Exploring Management Research Landscape in Indonesia

Budi Harsanto, Egi Arvian Firmansyah
Faculty of Economics and Business, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia

Abstract
Management research is critical to the advancement of management studies and practice in Indonesia. The aim of this study is to explore the landscape of management research in Indonesia. This study uses a bibliometric approach with data collected from the international academic database. In our analysis, among others, we refer to the classical categorization of business functions and macro clusters or special interest groups from leading management associations. The study results show that the management research landscape in Indonesia can be grouped into six categories, namely 'operations management', 'financial management', 'marketing management', 'human resource management', 'strategy and entrepreneurship', and 'performance and governance'. This is the first study that explores the management research landscape in the Indonesian context.

Eksplorasi Lanskap Riset Manajemen di Indonesia

Abstrak

JEL Classification: M00, M10

INTRODUCTION

Research on management is one of the most widely researched areas and has been extensively published in both academic and non-academic literature. A similar pattern also happened in Indonesia, where the field of management is one of the most sought after fields of science, as indicated by the number of study programs and the number of researchers. In 2019, there were more than 1100 management study programs, the most in Indonesia, followed by accounting 991 study programs and midwifery 790 study programs (Kemenristekdikti, 2019).

In terms of the number of researchers, author data in the Science and Technology Index (Sinta) shows that the researcher or author is one of the highest compared to other fields. Authors with the subject ‘management’ are the most in number (928), followed by ‘accounting’ (845), then ‘education’ (629) and ‘nursing’ (441) (SINTA, 2021).

Indeed, the subject area in the index does not include other synonyms (such as ‘management science’ or ‘management’ or ‘accounting’ for ‘accounting’), but at least it provides an idea of how many authors in Indonesia are in this subject area. Not to mention if we examine the non-academic or grey literature such as reports in various institutions, or writings in the mass media, the number can be said to be almost in-calculable.

Despite the fact that there has been a lot of research done on management research in Indonesia, there is not a single study that maps the research landscape in this field in Indonesia. Previous research has been conducted in a broad context, such as Asia (Lau, 2002), or on a specific aspect of management in a specific country or region (Kaufman, 2012; Castillo & Hallinger, 2018). None of it has yet been discovered for the Indonesian context. Efforts to map this landscape are important, especially for academic literature, so it is clear which direction these studies are taking so far. Also, to identify areas that researchers in Indonesia have less research to reduce the excess of research in certain areas.

The purpose of this paper is to explore the landscape of management research in Indonesia by analyzing the studies of Indonesian authors published in international journals. In order for this landscape exploration to be relevant to the latest developments in management science, the exploration is carried out by referring to the classical categorization of business functions as well as looking at research areas (clusters of special interest groups) that exist in world-leading management associations such as the Academy of Management (AOM) or British Academy of Management (BAM).

This study contributes to this growing area of research by providing ideas for advancement research on management in Indonesia. This study can also provide ideas for researchers in Indonesia to develop areas that have developed internationally but are less researched in Indonesia. To the best of our knowledge, this present research is the first study that specifically explores the management research landscape in the Indonesian context. Therefore, our research finding will enhance the literature of management study, primarily in the context of an emerging economy.

This paper is structured as follows. The next section contains an explanation of the research approach along with data collection and analysis. The results and discussion are presented in detail in the third section. The last section contains conclusions, including limitations and further directions.

METHOD

In this present study, we employ a bibliometric approach utilizing a major academic database. We used the following protocol, which was adapted from various studies on the bibliometric and systematic review (Denyer & Tranfield, 2009; van Eck & Waltman, 2014).

First, we performed the search in the academic database of Scopus. Scopus was selected due to its extensive coverage and relatively well-maintained quality control (Harzing & Alakangas, 2016; Schotten et al., 2017). We have con-
sidered combining it with other databases with high-quality control, such as Web of Science. However, we decided to focus on Scopus because the overlap is very large with WoS. In addition, it was common in previous bibliometrics studies to use a single database (e.g., Kalantari et al., 2017; Harsanto, 2020).

We search the title, abstract and keywords using the search term of “management OR business and indonesia”. We obtained a huge number of items consisting of 19,468 items. We then limited the subject area to the field of business, management, and accounting, resulting in 3,673 items.

Subsequently, we applied some filters, selecting only journal articles published in English with at least one author from Indonesia. Furthermore, we limited the search to the items published only from 2015 to 2021 which are considered new publications. Finally, we obtained 1,956 final items to be explored in this study. The process of item selection is shown in Figure 1.

