



Optimizing the Health System Through Increasing Health Service Guarantees in the Context of Fulfilling Human Rights Post the Covid-19 Pandemic in Indonesia

Sahat Maruli Tua Situmeang^{1✉}, Diah Pudjiastuti²

¹Faculty of Law, Universitas Komputer Indonesia

²Faculty of Social Sciences and Business, International Women University

DOI: [Http://Dx.Doi.Org/10.15294/Pandecta.V18i2.47957](http://Dx.Doi.Org/10.15294/Pandecta.V18i2.47957)

Article Info

Abstract

Article History:

Submitted: October 4th 2023

Revised: November 24th 2023

Accepted: December 5th 2023

Keywords:

Health System; Health services; Human rights; Post Covid 19 Pandemic

The COVID-19 pandemic has had a major impact, especially in the health sector. Health facilities and personnel play a key role in handling this pandemic. The importance of improving the quality of health services does not only depend on regulations, but also structure and culture as an interconnected system. This pandemic has been an important lesson, highlighting the readiness and quality of health services. Community resilience emphasizes the need for health protection as a state responsibility and a constitutional right of citizens. In facing the future, the role of the state, regulations and systems will be crucial in managing the health of its citizens in a sustainable manner. Using normative juridical research methods, the results of the analysis show that the state has full authority through the formation of regulations, infrastructure, improving the quality of human resources, and regulating the health system. This step aims to increase guarantees of public health services and fulfill citizens' human rights in the future.

✉Address: Jl Dipati Ukur No 94 Jawa Barat 40132
Email: sahat@email.unikom.ac.id

ISSN: 1907-8919 (Cetak)
ISSN: 2337-5418 (Online)

A. Introduction

The development of a country is very dependent on its ability and success in carrying out the development process. Development, as a planned change, covers all aspects of community life. The success of development really depends on two main factors, namely human resources which involve people from the planning stage to implementation, and the financing aspect.¹ the Covid-19 pandemic outbreak which began at the end of december 2019 prompted the need for intensive and intelligent efforts to find alternative sources of economic growth for Indonesia.²

Global economic growth will also be greatly influenced by international cooperation. This pandemic has shown that global health challenges know no

national boundaries, and solutions must also be global. Countries need to increase cooperation regarding vaccine distribution, climate change, international trade and economic recovery efforts. This is the right time for countries to increase their collaboration through international organizations such as The United Nations and the G20.³

A public health emergency is an unexpected emergency event in a community risk situation, causing a major impact on all aspects of social life. Public emergencies of all kinds are characterized by uncertainty, complexity, and dispersion across multiple domains.⁴

The Covid 19 pandemic has caused a multidimensional crisis,

¹ Amalia Fadhila Rachmawati Et Al., "Dampak Korupsi Dalam Perkembangan Ekonomi Dan Penegakan Hukum Di Indonesia," *Eksaminasi: Jurnal Hukum*, Vol. 1, 2022.

² A. S. Rusydiana, "Indeks Malmquist Untuk Pengukuran Efisiensi Dan Produktivitas Bank Syariah Di Indonesia." *Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Pembangunan*, *Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Pembangunan* 26, No. 1 (2018): 47-58.

³ Aris Agus Wahyudi, "Pemulihan Pasca-Pandemi: Bagaimana Ekonomi Global Menyusun Strategi Kembali Ke Jalur Pertumbuhan," N.D.

⁴ Li Xiong, Peiyang Hu, And Houcai Wang, "Establishment Of Epidemic Early Warning Index System And Optimization Of Infectious Disease Model: Analysis On Monitoring Data Of Public Health Emergencies," *International Journal Of Disaster Risk Reduction* 65 (November 1, 2021), <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijdr.2021.102547>.

one of the sectors most affected is the health sector. The implementation of new habits (new normal) which aims to reduce the spread of the Covid 19 pandemic, such as social distancing, the imposition of restrictions on physical activities, has had a negative impact but also has an impact as a positive habit in the actualization of the right to health services. This is because the Covid 19 pandemic is a test of a nation's resilience. As Singapore's minister of foreign affairs Vivian Balakrishnan said, the Covid 19 pandemic is a quick test of the resilience of public health, social capital and government governance systems.⁵ The multidimensional crisis resulting from the Covid 19 pandemic came so quickly and revealed the fragility of a country in various fields.

