Meaning Reconstruction in Fairy Tales Across Eras: An Intertextual Study on A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast

Muhammad Fa’iz Jilan*, Rahayu Puji Haryati
Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia
*Email: muhammadfaizjilan@students.unnes.ac.id

Abstract

Intertextuality is a study that observes the relation and connection that text has with other texts. By looking at intertextuality, it can be seen how one text can have resemblances to another text, whether that resemblance is intentional or not. This study uses a story by Andrzej Sapkowski, titled A Grain of Truth as the material object of the study. It tells the story of a cursed human with a monstrous body who desires to find love to be human again. This research uses qualitative research methods, and the data were analyzed using intertextuality theory to answer the research questions. This paper aims at finding out the intertextuality connection between A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast, through their resemblances in theme and due to the sociocultural environment around the stories. The result shows that there are resemblances in terms of theme, characterization, and symbols in the story. This is related to the collective unconsciousness about the perception of love and curse in fantasy.

Keywords: intertextuality, collective unconscious, The Witcher, Andrzej Sapkowski

INTRODUCTION

The Witcher is the title of a fantasy series written by a Poland writer, Andrzej Sapkowski. This series consists of a compilation of short stories and novels that correlate to each other. They are popular fantasy books in Poland, but not until they got adapted into video games and drama television series that they became popularized across the globe. These adaptations, however, are not the only reason why The Witcher stories can gain such a massive followers (The Witcher has been present and favored in Polish culture for nearly thirty years). Even, they, as literary works, have emerged in numerous discussions in the Polish literature academic field, such as the ideas of feminism, racism, and as well as linguistics (Roszczynialska, 2009). One example of can be seen in the first short story beginning this series, titled “Wiedźmin” (1990) which carries a concept from a Polish fairy tale where a princess is turned into a monster because of the taboo her parents committed. Anna Michalska describes that the way Sapkowski constructed these stories is he rewrote fairy tales like Sleeping Beauty and Snow White and changed them to anti-fairy tales fitting with his gore universe (Michalska, 2020). However, rewriting fairy tales and subverting their elements has also been done in many other series or media.

This paper attempts to look further into the nature of this change, to see the correlation between the fairy tales and their elements, and how it is connected to its form in The Witcher. It has decided to pick “A Grain of Truth” as the focus of this research. A Grain of Truth is a story about the meeting of a monster slayer and a monster. The monster slayer, a witcher, is the main protagonist of the entire series, Geralt of Rivia. The monster he should face is Nivellen, a man cursed into a monster because of his horrible wrongdoings in the past. Their meeting leads to a calm dinner in which Nivellen tells Geralt his life story. Nivellen once believes that love can cure his curse and turn him back into a human. That premise of A Grain of Truth alone speaks of how it has traces to elements or tropes that Beauty and the Beast has. Beauty and the Beast popularized the trope in a classic romantical genre that true love can cure the curse. A Grain of Truth makes use of that trope to question the truthfulness that is often covered by the fantasy, enabling A Grain of Truth to manage to diversify and stray from the elements it brought from Beauty and the Beast.

Through the similarity of A Grain of Truth with Beauty and the Beast, it can be said that there is a close tie between them. The relationship that they form refers to a literary theory called intertextuality. Intertextuality is a theory coined by Julia Kristeva that states the interconnection between one text to another can create a meaning, as no text can stand on its own, each text depends on, absorbs, or is influenced by the text prior to it (Kristeva, 1980).
Julia Kristeva also states that intertextuality replaces the notion of intersubjectivity (Kristeva, 1980). This theory mentions that a text has a connection through another text which can be caused by an inadvertent factor. As long as the readers perceive the similarity or dissimilarity that correlates with one another, intertextuality can be established. This is why this study also refers to Carl Jung’s idea of collective unconsciousness. This theory supports the reason behind any similar themes that often occur in mythologies around the globe.

