The Role of Parents in Their Children’s Artistic Education: The Effect of Parental Involvement in the Transgenerational Process

Tímea Szűcs, Judit Váradi, Henrietta Kelemen, Zsófia Miklódi-Simon, Gabriella Pusztai

University of Debrecen, Hungary

Submitted: 2023-02-06. Revised: 2023-05-08. Accepted: 2023-08-12

Abstract

Little is known about the methods and effects of parental involvement in art education. The aim of our systematic literature review is to explore the types of parental involvement in four branches of art (music, dance, visual arts, and theatre). We conducted our research with the help of the EBSCO database, using the PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses) procedure. We found that the share of the different artistic fields is highly disproportionate in the literature on parental involvement. Compared to music, theatre, dance, and visual arts, coverage is negligible. During our study, we managed to classify types of parental involvement and found that it showed variety across different branches of art.

Keywords: parental involvement; artistic education; music education


INTRODUCTION

Parents are important and indispensable actors in children’s artistic learning, providing them with financial, technical, and emotional support. The literature (Epstein, 1994; Grolnick & Slowiacek, 1994; Hoover-Dempsey et al., 2001; Keith et al., 1993; Nyitrai et al., 2019; Zdzinski, 2013) abounds in well-constructed models that describe different levels of parental involvement, the most significant of which are highlighted below.

One of the best-known models of parental involvement was created by Epstein (1994), who formulated a six-factor structure of school-based parental involvement. This includes assisting parents in child rearing, school-parent communication, parental volunteering, parental involvement in home learning, school decision-making, and school-community partnerships. Grolnick and Slowiacek’s (1994) three-factor model consists of behavioural factors, cognitive-intellectual factors and personal factors. Hoover-Demsey et al. (2001) model of parental involvement discusses the causes and realisation of parental involvement and the question to which aspects of parental involvement are the most influential. Keith et al. (1993) categorise parental involvement into four components, which include parental expectations, school involvement, providing structure at home (home involvement), and parent-child communication about school (personal support).

Parental involvement (PI) impacts

Corresponding author:
E-mail: szucstimea77@gmail.com
school success, and because of that this research area is the focus of educational research, but art-education is a neglected topic. In this systematic review, we want to explore how this topic (PI) appears in drama-, dance-, visual arts- and music education.

METHODS

This systematic literature review was prepared based on the Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses (PRISMA) guidelines (see Figure 1).

Eligibility criteria

The following criteria were formulated for the systematic review. The studies to be included (1) reported original research published in a peer-reviewed journal; (2) were written in English; (3) were published in academic journals with their full text; (4) contained the selected keywords in their abstracts; (5) belonged to the discipline of education; (6) examined the relationship between the families of children in art education and the school.

Search Strategy

Before the search, we consulted a research librarian from the University of Debrecen about our searching strategy. We performed the search on 8th December, 2021 in EBSCO Discovery Service Search Engine, which included 85 databases.

During the search, we considered it important that the keywords cover all four fields of art (music, dance, visual arts, theatre). For this purpose, we used the terms that occurred most frequently in the international literature. The keywords were: 1. parent involvement OR parent participation OR parent engagement OR family involvement OR family engagement 2. music education OR music learning OR music teaching OR music class OR visual art education OR visual arts learning OR visual arts teaching OR visual arts class OR dance education OR dance learning OR dance teaching OR dance class OR creative dramatics education OR creative dramatics learning OR creative dramatics teaching OR creative dramatics class OR creative art education OR creative arts learning OR creative arts teaching OR creative arts class OR theatre education OR theatre learning OR theatre teaching OR theatre class OR artistic activity. Overall, our systematic searches resulted 108 records. After double filtering, we excluded 23 records.

Study Selection

After removing duplicate studies, we performed a multi-step screening process to select the studies that met the inclusion criteria.

