Undergraduate English Students’ Perception, Plan, and Implementation of Critical Thinking Skills in Their Presentation

Silvia Nanda Putri Erito, Dwi Anggani Linggar Bharati, Puji Astuti

Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Abstract

Previous studies shows that several learning strategies have been used to promote critical thinking skills for students at the university level, the most frequently used is presentation. The students in the third semester of the English department in IAIN Pekalongan have distinctive responses regarding their critical thinking skills in their presentation. This study aimed to explain students’ perception, plan and implementation in their use of critical thinking skills in their presentation. This study was qualitative case study. The data gathered by classroom observation, questionnaires, and interviews. The findings showed (1) the students positively perceived their use of critical thinking skills in their presentation, they believed that critical thinking skills help them to enable their presentation, English skills, and performance (2) the students plan their critical thinking skills by preparing the schema, skills, and practicing (3) the implementation of critical thinking skills in students’ presentation by combining students’ awareness, activeness, and learning style. Theoretically, critical thinking skills are fundamental to be implemented in higher education students. Practically, the result of this study gave benefit for the lecturer in giving students challenging tasks that encourage them to use their critical thinking skills. Pedagogically, the implementation of critical thinking skills in students’ presentations needs a student-lecturer relationship.
INTRODUCTION

Critical thinking skills have been essential for every student, especially university students who are required to use their critical thinking in solving the issues because they are individuals who will contribute a lot to society. Vainikainen et al. (2015) stated that critical thinking skills could develop individually or in groups. A year passed of COVID-19, the pandemic affected the learning process. To achieve the objective of the learning in the university, one of the learning methods that help students develop their critical thinking skills is presentations, where they are expected to convey information accurately from the results of their analysis. Students' presentations required them to synthesizing and outlining their awareness, mindset, and attitude in presenting the material in front of the audience. We observed then found a phenomenon in the third semester of undergraduate tadris English students in IAIN Pekalongan who joining classroom activity by using presentation. The students have distinctive responses regarding their use of critical thinking skills in their presentations in the field. The distinction is affected by how they implement critical thinking skills in their presentations and how they perceive it.

For those reasons, discovering students' perception, plan, and implementation in their use of critical thinking skills in their presentation is crucial. The implementation of students' presentations brings some benefits for the students in enhancing their motivation, knowledge, self-confidence, and speaking ability. It also has the same purpose. To make the students have to be ready in being presenter, how they can prepare the material related to the topic, and the outline in the present their work one of the technique used is students' presentation (Al-Nouh et al., 2015; Husain & Mohammad, 2015; Manalu, 2016; Saritwa et al., 2018; Wilson & Brooks, 2015).

We would like to find out the real situations of the manifestation of critical thinking skills in students' presentations held in the English Foreign Language (EFL) students' class of English Tadris in IAIN Pekalongan. They use the presentation to joining the activity and encourage their use of critical thinking skills in delivering their presentation. Critical thinking must be developed and improved in education settings such as schools, colleges, and universities. (Aryani et al., 2017; Bagheri, 2018; Chairunnisa, 2016; Changwong et al., 2018; Devi et al., 2016; Milchatun et al., 2015; Nadara & Chew, 2018; Nold, 2017; Sanavi & Tarighat, 2014; Setiawan & Bharati, 2019; Wason & Southall, 2016), they noted that the students should express a positive perception toward critical thinking learning. Through a different way of study, they acknowledge that critical thinking is a skill that needs practice. They suggest some strategies to develop critical thinking, such as education, practice, and experience. The students have to be active in organizing their critical thinking in learning situations.

Critical thinking skills

Avery (1994) stated that critical thinking skill is one of the main components of thinking skills. The word “critic” comes from the Greek “Kritikos” which means “able to evaluate.” The definition of critical thinking skills has changed over the years. There are many definitions of critical thinking skills from various fields, started by cognitive psychologists. Hatcher (2015) argued that critical thinking skills try to arrive at a judgment only after evaluating alternatives to available evidence and arguments. On the other hand, Cottrell, (2011) defined that there are several benefits of critical thinking skills, as follows:

1. Improved attention and observation.
2. More focused reading.
3. Improved ability to identify the key points in a text or other message rather than becoming distracted by less important material.
4. Improved ability to respond to the appropriate points in a message.
5. Improved knowledge of how to get point across more easily.

From those benefits, we could infer that critical thinking skills are essential in using intellectual tools at the university level by which one appropriately assesses thinking. By utilizing critical thinking skills, students can use the intellectual tools that critical thinking offers –
concepts and principles that enable them to analyze, evaluate, and improve thinking.