In the health sector, this pandemic, for example, shows how inadequate and uneven health

⁵ A. I. Rahutami, "Covid-19 Dan Respon Usaha Kecil Menengah Di Asia Tenggara," In *Chapter*, 2021, 2.

facilities are in many countries.⁶ Even though health is very important, humans will lose all possibility of obtaining other rights without health. Therefore, health is one of the basic human needs. Health insurance has been regulated in various provisions of national legislation as well as in the global community through the 1946 World Health Organization (WHO) constitution which also outlines that obtaining the highest possible level of health is a human right for every person. Therefore, the right to health should be respected and implemented by the state as one of the fundamental rights. The government's obligation to fulfill constitutional rights in Article 28 paragraph (4) of the 1945 Constitution states that the protection, promotion and fulfillment of human rights is the responsibility of the state, especially the government. This government obligation is further

⁶ Mohamad Ikhsan Modjo, "Memetakan Jalan Penguatan Ekonomi Pasca Pandemi," *The Indonesian Journal Of Development Planning*, Vol. Iv, N.D., [Http://Shorturl.At/Xjxz2](http://Shorturl.At/Xjxz2).

clarified in article 8 of the human rights law, and in Article 7 of the health law which states that the government is tasked with providing health efforts that are equitable and affordable for every Indonesian citizen. Apart from that, Article 9 of Law Number 36 Of 2009 Concerning Health States That The Government Is Responsible For Improving The Health Status of Indonesian Citizens.

These weaknesses in the health system reflect a failure of accountability that violates the right to health and maintains stark inequities.⁷

In this regard, development in the health sector is an integral part of overall national development. Development in this field is directed at achieving optimal levels of health at all levels of society. With regard to this, in

⁷ Alison Hernández Et Al., "Pathways To Accountability In Rural Guatemala: A Qualitative Comparative Analysis Of Citizen-Led Initiatives For The Right To Health Of Indigenous Populations," *World Development* 113 (January 1, 2019): 392–401, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2018.09.020>.

practice, after the Covid 19 pandemic, development in the health sector is not going well, this can be seen from the fact that there are still many health services that are not running optimally, which is manifested by the low level of health services for citizens of the country. For example, patients are required to register to get health services and have to queue from early in the morning to get an early queue number, then get initial examination services by nurses who also queue and to get medicine they also queue for hours, apart from that, patients who have to seek outpatient treatment do not there are efforts by health facilities or hospitals to control whether routine checks are going well or not, meaning that decisions regarding health follow-up are returned to the community as citizens. Even though logically this doesn't work, it certainly doesn't escape the factors that influence it, for example not all of the medicines that are covered by the government so the rest must be borne by the patient without

knowing for sure what medicines are actually covered by the government, the difference in services for BPJS and non-BPJS patients. Apart from that, there is a lack of nursing services, administrative and information services, medical services, pharmaceutical services, nutritional services, emergency services, and other services which of course constitute the optimization of the health system.

In the minister of health regulation Number 20 of 2022 Concerning National Indicators For The Quality Of Health Services For Independent Practice Places For Doctors And Dentists, Community Health Center Clinics, Hospitals, Health Laboratories And Blood Transfusion Units Article 4 Number 1 Letter A, Number 2 Letter D, Number 3 Letter F, Number 4 Letter M, Number 5 Letter G, Number 6 Letter G, Which States That The Quality Indicators In The Independent Practice Of Doctors And Dentists As Intended In Article 3 Consist Of Patient

Satisfaction. This means that patient satisfaction determines the quality of health services, which is currently known to be very different between government and non-government health services. This is certainly a challenge and obstacle in efforts to fulfill health.

In this regard, the problem is firstly how to regulate health services after the Covid-19 Pandemic in Indonesia and how the government will make efforts to optimize the health system by increasing health service guarantees in order to fulfill human rights after the Covid-19 pandemic in Indonesia.

The discussion about health insurance is not a new topic, there has been a lot of previous research, including:

1. Supriyono, Et Al, With an Article Entitled The Urgency of Fulfilling Citizens' Constitutional Rights In The Covid 19 Pandemic Era In Indonesia In The Scientific Journal Of Law And Human Rights Vol 1 No. 2 Of 2022;
2. Sholahuddin Al-Fatih, Et Al With an Article Entitled State Responsibility in The Covid 19 Case As A

Manifestation Of Human Rights Protection;

3. Ni Ketut Tri Srilaksmi With an Article Entitled Health Insurance Policy For The Community During The Covid 19 Pandemic In Indonesia.

The first research is limited to fulfilling the constitutional rights of citizens during the Covid-19 Pandemic. The second research discusses the government's efforts to ensure the fulfillment of citizens' basic rights during the Covid-19 Pandemic. The third research discusses Indonesian citizens' rights to health insurance, and: in this context, it becomes mandatory to become a health insurance participant. Meanwhile, research conducted by the author states that the state has full authority through the establishment of regulations, infrastructure, improving the quality of human resources, and regulating the health system in improving guarantees of public health services and fulfilling citizens' human rights in the future.