Stage 1, screening of titles and abstracts. Filtering both titles and abstracts, each author created their list independently. Comparing these, if two authors found a study to be eligible, they moved on to the
next item. Stage 2, screening of full texts. We divided the studies selected in the previous section for further analysis. Then, after reading the full text, each author explained why they would include or exclude that study. We then checked each other's work in pairs, and if there was agreement, the study was included in the review.

The characteristics of the selected studies are shown in Tables 2 and 3.

**Table 2.** Distribution of the selected studies by year of publication

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 3.** Studies selected for analysis by location

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Journal</th>
<th>Journal metrics</th>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Number of studies</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>British Journal of Music Education</td>
<td>Scopus Q1</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zbornik Institutia za pedagoska istrazivanja</td>
<td>Scopus Q4</td>
<td>Serbia</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Childhood Education Journal</td>
<td>Scopus Q2</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Canadian Journal of Education</td>
<td>Scopus Q4</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Horizons in Education</td>
<td>Scopus Q4</td>
<td>China</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Journal of Negro Education</td>
<td>Scopus Q2</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

General Music Today
International Journal of Education & the Arts
Scopus Q1 United States 1

International Journal of Art & Design Education
Journal of Research in Music Education
Music Educators Journal
Scopus Q1 United States 4

Australian Journal of Music Education
Asia-Pacific Education Researcher
New Waves Educational Research & Development
Scopus Q2 Singapore 1

United States 1

The fourth table shows the distribution of studies among branches of art. It is clear that more than 80% of the studies are in the field of music and only 1-2 studies are related to the other fields of art.

**Table 4.** Distribution of branches of art in the studies

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Distribution of branches of art</th>
<th>Music</th>
<th>Dance</th>
<th>Visual art</th>
<th>Theatre</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The authors used the following terms to express parental involvement: parental involvement, parental engagement, parental support, parental influence, family and community partnerships, cooperation between schools and the parents, music
activities in the home, direct adult involvement, parental role, involvement of parents, direct adult involvement.

The proportion of research methods in the studies was 50% quantitative method (questionnaire), 25% qualitative method (interview), and 25% mixed methodology.

Regarding the geographical distribution of the target groups, most of the research took place in the USA (9). Two studies were written in England and China, respectively. In addition, studies were conducted in Canada, Africa, Europe, Australia, Malaysia and South Korea.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Research on the motivational power of music at home

Our results show that several researchers have investigated the impact of children’s musical environment at home and the decisive role of parents in sensitising their children to the arts. This is a key area because early childhood music education can determine both a lifelong relationship with music and, later, intergenerational transmission by the next generation of parents. Samuel’s (2014) research looked at transgenerational effects. He looked for volunteer families in Boston where children had no previous art education and there were no professional musicians in the family. The families, which were selected randomly, were pre-assessed on the parents’ prior art education and experience. Each week during the children’s education, parents were asked about musical activities at home, changes in the frequency of those activities, and any non-musical areas of interest. The research confirmed that parents’ childhood musical experiences were incorporated into childrearing, but only in the area of singing at home; this relationship did not apply to music education. The frequency of parents’ early singing experiences significantly correlated with the frequency of singing at home. Thus, the predictive effect of parents’ childhood musical experiences on their later musical parenting behaviour may be significantly larger than previously reported. In fact, participation in music lessons did not increase the time spent playing music together at home. At the same time, parents perceived music lessons to provide various cognitive benefits in areas unrelated to musical development.

Custodero (2006) also investigated singing at home as an artistic activity shared by parents and children. By researching the practices of ten families of three-year-old children, she explored the types of musical activities parents engaged in at home. The first was singing in relation to daily activities such as meals, naps, bathing, and falling asleep. Some participants reported singing to accompany these activities to make them special and to incorporate the songs into daily life. Families found the use of music important to pay tribute to generational culture, maintain and adapt old traditions, and create new ones. Some participants carried on the influence of their own parents. Both the researchers and the parents in the study observed a number of singing practices that took place during play. These songs fell into three categories: learnt, adapted or invented. Learnt songs – clearly recognisable songs from the cultural heritage – were present in all families. Adaptations of these learnt songs were also common, usually accompanied by repetitive fragments and wordplay. All families reported the use of spontaneously invented singing and was also recorded in the researchers’ field notes and in parental diary entries.

