The Rendering of Ideology in the English-Indonesian Translation of Brontë’s Jane Eyre

Khalida Ash Shofa
Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia
khalidashofa@gmail.com

Issy Yuliasri
Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Yan Mujiyanto
Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia
ysnmujiyanto@mail.unnes.ac.id

ABSTRACT
This study deals with the rendering of ideology found in the English-Indonesian translation of Brontë’s Jane Eyre. The main objective of this study is to investigate the rendering ideology in Brontë’s Jane Eyre from English into Indonesian which is realized in the vocabulary and grammar choices used by the translator in translating ideology in Jane Eyre from English into Indonesian. It used descriptive qualitative approach. Moreover, Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) proposed by Fairclough (1989) is used as the framework of the study. The data obtained were taken from ‘Jane Eyre’ by Charlotte Brontë and it is translated by Lulu Wijaya entitled Jane Eyre. The unit of analysis of the study was ideological content including word, phrase, clause, sentence, and paragraph contained in Jane Eyre and its translation. The results showed that there are 120 ideologically loaded-data which is categorized into Ideology. They are ideology as tacit assumptions, beliefs and value systems. Meanwhile, there are 32 (27%) data which are not lexically equivalent in the Indonesian translation. Thus, the remaining data represent the ideology of the source text in the same way. Based on those findings, the writers concluded that most of the ideologically-contested words, nominalizations, and voices are rendered into Indonesian. There are no ideological differences between the source text and its translation. Furthermore, the translators mostly expressed ideology of the source similarly by means of selecting similar lexical choices. It means that translator’s ideology in the source text and their translation in the target text reach ideological equivalent.

INTRODUCTION
Translation has a great importance in the world nowadays. It plays an important role in communication. It is used to convey the culture and literature from one nation to another (Al-Nakhalah, 2013). Several studies showed that most researchers mainly focused on sentence translation without paying attention to the influence of ideology. Hartono (2016) states that translating a text from one language to another is a very difficult and complicated activity (p. 593). However, recently, translation is viewed in different ways and theories of translation are more focused on factors that influence translators’ decision making. In this perspective, translation is not just a process of substituting lexical and grammatical equivalences (Yazdanmehr & Shoghi, 2014), it is seen as a process in which the translators are involved are in selecting among the wide varieties of lexical and grammatical choices. Since the work of the translator consists of not merely transferring lexical units from source text (ST) into target text (TT), importantly the work of the translator is rewriting or
manipulating original texts (Lefevere, 1992: 16), hence, translator’s choices are related to his/her ideological. This is in line with Schaffner’s statement (2002) that idea that each translation is a product of an ideology, and ideological aspects of a translation can be extracted and analyzed in lexical (vocabulary) and grammatical levels.

However, in translating novels, especially children novel, it has a striking difference when compared to translate non-literary texts (Hartono & Priyatmojo, 2015, p. 183), it is found that it is not a straightforward matter, there are several problems connected with the actual translation process because of the forces of manipulation (Khwira, 2010). In addition, because of the limited experience and background knowledge about children, translators encounter an array of problems adapting the target text to the level of children’s understanding. Cultural differences between the Source Text (ST) and the Target Text (TT), which may even lead to censorship that should also be considered. Such cultural and ideological differences among Indonesian and other cultures can result in mistranslations and likely breakdowns. In this regard, Sertkan (2007: 6) points out that “the act of translation is not an innocent one since the translator is influenced by his/her own cultural values and his/her ideology, which causes him/her to “manipulate” the source text by making some additions, omissions, adaptations. However, the translated children literature may cause breakdowns concerning morals, ideologies, and social customs, especially if the source and target cultures have little in common.