We utilized VOSviewer software to map the keywords used in the management research (van Eck & Waltman, 2020). It helps us develop the landscape and relate the results with the formal categorization in management research used such as in AOM and BAM. Furthermore, we use content analysis on article keywords to determine the frequency of occurrence of specific term in particular content (Armfield et al., 2014; Harsanto, 2020a) ranked, charted and tabulated. Frequency of publication by author was also calculated, ranked and tabulated. The process was repeated for two time periods to examine change: to help distinguish between areas of management research in Indonesia that have received a lot of attention and those that have not.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

As shown in Figure 2, the number of studies in our investigation generally shows an increasing pattern from 2015 to 2020. The year 2021 displays a much lower number because we retrieved the data in April 2021, and this year has not ended yet. However, due to the Covid-19 pandemic and lockdowns, there is a probability that the total number might be lower than 2020 or 2019.

It is interesting to note that the increase of research numbers from 2015 to 2018 is somewhat steady, while the research in 2019 experienced a high leap, growing around 79 percent from the previous year.

In addition to the year of publication, we map the management research based on the journals becoming the publication channels. Most of the studies within our observation period were published in the International Journal of Supply Chain Management, based in the UK. When this paper is composed, this journal is no
longer indexed in Scopus, as can be seen from its website and Scimago website. The second most chosen journal is the International Journal of Scientific and Technology Research, based in India. This journal is also not indexed in Scopus anymore per 2021. Seeing these results and the overall result is shown in Table 1, it can be implied that most of the studies in our investigation are not the highest in terms of quality because none of these ten most journals is indexed in Scopus first quartile (Q1). Besides, some of them do not possess Scopus indexation per 2021.

In addition to mapping the items based on year and journal outlets, we conducted an analysis on the document keywords using VOSViewer software. Our analysis shows that in total, there are thousands of keywords used in the publications analyzed. The analysis is then carried out on the keywords with high occurrence to obtain a clearer picture of the landscape. The default setting in VOSViewer is a minimum of 5 occurrences which is then doubled to a minimum of 10 occurrences to really obtain a more focused picture of the specific topic studied by Indonesian authors. The results of the analysis show that there are 69 keywords that appear most often with a minimum occurrence rate of 10 times (Table 1).

Table 1. Keyword Occurrences

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Keyword</th>
<th>Occurrences</th>
<th>Keyword</th>
<th>Occurrences</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>indonesia</td>
<td>311</td>
<td>culture</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>supply chain management</td>
<td>92</td>
<td>employee performance</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>performance</td>
<td>61</td>
<td>marketing performance</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>business performance</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>smes</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>smes</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>organizational culture</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>earnings management</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>risk management</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>competitive advantage</td>
<td>39</td>
<td>environmental performance</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>knowledge management</td>
<td>38</td>
<td>job satisfaction</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>financial performance</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>human resource management</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>innovation</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>information technology</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>profitability</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>loyalty</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>supply chain</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>social media</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>corporate governance</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>strategic management</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>service quality</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>sustainable development</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>leadership</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>higher education</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sustainability</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>sme</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>competitiveness</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>technology</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>entrepreneurial orientation</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>ahp</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>entrepreneurship</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>business</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tourism</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>company size</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>corporate social responsibility</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>competition</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>intellectual capital</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>firm size</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>business strategy</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>transformational leadership</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>firm performance</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>bali</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>leverage</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>commitment</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>motivation</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>creative industries</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The top keyword with the highest occurrence is ‘indonesia’ (311 times). This is indeed not surprising because the focus of the search is on publications written by Indonesians whose research is most likely carried out in the Indonesian context. After that, there are various keywords used by the authors. These emerging keywords are diverse and come from various sub-disciplines in management such as operations management (e.g., supply chain management 92 times, innovation 36 times), financial management (e.g., earning management 40 times, financial performance 36 times), human resource management (e.g., knowledge management 38 times, leadership 28 times) and marketing management (e.g., service quality 29 times, market orientation 20 times).

At the top of the list, the most widely used keywords relate to performance either in general (e.g., performance 61 times, business performance 49 times, firm performance 22 times) or specifically to certain aspects, especially finance (e.g., financial performance 36 times, profitability 35 times). This indicates that many authors pay attention to the tangible output of the company in the form of measurable performance as one of the key variables in their research. This also indicates a tendency to gain managerial insights by analyzing data based on past performance.

