



## The Effectiveness of Arrangement Modern Stores Minimarket Policy

Vanessa Putri Maghfira<sup>✉</sup>

Jurusan Ekonomi Pembangunan, Fakultas Ekonomi, Universitas Negeri Semarang

Permalink/DOI: <https://doi.org/10.15294/efficient.v2i1.30781>

Received: July 2018 ; Accepted: October 2018 ; Published: January 2019

### Abstract

*The purpose of this study is to find out effectiveness of policy Law No.1 of 2014 on the Arrangement of Modern Minimarket in Semarang City and to know the supporting factors and inhibiting factors of the policy. The research method used in this research is using descriptive method percentage. The result of the research shows that policy of Law No.1 of 2014 about setup of Modern Minimarket arrangement in Semarang City is not yet effective with target that has been set. Supporting factors in this policy is the minimarket workforce comes from the local orkforce and the distance between the minimarket and traditional market already 500m. while the inhibiting factor in this policy there are still many minimarkets operating that are not in accordance with the rules that have been set.*

**Keywords:** Policy, Modern Stores, Minimarket.

### Abstrak

Tujuan dari penelitian ini adalah untuk mengetahui efektivitas kebijakan UU No.1 tahun 2014 tentang Pengaturan Pasar Minimarket Modern di Kota Semarang dan untuk mengetahui faktor pendukung dan faktor penghambat kebijakan tersebut. Metode penelitian yang digunakan dalam penelitian ini adalah menggunakan metode deskriptif persentase. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa kebijakan UU No.1 tahun 2014 tentang pengaturan pengaturan Minimarket Modern di Kota Semarang belum efektif dengan target yang telah ditetapkan. Faktor pendukung dalam kebijakan ini adalah tenaga kerja minimarket berasal dari orkforce lokal dan jarak antara minimarket dan pasar tradisional sudah 500 m. sedangkan faktor penghambat dalam kebijakan ini masih ada banyak minimarket yang beroperasi yang tidak sesuai dengan aturan yang telah ditetapkan.

**Kata Kunci:** Kebijakan, Toko Modern, Minimarket.

**How to Cite:** Maghfira, V. (2019). The Effectiveness of Arrangement Modern Stores Minimarket Policy. EFFICIENT Indonesian Journal of Development Economics, 2(1), 310-320. <https://doi.org/10.15294/efficient.v2i1.30781>

## INTRODUCTION

The phenomenon of the emergence of the retail market in Indonesia is one small part of trade liberalization in Indonesia, the existence of corporate multinational corporations (MNCs) that have been operating a lot has led to competition among industry players. The existence of these competition can provide benefits to consumers because they get low prices (Kusnadi, 2013). But on the other hand, competition will also result in practices that lead to unfair competition. One form of the impact of competition is the occurrence of monopolistic practices.

Through retail, a product can meet directly with users. The retail industry here is defined as an industry that sells products and services that have been added value to meet personal, family, group, or end-user needs. Products sold mostly are fulfillment of household needs, including nine basic ingredients (Soliha, 2008).

Modern retail growth in Indonesia at this time has a very rapid growth, especially in big cities in Indonesia, one of the city is Semarang City. Semarang City is the capital of Central Java Province which has an area of 373.70Km<sup>2</sup> with a population density in Semarang City in 2016 which reached 1,729,428 people with a population growth of 1.66% (BPS, Semarang City in 2016 Numbers, 2016). Given that population density will always increase from year to year, the fulfillment of daily needs becomes very important. This is what underlies investors to develop their businesses in the form of modern retail.

Based on the data from the Semarang City Statistic Agency recapitulation in 2016 based on constant prices, the trade sector is one of the five categories of GRDP in the largest contribution to the development of Semarang City with a contribution of 14.06% after the manufacturing and construction

industries. This is in line with the vision of the City of Semarang, which is to have a metropolitan city infrastructure facility so that it can serve all the activities of its people, with the main economic activities that rely on the trade and service sector while still paying attention to the existence of local economic potential, in the frame and order of society that is always imbued with value. religious values to realize the welfare of the entire community.

