

EFL Learners' Views on Innovative Meaning-Making through Multimodal Composition: Affordances and Constraints

Fatma Rahayu Nita
Pusat Pengembangan Bahasa (P2B), UIN Sunan Ampel Surabaya
fatmarhy@gmail.com

Him'mawan Adi Nugroho
English Department, Universitas Negeri Surabaya
himmawannugroho@unesa.ac.id

Abstract

This current study explored the findings from the learners' views and experiences while creating a multimodal composition, particularly the affordances and the constraints. A qualitative analysis was used in this study as it analyzed the narratives of 15 (fifteen) learners who responded to an open-ended questionnaire. The findings reveal that most learners positively perceived the multimodal composition since they could learn differently, an innovative meaning-making. Second, several affordances of creating multimodal composition are learning through multimodal composition, innovative meaning-making, understanding the information easily, collaboration, and attracting the reader's attention. Apart from the affordances, the learners also encounter a few constraints: struggling with meaning-making, collaboration with peers, and putting the idea. Relatedly, the teachers could use these results as their reflection in utilizing multimodal composition in the class. First and foremost, multimodal composition offers a new perspective of innovation in ELT context which could be applied in teaching and learning process.

Keywords: Learners' views; Meaning-making; Multimodal composition; Affordances; Constraints

INTRODUCTION

In the present-day, English educators at every level have concerned with enhancing students' skills and knowledge to fulfill the framework set out by the Partnership for 21st Century Skills. Based on this framework, students are required to utilize English to express culture and concepts worldwide. Also, there are six essential foundations to drive 21st-century learning: (1) highlighting learning abilities (communication skills and

information), problem-solving skills and thinking, and self-direction skills and interpersonal, (2) applying 21st-century tools to advance learning abilities involving the utilization of communication technologies and information, (3) learning and teaching in a 21st-century context push the students to learn academic content through real-life applications and experiences (outside and inside the classroom), (4) learning and teaching 21st-century content involving

international consciousness, (5) economic, business citizenship literacy, and finance (6) applying 21st-century assessments that gauge 21st-century skills (Sakulprasertsri, 2020).

All those skills have been expanded in Indonesian universities refers to the regulation announced by the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia regarding higher education (*Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia*, 2020). It is stated in Permenristekdikti number 3, 4, 5, 6, and 7 of 2020 that students must master those six skills after graduation to meet the skills required in education in this 21st century. English is a compulsory subject for students from first grade to university level. It is a powerful tool in today's learning environment that aids students in sustaining with changing society, communicating in real-life conditions, and seeking information in the digital phase. Hence, there is a requirement to focus on pedagogical practices related to or associated with the practice of digital and multimodal literacy practices that can involve students as part of their lives (Yi, 2014).

A number of research have shed light on the process of meaning-making through several modes that could stimulate content learning for students (S. Grapin, 2019; S. E. Grapin & Llosa, 2020; Zheng et al., 2014). For instance, Smith et al. (2017) shed light on how three bilingual eighth graders use multiple languages and modalities when creating digital projects, a process known as multimodal code meshing. The subsequent previous study conducted by Lee et al. (2019) attempted to investigate a practice of creating a multimodal text. The interactive reading-writing process had a significant effect on project design with multimodal, which provides intertextuality amongst texts and improves the quality of the final project. Recently, Chen (2020) explored the results of students' involvement in compiling printed

essays and combining several modes to practice multimodal projects.

Aforementioned studies have taken into account the possibilities of multimodal writing for learning; there remains a scarcity of research evaluating students' perspectives when writing for academic objectives. Still, much of the early research is based on student products or case study methodologies, with one to three small groups of students generating one form of the digital product being followed (Smith, Pacheco, et al., 2021). An increasing number of academics suggest that digital technologies could be used as the diversity of the students to make meaning through the multimodal project (Yi et al., 2019). It is critical that student voices be enlarged to comprehend the affordances and constraints of creating multimodal products in the classroom since students are directly involved in the practice.

Therefore, this current study aims to explore EFL undergraduate students' views while creating multimodality projects in English classroom practice. The investigation of students' perception towards multimodal composition can aid in recognizing the benefits and its drawbacks so that it can make feasible suggestions for teachers. This study offers three research questions: (1) What are EFL learners' experiences and views on a multimodal composition?, (2) What affordances do EFL learners perceive when creating multimodal composition?, and (3) What constraints do EFL learners perceive when creating multimodal composition?