Also, Facione (2011) stated that the following skills create critical thinking skills, namely interpretation, analysis, evaluation, inference, explanation, and self-regulation. Therefore, Facione defines each of the skill as follows:

1. Interpretation is the ability to comprehend the information.
2. Analysis is the ability to identify the intended and actual inferential relationships among statements or, in short, to identify the main argument presented.
3. Inference is the ability to decide what to believe or do based on solid logic. In short, it is the ability to identify and secure elements needed to draw reasonable conclusions. For example, the students can suggest predicting what will happen next based on what is known.
4. Evaluation is essential to improve themselves. Evaluation is a tool for introspection to have a better appearance. It is the ability to evaluate, to assess the credibility of a statement, or in short, to judge whether the argument is credible based on evidence given or other forms of representation.
5. Explanation is the ability to communicate the process of reasoning to others.
6. The last is self-regulation, which can monitor one’s thinking and correct flaws in logic. This one is strongly remarkable because it allows students to use their critical thinking to improve their thinking.

From this theory, we believed that critical thinking skills are complex process, and it is generally higher-order thinking cognitive processing. Finally, the critical thinking skills that were identified by Facione (2011) were used in this study because the theory most closely matched with the definition of critical thinking skills that we adopted. So this theory guides this research to achieve the objectives of the research. Birjandi and Alizadeh (2012), Jebbour (2019), Solihiati and Hikmat (2018), Wu and Pei (2018) researched the manifestation of critical thinking skills, the focus of those studies in the manifestation of critical thinking skills in English textbooks that the result of the studies had significant implications for material developers, educational policymakers, and teachers.

Many researchers had held most of the previous studies that related to the research about critical thinking skills. Hence, the novelty of this research is more prioritize in how the students perceive, plan and implement critical thinking skills in their presentationsurprise. Thus by conducting this research, it is expected to enhance in-depth understanding of technique used in fostering and adding new enlightenment dealing with the manifestation of critical thinking skills in students’ presentations.

METHODS

Qualitative case study was employed because the details are provided in this study to explain students’ perception, plan and implementation in their use of critical thinking skills in their presentation.

This study was focused on explaining students’ perception in their use of critical thinking skills in their presentations, students’ plan in their use of critical thinking skills in their presentation and students’ implementation in their use of critical thinking skills in their presentation. It consisted of thirty nine students of the third semester of IAIN (Institute Agama Islam Negeri) Pekalongan using the purposive sampling technique.

Methods of collection data in this research were observation, interview, and questionnaire. The instruments were field notes observation, students’ observation checklist, open-ended questionnaires, and structured interviews. In this case, open-ended questionnaires enable the students to give free-form answers on the lists of structure. It was used to gather students’ responses about their perception and plan in their use of critical thinking skills in their presentation. Field note classroom observation was used to
observe, collect and note certain events or actions in the classroom. Students’ observation checklist was used to check whether the students use their critical thinking skills or not. The last, structured interviews to provide an in-depth understanding and exploration. Due to COVID-19, all data were taken in online ways.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

The results and discussions presented the data from the analysis of the questionnaire response, interview response, field note of the classroom observation, and transcripts of the interview. It attempts to explain the manifestation of students' perception, plan, and implementation in their use of critical thinking skills in their presentation.

Students' Positive Perception of the Importance of Critical Thinking Skills in their Presentation

In gathering information about student's perceptions, we employed open-ended questionnaires and interviews. We formulated some questions related to students' perceptions of their critical thinking skills in their presentations. Below was the highlight of the question.

Students' Understanding of Critical Thinking Skills and Presentation

First, the students were asked about their understanding of critical thinking skills and present. Here were the exemplary responses:

Critical thinking is viewed from many aspects, to think straightforwardly, carefully, and deeply in response to what we receive. (Student #2, questionnaire, 131020)

Critical thinking is an attempt to be responsive in considering and deciding something, responding to the thoughts and theories we receive. (Student #3, questionnaire, 131020)

From the answers, their perceptions of critical thinking skills were positive and varied widely. They could define critical thinking skills as their means to analyze problems well. They also realized that critical thinking skills played an important role for them. They were required to think at a higher level in solving a problem. They assumed that critical thinking skills could see a problem from various points of view by considering the good/bad of the idea. Critical thinking skills respond to other people's responses in a good, systematic, rational, logical, and acceptable to many people. In the following question, students were asked about the definition of presentation, caused based on research needs. This technique is used to attract they're used of critical thinking skills. Here are the exemplary responses:

A presentation is a form of public communication regarding a problem or topic carried out in front of the crowd verbally and formally to explain, invite, persuade, and influence the audience (Student #9, questionnaire, 131020).

A presentation is a form of communication in front of many people by submitting information to others. (Student #17, questionnaire, 131020).

Based on the explanation from the questionnaire, the students knew, and they have conducted a presentation on several occasions. They define that presentation as an activity to convey information, idea, or thought with a specific purpose. The presentation also speaks in front of the audience / many people about a topic or information. It concluded that the students familiar with the presentation. This technique assesses their critical thinking skills, how they interpret, analyze, evaluate, explain, infer, and self-regulate seems on this activity.