B. Method

This research is research that uses a qualitative approach, namely focusing on in-depth and interpretive understanding of individual experiences, community perceptions and social contexts related to the health system and human rights to identify patterns, themes and concepts that emerge from the data. Apart from that, this research is normative/doctrinal legal research, namely research that systematically explains the rules related to the health system and analyzes the relationship between these regulations. In this research the author used a normative juridical approach and the research specifications used a descriptive analytical method, where in this research the object of research was the health system after the Covid 19 pandemic in Indonesia as a form of health system reform in the future that is better prepared to face global health recovery.

C. Results and Discussion

1. Post Covid 19 Pandemic Health Service Arrangements in Indonesia

The concept of international health focuses on the application of public health principles to health problems and challenges affecting low- and middle-income countries and the complexity of global and local factors that influence them.⁸

The 1945 Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia is based on Human Rights. These rights include gaining access to resources in the health sector, obtaining safe, quality and affordable health services, as well as the right to social security which enables one's full development as a human being with dignity. The implementation of equitable and affordable health efforts is planned, regulated, organized, fostered and supervised by the government in accordance

with the mandate of law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 36 Of 2009 Concerning Health.⁹ apart from that, based on The Declaration of Human Rights From The United Nations, In 1948 everyone has the right to receive health services and care for themselves and their families, as well as guarantees when unemployed, sick, disabled, widowed, old age or lack of sufficient income. Caused by things beyond his control. Patients should be respected for their basic rights and Human Rights, but sometimes due to several reasons these patient rights are ignored, so that legal protection for patients is increasingly fading.¹⁰

In this regard, the quality of the medical team's services is the focus of society during this

⁸ K. La Ane, R., Putri, M. S. A., Susilawaty, A., Marlina, H., Syakurah, R. A., Niam, A. C., ... & Ernawati, *Kesehatan Global*, 2022.

⁹ A. A. Malik, "Implementasi Kebijakan Diskresi Pada Pelayanan Kesehatan Badan Penyelenggara Jaminan Kesehatan (Bpjs)," *Jurnal Ilmiah Kesehatan Sandi Husada* 8, No. 1 (2019): 1389.

¹⁰ Valeri M P Siringoringo, Dewi Hendrawati, And R Suharto, "Pengaturan Perlindungan Hukum Hak-Hak Pasien Dalam Peraturan Perundang-Undangan Tentang Kesehatan Di Indonesia," *Diponegoro Law Journal*, Vol. 6, 2017.

pandemic. The public expects guarantees of confidentiality too, not only protecting the patient's body and mind. Apart from that, patients expect the capability, skill and patience of the medical team to carry out their duties. This is an indicator of the public's assessment of the quality of the medical team's services. Patients can experience good health services in the form of maintaining patient safety, reducing service negligence, improving service quality, accurately diagnosing illnesses and procedures, as well as the way doctors convey information to patients.

Health insurance is a human right, therefore every country must develop universal health coverage through a social health insurance mechanism to guarantee sustainable health financing. The term Universal Health Coverage (UHC) comes from The World Health Organization (WHO) which ensures that all people have access to the health services they need. The first dimension of universal coverage according to

who is the size of the population whose health services are guaranteed. The second dimension is the completeness of guaranteed health services. The third dimension is the proportion of direct costs borne by health service recipients.¹¹

Guarantees of Human Rights protection for the right to obtain health services are regulated in international human rights instruments and national laws and regulations, the government's responsibility in upholding human rights in health services. Decree of the people's consultative assembly of the Republic of Indonesia Number XVII /MPR/1998 Article 43: The protection, promotion, enforcement and fulfillment of human rights is primarily the responsibility of the government. The responsibilities of the government and regional governments are regulated in Law Number 36 Of 2009 Concerning

¹¹ I. R. Chumaida, Z. V., As, B. S., Silvia, F., Usanti, T. P., & Aryatie, "Kepesertaan Program Bpjs Kesehatan Di Tengah Wabah Pandemic Covid-19," *Jurnal: Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 4, No. 2 (2020): 131.

Health, As Regulated In Articles 14 To Article 20.¹² in addition, the regulation of health services for citizens is regulated in statutory provisions, including the following:¹³

- a. Law Number 40 of 2004 Concerning The National Social Security System (State Gazette of The Republic of Indonesia of 2004 Number 150, Supplement to the State Gazette of the Republic of Indonesia Number 4456).
- b. Law Number 24 of 2011 Concerning Social Security Administering Bodies (State Gazette of The Republic of Indonesia of 2011 Number 116, Supplement to State Gazette of The Republic of Indonesia Number 5256).
- c. Presidential Regulation Number 82 of 2018 Concerning Health Insurance (State Gazette of

The Republic of Indonesia of 2018 Number 165) as Amended Several Times, Most Recently By Presidential Regulation Number 64 of 2020 Concerning The Second Amendment to Presidential Regulation Number 82 of 2018 Concerning Health Insurance (State Gazette of The Republic of Indonesia 2020 Number 130).