This research is based on the point of view of social semiotics multimodality, which highlights how several modes, for example, are not limited to sound, text, movement, and visual (Kress, 2010). Those are essential components of communication. Meaning arises from complex connections between diverse modes, and the different

layers produce synergistic messages that cannot be communicated by a single-mode alone (Jewitt, 2009). Mode denotes an arrangement of culturally and socially constructed sources for meaning-making. Due to these extended communicative options, multimodality reverses semiotic power that enables composers to reveal themselves, which is not offered by written texts (Cimasko & Shin, 2017). Additionally, the process of transformation and transmediation of meaning across numerous modes provides significant opportunities for multilingual students to express their linguistic identities and culture (Ajayi, 2015).

Based on New London Groups (1996), multimodal denotes combining several modes into a single arrangement. In this recent study, students need to employ words, images, tables, infographics, or mind maps and express the multimodal results in a poster as they create as creatively as possible. Thus, multimodal composing is utilized interchangeably by combining several modes (Smith, 2017). Multimodality study has studied how young people employ the affordances of specific modes (visual and sound) in digital products (Dalton et al., 2015). Besides, adolescents validate and reveal various modes of communication (Kress, 2010). For instance, a study has shown that several students elucidate the affordability of nonlinguistic modes to convey abstract concepts or emotions (de los Ríos, 2018) while other learners tend to use the linearity and stability of writing to share ideas (Smith, 2017). This affordability is unique to each person and varies depending on their circumstances.

Literacy academics are concerned about the potentials of semiotics as youth draw on the meaning-making resources accessible by digital technologies to enlarge the social world over traditional borders (Kim, 2016). In such a case, there is an effort that teachers employ multimodal

composition to make meaning-making innovative. Multimodal has enabled students to reveal themselves creatively. However, it was found that students' multimodal results are likely to show interactive and visual elements, but it is less clear and convincing arguments to display in their print-based compositions. In the digital phase, recognizing how to take advantage of new technological tools is inadequate. As stated by Walsh (2010), students must take into consideration the purpose of writing and its audience and use the most appropriate tools and media for writing. Carrying out a multimodal product on a similar topic enables the students to attempt how best to express the message.

The perceived affordability of students of distinct kinds of compositions has been cooperatively examined by Alexander et al. (2012). The respondents were requested to create a place or activity, a profile of a person, and then produce two essays, printed and multimodal, on the equivalent theme. A vivid direction guides students to write an explicit thesis and cautiously edit their two essay types. The findings reveal that the affordances while employing multimodal composition involve layering (the utilization of several modes to make an argument), implicit persuasion in which displaying rather than telling directly, and a more accurate sense of addressees and more creativity and affective attraction to involve the viewers (Blevins, 2018).

Much research delved into students' perspectives on digital multimodal composition and revealed that students positively perceive creative freedom in cooperating through various modes (Henry, 2018). This study shows how multimodal composition provides students numerous entry points to express, negotiate, and assert their identity (Smith, Pacheco, et al., 2021). Students pointed out the typical semiotic resources of nonlinguistic modes to support

their comprehending innovative meaning-making and its content. Most of the students designated how collaborating through several modes offered significant opportunities to convey their identity and sightsee the affective proportions of English Arts content. In addition, students elucidated how the process of multimodal composing nurtures peer collaboration and creates meaningful relationships with other works. Moreover, students also defined various challenges when scheming the digital projects, involving the hesitation of potentials, technical problems, and adequately exploring their thoughts in a multimodal way.

LITERATURE REVIEW

This research is based on the point of view of social semiotics multimodality, which highlights how several modes, for example, are not limited to sound, text, movement, and visual (Kress, 2010). Those are essential components of communication. Meaning arises from complex connections between diverse modes, and the different layers produce synergistic messages that cannot be communicated by a single-mode alone (Jewitt, 2009). Mode denotes an arrangement of culturally and socially constructed sources for meaning-making. Due to these extended communicative options, multimodality reverses semiotic power that enables composers to reveal themselves, which is not offered by written texts (Cimasko & Shin, 2017). Additionally, the process of transformation and trans mediation of meaning across numerous modes provides significant opportunities for multilingual students to express their linguistic identities and culture (Ajayi, 2015).

Based on New London Groups (1996), multimodal denotes combining several modes into a single arrangement. In this recent study, students need to employ words, images, tables, infographics, or mind maps and express the multimodal results in a

poster as they create as creatively as possible. Thus, multimodal composing is utilized interchangeably by combining several modes (Smith, 2017). Multimodality study has studied how young people employ the affordances of specific modes (visual and sound) in digital products (Dalton et al., 2015). Besides, adolescents validate and reveal various modes of communication (Kress, 2010). For instance, a study has shown that several students elucidate the affordability of nonlinguistic modes to convey abstract concepts or emotions (de los Ríos, 2018) while other learners tend to use the linearity and stability of writing to share ideas (Smith, 2017). This affordability is unique to each person and varies depending on their circumstances.