McDowell (2008) shows the strong impact of cultural transfer. Her research found that singing at home was parents’ main musical activity. They had already enjoyed it as children and now wanted to pass on the love of singing to their own offspring. The author believes that a child who is read to is more likely to become a reader, and the same is true for a child who is sung to. In her opinion, music is something children will not outgrow, but something they will grow into and will stay with them for the rest of their lives.
Anderson and Barton-Wales (2019) confirm that parental values shape and determine the contexts within which musical experiences are created.

Koops (2012) examines music education in school and out-of-school contexts, focusing on the extent to which parents influence and participate in the process of learning music and related activities. The results show that parents’ encouragement of musical activities has a long-term impact on families’ joint musical activities. Parents perceived that music education had the most powerful impact on their children’s creativity.

Zdzinski’s (2013) study used factor analysis to examine the multifaceted structure of the home environment in music. In order to provide music education researchers with a common definition of parental involvement, he created a scale that reflects this structure, thus creating the home environment in music (PI-HEM) construct. The results of the analysis showed that the data fitted a seven-factor model best. The seven factors were identified as (1) home musical structure, (2) attitudes toward music, (3) home musical environment, (4) music programme support, (5) parental expectations, (6) family musical participation, and (7) family musical background. It was found that parents’ education and socioeconomic status influence their musical tastes; thus, the influence of the home environment is significant. It was concluded that parental involvement in music is not a uniform construct. Although the types of PI-HE in general education are very similar, they are not identical to those in a musical context. Music-specific forms may go beyond the strategies proposed in the literature on general education.

Involving parents to be active in their children’s music education

The special system of teaching through art education is demonstrated by the fact that many researchers recommend the active involvement of parents as a major motivator for their children to be successful. This is the phenomenon on which Suzuki grounded his method. Considering parental example to be a key factor in musical activity, his philosophy bases the structure of music education on parental involvement. Preschool-age children attend instrumental lessons with their parents, where the parent must also be actively involved in the instruction. The Suzuki method is seen as effective because parental involvement motivates the child, and setting an example makes the activity attractive to them. In addition to supporting the child, parental involvement can help build deeper relationships between family members (Fagan et al., 1992).

Fagan et al. (1992) presented a study of educators’ efforts to encourage parents to actively participate in musical productions to increase parental involvement. Joint parent orchestras, rehearsals, and individual preparation and practice showed children that musical activity was not only a short-term but a lifelong opportunity. At the same time, it was a great opportunity for teachers to get to know the parents better and utilize music’s community-building effect. The experiment had a double outcome; on the one hand, seeing their parents playing music motivated the children, and on the other hand, parents were shown how to spend their free time in a useful way.

Marjanovic-Shane (2006), examining the Project Learn School Community teaching method, found that education through the arts is given a prominent role in education which is built on the system of cooperation. Parental involvement manifests itself in all aspects of school life, from teaching to school management. Children are particularly affected by their parents’ extra effort, making them feel more responsible and motivated to achieve good results.

Bugeja (2009) studied parental involvement in music education systems using Suzuki’s and traditional methods. She explored how the teacher can facilitate parental involvement through ongoing communication, highlighting the role of parents in music lessons, what their tasks are and
how they can help their children. There were also negative experiences showing that the teacher completely excluded the mother from the child’s musical education due to a lack of communication. Bugeja’s research fully supported the view that the key to musical success is the collaboration between the student, parent, and teacher. Having examined the relevant similarities and differences, Bugeja also found that no generalizations could be made about parents, because it is not only different educational systems that determine behaviour and involvement, but probably also different personality traits.