- d. Regulation of The Social Security Administering Agency For Health Number 5 Of 2018 Concerning Procedures For Billing, Payment And Recording of Health Insurance Contributions And Payment of Fines Due to Late Payment of Health Insurance Contributions (State Gazette of The Republic of Indonesia of 2018 Number 1665).
- e. Regulation of The Health Social Security Administering Body Number 3 of 2020 Concerning Amendments to Regulation of The Social Security Administering Body of Health Number 5 of 2018 Concerning Procedures for Billing, Payment and Recording of Health Insurance Contributions, And Payment of Fines Due

¹² Irwansyah Reza Mohamad, "Akademika Jurnal Umgo Perlindungan Hukum Atas Hak Mendapatkan Pelayanan Kesehatan Ditinjau Dari Aspek Hak Asasi Manusia," N.D.

¹³ N. W. W. Putri, N. E. K., Agustin, M. V., Kuswanto, M., & Oktori, "Urgensi Kebijakan Pendanaan Jaminan Kesehatan Masa Pandemi Covid-19 Di Indonesia Menurut Undang-Undang Nomor 40 Tahun 2004 Tentang Sistem Jaminan Sosial Nasional (Sjsn)," *Perspektif Hukum*, 2022, 36–37.

to Late Payment of Health Insurance Contributions.

Based on this, it shows that legal certainty regarding health guarantees has been contained in statutory regulations. However, in its implementation there are still ethical violations that even lead to criminal acts, such as medical crimes. Therefore, establishing regulations alone is not enough, but it is important to carry out supervision from upstream to downstream, so an integrated system is needed.

Additionally, the importance of policy makers, and mental health professionals in developing evidence-based strategies to create more healthy and resilient work environments.¹⁴

Furthermore, the directorate of legislative regulation analysis (dapp) stated that there are two ways that can be done to improve the quality of regulations, namely

¹⁴ Laura Sokal And Lesley Eblie Trudel, "Effects Of A School-Based, Post-Pandemic Recovery Intervention On Canadian Educators," *International Journal Of Educational Research Open* 5 (December 1, 2023), <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.Ijedro.2023.100298>.

improving existing regulations and establishing quality regulations. The formation of quality regulations means that their formation is in accordance with the principles of forming appropriate laws and regulations, their existence is really needed, and their implementation can encourage the achievement of national development goals.¹⁵

In this regard, the position of legal norm-making authority is the embodiment of state administration functions in the trias politica in the form of the executive, legislative and judiciary, the authority to regulate and make rules is not only the domain of legislative authority. In the development of a modern legal state, the authority to form legal norms by the legislature cannot be applied in a limitative manner because the need in practice means that all institutional functions require the authority to form their own regulations. Within

¹⁵ M. N. Sholikin, "Penataan-Kelembagaan-Untuk-Menjalankan-Reformasi-Regulasi-Jurnal-Hkhpmmns," *Jurnal Hukum & Pasar Modal.*, 2018, 84.

its corridors, the authority for statutory review rights in Indonesia is delegated to 3 (three) institutions. Testing by executive institutions is called executive review, testing by legislative institutions is called legislative review, and testing by judicial institutions is called judicial review.¹⁶

Furthermore, apart from the importance of regulations in optimizing the health system, it is also necessary to develop health infrastructure, which is also the main thing in efforts to optimize the health system through increasing health service guarantees in the context of fulfilling human rights. If you look at the number of hospitals available, it can be seen that hospital development is uneven. The availability of this hospital certainly affects health services for its citizens. This can be seen in

¹⁶ U. S. Wibowo, B. N., Alw, L. T., & Hardjanto, "Kewenangan Executive Review Oleh Badan Pembinaan Hukum Nasional Dalam Penataan Regulasi.," *Diponegoro Law Journal* 10, No. 1 (2021): 71.

2015, it was recorded that there were 1,951 public hospitals spread throughout Indonesia. Every year it increases. In 2016, there were 2,045 public hospitals registered with the Indonesian ministry of health. Meanwhile, in 2017 and 2018, the number increased to 2,198 and 2,269 public hospitals.¹⁷ even though there seems to be an increase, if you look at the area of Indonesia, it is 1,916,906 square kilometers for its land area ¹⁸ and the population is 275,773.8 people.¹⁹ From this data, the availability of hospitals should be easy for all citizens to access. This means that access and appropriateness of hospitals and the quality of health services must be able to create a

¹⁷ Firdhy Esterina Chrysty, "Jumlah Rumah Sakit Umum Di Indonesia 2015-2019," <https://Data.Tempo.Co/Read/985/Jumlah-Rumah-Sakit-Umum-Di-Indonesia-2015-2019>, 2022.