Literacy academics are concerned about the potentials of semiotics as youth draw on the meaning-making resources accessible by digital technologies to enlarge the social world over traditional borders (Kim, 2016). In such a case, there is an effort that teachers employ multimodal composition to make meaning-making innovative. Multimodal has enabled students to reveal themselves creatively. However, it was found that students' multimodal results are likely to show interactive and visual elements, but it is less clear and convincing arguments to display in their print-based compositions. In the digital phase, recognizing how to take advantage of new technological tools is inadequate. As stated by Walsh (2010), students must take into consideration the purpose of writing and its audience and use the most appropriate tools and media for writing. Carrying out a multimodal product on a similar topic enables the students to attempt how best to express the message.

The perceived affordability of students of distinct kinds of compositions has been cooperatively examined by Alexander et al. (2012). The respondents were requested to create a place or activity, a profile of a

person, and then produce two essays, printed and multimodal, on the equivalent theme. A vivid direction guides students to write an explicit thesis and cautiously edit their two essay types. The findings reveal that the affordances while employing multimodal composition involve layering (the utilization of several modes to make an argument), implicit persuasion in which displaying rather than telling directly, and a more accurate sense of addressees and more creativity and affective attraction to involve the viewers (Blevins, 2018).

Much research delved into students' perspectives on digital multimodal composition and revealed that students positively perceive creative freedom in cooperating through various modes (Henry, 2018). This study shows how multimodal composition provides students numerous entry points to express, negotiate, and assert their identity (Smith, Pacheco, et al., 2021). Students pointed out the typical semiotic resources of nonlinguistic modes to support their comprehending innovative meaning-making and its content. Most of the students designated how collaborating through several modes offered significant opportunities to convey their identity and sightsee the affective proportions of English Arts content. In addition, students elucidated how the process of multimodal composing nurtures peer collaboration and creates meaningful relationships with other works. Moreover, students also defined various challenges when scheming the digital projects, involving the hesitation of potentials, technical problems, and adequately exploring their thoughts in a multimodal way.

METHODOLOGY

The Setting and Participants

This recent study was conducted in a Western and Cultural Society class of Mrs. Aisha (all names are pseudonyms), a lecturer in one of the state universities in Surabaya. A

total of 13 (thirteen) females and 2 (two) males majoring in English Literature took place in the fifth semester of the school year. This course focuses on some of the West's central cultural and national identity aspects, examining them critically. Categories such as gender, ethnicity, and class are introduced and explored in the context of British and American culture and society. Each academic semester lasts 16 weeks. The students are all native speakers learning English as a foreign language. Before the study was conducted, each participant and the teacher agreed to participate.

Illustration of Multimodal Composition Task

Mrs. Aisha as the lecturer of Western and Society Culture class, focused on developing digital literacy by employing multimodal composition as their assignment. Initially, the students watched the videos on The Black Death and Covid-19. After having an idea of the topic, the students are asked to do the assignment with a classmate. The instruction of assignment has two phases:

- 1) Summarize the similarities and differences between two pandemics (it can use a mind map, table, infographics, or any other visualization. Be creative!)
- 2) Reflect on the history of the Black Death and its impact on society. What do we learn from this and what do you think you (as an Indonesian) need to do to help protect yourself and the community?

At the time the research was conducted, we were still living amidst a worldwide pandemic. Thus, Mrs. Aisha employed the topic of Covid-19 to be explored in the multimodal composition task. Under that topic, the students were required to work in pairs to create a poster that included images and words. The poster

should consist of the content related to the videos on The Black Death and Covid-19. Another mode to be employed in the poster is an image or infographic. This assignment was given during the fourth and fifth weeks so that they had two weeks to finish the project.

Data Collection

There are 17 (Seventeen) students in the class, but only 15 (Fifteen) students submitted the assignments since the rest are assigned to another campus program. The task is done in the fourth and fifth weeks of class. The data was obtained through an open-ended questionnaire made from the google form. Then, it selected certain students to be interviewed to dig for more profound information about their experiences while working on the multimodal composition.

This qualitative study obtained data on EFL students' views on their experiences with digital multimodal composition tasks. They were asked their ideas related to the assignment given by the lecturer. The example of questions involve: (1) How long did you work on the multimodal composition?, (2) How did you create the content and design the multimodal composition?, (3) What do you think of the multimodal composition given by the lecturer?, (4) What are the benefits of creating multimodal composition?, and (5) What are the challenges while creating multimodal composition?

Data Analysis

A total of 15 (fifteen) responses were obtained from an open-ended questionnaire for further analysis. This recent study employed a grounded theory approach by Strauss & Corbin (1988, as cited in Smith, et al. 2021). It consists of three stages of data analysis. First is coding all the answers from the student's perspective. This phase

identifies names and categorizes the dissimilar points of the experiences while creating a multimodal composition. The second stage concerns filtering the code initially established through reflection by utilizing it in student interviews. The last stage of analysis rolled back all data to perform selective coding. The purpose of this concerned analysis was to confirm whether the overall sorts were sufficiently abstract to summarize students' views for distinctions in experiences, digital projects, and composers.