The increasing number of modern markets in the city of Semarang shows that the trade sector in Semarang has a fairly competitive development. The most visible growth of modern stores is minimarkets. The number of modern stores is expected to continue to grow in line with the opening of investment opportunities in Semarang City (Widiastuti & Santoso, 2016). The mushrooming of the modern market in the city of Semarang occurs because of various things including the increasing population in the city of Semarang itself, along with the growth of the population, the daily needs also increase.

Based on table 1 the number of modern stores in Semarang City tends to increase throughout 2012 to 2016 from 474 modern stores to 643 modern stores. The most visible growth of modern stores is minimarkets. The number of modern stores is expected to continue to grow in line with the opening of investment opportunities in Semarang City (Widiastuti & Santoso, 2016). The example of minimarkets that we can find everywhere is Alfamart and Indomaret. At present, the two minimarkets are already very large in all corners of Indonesia both in cities and in rural areas. This is because the facilities provided and the existence both of them make it very popular among the public. On the one hand, modern market growth in the city of Semarang has a positive impact including increasing regional income, expanding employment

opportunities for those who do not have a job, and making it easier for people to fulfill their needs because of the location of this modern shop that is so close to people's homes. But on the other hand its existence can be detrimental to small traders such as stall owners and existing traditional markets. If this is left

unchecked, the existence of a modern market will displace small traders. But on the other hand its existence can be detrimental to small traders such as stall owners and existing traditional markets. If this is left unchecked, the existence of a modern market will displace small traders (Wulandari, 2015).

**Table 1.** Modern Market Types Data in Semarang City 2013 - 2016 Per Unit

No	Type of Modern Stores	Years				
		2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
1	Department Store	12	12	12	12	13
2	Supermarket	26	32	38	42	54
3	Minimarket	436	456	533	560	576
	Total	474	500	583	614	643

Soruce : Department of Trade

From the above phenomenon, there needs to be a modern store arrangement to minimize adverse impacts and protect traditional markets, stalls or grocery stores from the onslaught of modern markets in Semarang City. In this case the Semarang City government issued the Semarang City Regulation No. 1 of 2014 concerning the arrangement of modern stores because it saw the rapid development of modern stores. This regulation is intended to maintain the balance between the growth of modern minimarket stores, traditional markets, shops / stalls and in order to empower small businesses (Widiastuti & Santoso, 2016). Basically the rules of the existence of a modern market are already contained in the Semarang City Regional Regulation. But the reality is that the Semarang City Regulation No. 1 of 2014 concerning Modern Store Arrangement, especially the Minimarket in Semarang City has not met expectations. This condition occurs because policy objectives have not been achieved and some regulations have not been implemented.

Based on table 2, it shows that the Semarang City Government set a quota of minimarket is 529 units, but in reality there were 576 units that had been established in all sub-districts in Semarang in 2016. In terms of licensing there are also 193 minimarket outlets that already have operating licenses and 383 other outlets still do not have permits to operate.

This is not in accordance with the policy regulations by the Semarang Government itself. Whereas the total number of traditional markets in Semarang City as a whole currently has 49 pieces. For the city market as many as 11 pieces, the regional market is 16 units and the environmental market is 22 (Trade Office, 2016). From the elaboration of the above problems there are still several objectives of the Semarang City Regional Regulation Law No. 1 of 2014 concerning Arrangement of Modern MinimarketStores that have not been achieved. Therefore, it is necessary to evaluate the effectiveness of government regulations. Act No. 1 of 2014 the arrangement of modern stores

so that their existence provides benefits to the community, especially the city of Semarang

**Table 2.** Modern Minimarket Market Data of Semarang City by unit in 2016

Sub District	Number of village	Quota	Total	Have Permits	Do Not Have Permits
Banyumanik	11	52	50	22	28
Candisari	7	24	27	9	18
Gajah Mungkur	8	27	29	7	22
Gayamsari	7	28	22	10	12
Genuk	13	25	28	10	18
Gunung Pati	16	19	24	4	20
Mijen	14	17	22	6	16
Ngaliyan	10	33	44	18	26
Pedurungan	12	58	74	27	47
Semarang Barat	16	54	61	18	43
Semarang Selatan	10	35	34	16	18
Semarang Tengah	15	32	35	16	19
Semarang Timur	10	27	21	7	14
Semarang Utara	9	29	23	5	18
Tembalang	12	53	65	13	52
Tugu	7	16	17	5	12
Total	177	529	576	193	383