Reviewing the problem related to the translation of ideology, especially translation of ideology in children literature, this study attempts to shed light on the relationship between language and ideology involved in translation in general, and more specifically, to uncover the underlying ideological assumptions invisible in the text, both source text (ST) and target text (TT), and consequently to find out whether or not translator’s ideology is imposed in the translation. Through the translation of ideology, it can be seen translator’s intervention in the process of translation. The ideology needs to be investigated to find out translator’s belief and to reveal the potential manipulation of ideological elements in the translation. Moreover, apart from the attempt to uncover implicit ideology, this study aims to investigate the rendering ideology and the adopting Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA), based on Fairclough’s CDA approach (1989). It is also supported by Puurtinen (2000) idea that Critical Discourse Analyses (CDA) aims at revealing how ideology affects linguistic choices made by a text producer and how language can be used to maintain, reinforce or challenge ideologies” (p. 178).

Moreover, CDA is considered the most appropriate approach for this study to uncover the relationship between discourse and manipulation. Language serves to construct particular positions. These particular positions entail unequal relations of power. As a result, it can be said that language has a function in the construction of ideology.

In this study, the writers use CDA which should pass three stages (Fairclough, 1989). Those three stages are description, interpretation, and explanation of the text. The description is the stage which is concerned with formal properties of the text. Interpretation is concerned with the relationship between text and interaction. Whereas explanation of the text is concerned with the relationship between interaction and social context.
The data of this study is a novel entitled “Jane Eyre”, it is one of children literary works written by Charlotte Brontë. It has been translated into “Jane Eyre” by Lulu Wijaya. The reason for taking the novel as the data source of this study because Jane Eyre novel ranks as one of the greatest and most perennially popular works of English fiction. However, there are some problems in translating novel, especially in translating ideology.

There have been a number of studies which supported this study, such as the study of Karimnia (2012) entitled “The impact of ideology on lexical choices in literary translation: A case of A Thousand Splendid Suns.” It discovers ideological differences between Hosein’s novel A Thousand Splendid Suns and its two Persian Translations, by Ganji and Soleimani and Ghebrai. According to Fairclough, ideology in discourse is encoded in the lexical, grammatical, and textual items and changes in these items indicate different ideology. Hence, lexical choices of the source book and the two translations were analyzed based on Fairclough’s approach to investigate ideological differences between them. The result of chi-square revealed that there were no ideological differences between the source text and its two translations. Moreover, the translator selected similar vocabularies for representing the ideology of the original author.

The study is conducted by Mujiyanto (2011). It is entitled “Nonequivalence in the English-to-Indonesian Translation of Behavioral Clauses”. The study is directed to deliberately analyze a written text in English and its translation in Indonesian. The object of this study is the translation, Indonesian text as a result of a rendering task from English. For this purpose, it has deliberately chosen J.K. Rowling’s Harry Potter series and their Indonesian counterpart which is done by L. Srisanti to be the object of the study. The data are clauses in Indonesian and their counterpart in English which are drawn from the source.

This study gives the writer input regarding how to achieve correspondence as well as equivalence. It is found out that formal nonequivalence may occur in word, phrase, and clause levels. Such formal nonequivalence has, however, facilitated the effort of achieving functional equivalence at clause level. Moreover, in order to materialize functional equivalence at the clause level, the translation has been conducted by means of retaining behavioral clauses or restructuring them to form material clauses, mental clauses, or verbal clauses.

Another study is written by Puuritinen (1998) entitled Syntax, Readability and Ideology in Children’s Literature. This study aims to compare different linguistic realizations of ideology in English and Finnish texts, investigates particular micro and macro-linguistic strategies which reflect ideology, for example, implicit assumptions, beliefs and power relations in English and Finnish children’s novels, and to reveal the potential manipulation of ideological elements in translation. The findings indicate that some linguistic forms which carry ideological meaning may reduce readability in a children’s book, ideology, and readability are related each other, and more complex syntax is a sign of greater confidence in children’s linguistic abilities and a more tolerant, “nonchalant” attitude towards children’s literature.

Moreover, it seems that this study is more interesting than the previous studies because it explores deeper and wider areas. This study will focus on vocabulary and
grammar choices used by the translator in translating ideology in *Jane Eyre* from English into Indonesian, the stage focuses on description of the text, interpretation of the relationship between text and interaction, and explanation of the relationship between interaction and social context.