Koops’ (2012) study also showed that the role of parents is prominent in music education. Parents’ active involvement changed preschool children’s behavior and activity during music sessions. In a later phase, music teachers tried to reduce parents’ role and distance them from their children. Many children experienced a prolonged process of separation, while children who had already let go of their parents were disturbed by the presence of other parents. Koops concluded that children behave differently in the presence of a parent. At the same time, she pointed out that encouraging parents to be active in music activities has a long-term effect on the joint musical activities of families.

Harris and Graves (2010), examining African American boys, found that cultural capital from family backgrounds was not evident in music studies. The role of parents through transgenerational mediation positively influenced reading achievement in the study sample, but involvement in art classes and music education did not yield any benefits.

McMillan’s (2004) study highlights an important point. The extent of parental involvement is not the same in teachers’, students’, and parents’ perceptions. How much and to what extent parents help with home practice is perceived very differently by each party. A survey of parents’ participation in music lessons revealed that parents perceived themselves as more passive participants in their children’s music lessons and were motivated to participate by a desire to conform rather than help their children. The survey revealed that parents’ participation was most encouraged by experienced teachers. One of the key findings was that children who received help from their parents accepted it with pleasure.

Parental attention to support and encourage children

One of the most influential factors in music education is parents’ attention, encouragement and support. The views emphasising the importance of parental involvement (both spiritual and physical) in music education are not new (Bugeja, 2009). Throughout history, renowned musicians such as Mozart benefited from parental guidance and support in their musical activities (Wagnes, 1998).

Prerequisites for extra-curricular activities such as music education include spiritual and financial support from parents (Xu, 2017). Spiritual support is manifested in parents’ positive attitudes towards music education. The effects of parental support and pressure on participation in extracurricular activities were investigated by Anderson, Funk, Elliott, and Smith (2003) among parents of elementary school children aged 9-11 years in Ohio (Cleveland) and Toledo in the USA. The results of their research show that parental support and encouragement are strongly associated with children’s participation in extracurricular activities. Research by Davidson et al. (1996) found that the most successful children in learning music were those whose parents had been involved and supportive from an early stage of learning. The study involved 257 children between the ages of 8 and 18 learning to play an instrument and their parents, with whom the researchers conducted individual interviews. A key finding of the research was that “overall, the most musically talented children received the highest levels of parental support”.

Denny’s (2007) research looked at factors influencing musical education
among 80 children aged 11-12 in England. She found that parental pressure did not influence how much a child enjoyed playing music, or how much they played, and that parental expectations did not influence musical participation. The only positive influencing factor was parental enthusiasm.

MacMillan’s (2004) study reports on a detailed qualitative survey examining teachers’, pupils’ and parents’ attitudes towards parental involvement, the extent and nature of participation and the resulting positive effects on pupils. The study involved 10 music teachers, 20 children in primary school grades 1-6 and their mothers. In the interviews and questionnaires, the teachers reported on the extent of parental involvement and on encouraging parents to invite their children to practise and to help them if the children requested it.

Bugeja (2009) explores the key similarities and differences in parental involvement between Australia’s music education systems, Suzuki and “traditional”. The research involved the mothers of two children learning to play an instrument. The interviews revealed that they both highly valued providing a suitable home environment and ongoing support and encouragement.

Koops (2012) examines music education in and out of school in terms of parental involvement. She analysed the attitudes of 19 families towards music education through a detailed qualitative survey. First, parents participated in an online music lesson and then recorded their observations online, on a platform accessible to other parents. Koops’ results show that while most parents support their children’s musical participation, there is an underlying problem, a generational gap in musical taste.