Source: Department of Trade

The arrangement of modern stores businesses, especially minimarket in the city of Semarang based on Semarang City Regional Regulation No. 1 of 2014, contain.

The minimarket business must have an IUTM (Modern Store Business License) as legality issued by SKPD that has duties in trade affairs, MSMEs (Micro, Small and Medium Enterprises), markets, and permits. Department in question is DPMPTSP (the Investment Service and Integrated Services of One Door of Semarang City).

The minimarket business as referred to in the article must have partnerships with local SMEs in order to develop local SMEs. The distance to the location of the establishment of a modern minimarket store is at least within a 500m radius of the traditional market, The minimarket business must have a sales floor area of less than 400m<sup>2</sup> (Four Hundred Square

Meters), Minimarket businesses have working hours from Monday to Friday from 09.00 WIB until 22.00 WIB. For Saturday to Sunday from 09.00 WIB to 23.00 WIB, and the number of Modern Stores Minimarket businesses in Semarang City in Limit. Of the 16 sub-districts in Semarang City, there are a maximum of 529 outlets.

Based on this goal stated that the criteria for the effectiveness of modern store structuring policies in Semarang City are as follows: Licensing Effectiveness, In handling the minimarket license, there is no charge (free), the processing time of a modern shop business permit is 5 days, Step and requirements for licensing submission are easy to understand and follow.

Effectiveness of Socialization, The Trade Service always conducts socialization and guidance related to the minimarket

arrangement policy. Partnership Effectiveness, Minimarket has cooperated with MSMEs (Micro and Small and Medium Enterprises). Legality Effectiveness, Minimarket has IUTM as legality. Local Workforce Effectiveness, The minimarket workforce comes from the local workforce. Reporting effectiveness, The perpetrators of minimarket business always submit reports in the form of the number of outlets owned, sales turnover of all outlets, the number of MSMEs that have partnered, and the amount of workforce absorbed by the related agencies.

Opening Hours Effectiveness, Minimarket working hours start at 09.00 until 22.00 WIB. Distance Effectiveness from Traditional Markets, Minimarket distance with traditional markets has > 500m. Based on these problems that is what underlies the writer to take the topic with the title "Effectiveness of Modern Minimarket Store Management Policy in the City of Semarang".

According to Mahmudi (2007: 84) effectiveness is the relationship between output and purpose. The greater the output contribution to the achievement of goals, the more effective the organization, program, or activity. Meanwhile, according to Sedarmayanti (2009) effectiveness is a measure that gives a sense of how far the target can be achieved. From some of the above opinions regarding effectiveness, it can be concluded that effectiveness is a key element which states how far the target has been achieved from the stated goals. A policy / program is said to be effective if the program has reached its goal.

Research on this modern store structuring policy has in common with research conducted by Suroso (2016), Rachman (2015), Syariah (2016) and Prananda and Prananningtyas (2017) which reveal that there are still many minimarkets are illegal but still

operating, and not affirmation from the relevant Office as the enforcer of the regiment.

The difference between this research and previous research is the research conducted by Suroso (2016), Rachman (2015), and sharia (2016) using descriptive qualitative analysis while this research uses descriptive quantitative analysis method. Research conducted by Prananda and Prananningtyas (2017) uses the socio legal method, which is an empirical legal research method while this research uses descriptive quantitative analysis method with percentage descriptive analysis.

## RESEARCH METHOD

This study uses a quantitative descriptive approach. This study aims to analyze the effectiveness of Law No. 1 of 2014 concerning Modern Minimarket Market Management in the City of Semarang, along with the inhibiting and supporting factors that occur during the implementation. The selection of descriptive research is based on the consideration that the objective achieved in this study is to provide an overview of the conditions in the field related to the policy of modern minimarket market arrangements in Semarang City.