RESULT

EFL learners' experiences and views on a multimodal composition

Related to the learners' experiences in creating multimodal composition, it emerged two themes: collaboration and innovating meaning-making. The first theme in creating multimodal composition is collaboration.

I divided the tasks with my other friend, so I prepared the content and she was the one who designed the poster (Student 3)

All of the students made the multimodal composition in collaboration since the assignment should be done in pairs, and they considered that if a person did it, it would be hard and take too much time. Therefore, in this assignment, they experience working collaboratively and cooperatively. After dividing the job description into each individual, the students began to work on the multimodal assignment by combining several modes and designing the products.

I match the design/picture/symbols with the content. The topics are about black death and covid, so that we put some picture/animation related to the topic (Student 4)

To create the content, we have to read and understand what actually the main paragraph and information are. After finding them, we make the template for the poster, then put the the main paragraph and information. We can add some elements to support our poster and to increase the interesting point. Don't forget to use the proper color in order that our poster doesn't seem cringe. To design the poster, I use Canva app because there are many templates provided to be the example of our poster (Student 14)

Student 14 elucidated how their group worked with the content and the design. In the process of creating the content, they must read and comprehend the issue that is being addressed. After that, they focused on the design. They put some modes to support their product and to attract their readers. In such a way, they were in the process of creating meaning-making through multimodal composition.

Across the learners' views on multimodal composition, most of them perceived the positive perceptions of it. From the data gained through the questionnaire, two themes appeared for their opinions on multimodal compositions: positive perception and neutral perceptions. None of them offers negative perceptions towards the assignment of multimodal perception. Many learners saw multimodal composition as interesting, fun, and challenging. They believed that through multimodal composition, they got several insights and knowledge. The extracts from the students could be seen as follows:

Interesting and challenging (Student 1)

It's fun and challenging (Student 5)

It's fun to do, and it gives me more insight about the plague (Student 9)

Apart from their delightful feeling when creating multimodal assignments, they could learn innovative meaning-making through multimodal composition. Several students expressed their positive perceptions regarding combining text and design. They got a new way of learning so that they could think differently. Thus far, they learn English through text only, but when the teachers provide a new multimodal composition approach. It gained their interest in learning something new in the EFL context. The proofs are provided below:

I think it's great because we are starting to inform our audience in a different way. Usually, it's all about text. People think that language solely concern towards text only, but that's not it. In reality, visual images are crucial, it catches audience's attention more. Thus, I would say that giving students multimodal assignment is a great idea (Student 8).

To be honest, actually the assignment was group, then I and my friend decided the assignments. I had the job to search the reflection, then my friend made the poster but I had ever done poster assignment as well. I think multimodal assignment given by the lecturer is really quite challenging because we have to summarize the information given into only some sentences, then we have to think what colors we need to be in the poster, we also need to place the sentence into the correct order, and many more (Student 14).

As stated by student 8, it is great to have a multimodal assignment in their class since they could inform the readers in a different way. They require to put much effort into

combining the text and the visual images. Meanwhile, student 14 has a similar idea that the multimodal assignment given by the lecturer was quite challenging since it needs to summarize the information and think about the modes such as color, layout, layering, etc. Not only learn in a different way, a few students also demonstrated that the assignment given by the lecturer assists them to understand history since the topic given in multimodal composition is about the history of the Black Death and its impact on society. Therefore, the student could identify people's perspective in the middle and modern era towards the pandemic that happened during this day.

I love how the assignment is related to history. Through the assignment, I can identify the perspective of people in middle age era and modern people in how they react to pandemic that kill so many of population. Moreover, this assignment helps students to practice critical thinking skills (Student 15)

Two highlighted points were conveyed by student 15, she uttered that the assignment was related to meaning-making, and it denoted to the history that happened several years ago. Thus, she could learn history through the multimodal assignment. Besides, the students could enhance their critical thinking skills since it pushed them to create a creative poster that attracts the readers. In this case, the critical skill is crucial in producing the product.

From the data, it could be seen that the students perceived positive perceptions towards the multimodal composition. Firstly, the assignment is interesting, fun, and challenging. Secondly, the multimodal composition teaches the students innovative meaning-making since it works with the text

and the several modes involved in the product. Thirdly, the students could also learn history since the topic given by the lecturer are related to the history of the Black Death and its impact on society. It compared between the pandemic that happened several years ago and nowadays. Thus, it discovered that multimodal composition should be maintained in EFL class as their assignment to enhance their critical skills since it positively gained positive perceptions by the students.