Ashbourne and Andres (2015) investigated the impact of parents on their children’s extracurricular activities. Originally, fifty-one Canadian subjects were involved in the study. Next, 24 interviewees participated in seven waves of interviews between 1990 and 2010. Finally, the accounts of 14 interviewees who became parents during this period were analysed. After evaluating the results, the researchers distinguished three types of parental involvement: the enforcer – who is motivated by their own conviction that their child should participate in some extracurricular activity; the facilitator – who lets their child choose an extracurricular activity based on their own interests; and finally, the encourager – who has an idea of what activity would be beneficial for their child, yet does not force them to participate, but rather encourages them to do so. The majority of parents fell into the last category.

Another study reveals that many Hong Kong parents want their children to learn music outside school. Choi et al. (2005) used a questionnaire survey to investigate the explanatory factors for this phenomenon among 97 Hong Kong parents (90% of them mothers). The parents in the study were willing to devote 10% of their monthly earnings to extracurricular activities and were able to devote time to this, indicating that they considered music studies important for their children’s development.

Youm’s (2013) research explored South Korean mothers’ desires, knowledge and practices regarding music education. Although the research questions were not primarily focused on parental support and encouragement issues, the author mentions an indirect finding in the results formulated after an analysis of qualitative data (interviews and diary entries by mothers). The author found a strong willingness among the mothers to learn more about the process of music education and to support their children.

McDowell (2008) investigated parents’ motivations to enroll their children in a 5-day music camp. The study involved 16 parents (with children aged 1.5 to 7 years) and found that one of the most common motivations for parents was to help their children develop their skills.
Other branches of art

Another big branch of artistic development is collaboration with the help of dance. Looking at case studies, we can find examples where both parents and children have had problems developing and sustaining personal relationships. As interacting with other people is inevitable in life, these people, despite having many good experiences, have overwhelmingly bad ones. An interaction that goes wrong can traumatising its participants, which can generate lifelong problems and lead to the loss of the ability to engage in interpersonal relationships. Such people are helped by targeted dance programmes that use the desire to bond and the general human need to develop interpersonal relationships and relational engagement in order to promote participants’ progress. The case study also shows that parental involvement is maximised and plays a prominent role in dance development, as it enables parent and children to achieve the desired goals together. As a result, a major role is given to fostering relationships, building interpersonal trust and developing social interactions at dance classes (Lorenzo-Lasa et al., 2007).

In their study, Lorenzo-Lasa et al. (2007) described their experiences in their dance program over three years. They mainly observed relational engagement in dancing. In community spaces or houses, they organised dancing sessions where families from any background could visit and participate in classes in an enjoyable and liberated way. Many participants also had problems communicating with their children, but the programme helped them start interacting. After the end of the project, there were several measurable outcomes including short-, medium- and long-term effects. The results showed that parents had a better insight into their children’s development and that their own skills had also reached higher levels. In addition to improving cognitive, social and physical skills and strengthening cohesion within their families, parents experienced improving relationships with their family members (Lorenzo-Lasa et al., 2007). We can also find examples of using the potentials of another major artistic field, the visual arts. Similarly to dance, the focus was on children and their parents. However, it is important to note that the role of a gallery as a formal mediator of art needed to be completely transformed. The Liverpool Tate Gallery targeted disadvantaged and immigrant families. For them, it was inherently difficult to integrate into a culture which was not their own, let alone understand art and consume a different culture. The involvement of parents was also very important in the programme, as they were the ones who took the children to the gallery. One of the innovations of the project was to organise interesting and safe exhibitions for children. However, the aims of the programme were more far-reaching. Parents were not only involved as observers but also played a part in passing on knowledge, thereby developing their own skills. This was only the first step in the programme, however, as it was necessary not only to attract disadvantaged families to the gallery but also to keep the interest and motivation of those once involved alive. This was to be achieved through well-defined activities and community-building tools. Indeed, fostering a sense of belonging to a community can provide the important missing bonds for an immigrant family that has already left its roots. In summary, the Liverpool Tate Gallery’s programme uses visual arts sessions to introduce art to children and parents, without them even leaving their comfort zone. Once the community is established, the exhibitions or events will no longer be the only motivators in the lives of families, but the community will also act as a pull factor. This suggests that this type of engagement in visual arts can be a chance for families to connect to the community and develop and improve their relationship with art (Wright 2020).