The data used in t/his study is using primary and secondary data. Primary data by distributing questionnaires to minimarkets, and secondary data is the number of modern markets and the number of modern stores per sub-district in Semarang City. The population in this study is the entire minimarket in the city of Semarang. In this research using purposive cluster sampling. Purposive cluster sampling in this study has the aim to determine whether the modern minimarket store structuring policy in each district in the city of Semarang has been effective or not. The sampling criteria in this study are minimarkets which have a floor area of <400m<sup>2</sup>, because in

Law No. 1 of 2014 article 9 states that the floor area of modern minimarket store sales is <400m<sup>2</sup>. Each district, researchers will spread questionnaires to 2 minimarkets in 16 sub-districts in Semarang City. So the total number of samples is 32 which is considered to have represented the minimarket in the city of Semarang. The modern minimarket shop surveyed is only Alfamart and Indomaret which is the most growing minimarket in the city of Semarang.

Data analysis method used in this study is using percentage descriptive analysis. Descriptive percentage is used to determine the descriptive type of percentage obtained by each indicator in the variable, and the descriptive percentage calculation is then interpreted into sentence form. Descriptive percentages made in this study were used to determine the success of the program by knowing the effectiveness of the modern minimarket store structuring policy in the city of Semarang.

$$Effectiveness = \frac{Realization}{Target} \times 100\% \dots \dots \dots (1)$$

Realization = Realization derived from empirical scores obtained from variable question items

Target = Target: Ideal target / score for each question score

Effectiveness is a condition that describes the level of achievement of program results with a set target. In simple terms, effectiveness is a comparison between targets and realization. A policy can be effective or successful if the right on purpose. The variable indicators are licensing fees, licensing time, understanding the flow and requirements, socialization and guidance, ownership of IUTM, partnerships with MSMEs, submission of reports by minimarkets, labor, minimarket

service hours and minimarket zoning. The use of effectiveness analysis in this case has in common with Suseno (2013), but in this study the effectiveness formula is modified using the realization and targets derived from the objective indicators of Law No. 1 of 2014.

**Table 3.** Interpretation of Effectiveness Value

No	Effectiveness Value	Criteria
1	90 - 100 %	Very Effective
2	80 - 89 %	Effective
3	60 - 79 %	Less Effective
4	<60 %	Ineffective

Source : Tim Litbang Depdagri-Fisipol UGM 1991 dalam Himran dkk (2013).

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### Percentage of Respondent's Answer

In the objective indicator in managing and submitting minimarket permits in Semarang City is free the respondents who answered yes is 62.5%, while those who answered no is 37.5%. In the objective indicator of processing the minimarket modern store business permit is the five-day respondent who answered yes is 56.25% and the respondent who answered no is 43.75%. In the objective indicators, the flow and requirements for licensing submission are easy to understand and followed by respondents who answered yes is 81.25% and respondents who answered no is 18.75%

In the indicator of Department of Trade always conduct socialization and guidance related to the minimarket management policy of respondents who answered yes is 75% and respondents who answered no is 25%. In the objective indicator Minimarket has cooperated with SMEs (Micro and Small and Medium Enterprises) the respondents who answered yes were 78.12% and respondents who answered were not 21.88%. At the minimarket goal indicator has IUTM (Modern Store Business

License) as the legality of the respondent who answered yes is 62.5% and the respondent who answered no is 37.5%. In the indicator of the goal of the minimarket workforce comes from the local workforce of respondents who answered yes is 100%, and the respondent who answered no is 0%.

In the objective indicator minimarket businesses always submit reports in the form of the number of outlets owned, sales turnover of all outlets, the number of MSMEs that have partnered, and the number of workers absorbed to the Department of Trade respondents who answered yes is 43.75% and respondents who answered no is 56.25%. On the objective indicator the minimarket working hours start at 09.00-22.00 WIB, respondents who answered yes is 0% and the respondents who answered no is 100%. In the minimarket destination indicator with traditional markets > 500m, respondents who answered yes is 93.75% and respondents who answered no is 6.25%.