Through Kristeva’s intertextuality approach, this study attempts to examine the aspects that connect A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast. It believes that discussing these two stories can bring forth a discussion regarding intertextuality and how it applies to contemporary works and also bring the reasoning that may cause it, as inadvertent factors such as intersubjectivity might come into place in the connection between them.

This study, using an intertextuality approach, is expected to reveal similar aspects between A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast. This study also explores the reasoning behind the connection between them and the factors that influence further differentiates A Grain of Truth from another story that is unique to its own.

**METHODS**

In conducting this study, a qualitative method was used. Here, the data can be taken from the researcher’s environment, and the data are analyzed based on a certain theme, and the researcher interprets based on the meaning of those data (Creswell, 2014). This method of research is suited in such a way that can provide a more in-depth discussion in the study.

In this study, there were two types of data, primary data and secondary data. The primary data were taken from the book The Last Wish by Andrzej Sapkowski, while the secondary data were data taken from articles or journals related to the discussion of the topic.

The data were collected through the following steps: (1) Collecting the data (elements from the story of A Grain of Truth and find its counterpart from Beauty and the Beast), (2) Comparing the elements from A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast, and explore the similarities and dissimilarities between them, (3) Analyzing the data based on the theory of intertextuality and other theories that support it, (4) Finding the cause of the interconnection that they have and factors that affect the differentiation between the two stories, (5) Answering the research questions and create the conclusion of the findings. The data gathered, then, were analyzed using

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

The analysis of the two material objects, A grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast, especially on the aspect of theme, result in some intertextuality of the two stories and the socioocultural aspects behind it.

**The themes of A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast**

Theme is regarded to be the base of any fiction work because theme is the representation of the writer’s idea and the vision that s/he wants to tell (Kasnadi & Sutejo, 2014). As other elements revolve around it, theme functions as the glue that keeps all of them together (Prityani, 2010).

The thematic resemblance of the two narratives under the study was found out to be the power of love against curse. This theme, as a matter of fact, is a typical concept in fairy tales. However, there is a notion that makes A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast unique in their execution of this concept. Beauty and the Beast has a more pure approach regarding its view towards love. Although there are resemblances in their view of love against the curse, A Grain of Truth distances itself away from the fairy tale genre and gives its story a darker tone and pessimism which believes that love can cure curse. The difference in the execution of this idea becomes more prevalent by looking into how they tackle the concept of taking lessons from the curse.

Beauty and the Beast also carries a vision that someone’s inner traits, such as kindness and compassion, are more favorable than their outer traits. The story creates a contradiction by creating their main characters representing the differences between what they look like and how they are perceived in their society, which contradicts how they are characterized in the story. Belle, the protagonist, is not perceived as the most beautiful and attractive girl, but rather is emphasized as one with noble kindness. She is frequently referred to as plain, and people around her do not instantly notice her attractiveness. Otherwise, they fall for her kindheartedness, intelligence, bravery, and compassion. This is in line with the findings reported by Budidarma and his colleagues (2023) By encompassing the heroine that challenges the usual view of a female character, Beauty and the Beast proposes a theme that true
love compliments what is inside the person. Thus, the main motifs and themes of Beauty and the Beast are “kindness and love are more important than wealth, wit, or good-look” as mentioned by Hains (2023) is agreeable. A Grain of Truth also has a similar theme as Beauty and the Beast regarding the portrayal of love and curses in the story. It is hidden, though, in the way the story is revealed as it is told from the perspective of the main character, Nivellen, the character compares to Beast who experiences the curse. It enables A Grain of Truth to be more focused on a different aspects from that in Beauty and the Beast. The story, as a matter of fact, seems to highlight the value of oneself, or self-love, more than merely romance. Thw two stories show resemblance in their thematic progression. Both present a character that holds true love as their main drive to revert back into a human. This is the link that interconnects both stories through intertextuality. They portray a message that love can overpower a curse through a different way. Beauty and the Beast’s love story portrays romantic love as it focuses on the development of the relationship between Belle and Beast. A Grain of Truth portrays self-love as it focuses on the journey of Nivellen in his attempt to find love and discover how to improve himself as a better person.