¹⁸ Irawan Sapto Adhi Iman Fadhilah Et Al., "Berapa Luas Negara Indonesia?," <https://Www.Kompas.Com/Global/Read/2022/11/01/170000370/Berapa-Luas-Negara-Indonesia->, 2022.

¹⁹ "Jumlah Penduduk Pertengahan Tahun (Ribuan Jiwa), 2020-2022," <https://Www.Bps.Go.Id/Indicator/12/1975/1/Jumlah-Penduduk-Pertengahan-Tahun.Html>, 2022.

just and dignified climate. This is because there are still areas where the location of the hospital is very far from being suitable and there are even areas that are not yet reached by hospitals. Based on this, health infrastructure development needs to be increased again accompanied by improvements in the quality of better health services in order to realize the protection of human rights.

Furthermore, if we look at the number of health workers, based on data from the Central Statistics Agency (BPS), the number of health workers in Indonesia will be 2,287,142 people in 2021. Of this number, nurses make up the largest number of health workers, namely 511,191 people. Many health workers are also midwives, namely 288,686 people. Then, as many as 170,541 health workers are medical personnel. There were 87,093 pharmaceutical workers. The number of biomedical engineering personnel and public health personnel is 63,748 people and 40,315 people respectively. Then, medical technical personnel

were recorded at 37,302 people. The number of nutrition workers and environmental health workers respectively is 27,917 people and 20,426 people. The number of traditional health workers is 13,485 people. Meanwhile, physical therapy and clinical psychology staff are 11,475 people and 1,155 people respectively.²⁰ at the implementation level, problems are still found which are the object of human resources, such as the unfriendliness of nurses, lack of clarity in the information received by patients, uncertain doctor visit schedules for inpatients, and other problems which will certainly affect the level of satisfaction with health services which is a basic right that protected by the constitution. Based on this data, the number of medical personnel needs to be increased in terms of numbers accompanied by an increase in the quality of human resources so that they can carry out their

²⁰ Ali Mahmudan, "Tenaga Kesehatan Indonesia Didominasi Perawat Pada 202," <https://DataIndonesia.Id/Ragam/Detail/Tenaga-Kesehatan-Indonesia-Didominasi-Perawat-Pada-2021>, N.D.

functions, duties and authority based on the applicable laws and regulations optimally.

2. Government Efforts To Optimize The Health System Through Increasing Health Service Guarantees In The Context Of Fulfilling Human Rights Post The Covid 19 Pandemic In Indonesia

Human rights are rights that humans have solely because they are human. Human beings have it not because it is given to them by society or based on positive law, but solely based on their dignity as human beings.²¹

In an effort to realize the protection of human rights, the state through its policies, namely through public policy, the government in making public policies must be able to strategically empower all available resources as solutions to the problems faced by society. Public policy should be carried out

continuously by the government to intervene in the interests of marginalized groups in society so that they can live in prosperity, and become an element that helps determine the course of development.²²

Welfare is a reflection of the quality of human life, namely a condition where basic needs are met and life values are realized.²³

Constitutionally, the government is obliged to provide adequate health services, and the community has the right to receive protection as an inherent right, so the protection and guarantee of everyone's health is at the forefront. The government's obligation to fulfill the people's constitutional right to health has

²¹ Pusat Studi Hak Asasi Manusia (Pusham), *Hukum Hak Asasi Manusia*, 2008.

²² R. M. Anwar, A., & Waas, "Hak Atas Informasi, Edukasi Dan Pelayanan Kesehatan Terhadap Masyarakat Adat Di Maluku Selama Pandemi Covid-19," *Sasi* 27, No. 2 (2021): 155.

²³ Nartin Nartin And Yuliana Musin, "Peran Pemerintah Daerah Dalam Meningkatkan Kesejahteraan Masyarakat Dimasa Pandemi Covid-19 (Studi Pada Kantor Camat Tinanggea Kabupaten Konawe Selatan)," *Sibatik Journal: Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Sosial, Ekonomi, Budaya, Teknologi, Dan Pendidikan* 1, No. 3 (February 26, 2022): 163-72, <https://doi.org/10.54443/Sibatik.V1i3.23>.

an international juridical basis, namely in Article 2 Paragraph (1) of the Convention on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.²⁴

In this regard, in a study of public satisfaction with health services in Indonesia. The ministry of health of the republic of Indonesia places eight analysis variables on community satisfaction: (1) Difficult to visit), (2) Not clean, (3) Not free to make choices, (4) Difficult to consult personally with officers, (5) Not participating in decision making in medical care, (6) Officers/Doctors/Nurses do not provide clear information to patients, (7) Officers are not friendly in providing services, and (8) Long waits for the health service process.