### Results of Effectiveness Analysis

Based on the Effectiveness Theory, it is stated that a policy is said to be effective if the policy can achieve the stated goals. From the results of the study showed that the policy was not entirely in accordance with the stated goals. Based on the results of the research the objective variables to be achieved obtained the following results:

**Permit Effectiveness** In handling and submitting minimarket permits in DPMPTSP, Semarang City is free of charge, stated in the less effective criteria (60% -79%), which in the results of the study was 62.5%. From these results indicate that there are still licensing submissions that are charged fees that are not in accordance with the established SOP (Standard Operating Procedures). The processing time of a minimarket modern store business permit is five days stated in the

ineffective criteria (<60%), which in the results of the study was 56.25%. From these results indicate that there are still licensing submissions that are processed in more than five days from the time specified. This is not in accordance with the established SOP (Standard Operating Procedures). Step and requirements for licensing submission are easy to understand and follow, stated in the effective criteria (80%-89%), which in the results of the research is 81.25%. It shows that the requirements for applying for a modern store business permit in the Investment Service and One Stop Services are easy to fulfill. So that the growth of minimarkets in Semarang City is growing rapidly.

**Effectiveness of Socialization.** Department of Trade always conducts information dissemination and guidance related to the minimarket arrangement policy stated in the ineffective criteria (60%-79%) which in the results of the research is 75%. Every year. Department of Trade also conducts socialization of guidance to all business operators and minimarket's owner in the city of Semarang. Although sometimes during socialization not all business operators and minimarket's owner are coming. Department of Trade also often monitors the expiration of goods, goods that are sold in good condition or not and regarding opening hours of minimarkets.

**Partnership Effectiveness.** Minimarkets have collaborated with MSMEs (Micro and Small and Medium Enterprises) stated in the ineffective criteria (60% -79%), which results in 78.12%. Based on these results indicate that most minimarkets already have partnerships with MSMEs, although there are still minimarkets that have not established partnerships with MSMEs.

**Legality effectiveness.** Minimarket has an IUTM (Modern Store Business License) as

legality is stated to be ineffective criteria (60% -79%) which is 62.5% the results of the research. Based on these results indicate that there are still minimarkets that do not have IUTM as legality, even though IUTM ownership is a very mandatory requirement for the establishment of a minimarket, from this phenomenon it can be seen that the new minimarket is proposing licensing when the minimarket is established.

Labor Effectiveness. Minimarket workforce originating from local workforce is stated to be very effective criteria (90% -100%) which in the results of this research is 100%. Based on these results, it shows that the minimarket workforce has come from all local workers, which can reduce unemployment in the city of Semarang. Reporting Effectiveness. The perpetrators of minimarket businesses always submit reports in the form of the number of outlets owned, the sales turnover of all outlets, the number of MSMEs that are partnering, and the amount of workforce absorbed to the related agencies is stated to be ineffective criteria (<60%) which results the research was obtained at 43.75%. Based on these results, there are still many minimarket entrepreneurs who do not report the number of outlets owned, sales turnover of all outlets, the number of MSMEs that have partnered, and the amount of workforce absorbed by the related agencies.

Effectiveness of Working Hours Minimarket working hours starting at 9:00 a.m. - 22 p.m. WIB are declared to be ineffective

criteria (<60%) which in the results of the study is 0%. Based on these results, there is no minimarket that starts the opening hours at that time. Most minimarkets in Semarang City are open at 07.00-22.00 WIB, and 24 hours.

Effectiveness of Minimarket Distance with Traditional Markets has been > 500m, which is stated to be very effective criteria with a percentage range of dimensions of (90% - 100%) which in the results of the study is 93.75%. Based on these results shows that there are many minimarkets that have a distance of > 500m from the traditional market, which is expected by the minimarket will not turn off traditional markets.

