfs22bde3.pdf>
- Ekholm, K. (2007). EXPORT-PLATFORM FOREIGN DIRECT INVESTMENT. *Journal of the European Economics Association vol. 5 no. 4*, 776-795.
- Garena Free Fire Indonesia. (2023, October 8). *FFML SEASONS 8 GRAND FINALS*. Retrieved from YouTube: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=LLuBXHDUVDc>
- Gathika, G. (2023, October 20). **【3D SHOWCASE】BANG I SO 3D BAAAANGGG**. Retrieved from YouTube: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=r-yy2AiYQ68>
- Harding, D. (2023, February 9). *Hololive VTubers Mori Calliope, Gawr Gura, Sakura Miko Become Tokyo Tourism Ambassadors*. Retrieved from Crunchyroll: <https://www.crunchyroll.com/news/latest/2023/2/8/hololive-vtubers-mori-calliope-gawr-gura-sakura-miko-become-tokyo-tourism-ambassadors>
- Holoeath. (2023, October 2). *Holoeath*. Retrieved from Holoeath: <https://holoeath.com/en/>
- Hololive ID Official Instagram. (2023, October 10).  *viv:ID CRUISE*  Retrieved from Instagram: <https://www.instagram.com/p/CyNEUJSTWp/>
- Hololive Official Fanclub. (2022, December 7). **【ゲスト：デヴィ夫人】ホロライブのそれテストに出ますか？#10 【#ホロテス】**. Retrieved from Hololive Official Fanclub: <https://hololive->



- fc.com/video/smhmi6vTvAkAzvBMZoMyK4dA
- Hololive Official Fanclub. (2023, October 18). 【ゲスト：大橋彩香】ホロライブのそれテストに出ますか？ #19 【#ホロテス】. Retrieved from Hololive Official Fanclub: <https://hololive-fc.com/video/smpBHbASEjkrbPPJgqHqjPX>
- Hololive Production. (2021, September 1). *A Reports on Anti-Harassment Measures Taken on Behalf of Company Talents*. Retrieved from Hololive Pro: <https://hololive.hololivepro.com/en/news/20210901-1/>
- Hololive Production. (2023, October 26). *About*. Retrieved from Hololive Production: <https://hololivepro.com/en/about/>
- Hololive Production. (2023, October 26). *Events*. Retrieved from Hololivepro : <https://hololive.hololivepro.com/en/events/vivid-cruise/>
- Hololive Production. (2023, October 26). *Hololy*. Retrieved from Hololivepro : <https://hololive.hololivepro.com/en/special/2127/>
- Hololive Productions. (2023, October 26). *News*. Retrieved from Hololivepro : [https://hololivepro.com/news\\_en/20231026-cover-corp-announces-hakos-baelz-as-virtual-navigator-for-vrchat/](https://hololivepro.com/news_en/20231026-cover-corp-announces-hakos-baelz-as-virtual-navigator-for-vrchat/)
- Hololive Production. (2023, August 21). *Talents*. Retrieved from Hololive Production: <https://en.hololive.tv/member>
- Hololive Super Expo 2022. (2022, April 15). “*hololive 3rd fes. Link Your Wish Supported By Weiß Schwarz*” DAY2 Report. Retrieved from Hololive Super Expo 2022: <https://hololivesuperexpo.hololivepro.com/news/220415-enreport2/>
- hololive TODAY. (2023, September 19). *COVER Corp. Releases New Investor Relations Material; hololive production Introduces "Letters from Management"*. Retrieved from hololive TODAY: <https://hololivetoday.com/tech-list/cover-corp-releases-new-investor-relations-material-and-holopro-introduces-letters-from-management-note>
- Indonesia Comics Con. (2023, 26 October). *Bringing The Best Pop Culture Experience*. Retrieved from Indonesia Comic Con: <https://indonesiacomiccon.com/>
- JKT48. (2023, October 31). *JKT48V*. Retrieved from JKT48: <https://www.jkt48.com/jkt48v>
- Kanaeru , K. (2023, August 25). *Tomorrow Kobo perform in events PLN in YOGYAKARTA!!* □□□
- SEE YOU LATER AFTERNOON SLEMAN CITY!!* ~. Retrieved from X: <https://twitter.com/kobokanaeru/status/1695104493032206604>
- Lada, J. (2022, December 5). *Hololive and Nijisanji Team Up to Protect VTubers from Defamation*. Retrieved from SILICONERA: Hololive and Nijisanji Team Up to Protect VTubers from Defamation
- Mackay, H. (2004). the globalization of culture? In D. Held, A *Globalizing World? Culture, Economics, Politics* (pp. 44-81). London: Routledge.
- Maya Daughter. (2019, October 18). *Talking with Lady Ratna Sari Goddess, Indonesia First President, President Soekarno's Wife (Episode 81)*. Retrieved from YouTube: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=XRZEs8L0LFA>
- Morissy , K. (2020, October 29). *Virtual YouTuber Agency hololive to Disband hololive CN Group (Updated)*. Retrieved from Anime News Network: <https://www.animenewsnetwork.com/interest/2020-10-28/virtual-youtuber-agency-hololive-to-disband-hololive-cn-group/.165640>
- Pekora , U. (2022 , September 23 ).お出かけ】みんなでディズニー行ってきた!!!ペコ!【ホロライブ/兎田ペコら】. Retrieved from YouTube: <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=bFBdGow6kb0&t=0s>
- Daughter, m (2018, June 1). *Maya Daughter*. Retrieved from YouTube: <https://www.youtube.com/@MayaPutri/about>
- Subhanij , T., & et.al. (2016). Horizontal, Vertical And Conglomerate OFDI: Evidence From Thailand. *The Journal of Applied Business Research Volume 32, Number 3* , 747-764.
- Sutton, Q. A. (2021). *GENDERED RHETORIC OF VIDEOS GAMES STREAMING: FEMALE AGENCY, HARASSMENT AND PAINT GIRLS*. New York: University at Albany, State University of New York.
- Universal Music Japan. (2023, October 20). *Mori Calliope*. Retrieved from Universal Music Japan: <https://www.universal-music.co.jp/mori-calliope/>
- VTubers & Radio. (2023, October 20). *home*. Retrieved from YouTube: <https://www.youtube.com/@vr6843/featured>
- Zeta , V. (2023 , October 15 ). 【3D SHOWCASE】LET M.E INNEN !!!!!!!!!!!!! Retrieved from YouTube: [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6-PIITA\\_VWg](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=6-PIITA_VWg)
- Zheng, B. (2020, October 30). *STREAMERS, VIRTUAL NATIONALISTS AND SOFT POWER: CHINA VS. THE WORLD?* Retrieved from Baker Institute Blogs: Rice University's Baker Institute for Public Policy: <https://blog.bakerinstitute.org/2020/10/30/1245>