**METHODOLOGY**

The form of research used is descriptive research, it is aimed to describe systematically a situation or something factual and accurate. This is also supported by Rusmiati and Sofwan (2010), “Descriptive method is to describe systematically a situation or area of interest factually and accurately and it is more focused on data of understanding efforts and descriptive to draw conclusion. by using descriptive qualitative research, this study focuses on identifying kinds of ideology that are found in *Jane Eyre* from source language into target language, describing accurately and factually Indonesian translation of ideology in *Jane Eyre* from English into Indonesian, and investigating vocabulary and grammar choices made by the translator in translating ideology in *Jane Eyre* from English into Indonesian.

The kinds of ideology will be categorized by Hatim and Mason’s theory. Hence, In this study, the kinds of ideology are reflected as tacit or implicit assumptions, system of beliefs, and value system.

Moreover, the vocabulary and grammar choices of the source text and the translation are analyzed by using CDA because it is the most appropriate design to explain the relation between linguistic choice and ideology. Moreover, this study uses Fairclough’s framework for CDA. The questions are used to cover aspects of vocabulary analysis within CDA model namely ideologically contested words, the other aspects of grammar analysis (such as nominalization, and active or passive sentences) are also examined. Moreover, in the stage of discourse analysis based on Fairclough’s approach, there are three stages, namely description, interpretation, and explanation, thus, this study focuses on those three stages.

In collecting data, the researcher used observation checklist. It is a table to put the ideological content found in the source text and their translation in the target text.

To validate the data, the writers apply triangulation by theory/perspective, In this type of triangulation, the writers use some theoretical perspective to examine and interpret the data and the writers referred back to the theories of conducting CDA. Those theoretical perspective are: the phenomenon can be regarded as ideology based on Hatim and Mason’s theory, critical discourse analysis by Fairclough (1989), and elements of vocabulary and grammar structures (ideologically contested words, nominalization, and active or passive sentences) from Fairclough (1989). Therefore, corroborating the findings in this study with their perspective and theories ensured that an account is rich and comprehensive. Furthermore, the writers use peer debriefing. According to Guba (1981) peer debriefing “provide inquirers the opportunity to test their growing insights and to expose themselves to searching questions” (p. 85). Moreover, it is the process whereby a researcher calls upon a disinterested peer, a peer who is not involved in the research project, to aid in probing the researcher’s thinking around all or parts of the research process. This probing includes, but is not limited to, methodology, interpretation, and analysis of data. As such, it is regarded as one of a complement of techniques used to enhance the credibility and trustworthiness of
qualitative research through the use of external peers.

**FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION**

The result of the study shows that there are 120 data of utterances containing ideology that are manifested in ideologically-contested words, nominalizations, and active and passive sentences identified in the novel. The data are presented in both source language, English and in the target language, Bahasa Indonesia. The ideological terms—words, phrases, clauses, and sentences—are analyzed to the level of lexical item, grammatical item. The ideological contested words and their translation are classified into categories as proposed by Fairclough and analyzed the ideology descriptively. After the analysis, the novel is also analyzed to know how the ideological terms, nominalizations, and active and passive sentences are translated into Indonesian. After identifying and analyzing the categories of translation, it is easier to find whether or not the ideological contested words, nominalizations, and active and passive sentences are rendered into Indonesian Translation. Moreover, the ideology contained and in their translation is analyzed to know whether or not they have ideological equivalence.

There are 120 ideologically-loaded data in Brontë’s *Jane Eyre*, out of 120 data, 89 data are rendered from English into Indonesian, while 31 data are shifted when they are translated into Indonesian. Therefore, most of ideologies found in the Brontë’s *Jane Eyre* are rendered into Indonesian.