For the size of the business that has been studied a lot, it seems that small and medium enterprises are indicated by several relevant keywords with high occurrences (sme 47 times, msme 16 times, sme 12 times). This can be caused by a large number of SMEs in Indonesia, according to the latest data reaching more than 64 million SMEs or 99% of business actors in Indonesia (cite). Another reason is that data access may be easier compared to large companies which usually require quite a long bureaucracy.

Those keywords are then grouped into categories to facilitate the landscape mapping. Categorization is mainly carried out by referring to the classical categorization of business functions which consists of ‘operations’, ‘marketing’, ‘finance’, and ‘human resources’ (Heizet al., 2017). In addition, we add two categories, namely ‘strategy and entrepreneurship’; and ‘performance and governance’. ‘Strategy and entrepreneurship’ are a common group or concentration in management schools, in Indonesia and globally. The ‘performance and governance’ categories were added because we found many publications in this area, so we decided to group it into one particular category.

For the subcategories, we group them with reference to world-leading management associations, including meso and macro clusters of the Academy of Management (AOM) and special interest groups of the British Academy of Management (BAM). Indeed, the process of grouping keywords sometimes overlaps. If a keyword can fit into some subcategories, then we have a discussion and include it only in one category that is more dominant. Some keywords that are also excluded in the categorization process are general keywords such as ‘Indonesia’, ‘business’, ‘company size’ or ‘management’. The results of this mapping process are shown in Figure 2.
Following the mapping, we identified less researched areas or gaps that could be prioritized for future research. We identify the less researched gap by identifying research clusters or sub-clusters in AOM (Academy of Management) or special interest groups (SIGs) or sub-SIGs in BAM (British Academy of Management) with a low or no occurrence frequency in Indonesian management research.

**Operations management**

In the subject area of operations management, two major groups were identified, namely ‘supply chain management’ and ‘technology and innovation’. These two subareas are two groups that are currently receiving great attention in the midst of a globalized value chain that involves not only local and national supply chains but also global. The supply chain is known to be a source of competitive advantage for companies where competition is no longer between companies but rather competition between supply chains.

The keywords of ‘technology and innovation’ evolve alongside technological developments in the era of Industry 4.0 (Fatimah et al., 2020; Mihardjo et al., 2021), as well as technological and non-technological disruptions that continue today. Some authors combine these two subareas, for example, examining the role of technology in the supply chain (e.g. Hendayani & Febriantia, 2020). Less researched areas identified are individual areas in critical operations management decisions such as quality management, location and layout, job design, inventory management, maintenance, scheduling, humanitarian SCM.

**Financial management**

In the financial management subject area, there have been numerous studies with the keywords ‘earning management’ (e.g., Kountur et al., 2021) ‘profitability’, ‘leverage’, ‘risk management’, and ‘liquidity’. These keywords have been central in financial management research because they are in line with the primary goals of financial managers, namely, creating value for the companies they are managing. Furthermore, as the business environment shifts and becomes more dynamic, the roles of financial managers also change from transactional to the ones which are more strategic, such as financial strategy (Ilie, 2015). Unfortunately, the re-

---

**Figure 2. Management Research Landscape in Indonesia (authors’ elaboration from Scopus database, 2021)**

[Table showing management research landscape in Indonesia]
search in this later field is lacking, as shown in Figure 2. Another less researched study in the financial management area deals with financial education. In fact, financial education is critical in facilitating the sustainability of micro-businesses, mainly in developing countries such as Indonesia (Sahela et al., 2021).

Marketing management

In the subject area of marketing management, the classical keywords that have been widely studied include ‘service quality’, ‘market orientation’ customer satisfaction’ or ‘loyalty’. The more recent ones include ‘e-commerce’ and ‘social media’. The ‘e-commerce’ has become an inseparable part of everyday life (Setyorini & Hendriyanto, 2017; Nurbadi & Purnomo, 2018). Especially in the era of a pandemic that is accompanied by various measurements such as lockdowns, social distancing, or mobility restrictions that make ‘e-commerce’ increasingly popular in the community. The use of ‘social media’ for marketing has also grown in such a way that research with these keywords has also grown (Hidayanti et al., 2018; Krisna et al., 2019). Less researched keywords found in this area that could be an important contribution in the future include, for example, ‘retail management’, ‘consumer behaviour’, and ‘marketing principles and practice’.