Students' Perception of the Importance of Critical Thinking Skills in Their Presentation

The students were asked about the role of critical thinking skills in their presentation. Here are the exemplary responses:

In my opinion, critical thinking during a presentation is important to explore deeper problems, gain new knowledge that may not be explained by the speakers and learn to analyze through independent identification and idea development. (Student #9, questionnaire, 131020)

During a presentation, the importance of critical thinking skills is that the presenter can carry out his presentation well and smoothly, can answer questions posed by the audience well and straightforwardly so that it is easy to understand.
and understand. (Student #23, questionnaire, 131020)

The students perceived presentation as their chance to practice their English speaking with their confidence to deliver the material and their occasion to use their critical thinking skills in doing presentations. Critical thinking skills played a role when they explained the information of the presentation. Automatically, they used their thoughts aloud so that what they delivered can be understood by their friends. It requires practice and good analytical skills to create harmony between what is conveyed by the presenter to friends.

We also conduct an interview section that will provide other opinions and ideas about how students perceived their critical thinking skills in their presentation. Here the exemplary responses:

*In my opinion, when we use critical thinking skills, we can convey and understand existing information, presentations can run well as they should, able to overcome obstacles that may occur during the presentation.* (Student #6, Interview, 161020)

*Using critical thinking skills, the presenters will understand the material, but the audience will also understand the material presented in detail.* (Student #8, Interview, 161020)

From the interview results above, students believed that critical thinking skills would lead them to be more active, critical, and solve problems, especially when they made presentations. It was important when used to deliver material/discussion. They assumed that they could choose selective information with critical thinking skills, so that is a sense of curiosity to know the existing evidence to understand it thoroughly.

### Students’ Perception of the Importance of Mastering Six Critical Thinking Skills

According to Facione (2011), there are six skills that a person must have to use their critical thinking skills. There were; interpretation skills, analysis skills, inferences skills, evaluation skills, explanation skills, and self-regulation skills. In the following given question, we asked about their opinion about mastering six skills that must be learned when using critical thinking skills, and these were the answers from the students’ interview script, as follows:

*In my opinion, the elements contained in critical thinking should be utilized in life, especially as students who always do a presentation. We have to apply the features in critical thinking skills—starting from the first step to the next step. So all elements are very influential on critical thinking that we have like that. Usually, all aspects have benefits for us to think critically, as the need for ideas. By thinking critically, we will find it easier to see new bright ideas that we can develop to get a refresher when we do, for example, research or mix issues with our critical thinking to get the latest information to foster solutions. Then critical thinking is also able to enable us to have high creativity by processing and evaluating so that we can find a way out.* (Student #1, interview, 161020)

The six skills are very important because the six points are interrelated, say. For example, we don’t have explanation skills, so we think we can’t conclude, then if we can explain but can’t conclude, it’s the same, so the explanation was round and round. (Student #2, interview, 161020).

From the students’ answers above, almost all students stated that they assumed they had to master the six skills to use critical thinking skills. If one of them is not fulfilled, it will be less in using critical thinking skills. These six skills are very influential in the decision-making process after analyzing critical thinking skills, especially when making presentations. In describing the work that students, skills in critical thinking have done are interrelated.

Hence, the obtained questionnaires and interviews reveal that generally, both students believed that using critical thinking skills is an aspect of cognition entrenched in students’ ability. The aim is to discover the truth or falsity of statements and look for evidence that will show the truth. Critical thinking skills are needed for the students to do presentations. In the presentation, there will be found any arguments from the audience. Some arguments are so strong that we need critical thinking skills to make the logical strength of an argument in the presentation.
Students’ Planning for the Use of Critical Thinking Skills in their Presentation: Preparing the Schema, Skills, and Practising

Revealing student’s plans in their use of critical thinking skills in their presentation was crucial, and the important factor, planning, needs to be contextualized to the learning environment. We employed open-ended questionnaires and interviews. In gathering the information, it conducted by using two instruments to make the data strength. Here are the exemplary responses:

To plan a good presentation by preparing the material, understanding the material, preparing mentally, preparing for ice breaking, and preparing prizes. (Student #1, questionnaire, 131020).

In planning critical thinking skills in the presentation, we can do these steps, as follows: 1) Looking for a clear statement of each question, 2) Looking for reasons, 3) Trying to know the information well, 4) Use credible sources, 5) Pay attention to the situation as a whole, 6) Trying to stay relevant to the main idea, 7) Given the genuine and fundamental interests, 8) Looking for alternatives, 9) Have an open mind and attitude, 10) Take a position when there is sufficient evidence to do so, 11) Be systematic and orderly with the parts of the whole problem. (Student #18, questionnaire, 131020).