For clarification, the chart below describes the percentage of the rendering of ideology in the English-Indonesian Translation of Brontë’s *Jane Eyre*:

![Figure 1. The Rendering of Ideology in the English-Indonesian Translation of Brontë’s Jane Eyre](image)

Figure 1 describes the ideologies which are rendered from Source Text into Target Text, there are 74% data which are rendered. However, there are 26% data which are shifted. Although it is not dominant, this reveals that there are changes made by the translators, either intentionally or unintentionally, the changes are related to the selection of lexical items and syntactic structures in comparison to those in the Source Text. Such differences between ideology in ST and TT is due to the translator is influenced by her own cultural values and her ideology, which makes her manipulate the source text. Nevertheless, based on the percentage presented in the figure above, most of ideologies are rendered in the Indonesian translation, it means that the Indonesian translator reflects the ideological content of the Source Text in the Target Text. Thus, the translator retained his ideological content in order to reflect the Source Text ideology in the Target Text.

**The Ideologically-Loaded Utterances in the English Novel and Their Translations.**
Hatim and Mason (1997) state that ideology encompasses “the tacit assumptions, beliefs and value systems which are shared collectively by social groups.” There are 120 data closely related to ideology as tacit assumption, beliefs and value systems which is identified. One sample is taken as examples of the analysis. It is presented as follows:

Sample 1
ST: I felt it a misfortune that I was so little, so pale, and had features so irregular and so marked. (Page 85)
TT: Aku merasa sungguh malang nasibku bahwa aku begini kecil, begini pucat, dengan bagian-bagian wajah begitu tak teratur dan m encolok. (Page 148)
BT: I felt it really unfortunate my fate that I am so little, so pale, with parts of the face so irregular and marked.

The context of situation is when Jane is preparing herself on her first day to teach Adele (her new student), she is not confident of being not beautiful.

This included ideological sentence since the author wants to uncover the ideology by mentioning Jane’s physical appearance. The sentence above is included as tacit assumption because this statement shows the author’s assumption by the negative point of view of Jane’s appearance.

The Rendering of Ideologically-Contested Word in English-Indonesian Translation of Brontë’s Jane Eyre
By looking at the lexical choices, the words which are ideologically contested can be seen. Ideologically contested words itself is certain words and phrases that signify an ideological stance or another. There are 120 ideologically contested words found. Among the data, one datum is taken as the example of the analysis. It is presented below:

Sample 2
ST: For it becomes my duty to warn you, that this girl, who might be one of God’s own lambs, is a little castaway (Page 56)
TT: Karena telah menjadi tugasku untuk memperingatkan kalian, bahwa gadis ini, yang semestinya bisa menjadi salah salah satu domba Tuhan sendiri, adalah anak buangan (Page 99)
BT: For it has been my duty to warn you, that this girl, who should be one of God's own lambs, is a castaway child.

The context of situation is when Brocklehurst mentally tells Jane to submissively stand on a stool before her peers and humiliates the hell out of her while she stands helplessly for a half hour enduring it all. The use and selection of the lexicalization that has ideological value is the verb warn. Warn in TT is succesfully translated into the verb memperingatkan. In this context, Mr. Brocklehurst warns the children to avoid and exclude Jane. The use of the word warn is associated with Jane’s behavior that does not fit to the people in Lowood, so there is a need for a warning to the children to anticipate Jane’s bad behavior which can influence them.

The verb warn in sentence For it becomes my duty to warn you, that this girl, who might be one of God’s own lambs, is a little castaway is rendered in the Indonesian translation. It depics that Mr. Brocklehurst, a heavily religious figure in the novel, as a tyrannical and evil man. The author very deliberately made the reader associate the cruelty of Brocklehurst (along with the
harshness and rigidity of Lowood) and the religious upbringing in general.

Based on the analysis above, it can be concluded that in the sentence *For it becomes my duty to warn you, that this girl, who might be one of God’s own lambs, is a little castaway* is lexically equivalent in the Indonesian translation and shares same ideology.

As stated above, this study uses Fairclough’s framework for CDA to find out whether or not the ideologically-contested words are rendered. Ideologically-contested words is defined as a word in the text that is immediately noticeable as being ideologically contested (Atkins, 2002: 9).

The result shows that there are 93 ideologically-contested words which are rendered into Indonesian. In other hand, the number of ideologically-contested word which are shifted when they are translated into Indonesian are 27. Hence, most of ideological words found in Brontë’s *Jane Eyre* are successfully rendered into Indonesian. This result is supported by Barnes’ (2014) study that the result of the study shows that ideological-laden texts or ideologically-contested words of the Source Text and Target Text mostly the same.