Apart from that, based on global issues related to restoring the health system in facing challenges, namely the need to

²⁴ Mikho Ardinata, "Tanggung Jawab Negara Terhadap Jaminan Kesehatan Dalam Perspektif Hak Asasi Manusia (Ham)," *Jurnal Ham* 11, No. 2 (August 28, 2020): 319, <https://doi.org/10.30641/Ham.2020.11.319-332>.

improve health in the midst of an environmental crisis, health services in conflict areas, equality and justice in health services, wider access to medicines, stopping infectious diseases, preparing for epidemics, protecting the public from dangerous products, investing in health workers, keeping teenagers safe, gaining public trust.²⁵

Based on this, it shows the need to build more resilient health care systems, encourage environmentally friendly initiatives, strengthen social protection and inclusion, improve crisis preparedness and response, and improve global health and equality.²⁶

Through these variables, an evaluation of each field is needed so that it is known what is appropriate, less appropriate and not appropriate so that it can

²⁵ La Ane, R., Putri, M. S. A., Susilawaty, A., Marlina, H., Syakurah, R. A., Niam, A. C., ... & Ernawati, *Kesehatan Global*.

²⁶ Krzysztof Goniewicz Et Al., "The European Union's Post-Pandemic Strategies For Public Health, Economic Recovery, And Social Resilience," *Global Transitions* 5 (January 1, 2023): 201-9, <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.Glt.2023.10.003>.

describe the problem to find a solution. This means that obstacles and challenges will be seen from the results of evaluations that occur in the field which will then be used as material for forming solutions through the formation of regulations, increasing human resources in accordance with competency and increasing supervision so that everything runs in accordance with applicable statutory provisions. Based on this, the government has full power or great authority in the context of forming regulations, establishing infrastructure and improving human resources through just policies.

In this regard, integrative legal theory provides enlightenment regarding the relevance of Pancasila and the importance of law in Indonesian human life, and reflects that law as a system that regulates people's lives cannot be separated from the culture and character of the community as well as the geographical location of the

environment and the people's way of life.²⁷ However, seeing that the health system is not yet optimal, which is characterized by low satisfaction with health services, it is certainly not without reason, there are factors that influence it that come from the government itself, for example, the government plays a partial role as a facilitator, only as a catalyst or only as a regulator.²⁸ Thus, it shows that the influence of integrated health service networks on public health is still small.²⁹

²⁷ Arfan Faiz Muhlizi Pusat Analisis Dan Evaluasi Hukum Nasional Badan Pembinaan Hukum Nasional Jl Mayjen Sutoyo No And Cililitan Jakarta, "Penataan Regulasi Dalam Mendukung Pembangunan Ekonomi Nasional (Regulatory Reform To Support National Economic Development)," *Penataan Regulasi Dalam Mendukung Pembangunan Ekonomi Nasional (Arfan Faiz Muhlizi, Vol. 6, 2017, Http://Www.Bkpm.Go.Id/Id/Artikel/Readmore/Usaha-Pemerintah-Indonesia-Dalam-Meningkatkan-*

²⁸ M. Zaelani, R., Sujana, H., & Zaky, "Optimalisasi Peran Pemerintah Sebagai Fasilitator; Katalisator; Regulator Dan Pemahaman Keuangan Syariah Dalam Mengembangkan Umkm Di Sukabumi Kota," *Jurnal Ilmiah Mea (Manajemen, Ekonomi, & Akuntansi)*, 6, No. 3 (2022): 958.

²⁹ Nicolas Larrain And Oliver Groene, "Improving The Evaluation Of An Integrated Healthcare System Using Entropy Balancing: Population Health

Based on this, the health system in the post-Covid-19 era has entered a challenging stage, characterized by increasing dependence on digital technology. Patient interactions with health systems are increasing, facilitated by Digital Health Technologies (DHT), where information is stored, processed and transmitted digitally. By adopting this approach, health systems can contribute to cost optimization, equitable access, increased efficiency, improved quality of care, population health management, and improved clinical decision making.³⁰

Thus, the formulation of regulations, implementation and enforcement requires the operation of an integrated legal

system, including ethical principles.

D. Conclusion

Based on the results of the discussion above, the form of state responsibility that guarantees health for its citizens as part of the constitutional rights of citizens is that the state has full authority and ability to protect the health rights of its citizens through the establishment of regulations, infrastructure and improving the quality of human resources and health system regulation in the future. In the future, namely increasing guarantees for public health services in order to fulfill citizens' human rights.