Human resources management

The topic researched in human resources management includes more varied keywords than other business functions of operations, financial, or marketing management. The sub-bereas studied include ‘HRM and leadership’, ‘organizational behavior’ and ‘knowledge and learning’. These topics seem to be topics of all time that are timeless to investigate. An interesting study that integrates several important themes in HR, for example, from Soeprayitno (2020) which examines the relationship between knowledge management, leadership, and motivation in organizations. Also, recent studies link HR topics with digital transformation (Fachrunnisa et al., 2020; Nasution et al., 2020).

Less researched topics identified, for example, are group or team characteristics, organizational processes and practices, organizational identity and climate, knowledge transfer, management learning, and management education.

Strategy and entrepreneurship

Strategic management and entrepreneurship play an essential role in corporations of any size, and they are closely related. Our research findings reveal that topic of strategy is also quite intensively researched. Several topics, such as ‘competitive advantage’ ‘competitiveness’, and ‘business strategy’. Many studies in this field investigate the determinant of competitive advantage both at small or micro-businesses (e.g., Wijaya & Suasih, 2020; Iriyanto et al., 2021) and large corporations (e.g., Maryono et al., 2020; Nadiah & Rosyidi, 2020) housing finance is mainly raised from banks, with the government-owned housing bank (GOHB). Other research topics which are less researched in strategy and entrepreneurship area are some keywords, such as ‘strategy as practice’, ‘global strategy’, ‘strategy foresight’, ‘teaching strategy’, and ‘family business’.

Performance and governance

Performance and governance are among the most intensively researched. For ‘performance’ this is not surprising because researchers and readers are usually interested in the concrete impact of the various variables studied on company performance. The most researched is ‘financial performance’ (e.g., Savitri, 2018; Singapurwoko, 2019). In addition, there are also publications that discuss non-financial performance, such as ‘environmental performance’ (Deswanto & Siregar, 2018; Susanty et al., 2020). For ‘corporate governance’ the keywords that are widely researched besides ‘corporate governance’ are ‘csr’ and ‘sustainability’. Areas that are less researched include, for example, ‘social performance’ or ‘managerial remuneration’.

Based on the results outlined in this section, to our knowledge, this is the first study to
look at the management research scene in Indonesia comprehensively. As a result, our findings will contribute to the management literature, especially in the setting of emerging economies.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

The purpose of this study is to explore the landscape of management research in Indonesia. This study has identified 69 most frequent keywords, which can be grouped into six main research areas. In the field of ‘operations management’ the two main subareas researched are ‘supply chain management’ and ‘technology and innovation’. In the field of ‘financial management’ and ‘marketing management’, generic for the two words. In the field of ‘human resource management’, the two main subareas studied are ‘HRM and leadership’, ‘organizational behavior’ and ‘knowledge and learning’. ‘Strategic management’ and ‘entrepreneurship’ are the two main subareas for the ‘strategy and entrepreneurship’ category. Finally, ‘performance management’ and ‘corporate governance’ are the main subareas in the ‘performance and governance’ category.

The study identified less researched topics in each research area, in addition to areas that have been extensively researched. The less researched area was identified by analyzing different clusters/sub-clusters in AOM or special interest groups (SIGs) or sub-SIGs in BAM with a low or no frequency of occurrence in publications included in this review. The less researched area has the potential to make significant future contributions to the landscape of management research in Indonesia.

There are several limitations in this study. First, the database used is a single academic database of Scopus. Although this database is considered the largest in terms of quantity and quality, it does not rule out the possibility of international publications not being included in the Scopus database. Future research can combine it with other academic databases such as the Web of Science. Second, the proxy used to identify the Indonesian context is the author’s affiliation with institutions located in Indonesia. This takes advantage of features in the database that have been able to identify author affiliations in detail. Although most likely the study conducted by at least one author comes from Indonesia, this has limitations because the context is not necessarily in Indonesia, and possible that management research studies in Indonesia are carried out by researchers not affiliated with institutions in Indonesia. Future studies can anticipate this shortcoming. Finally, the quality of the analyzed publications was not specifically assessed in this study. We rely on quality assurance mechanisms by Scopus. Also, this study does not exclude journals that are no longer indexed in the database (discontinued). Future studies can assess in more detail the quality of publications and may exclude publications in discontinued journals.

REFERENCES


Sahela, K. Z., Susanti, R., & Adjie, A. R. (2021). The Influence of Government Dimension on the...