The third major category is theatre arts development, which is described by Reinking et al. (2017) in a study that provides a number of good practices. Theatre is perhaps the artistic field that everyone
encounters at least once in their life. The event presented in the study familiarised entire families with this form of the performing arts. Involving parents and children alike allowed them to develop not only in their understanding of art, but also in other areas. Theatre and puppetry provided opportunities for those involved in the event to develop STEM and other cognitive areas through the performance. The performance was a particularly important moment in the process, as they allowed all members of the family to get involved, so that parents were actively engaged. Families reported that they really enjoyed it when their children could try their hand on stage.

In summary, unlike in the field of music, where all three types of parental involvement are present, the studies describing theatre, visual arts, and dance development mainly focus on parents as active participants. It is also shown that playful activities and projects can provide children and their parents with skills they have not had before.

CONCLUSIONS

One of the aims of our research was to explore studies on parental involvement in different artistic fields (music, dance, visual arts, drama, and puppetry) using a systematic review method. Systematic literature review is a methodology that examines all published studies in order to avoid the bias that may result from the fact that a researcher of a field of study may attach greater importance to a particular area of research. We have found that research is highly disproportionate across the different branches of art. Compared to the high profile of music education in the studies, the amount of research published on theatre, dance and visual arts is negligible. We firmly believe it is important that research is also carried out in these branches of art, as these are in fact unexplored areas. Our research also fills a gap because it highlights this deficiency in educational research.

Using the PRISMA procedure, 21 out of 108 studies were selected, all but one published after 2000. The studies were reviewed to study the impact of parents on their children’s art education. We lay special emphasis on the factors affecting the development of taste. Overall, several studies confirmed the influence of cultural capital, i.e. parents’ previous musical or cultural experiences as a determinant of their children’s upbringing.

The most common musical activity done together was singing at home, which can be realized easily and accompanies one during a lifetime. Singing together helps to build and nurture interpersonal relationships, which is why interiorisation is so important, making the activity natural.

Several researchers recommend the active involvement of parents in their children’s musical studies, which, in addition to setting an example and providing a useful way to spend leisure time, also strengthens family cohesion. The key to effective music education is teacher, parent and child collaboration. At the same time, one should not overlook MacMillan’s research findings, which have shown that the degree of parental involvement is subjective from the point of view of each actor concerned in the process, who experiences, perceives, and evaluate the same situation differently. Nevertheless, parental attention and support is a significant stimulus for their children’s artistic studies.

Our research aimed to identify similarities and differences in types of parental involvement across artistic fields. Parental involvement in art education can take two dimensions: passive – parents act as observers, or active – they engage in the activity itself. The study found differences between the involvement of parent groups in each branch of art. For children learning music, three groups were distinguished: 1. Active parental involvement in the child’s musical education; 2. Parental attention, mainly with the purpose of encouragement and support; 3. The motivating power of musical activity at home. There was no evidence of joint activity at home in the
other three arts.

Overall, it can be concluded that the involvement of parents in their children’s artistic education is of paramount importance both for the development of the children and for the strengthening of family ties. We believe it is essential to research this area because a situation analysis can help us find out what needs to be changed in each institution and make our recommendations for each branch of art. In this way, the motivation and efficiency of art education can be increased and drop-out rates can be reduced, which is extremely important as it is not a compulsory school activity but a useful way of spending leisure time.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Funding: This paper has been implemented with the support provided by the Scientific Foundations of Education Research Program of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences. The APC was funded by MTA-DE-Parent-Teacher Cooperation Research Group.

REFERENCES