The portrayal of self-love in the characterization of Nivellen is most prevalent in the idea of a lesson taken from the curse in this story. This also applies to the character of Beast in Beauty and the Beast whose success to be able to acquire Belle’s love is due to a behavioral change. Beast, who was once an arrogant prince, got a punishment of being cursed. The changes in his personality is a form of self-love as it pushes him to be a better person.

Jonhson (1983) views this of self-acceptance as an indication of acceptance towards shortcomings. By acknowledging his mistake and his weakness, Nivellen can begin his development later on, as he is then able to see himself in a more positive way though his monstrous appearance. It can be seen in his dialogue on how he sees himself as of now in this excerpt, “I used to be a weakling and now I’d become a strapping fellow.” (Sapkowski, 2007, p. 53).

Even though his reasoning for finding true love is because he wants to be human again, Nivellen begins to reflect that he might not be able to be proud of himself without his experiencing to be in a monstrous form. Nivellen accepts his destinies in a monstrous nature and comes to terms with how he is at the end. This is in line with what Germer (2029) says that self-acceptance is the person’s ability to have a positive view of who he is This development of Nivellen’s view towards himself is the portrayal of self-love which becomes the main message or theme of A Grain of Truth has for its theme. This is stressed in Nivellen’s utterances in seeing himself in the resoultion of the story. “I’d come to terms with it” (Sapkowski, 2007, p. 53).

The changes in the two characters’ personality can be said as the result of their redemption act that was brought by the curse. Taking lessons from the curse is one trend that linked A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast, providing a link towards their intertextuality. Despite the similarity that they share, there is still a distinguishable aspect that they have unique to their own. That is the changes of personification between Beast and Nivellen. The curse is used to humble Beast from prideful to passionate. On the other hand, it strengthens Nivellen, from weak-mindedness into strong-mindedness. Beauty and the Beast and A Grain of Truth show that there is a link that ties them together. In other words there is intertextuality between them as what Priyatni (2010) says that one aspect of intertextuality is that it appreciates the presence, the retrieval, and the inclusion of other elements into a certain work.

The Intertextuality between A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast

Culler states that a contradiction between two stories that have similar themes can be a notion of their distinguishable aspect as how they have different ways to tell or execute their elements, or vice versa (Culler, 1977). Regarding intertextuality theory, some similar elements can be found in A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast and A Grain of Truth regardless of the way the latter tries to distinguish it through the a shift in point of view. A further observation to the two stories has led the attention to the reasoning behind the similarities and differences and how they correlate to the collective unconsciousness of the perception of love theme in fairy tales.

Cursed Characters and the Concept of Curse

In the case of Beauty and the Beast and A Grain of Truth, the most prominent character that they share is the cursed character. The stories (A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast) follow the same steps: the male character is cursed due to his wrongdoings in the past and spends a lone time alone in an enchanted house (Häkki,
The main characters of both stories, Beast and Nivellen, are cursed, transforming their physical bodies. Beaumont described The Beast’s appearance as frightful. In the animated film Beauty and the Beast (1991) by Disney, The Beast is depicted as a portrayal of a mixture of several animals in humanoid figures. He bears resemblances to mythical beings like minotaur or werewolf. He is able to stand with two feet, and his upper body grown massive and covered in fur. He grows fangs for his teeth and horns on his head. Beast is also portrayed wearing clothes that are stylized and luxurious. Nivellen in A Grain of Truth is portrayed in a similar fashion, which can be seen in this excerpt.

“The creature was humanoid, and dressed in clothes which, though tattered, were of good quality and not lacking in stylish and useless ornamentation. His human form, however, reached no higher than the soiled collar of his tunic, for above it loomed a gigantic, hairy, bear-like head with enormous ears, a pair of wild eyes, and terrifying jaws full of crooked fangs in which a red tongue flickered like flame.” (Sapkowski, 2007, p. 42).