Affordances of creating a multimodal composition

From the data obtained through the questionnaire, five main themes arose for the affordances of creating a multimodal composition, involving learning through multimodal composition, innovative meaning-making, understanding the information easily through multimodal composition, collaboration, and attracting the reader's attention through multimodal composition. In this section, each theme is offered in descending order of prevalence. It aims to recognize learners' the depth and breadth of learners' perspectives by presenting the total number and percentage of each theme and various learners' citations from the questionnaire explaining each theme.

Learning through multimodal composition

Many students (33%) described how lettering in various modes assisted them in learning in different ways. By presenting their thoughts through text, visuals, and media, learners had confidence that they obtained a deep understanding of content and could intellectualize their ideas. Also, several learners defined how they learned the utilization of texts and how to interpret through the preparation of the multimodal assignment. A number of learners explained how visuals and text function as communicative messages to advance their thoughts. Thus, multimodal composition allows the learners to learn visual communication:

It helps us to learn visual communication. Again, by learning multimodal we no longer rely on texts only in communicating message, instead, we start to pay attention to the visual elements as well (Student 8)

As student 8, she said that multimodal composition assisted in learning visual communication through various modes. Through multimodal composition, the students no longer rely on texts only but could communicate through visual elements. Many students described that multimodal writing involved closer reading of the text to comprehend an idea to represent it multimodally completely. Therefore, through multimodal composition, the learners learn in a different way.

Innovative meaning-making through multimodal composition

A number of students (33%) elucidated that multimodal composition made them think differently. Through the potentials for meaning-making, learners compliantly employ unique visuals and texts to convey themselves creatively. In this case, they have the freedom to select several modes and layers to create a new opportunity to explore themselves. The data gained from an open-ended questionnaire revealed that the learners could explore their product as creatively as possible. Learners who explore those particular modes are purposely designated, joint, and reproduced for unique aims.

Help to hone our creativity and teaches us to sort out the information that is important to include in the poster (Student 11)

As stated by Student 11, the multimodal composition assisted them in thinking creatively since it should combine several modes in a product. Simultaneously, the learners should be able to sort out the information and make it as concise as possible. Thus, it requires a creativity skill while doing the multimodal composition. Below is the example of a multimodal composition that reveals students' creativity.



FIGURE 1. Student's Results of Multimodal Composition)

Understanding the information better through multimodal composition

A few students (13%) expressed that multimodal composition allowed them to learn and understand better since they needed to put the most important thing in the poster. Besides, the students must select the appropriate texts

that should be included in the product. Thus, feedback one to another so that the results some students stated that they must comprehend should be good and interesting. the information deeply to create a multimodal composition:

As someone who prepared the content, I think I understand it better since I need to only put the most important piece of information since the poster has limited space. Different with summary in which I can still kind of see the source and paraphrase it. I need to understand the whole point and make it as concise as possible (Student 3).

Words are stronger when they are added with pictures/symbol and it makes the reader easy to grab the meaning (Student 4)

As data above, the learners clearly stated that they need to comprehend the information better to make the multimodal composition. In such a case, they could learn more and recognize each sentence put in the product. Not only dealing with the most important thing, but the learners should also be able to combine the words and various modes employed in the multimodal composition. Therefore, creating multimodal composition allows the learners to better understand the information that should emerge in the product.

Collaboration through multimodal composition

Not many students (13%) also demonstrated that multimodal composition gave them a new chance to learn and collaborate with their friends. In the process of the creating the multimodal composition, the learners worked together and gave

The efficiency of the time, team-work, and learn how to combine the color and the design of infographic (Student 6)

We discussed the content and the design through google meet. In the discussion, we decide the format and the theme we want. Also, We use our Canva account and choose the format of our poster. After that, we decide to divide the task, since the task is about comparison of Covid-19 pandemic and Black Death pandemic (Student 14).

As stated by Student 6, she or he said that multimodal composition allows them to work in a team so that it does not consume much time to create a multimodal composition. Meanwhile, Student 14 expressed that they discussed how to process the multimodal composition. Initially, they decided on the format and the theme. After that, they started to select the application used to make the product. Finally, they divide the task based on their interest and skills. From this, they could work together and collaborate with their classmates in which it assisted them to comprehend the content and the theme better and examine the assignment better.