The rendering of nominalization in English-Indonesian Translation of Brontë’s *Jane Eyre*

According to Fairclough (1989: 109-139), nominalization can be used to obscure agency, responsibility and causality because it allows deletion of participants from the sentence. There is one instance of nominalization found, the representative datum is presented in the following:

**Sample 3**

ST: There is something truly *forbidding* in a child taking up her elders in that manner (Page 3)

TT: Lagi pula sungguh *tidak menyenangkan* ada anak-anak yang suka membangkang kepada orang yang lebih tua (Page 8)

BT: Moreover it is really unpleasant there is child who is rebellious to the elders.

In the sample 3, the term ‘*forbidding*’ in ST (nominalization of the verb ‘*to forbid*’), the effect of using nominalization of the words in brackets is to separate the action from the actor. In this example, the author used nominalization to hide the identity of the characters that are forbidding people not to have a bad manner to the elder, the author only describing the actions. Therefore, by impeding clarity within this word, it is possible for the author to obscure meaning by removing agent and the accountability for the action resulting in an ideological use of nominalization is to remove responsibility for the action from the agent.

In other hand, the term *forbidding* is translated into *tidak menyenangkan*, it should be translated into *terlarang* instead of *tidak menyenangkan*, hence, although the translator adapts a new word, the meaning of term *forbidding* in ST is shifted in TT, by using the term *tidak menyenangkan*, the reader still can not make any guess about the actual involvement of an actor.

Below is the result of nominalization that is found in the English-Indonesian translation of Brontë’s *Jane Eyre*.

**Table 1** Nominalization in English-Indonesian Translation of Brontë’s *Jane Eyre*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>ST</th>
<th>TT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Forbidding</td>
<td>Tidak menyenangkan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In the grammar choice, the use of passive and active voices in the source text and target text can lead different ideological point of view. The representative datum is taken as the example of the analysis. It is presented as follows:

Sample 4

ST: I dislike you the worst of anybody in the world except John Reed (Page 29)

TT: kau orang yang paling kubenci di seluruh dunia ini. (Page 53)

BT: you are the one I hate the most in the world

In the ST, I dislike you the worst of anybody in the world except John Reed belongs to active voice sentence, the agent (I) is prominent.

Whereas, it is translated into passive sentence kau orang yang paling kubenci di seluruh dunia ini in the TT, the action (yang paling kubenci) is prominent.

Hence, from the example above, it can be said that when active voice sentence is translated into passive voice sentence, the action will be important. This type of optional shift will produce an ideological value.

As the comparison of voices (active and passive sentences) in the Source Text and Target Text provide considerable results from ideological point of view. The result shows that there are four changes in rendering voices from English into Indonesian. They are active-active, active-passive, passive-passive, and passive-active. There are 107 active sentences that are translated into active sentences and five active sentences which are translated into passive sentences. Meanwhile, there are four passive sentences that are translated into passive sentence, four passive sentences which are translated into active sentences. The percentage is, there are 89%

Table 1 indicates that both in ST and TT, twenty nominalized constructions are utilized. There are thirteen nominalizations which are rendered equivalently into Indonesian, there are seven nominalizations which are shifted into Indonesian. Hence, mostly nominalizations in the Source Text is rendered equivalently into Indonesian Target Text.

The result of this study is in line with the related previous study stated in chapter two by Barnes (2014) in his study entitled Ideology in Translation: CS Lewis’ The Lion, the Witch, and the Wardrobe which states that the linguistic elements, such as nominalizations of both source text and target text are dominantly the same.