This portrayal of the cursed man functions as a contradiction that they have, that is their monster looks and their human nature. Despite their terrifying looks and power, the Beast is portrayed to be emotional, sensitive, and in need of love and friendship (Budidarma et al., 2023). As does as Nivellen, characterized as sentiment, “I looked at myself with growing anxiety” (Sapkowski, 2007, p. 53) and graceful, “They walked around like princess here, carried nothing but a fan, and did not even know where the kitchen was” (Sapkowski, 2007, p. 54). This contradiction between their looks and their traits portrays their refusal of the curse and their determination to retain their humanity.

The curse element that is portrayed in both stories becomes the part that distinguishes them. This correlates to the specific theme that they brought, which is the purity of love and inner beauty against outer look for Beauty and the Beast, and self-acceptance in A Grain of Truth. Beauty and the Beast values the purity of love as the main theme and values inner beauty. By focusing Beast’s characterization and how it contrasts with his looks and other characters, it uses the Beast’s sensitive and compassionate traits as the part of him that attracts love from Belle. Belle is drawn to Beast’s gentle and compassionate demeanor rather than his outward looks (Budidarma et al., 2023). Meanwhile, A Grain of Truth, as mentioned before focuses on the changing of Nivellen’s characters, as it supports the theme that they brought which is self-love.

**Symbols**

Symbols are a sign that appears frequently in a story and it carries meaning behind them, regarding how that symbol is paired with the context of the story. In the case of A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast, the recurring symbols that appear in both of them are a rose and a mirror.

A flower is a representation of love, and it is also often used to accompany and amplify romantic elements in general. Universally and throughout history, in literature and art, rose has been admired and revered for its beauty, regality, and fragrance (Mintz, 1969). The red rose in Beauty and the Beast represents the magnitude of love that the Beast has. Rose as a flower is a universal symbol that is often paired with love and used to represent the romantic feeling between couples. Beauty and the Beast uses the red rose as the symbol for Beast and his chance to find love.

The rose in A Grain of Truth story is colored indigo, with a bit of purple on its petals. The rose is also used to represent the character, which is Nivellen, as the color indigo represents his journey toward maturity. Indigo and purple often symbolize hybridity, which is the stage that Nivellen is in. Nivellen although wants to be-
come human again, he also ready to accept his monstrosity side. Brînzeu describes that the color indigo as an intricate amalgam of colors, where nothing is black and white (Brînzeu, 2009).

The second symbol from both stories is a mirror, and it is used to represent anxiety. In Beauty and the Beast, the mirror is often used by Beauty whenever she misses her father, which is accompanied by a growing feeling of anxiety and worry. Beast also uses the mirror as well, and what reflects on him is the condition of the world outside his castle that he refuses to touch anymore, representing his worries and solicitudes towards the outside world. In A Grain of Truth, the mirror is also used to represent the anxiety that Nivellen has regarding his body. It is used as the remainder that he’s still a monster, that he has not succeeded in regaining his humanity, which questions him, whether that is it not true love that can cure him, that is it, not true love that he and his girl feel towards each other.

The mirror is used to symbolize the fear and solicitude of what Nivellen sees in himself. It represents the worst part of his self-reflection. By using a mirror to represent his anxiety, A Grain of Truth reinforces its theme of self-acceptance by transforming Nivellen into a person who has come to terms with himself, “now I’d become a strapping fellow.” (Sapkowski, 2007, p. 53).

The use of rose and mirror as symbols in both stories indicates the intertextuality that they have. Although both stories have the same symbolism that they brought into their narratives, there is also deviation in how it is executed. The difference in the color of the rose is the deviation of A Grain of Truth from the romance genre and renders its story different. For mirror symbolizes the anxiety that the characters feel. The use of a mirror to symbolize characters’ weaknesses is a trope that is often used in literary works. Arlandis describes that the mirror is a highly suggestive element and prone to hundreds of interpretations and applications (Arlandis & Reyes-Torres, 2018). There are differences in how it is played out in both stories, for Beauty and the Beasts, the mirror is used to symbolize what they are longing for. While in A Grain of Truth, the mirror is used to symbolize the credibility of oneself. The mirror can reenact the role of questioning self (Stoljar, 1990). The mirror to be used in A Grain of Truth correlates with the theme of self-acceptance that it has, rendering the reflection that the mirror shows as the struggle that the character has to face.