Attracting the reader's attention through Multimodal Composition

Several students (20%) revealed that multimodal composition could help the readers understand the information better. Nowadays, it is not new that the information is delivered through multiple modes, including text, image, audio, etc. Readers will easily understand the

contents since the learners have summarized the information from several sources and put by the learners is struggling with meaning-making. It denotes the way the learners make meaning through multimodal composition. They should be able to arrange and combine several modes into meaning. In this case, most of the learners (53%) described how they had difficulty combining every single mode to create an innovative meaning-making. Student 4 explained below:

The multimodal is really important in delivering information in order that the reader will not get bored and tired when they see our poster, the information also should easily come to the reader, it is also help the reader to see which one the main information of the source is and many more (Student 14)

The last affordance of creating multimodal composition allows the readers to grasp the information easily. As it provides the words and the image involved in it, the readers are more interested in understanding the content and reading the information. Therefore, through multimodal composition, the learners could attract the readers' attention to read the information in the product.

Constraints of creating a multimodal composition

After deliberating the affordances of creating a multimodal composition, the learners expressed the constraints they faced. In such a case, three main themes appeared for the limitations of creating a multimodal composition, involving struggling with meaning-making, collaboration with peers, and putting the idea. In this section, each theme is offered in descending order of prevalence. It aims to recognize learners' depth and breadth of learners' perspectives by presenting the total number and percentage of each theme and various learners' citations from the questionnaire explaining each theme.

Struggling with meaning-making

The most common constraint faced by the learners is struggling with meaning-making. It denotes the way the learners make meaning through multimodal composition. They should be able to arrange and combine several modes into meaning. In this case, most of the learners (53%) described how they had difficulty combining every single mode to create an innovative meaning-making. Student 4 explained below:

We have to make sure that the topic given and the symbol/picture/sign we choose match. Every single element could deliver different meaning. Once we choose unrelated symbol, it could lead the readers to misinterpreting the message (Student 4).

The challenges to create multimodal assignment are that there are a lot of aspects to be considered, like the maximal sentences, the elements to support the text, the colors of the poster, the main information, the relation between the topic and the supporting elements (like picture, gif, sticker, etc) and many more. Deciding those aspects are challenging for me (Student 14).

Student 4 shared that it is hard to make sure that the topic put in the multimodal composition match with the modes, such as symbol, picture, and sign. It should sync between the topic and the modes. In this case, learners revealed that they were struggling in creating meaning-making. If the learners combine inappropriate modes, it would lead to misunderstanding for the readers. Similarly, student 14 showed that one of the challenges to creating multimodal composition is several aspects should be considered, involving texts, images, colors, layout, and another mode. Therefore, the learners encountered little

difficulty in creating meaning-making in multimodal composition.

Collaboration with peers

Another constraint is a collaboration with peers. Some of them revealed that collaboration is their affordances in creating a multimodal composition. However, a few students (27%) also described that they had difficulty collaborating with their peers. The responses from the students are provided as follows:

To be honest, the fact that it is a partner-based assignment makes it tough because each person has different visual style and taste, so combining them does look odd (Student 8).

Both I and my friend focus on Kampus Mengajar. Sometimes it is difficult to find the right time to discuss the assignment (Student 15)

It was shared by Student 8 that she or he encountered difficulty in matching the idea with their peers since they have a different perspective, visual style, and taste. In this case, they should deal with putting it all together to cohere the idea into the multimodal composition. Likewise, Student 15 expressed that it is hard to discuss with peers due to time constraints. In this case, a few students had a problem collaborating with peers since they require to work together and put their idea together into one project. Besides, finding an adequate time to discuss is slightly difficult for some of them. Actually, teamwork requires communicating with each other and cohere their idea so that it would be easier to finish the project.

Understanding the materials

Apart from struggling with meaning-making and collaboration with peers, understanding

the materials is also considered the constrain in creating a multimodal composition. Not many of the students (20%) elucidated that they have a problem understanding the materials. It is a little bit confusing to look for the information related to the topic. The extracts could be seen as follows:

Because I'm not from the linguistics fields, I feel a little bit confused at the beginning but all is well (Student 2)

Finally, a few students explained that they had difficulty comprehending the materials. Student 2 does not have linguistics background, so it feels hard to finish the project in which the multimodal is closely related to the linguistics field. Meanwhile, student 7 stated that it is hard to understand the materials, so that it takes too much time to finish the project. However, it is such collaborative work to collaborate to complete the project.

DISCUSSION

Connecting to the findings of the previous studies presented in the literature review, this current study distinguishes three points that are fascinating to deliberate: EFL learners' experiences and views on a multimodal composition, affordances of creating a multimodal composition, and constraints of creating a multimodal composition. From the obtained through an open-ended questionnaire, the learners perceived positive perceptions towards the multimodal composition. This finding is in line with the previous study done by Smith, Amgott, et al. (2021) and (Smith, Pacheco, et al. (2021) that the learners showed positive views when creating a multimodal composition. Firstly, the assignment is interesting, fun, and challenging. Secondly, the multimodal composition teaches the students innovative

meaning-making since it works with the text and the several modes involved in the product (Leeuwen, 2004). Thirdly, the students could also learn the history since the topic given by the lecturer are related to the history of the Black Death and its impact on society. It compared between the pandemic that happened some years ago and nowadays. Thus, it discovered that multimodal composition should be maintained in EFL class as their assignment to enhance their critical skills since it positively gained positive perceptions by the students (Deroo & Ponzio, 2021; Hellmich et al., 2021; Smith, Pacheco, et al., 2021).