E. Bibliography

- Ane, R., Putri, M. S. A., Susilawaty, A., Marlina, H., Syakurah, R. A., Niam, A. C., ... & Ernawati, K. La. *Kesehatan Global*, 2022.
- Anwar, A., & Waas, R. M. "Hak Atas Informasi, Edukasi Dan Pelayanan Kesehatan Terhadap Masyarakat Adat Di Maluku Selama Pandemi Covid-19." *Sasi* 27, No. 2 (2021): 155.

Improvements In *Gesundes Kinzigal*," *Ssm - Population Health* 22 (June 1, 2023),

<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.Ssmph.2023.101371>.

³⁰ Madeleine Haig Et Al., "A Value Framework To Assess Patient-Facing Digital Health Technologies That Aim To Improve Chronic Disease Management: A Delphi Approach," *Value In Health* 26, No. 10 (October 1, 2023): 1474–84, <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.Jval.2023.06.008>.

- Ardinata, Mikho. "Tanggung Jawab Negara Terhadap Jaminan Kesehatan Dalam Perspektif Hak Asasi Manusia (HAM)." *Jurnal HAM* 11, No. 2 (August 28, 2020): 319. <https://doi.org/10.30641/Ham.2020.11.319-332>.
- Chrysty, Firdhy Esterina. "Jumlah Rumah Sakit Umum Di Indonesia 2015-2019." <https://data.tempo.co/read/985/jumlah-rumah-sakit-umum-di-indonesia-2015-2019>, 2022.
- Chumaida, Z. V., As, B. S., Silvia, F., Usanti, T. P., & Aryatie, I. R. "Kepesertaan Program Bpjs Kesehatan Di Tengah Wabah Pandemic Covid-19." *Jurnal: Kajian Hukum Dan Keadilan* 4, No. 2 (2020): 131.
- Faiz Muhlizi Pusat Analisis Dan Evaluasi Hukum Nasional Badan Pembinaan Hukum Nasional Jl Mayjen Sutoyo No, Arfan, And Cililitan Jakarta. "Penataan Regulasi Dalam Mendukung Pembangunan Ekonomi Nasional (Regulatory Reform To Support National Economic Development)." *Penataan Regulasi Dalam Mendukung Pembangunan Ekonomi Nasional (Arfan Faiz Muhlizi)*. Vol. 6, 2017. <http://www.bkpm.go.id/id/artikel/readmore/usaha-pemerintah-indonesia-dalam-meningkatkan->
- Goniewicz, Krzysztof, Amir Khorram-Manesh, Frederick M. Burkle, Attila J. Hertelendy, And Mariusz Goniewicz. "The European Union's Post-Pandemic Strategies For Public Health, Economic Recovery, And Social Resilience." *Global Transitions* 5 (January 1, 2023): 201-9. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gt.2023.10.003>.
- Haig, Madeleine, Caitlin Main, Danitza Chávez, And Panos Kanavos. "A Value Framework To Assess Patient-Facing Digital Health Technologies That Aim To Improve Chronic Disease Management: A Delphi Approach." *Value In Health* 26, No. 10 (October 1, 2023): 1474-84. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jval.2023.06.008>.
- Hernández, Alison, Ana Lorena Ruano, Anna Karin Hurtig, Isabel Goicolea, Miguel San Sebastián, And Walter Flores. "Pathways To Accountability In Rural Guatemala: A Qualitative Comparative Analysis Of Citizen-Led Initiatives For The Right To Health Of Indigenous Populations." *World Development* 113 (January 1, 2019): 392-401. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.worlddev.2018.09.020>.