The rendering of voices in English-Indonesian Translation of Brontë’s Jane Eyre
of active-active change, 4% of active-passive change, 4% of passive-passive change, and 3% of passive-active change. Hence, it shows that the dominant change in rendering voices in the English-Indonesian translation of Brontë’s Jane Eyre is active-active change. It is in line with the previous study which is discussed in chapter two conducted by Savola (2006) in her study An Analysis on the Language and Structure of General Election Manifestos of the British Labour Party 1983-2005 which states the majority of the writing in the manifesto in which she is analyzed is in the active voice. Therefore, the result of both studies shows the purpose of the manifestos and the novel (and its translation) are mostly to seek compassion and to identify the writers or the agent.

CONCLUSION
First, the aim of this study is to determine through a process using elements of Critical Discourse Analysis, the examination of linguistic elements within the source and target texts, and other ideological issues related to Jane Eyre, and whether the Indonesian translator reflected the ideological content of the source text in the target text. Different ideological issues within the different textual segments are identified by means of Critical Discourse Analysis based on an integrated model by Fairclough, examining ideologically contested word, nominalization, and voices (active and passive sentences).

Second, regarding the rendering of ideology found in the novel Jane Eyre and its translation, there are 120 data of utterances containing ideology that are manifested in ideologically-contested words, nominalizations, and voices (active and passive sentences). Out of 120 data, 93 ideologically-contested words are rendered into Indonesia, thirteen nominalizations which are rendered equivalently into Indonesian. Moreover, in the rendering of voices, there are 107 active sentences that are translated into active sentences and five active sentences which are translated into passive sentences. Meanwhile, there are four passive sentences that are translated into passive sentence, four passive sentences which are translated into active sentences. It can be said that the result from vocabulary and grammar choices shows that there are no ideological differences between the source text and its translation. Furthermore, the translators mostly expressed ideology of the source similarly by means of selecting similar lexical and grammatical choices. Hence, translator’s ideology in the Source Text and their translation in the Target Text reach ideological equivalent.

Third, in the novel Jane Eyre and its translation, some categories of ideologies are found and investigated. There are 107 data which are identified, they are classified into three categories, ideologies as tacit assumptions, beliefs and value systems. Most of the ideologies are classified into ideologies as system of belief, the second rank is ideologies as value system, while the least ideologies are classified into ideologies as tacit assumption. The ideologies of system of belief found in the novel refers to religious teaching, racism, and feminism, ideologies as value system refers to inequalities, norm, and independence, while ideologies as tacit assumption refers to logical argument, and judgment. In one hand, the dominant ideologies found in the novel is regarding religious teaching, it is rendered in the Target Text because the translator is a Christian, and being a Christian herself make it easier for her to understand Christian terms, themes, or symbols used in Jane Eyre novel, and it makes her reflect the ideology of the Source
Text in the same way. In other hand, the ideologies regarding norms is mostly shifted from the Source Text into Target Text, because it is found in the Source Text a taboo and rough words, the translator manipulates the term by using more polite words and careful consideration in translating the text for its acceptance in Target Text. Hence, in sum, it can be said that the differences between ideology in ST and TT is due to the translator is influenced by her own cultural values and her ideology, which makes her manipulate the Source Text.

SUGGESTION
Translating is not merely changing words, phrases, or sentences into different languages, it has to do with culture. Moreover, it is assumed to be a communicative performance engaging with the production of a new Target Text in a new target context through CDA framework. Theoretically, a translator must be aware and careful in rendering the author’s lexicalizations because they represent his/her ideology. Hence, it is suggested that a translator should have deep understanding of the Source and the Target language lexically and grammatically.

Furthermore, since this study focused only on vocabulary and grammar choices used by the translator, in this case, Jane Eyre translated by Lulu Wijaya, pedagogically, it is suggested for students, researchers, and scholars who are interested in conducting a study on translation to find another translated novel of Brontë’s Jane Eyre. The next study can compare the two Indonesian translators of Brontë’s Jane Eyre, which one of Indonesian translation is ideologically much more similar to the source book and whether or not there are ideology differences between two Indonesian translated version and the source book. In addition, since practically this study is expected to give contribution for those who are interested in translation, it is suggested to implement the whole part of vocabulary and grammar choices in the description stage of Fairclough’s (1989) Critical Discourse Analysis framework.

REFERENCES