The second point is related to the affordances of creating a multimodal composition. This recent study found five main themes arose for the affordances of creating a multimodal composition, including learning through multimodal composition, innovative meaning-making, understanding the information easily through multimodal composition, collaboration, and attracting the reader's attention through multimodal composition. These findings correlate with the previous study by Smith, Amgott, et al. (2021) that creating multimodal composition assisted the students to "learn" differently. By presenting their thoughts through text, sound, movement, and visuals, learners expressed that they are obtaining an in-depth comprehending of content and can intellectualize their notions. Besides, it confirmed that the learners could learn through multimodal composition since it is an innovative meaning-making outside word (Deroo & Ponzio, 2021). The study's finding confirmed that through the potentials for meaning-making, learners obediently utilize unique visuals and texts to convey themselves creatively. In this case, multimodal composition enhances the students to become creative (Setiawati et al., 2021). In terms of understanding the information better, it relates to the previous

study done by Chen (2020). The learners felt that the students could understand and express their thoughts better through multimodal composition since it offers more visualization. Also, the result of the study showed that attracting the reader's attention through multimodal composition is one of the affordances in creating multimodal composition. It is emphasized that the multimodal composition also makes the students are extremely easy to share both in and out of the classroom, giving students the opportunity to write for the readers outside of their teachers (Nash, 2018).

The last point deals with the constraints of creating a multimodal composition. After deliberating the affordances of creating a multimodal composition, the learners expressed the constraints they encountered. In such a case, three main themes appeared for the limitations of creating multimodal composition: struggling with meaning-making, collaboration with peers, and putting the idea. Similarly, the previous study by Smith, Amgott, et al. (2021) revealed that the students also had difficulty dealing with time management to finish the project. Some of them expressed that it takes much time to create a multimodal composition. Besides, it explained that the learners had a problem putting the several modes into a coherent project since it was done through collaborative work. The learners need to combine their idea to make the projects better.

CONCLUSION

From the study results, three ideas can be emphasized based on research questions. First, the learners positively perceived the multimodal composition since it deals with meaning-making in which it is interesting, challenging, learning something new in a different way. Second, it concerns the affordances of creating a multimodal

composition, such as learning through multimodal composition, innovative meaning-making, understanding the information easily through multimodal composition, collaboration, and attracting the reader's attention. The last point deals with the constraints of creating a multimodal composition. It discovered three main themes that appeared for the limitations of making a multimodal composition: struggling with meaning-making, collaboration with peers, and putting the idea.

Most importantly, multimodal composition offers a new perspective of innovation in the ELT context. In this case, the students could learn innovative meaning-making to enhance their critical and creative skills. This recent study could be valuable for educational practitioners to acquaint themselves with multimodal composition as an innovative teaching method in higher education. Therefore, this research can provide a wake-up call for the government to promote multimodality in higher education due to its many advantages in line with learning in the 21st century. Through this study, the educators could find ways to prepare learners for the constraints they encounter while creating a multimodal composition.

REFERENCES

- Ajayi, L. (2015). Critical multimodal literacy: How Nigerian female students critique texts and reconstruct unequal social structures. *Journal of Literacy Research*, 47(2), 216–244. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1086296X15618478>
- Alexander, K. P., Powell, B., & Borton, S. C. (2012). Understanding modal affordances: Student perceptions of potentials and limitations in multimodal composition. *Basic Writing E- Journal*, 1–37.
- Blevins, B. (2018). Teaching digital literacy composing concepts: Focusing on the layers of augmented reality in an era of changing technology. *Computers and Composition*, 50, 21–38. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compcom.2018.07.003>
- Chen, C. W. yu. (2020). Composing print essays versus composing across modes: Students' multimodal choices and overall preferences. *Literacy*, 55(1), 25–38. <https://doi.org/10.1111/lit.12234>
- Cimasko, T., & Shin, D. S. (2017). Multimodal resemiotization and authorial agency in an L2 writing classroom. *Written Communication*, 34(4), 387–413. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0741088317727246>
- Dalton, B., Robinson, K. H., Lovvorn, J. F., Smith, B. E., Alvey, T., Mo, E., Uccelli, P., & Proctor, C. P. (2015). Fifth-grade students' digital retellings and the Common Core: Modal use and design intentionality. *The Elementary School Journal*, 115(4), 548–569.
- de los Ríos, C. V. (2018). Toward a corridista consciousness: Learning from one transnational youth's critical reading, writing, and performance of Mexican corridos. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 53(4), 455–471. <https://doi.org/10.1002/rrq.210>
- Deroo, M. R., & Ponzio, C. M. (2021). Fostering pre-service teachers' critical multilingual language awareness: Use of multimodal compositions to confront hegemonic language ideologies. *Journal of Language, Identity and Education*, 00(00), 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15348458.2020.1863153>
- Grapin, S. (2019). Multimodality in the new content standards era: Implications for