Based on table 4, the percentage of effectiveness based on the policy of Law No. 1 of 2014 shows that there are still four goals that are less effective and three goals that are not effective. Whereas there are two very effective goals and one effective goal. This shows that modern stores minimarket structuring policy has not fully achieved the stated goals. Supporting Factors in the Modern Store Arrangement Policy in the City of Semarang based on the results of the study using percentage descriptive analysis there are three very effective and very effective.

objectives such goals are: Licensing requirements is easy to understand and followed by a percentage of 81.25%. This shows that the flow and requirements for licensing submission are easily followed and understood to be effective. In this case the target indicator is right on target. Only the Semarang City



Investment and One-Stop Service (DPMPTSP) can issue permits with recommendations from the Trade Office.

The minimarket workforce comes from local workers with a percentage of 100%. In this case the target indicator is right on target.

With the large number of local workers absorbed in the minimarket, it can reduce the unemployment rate in the city of Semarang. Because every minimarket must employ 4-6 people in each minimarket.

**Table 4.** Descriptive Percentage of Effectiveness of Policy Objectives

Indicators	Percentage (%)	Criteria
In handling and submitting minimarket permits in DPMPTSP, Semarang City is free of charge	62,5 %	Less Effective
The processing time of a minimarket modern store business permit is five days	56,25%	Ineffective
Step and requirements for licensing submission are easy to understand and follow	81,25%	Effective
Department of Trade always conducts information dissemination and guidance related to the minimarket arrangement policy	75%	Less Effective
Minimarkets have collaborated with MSMEs (Micro and Small and Medium Enterprises)	78,12 %	Less Effective
Minimarket has an IUTM (Modern Store Business License) as legality	62,5%	Less Effective
Minimarket workforce originating from local workforce	100%	Very Effective
The perpetrators of minimarket businesses always submit reports in the form of the number of outlets owned, the sales turnover of all outlets, the number of MSMEs that are partnering, and the amount of workforce absorbed to the related agencies	43,75%	Ineffective
Minimarket working hours starting at 9:00 a.m. – 22.00 p.m. WIB	0%	Ineffective
Distance of Minimarket with Traditional Markets has been > 500m	93,75%	Very Effective

Source : Primary Data

The minimarket distance with traditional markets has > 500m with a percentage of 93.75%. In this case the target indicator is right on target and very effective. With the minimum distance between minimarkets and traditional markets, it is expected that the growing number of minimarkets in the city of Semarang will not turn off traditional markets in the city of Semarang.

Inhibiting factors in the Modern Store Arrangement Policy in Semarang City based on

descriptive percentage analysis there are seven goals that are less effective or ineffective in these objectives are: In arranging and submitting minimarket permits at DPMPTSP, Semarang City is free of charge with a percentage of 62.5%. Based on these results indicate that this is not on target because it is not yet in accordance with the established SOP (Standard Operating Procedures).

The processing time of a minimarket modern store business permit is five days with

a percentage of 56.25%. Based on these results indicate that this is not on target because it is not in accordance with the SOP (Standard Operating Procedures) that are set, and sometimes exceeds the set time limit. The Trade Office always conducts socialization and guidance related to the minimarket arrangement policy with a percentage of 75%. Based on these results indicate that this is not on target and less effective. There are still minimarkets that are not carried out coaching. In this case the Trade Office has the function to provide guidance and supervision to modern minimarket stores.

Minimarket has cooperated with SMEs (Micro and Small and Medium Enterprises) with a percentage of 78.12%. These results indicate that there are still many minimarkets that have not cooperated with MSMEs. Minimarket has an IUTM (Modern Store Business License) as legality with a percentage of 62.5%. From these results indicate that there are still many minimarkets that do not have IUTM, which means that the minimarket is still illegal to operate.

The minimarket businessman always submits reports in the form of the number of outlets owned, sales turnover of all outlets, the number of MSMEs that have partnered, and the number of workers absorbed to the service related to the percentage of 43.75%. From these results, there are still many mini markets that have not reported it to the Department of Trade. Minimarket working hours start at 09.00 - 22.00 WIB with a percentage of 0%. From these results indicate that there is no minimarket that has opening hours in accordance with the specified hours. The law does not mention the prohibition to operate within 24 hours, but if the minimarket is open within 24 hours,

security must be added to prevent criminal acts.