**Tone of the Story**

Perrine describes that tone is an important part of meaning, it may be the most important part of meaning (Perrine, 1963). The tone in Beauty and the Beast and A Grain of Truth renders to be different from the elements that have been discussed earlier. It is because the tone of their stories contradicts each other in opposition. A contradiction between two stories that have similar themes can be a notion of their distinguishable aspect as how they have different ways to tell or execute their elements, or vice versa (Culler, 1977).

The differences in the tone of both stories lead to the differences in how they execute the idea of love in their themes. Beauty and the Beast has a more hopeful tone regarding their love and happiness, while A Grain of Truth has a rather greyer tone regarding there is happiness in love itself. It is because, in Beauty and the Beast, there is a guarantee that love can transform the Beast to be human again. It gives an expectation of how it will resolve. In A Grain of Truth, this guarantee that love is the answer is nonexistent. It is only stated that Nivellen put his hopes into believing in the fairy tales, rendering it to be the coping mechanism that he creates to cope with his condition. Häkki describes the differences between Beauty and the Beast and A Grain of Truth, that is that in the original fairy tale, it is clear to the Beast from the beginning that true love can break the curse, whereas in A Grain of Truth is only revealed in the end (Häkki, 2019). The differences in how love can cure the curse in A Grain of Truth make the story have a greyer tone rather than Beauty and the Beast. The depictions of corpses, blood, sex, and death in A Grain of Truth also enable it to have a much more mature tone.

**The Inadvertent of Intertextuality**

The main idea in intertextuality is the appreciation of the retrieval, the presence, and the inclusion of other elements into a particular work. However, there is still a question lingering, regarding how intertextuality occurs in the first place. Intertextuality itself is often associated with strategies that writers use (Clayton & Rothslein, 1991) as it offers a way to reference another text. The intention of the author is to contribute a perspective on viewing an intertextuality phenomenon in a text. By looking into the variables of elements in both stories that have been presented, it can be taken that A Grain of Truth is written as a retelling work of Beauty and the Beast. Although it can be taken as such, there is still no direct confirmation of enabling A Grain
of Truth as a retelling of Beauty and the Beast by the author. Thus, the researcher wants to propose to view this intertextuality phenomenon from another perspective as well. That is the inadvertent cause that ties A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast. Supporting Kristeva’s mentioning intersubjectivity (1980). Albertz describes that the author does not have to become the reasoning behind the referential intertext, but rather the readers and their knowledge are the one that creates that connection (Albertz, 2012).

This refers back to the theme that A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast have, which is about love against the curse. This trope that the curse can only be broken by true love is popularized by fairy tales like Beauty and the Beast and Sleeping Beauty. As the presence of the perception that love and its power is the answer to breaking the curse in fantasy, it has become a common archetype in the genre. Jung describes archetypes as typical reoccurring modes that we meet regularly (Jung, 1970). The archetypical feature that this concept has, become a part of understanding that has been received collectively. This refers to Jung’s theory of collective unconscious, which is mental concepts that reside in the human unconscious mind. The human collective unconscious consists of instincts and archetypes (Doyle, 2018).

Both stories use this concept to develop their characters respectively, Nivellen and Beast. This archetype renders it as one shape of intertextuality that A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast. Jung describes that collective unconsciousness theory helps to explain why similar themes occur in many mythologies around the globe. By applying this perspective, it can be viewed that there is another link that ties A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast through intertextuality, that is caused by a mutual understanding about love and its power against the curse that is shared by their authors and the readers.

The concept of love against curse has been done in many stories and other fairy tales. But what makes A Grain of Truth and its intertextuality connection to Beauty and the Beast specific is the specific elements that they share. The portrayal of the cursed character, their characterizations, symbols, and tones become the specific ties that create their intertextuality connection unique to their own.