- English learners. *TESOL Quarterly*, 53(1), Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia. 30–55. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.443> (2020). Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia: Jakarta.
- Grabin, S. E., & Llosa, L. (2020). Journal of second language writing toward an integrative framework for understanding multimodal L2 writing in the content areas. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jslw.2020.100711>
- Group, N. L. (1996). A pedagogy of multiliteracies: Designing social futures. *Harvard Educational Review*, 66, 60–93.
- Hellmich, E., Castek, J., Smith, B. E., Floyd, R., & Wen, W. (2021). Student perspectives on multimodal composing in the L2 classroom: tensions with audience, media, learning and sharing. *English Teaching*, 20(2), 210–226. <https://doi.org/10.1108/ETPC-07-2020-0082>
- Henry, A. (2018). Online media creation and L2 motivation: A socially situated perspective. *TESOL Quarterly*, 53(2), 372–404. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.485>
- Jewitt, C. (2009). An introduction to multimodality. In *The Routledge Handbook of Multimodal Analysis* (pp. 14–27). Routledge/Taylor & Francis Group.
- Kim, G. M. H. (2016). Transcultural digital literacies: Cross-border connections and self-representations in an online forum. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 51(2), 199–219. <https://doi.org/10.1002/rrq.131>
- Kress, G. (2010). *Multimodality: A social semiotic approach to contemporary communication*. Routledge.
- Leeuwen, T. van. (2004). *Introducing social semiotics: An introductory textbook*. London: Routledge.
- Nash, B. (2018). Exploring multimodal writing in secondary English classrooms: A literature review. *English Teaching: Practice & Critique*, 17(4), 342–356. <https://doi.org/10.1108/ETPC-01-2018-0012>
- Sakulprasertsri, K. (2020). Teachers' integration of multimodality into 21st Century EFL classrooms in Thailand: Practice and perception. *LEARN Journal: Language Education and Acquisition Research Network*, 13(2), 225–242.
- Setiawati, D., Purnawarman, P., & Sukyadi, D. (2021). Promoting students' critical thinking through multimodal digital classroom assessments (MDCAs) in online learning. *ACM International Conference Proceeding Series*, 75–81. <https://doi.org/10.1145/3468978.3468991>
- Smith, B. E. (2017). Composing across modes: A comparative analysis of adolescents' multimodal composing processes. *Learning, Media and Technology*, 42(3), 259–278. <https://doi.org/10.1080/17439884.2016.1182924>
- Smith, B. E., Amgott, N., & Malova, I. (2021). “It made me think in a different way”: Bilingual students' perspectives on multimodal composing in the English language arts classroom. *TESOL Quarterly*, 0(0), 1–27. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.3064>
- Smith, B. E., Pacheco, M. B., & de Almeida, C. R. (2017). Multimodal codemeshing: Bilingual adolescents' processes composing across modes and languages. *Journal of Second Language Writing*, 36(May 2016), 6–22. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jslw.2017.04.001>

- Smith, B. E., Pacheco, M. B., & Khorosheva, M. (2021). Emergent bilingual students and digital multimodal composition: A systematic review of research in secondary classrooms. *Reading Research Quarterly*, 56(1), 33–52. <https://doi.org/10.1002/rrq.298>
- Walsh, M. (2010). Multimodal literacy: What does it mean for classroom practice? *Australian Journal of Language and Literacy*, 33(3), 211–239.
- Yi, Y. (2014). Possibilities and challenges of multimodal literacy practices in teaching and learning English as an additional language. *Linguistics and Language Compass*, 8(4), 158–169. <https://doi.org/10.1111/lnc3.12076>
- Yi, Y., Shin, D., & Cimasko, T. (2019). Multimodal literacies in teaching and learning English in and outside of school. In *The Handbook of TESOL in K-12* (pp. 163–177). Chichester, UK: John Wiley & Sons. <https://doi.org/10.1002/9781119421702.ch11>
- Zheng, B., Warschauer, M., Hwang, J. K., & Collins, P. (2014). Laptop use, interactive science software, and science learning among at-risk students. *Journal of Science Education and Technology*, 23(4), 591–603. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10956-014-9489-5>