## CONCLUSION

Based on the results of the study and the results of the discussion, the following conclusions are obtained: Based on the results of the research on the arrangement of modern minimarket stores in the city of Semarang, it is still ineffective and has not achieved the stated goals. Of the ten indicators for the purpose of structuring a modern minimarket store, only 3 indicators have effective or very effective results. Whereas for the 7 other indicators the purpose is in the category of less effective or ineffective.

Supporting factors in the modern shop structuring policy are the licensing filing requirements and requirements easy to understand and followed by a percentage of 81.25%, minimarket workforce comes from local workers with a percentage of 100%, and the distance between minimarkets and traditional markets is > 500m with a percentage of 93.75%.

The inhibiting factor in the modern shop structuring policy is that in terms of the minimarket licensing process, fees and processing permits are still collected in excess of the stipulated time. And there are still many minimarkets that are not in accordance with the Regional Regulation No. 1 of 2014 concerning Modern Store Arrangements.

## REFERENCES

- BPS. (2016). Kota Semarang Dalam Angka 2016. Semarang: Badan Pusat Statistik Kota Semarang.
- Himran, Y., Koleangan, R. A., & Kawung, G. (2013). Analisis Kinerja Keuangan Keuangan dan Efektivitas Pengelolaan Keuangan Daerah Tahun 2007-2013 di Kabupaten Banggai. *Jurnal Ekonomi dan Bisnis*.
- Kusnadi, D. (2013). Implementasi Kebijakan Penataan Ritel Tradisional dan Modern di Kota Jambi. *Jejaring Administrasi Publik*, 294 - 302.

- Prananda, R. R., & Prananningtyas, P. (2017). Implementasi Peraturan Daerah Kota Semarang No.1 tahun 2014 tentang Penataan Toko Modern Terhadap Iklim Persaingan Usaha yang Sehat antara Toko Modern dan Pasar Tradisional di Kota Semarang. *Law Reform*, 114-131
- Rachman, A. (2015). Kebijakan Penataan Minimarket (Studi Deskriptif Implementasi Peraturan Bupati Sidoarjo Nomor 20 Tahun 2011 Tentang Penataan Minimarket di Kabupaten Sidoarjo). *Kebijakan dan Manajemen Publik*, 33-43.
- Soesilowati, E. (2008). Dampak Pertumbuhan Ekonomi Kota Semarang Terhadap Kemacetan Lalulintas Di Wilayah Pinggiran dan Kebijakan yang Ditempuhnya . *Jurnal Ekonomi dan Kebijakan*, 9-18.
- Suaib, M. R. (2016). *Pengantar Kebijakan Publik*. Yogyakarta: Calpulis.
- Suroso. (2016). Public Policy in Managing Modern Stores for Community Development. *Jurnal Bina Praja*, 187-197.
- Suseno, D. A. (2013). Efektivitas dan Kemandirian Keuangan Daerah Provinsi Jawa Tengah Pasca Diterapkannya Desentralisasi Fiskal. *Economics Development Analysis Journal*, 1-8.
- Syariah, T. (2016). The Implementation of Modern Market Management Towards The Improvement of Small Traders Revenue In Subang District of Subang Regency Under Regional Regulation Number 4 of 2010. *International Journal of Sciences*, 1-11.
- Widiastuti, D., & Santoso, R. S. (2016). Evaluasi Kebijakan Peraturan Walikota Semarang No. 05 Tahun 2013 Tentang Penataan Toko Modern Minimarket Kota Semarang (Studi di Kecamatan Banyumanik Kota Semarang). *Journal of Politic and Government Studies*.
- Wulandari, F. (2015). Analisis Kebijakan Pemerintah Dalam Penataan Minimarket Di Kota Palopo. Universitas Hasanuddin. Makasar: Universitas Hasanuddin.
- UU No. 1 Tahun 2014 Tentang Penataan Toko Modern