- <https://www.bps.go.id/indicator/12/1975/1/jumlah-penduduk-pertengahan-tahun.html>. "Jumlah Penduduk Pertengahan Tahun (Ribu Jiwa), 2020-2022," 2022.
- Iman Fadhilah, Irawan Sapto Adhi, Klik Untuk Baca: <https://www.kompas.com/global/read/2022/11/01/170000370/berapa-luas-negara-indonesia->. Artikel Ini Telah Tayang Di Kompas.Com Dengan Judul "Berapa Luas Negara Indonesia?", Kompascom+ Baca Berita Tanpa Iklan: <https://kmp.im/plus6>, And Download Aplikasi: <https://kmp.im/app6>. "Berapa Luas Negara Indonesia?" <https://www.kompas.com/global/read/2022/11/01/170000370/berapa-luas-negara-indonesia->, 2022.
- Larrain, Nicolas, And Oliver Groene. "Improving The Evaluation Of An Integrated Healthcare System Using Entropy Balancing: Population Health Improvements In Gesundes Kinzigtal." *SSM - Population Health* 22 (June 1, 2023). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssmph.2023.101371>.
- Mahmudan, Ali. "Tenaga Kesehatan Indonesia Didominasi Perawat Pada 202." <https://dataindonesia.id/ragam/detail/tenaga-kesehatan-indonesia-didominasi-perawat-pada-2021>, N.D.
- Malik, A. A. "Implementasi Kebijakan Diskresi Pada Pelayanan Kesehatan Badan Penyelenggara Jaminan Kesehatan (BPJS)." *Jurnal Ilmiah Kesehatan Sandi Husada* 8, No. 1 (2019): 1389.
- Modjo, Mohamad Ikhsan. "Memetakan Jalan Penguatan Ekonomi Pasca Pandemi." *The Indonesian Journal Of Development Planning*. Vol. IV, N.D. <http://shorturl.at/xjxz2>.
- Mohamad, Irwansyah Reza. "Akademika Jurnal Umgo Perlindungan Hukum atas Hak Mendapatkan Pelayanan Kesehatan Ditinjau dari Aspek Hak Asasi Manusia," N.D.
- Nartin, Nartin, And Yuliana Musin. "Peran Pemerintah Daerah Dalam Meningkatkan Kesejahteraan Masyarakat Dimasa Pandemi Covid-19 (Studi Pada Kantor Camat Tinanggea Kabupaten Konawe Selatan)." *SIBATIK JOURNAL: Jurnal Ilmiah Bidang Sosial, Ekonomi, Budaya, Teknologi, Dan Pendidikan* 1, No. 3 (February 26, 2022): 163-72. <https://doi.org/10.54443/Sibatik.V1i3.23>.
- Pusat Studi Hak Asasi Manusia (Pusham). *Hukum Hak Asasi*

- Manusia*, 2008.
- Putri, N. E. K., Agustin, M. V., Kuswanto, M., & Oktori, N. W. W. "Urgensi Kebijakan Pendanaan Jaminan Kesehatan Masa Pandemi Covid-19 Di Indonesia Menurut Undang-Undang Nomor 40 Tahun 2004 Tentang Sistem Jaminan Sosial Nasional (Sjsn)." *Perspektif Hukum*, 2022, 36–37.
- Rachmawati, Amalia Fadhila, Kata Kunci, : Korupsi, And Penegakan Hukum. "Dampak Korupsi Dalam Perkembangan Ekonomi Dan Penegakan Hukum Di Indonesia." *Eksaminasi: Jurnal Hukum*. Vol. 1, 2022.
- Rahutami, A. I. "Covid-19 Dan Respon Usaha Kecil Menengah Di Asia Tenggara." In *Chapter*, 2, 2021.
- Rusydiana, A. S. "Indeks Malmquist Untuk Pengukuran Efisiensi Dan Produktivitas Bank Syariah Di Indonesia. *Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Pembangunan*." *Jurnal Ekonomi Dan Pembangunan* 26, No. 1 (2018): 47–58.
- Sholikin, M. N. "Penataan-Kelembagaan-Untuk-Menjalankan-Reformasi-Regulasi-Jurnal-HKHPM-MNS." *Jurnal Hukum & Pasar Modal*, 2018, 84.
- Siringoringo, Valeri M P, Dewi Hendrawati, And R Suharto. "Pengaturan Perlindungan Hukum Hak-Hak Pasien Dalam Peraturan Perundang-Undangan Tentang Kesehatan di Indonesia." *Diponegoro Law Journal*. Vol. 6, 2017.
- Sokal, Laura, And Lesley Eblie Trudel. "Effects Of A School-Based, Post-Pandemic Recovery Intervention On Canadian Educators." *International Journal Of Educational Research Open* 5 (December 1, 2023). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedro.2023.100298>.
- Wahyudi, Aris Agus. "Pemulihan Pasca-Pandemi: Bagaimana Ekonomi Global Menyusun Strategi Kembali Ke Jalur Pertumbuhan," N.D.
- Wibowo, B. N., Alw, L. T., & Hardjanto, U. S. "Kewenangan Executive Review Oleh Badan Pembinaan Hukum Nasional Dalam Penataan Regulasi." *DIPONEGORO LAW JOURNAL* 10, No. 1 (2021): 71.
- Xiong, Li, Peiyang Hu, And Houcai Wang. "Establishment Of Epidemic Early Warning Index System And Optimization Of Infectious Disease Model: Analysis On Monitoring Data Of Public Health Emergencies." *International Journal Of Disaster Risk Reduction* 65 (November 1, 2021).

<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.Ijdr.2021.102547>.

Zaelani, R., Sujana, H., & Zaky, M. "Optimalisasi Peran Pemerintah Sebagai Fasilitator; Katalisator; Regulator Dan Pemahaman Keuangan Syariah Dalam Mengembangkan Umkm Di Sukabumi Kota." *Jurnal Ilmiah Mea (Manajemen, Ekonomi, & Akuntansi)*, 6, No. 3 (2022): 958.