The Social-cultural Aspect that Influenced the Intertextuality

A Grain of Truth carries elements that enable its intertextuality connection to Beauty and the Beast. Although they are carrying resemblances, there are deviations that are performed. Häkki (2019) describes that the story differs in some aspects, most notably in the original, the Beast character did not have multiple women to be the love interests before finding the one that would lift the curse, nor did the beauty die in the original or be revealed as a vampire. This deviation from their similar theme regarding love is portrayed through how they execute the practice of romantic love of their respective couple in their stories. The differences in how both stories view romantic relationships tie to the perspective of romance in their respective era during their writing.

Beauty and the Beast was written originally in 1740. Beauty and the Beast favors the idea of the unification of the couple, or marriage that leads to happiness for their characters. James stated that there is an old notion that developed in the early modern literature age, which favors the unification of oneself and other (James, 2008). With this unification being symbolized as marriage, Beauty and the Beast portrayed marriage as the key to the happiness of a romantic couple. Beauty and the Beast is also viewed as a commentary on the portrayal of romantic ideas that were often stereotyped during that era. Beauty and the Beast’s portrayal of romantic love shows there is a perception and expectation for romantic couples to pursue marriage to reach true love and happiness.

A Grain of Truth was written in a later age, which is in a modern era in 1993. It has the portrayal of romantic love practice in the modern era, as it is less romantic and more pragmatic. There is a lack of commitment that forces marriage in A Grain of Truth, rendering a more pragmatic nature of the relationship that Nivellen had built in the story. This can be seen in Nivellen’s story in which Nivellen had lived with some girls which was the result of him offering a part of his wealth to those who let their daughter live with him for a year. Although each relationship started in a forced manner, Nivellen’s changed demeanor enables him to form a mutual relationship with them.

Nivellen has gone through several relationships in attempting to find true love that would break his curse. Although the curse still remains on him, Nivellen finds himself to accept it as it is. The relationship that Nivellen has built with each girl shows that there is a lack of force on unification or marriage. Romantical practice in the modern era has a more pragmatic nature as the force of marriage has weakened. David (2003) describes that an ideal intimate relationship between
lovers had moved from pursuing the relationship level, and rather focused more on the communication between the couple. It can be taken that the social and cultural aspect that populated their respective time affects the way the story portrays the theme that correlates with love. This indicates the deviation is caused by the differences in the eras in which they were written and it has given another meaning of the intertextuality connection that they have.

CONCLUSION

The intertextuality that is realized in the connection between A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast can be taken from looking into their core elements, that is the themes of their stories. A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast, although have narratives that are quite different, there is a similarity when it comes to theme, that is the power of love and the lesson behind a curse. Yet, they execute their themes in different ways. Beauty and the Beast with its theme that is the purity of love and inner traits versus outer traits, while A Grain of Truth goes with its theme of self-growth and self-reflection.

The intertextuality connection that is shared by A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast is also strengthened by the elements that can be found in both narratives which include concepts, characters and characterizations, symbolism, and events that function as referential aspects. The stories, thogh, hide this behind the differences in the contextualization of those elements.

How those similarities are created, however, is entirely based upon the author’s intention, but the lack of clarity of the connections produces ambiguity. Thus, it another implication is that the factor on which intertextuality is an inadvertent factor. It is due to the collective unconsciousness that drives both writers to produce those similarities. Hence, it reflects on their mutual idea of the power of love and the curse.

Despite the stories carrying resemblances in their elements, deviation also exists that results in the different outcomes of both stories and their elements. Those differences are part of the individuality of the respective authors related to their experiences and their backgrounds, which include the force of culture and social structure that reflects on the state of the era during its creation.

From this intertextuality between A Grain of Truth and Beauty and the Beast, it can be taken that there are many possibilities that this also happens to many texts in this world. Despite the similarities that be found between them, the culture around them and the experience of the writer become the distinguishing factors on how they are different in their way. The nature of craftsmanship in the texts is what makes the texts unique to their own and to other texts.

REFERENCES