To strengthen the data, we also conduct an interview section regarding students’ plan to use critical thinking skills in their presentation. Here are the exemplary responses:

Before the presentation starts, I usually apply critical thinking by looking for the correct information. Now, this accurate information is a crucial factor in the success of implementing critical thinking in learning. We can use it to gain knowledge about why something happened, how the solution is. (Student #7, Interview, 161020).

Prepare and dig the material, control time management, support tools for presentation so the audience can see and read. What's more important is mental. Because speaking in front of a crowd, usually mentally must be prepared first” (Student #10, Interview, 161020).

From the questionnaire and interview, therefore, we revealed the following points, they were:

1. Preparing the schema

The students stated that they formulated the schema to be conducted in how their act/plans to use their critical thinking skills in their presentation. The schema can be drawn by identifying, validating, analyzing, and assessing whether the problem/information is relevant to the audience, seeking solutions to problems, drawing conclusions, making decisions, practicing before conducting the presentation. The schema can help the students to attend to the incoming information and utilize the knowledge.

2. Preparing each skill of critical thinking skills by Facione

Most students said that using critical thinking skills is more emphasized by applying the skills and mastering the material by searching the most relevant references from books and various material sources. They also have to prepare themselves before a day to present their work. They must also familiarize themselves with critical matters, seeing cases from a different perspective. Identify problems, analyze solutions, make the right decisions when asked for opinions, and evaluate issues to take the good side. It deals with the theory of critical thinking skills from Facione (2011).

3. Practicing

The students’ answers tend to practice preparing and using their critical thinking skills well because practice will provide thorough preparation. They can do practice in their respective groups or can practice by themselves. To master every skill in critical thinking, they can train themselves. For example, they will use their interpretation and analysis skills. Thus they must be accustomed to training to critique and analyze information properly, looking for two sides to produce conclusions and valid arguments. Lecturer also greatly influences the lesson planning in class.
During COVID-19, learning took place online. The lecturer also changed the face-to-face method, alternating with online meetings through zoom meetings/google meetings. The assessment is carried out by looking at students' activeness in taking classes online.

*Usually, in my class, I always include some criteria to assess my students, for example, attendance, class participation, and then the assignment. I think the more significant portion is class participation. For instance, in meeting Joni asking the question to check his name, I will just see who they have more checks and who they have no check symbols at the end of the course. So who they have more check, they will have a higher grade than who is only keep silent or they/ he who never ask question/say something so they will have lower than those who have more checks.* (Lecturer, Interview, 201020)

From the answer above, the lecturer explained that the way he assessed his students was by giving a checklist of who was active in his class, and when the activity checklist was good, the score would be better than those who were not active in the class.

So, in general, the lesson plan is the basis for the lecturer planning to teach students in class and a guide for the course of the teaching and learning process in class. It is written that students' critical thinking skills are the learning objectives to create students with critical thinking skills and communicate in English well.

### The Implementation of Critical Thinking Skills in Students' Presentation: Combining Students' Awareness, Activeness, and Learning Styles.

We used two instruments to gather data about the implementation of critical thinking skills. There were: classroom observation field notes and students’ observation checklist.

Besides observing their actions in the classroom, we employed students’ observation checklist to know what measures had been done by the students. It aimed to point and highlight some efforts made by the students in presenting the work. It gave a summary of students' activities in the classroom as listed in the table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items of checklist</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The students can speak English fluency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>The students know the material and objectives of the learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The students follow instruction from the lecturer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The students use their critical thinking skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>The students practice their interpretation skills in their presentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>The students practice their analysis skills in their presentation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>The students practice their inference skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>The students practice their explanation skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>The students practice their evaluation skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>The students practice their self-regulation skills</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The result of the observation classroom had shown the students' activity when present and discussed their work. Their critical thinking skills when delivering work were very good. Overall, the students use six skills. There were; interpretation skills, analysis skills, inference skills, evaluation skills, explanation skills, and self-regulation skills in their presentation. The students represent their work in virtual meetings. They are in a group working to present the results. (Classroom observation #2, 131020)

Following were the points that we revealed based on the results of classroom observations using Facione's theory (2011):

In interpretation skills, the students interpreted the work (short story). They try to interpret what the story about they deliver their thought in their presentation. They sum up all of the parts that they interpret the story into their work. (Classroom observation #2, 131020) and (Classroom observation #3, 201020)

In analysis skills, the students analyzed part of the story carefully too. It deals with the characteristic of the short story, the genre of the
short story, the plot of the short story, the moral value of the story. They analyze one by one. They use their analysis skill in their work well to succeed in delivering the result of their analysis of the story (Classroom observation #2, 131020) and (Classroom observation #3, 201020).

In explanation skills, the students practiced in explaining the result of their work in their presentation. They explain to other students by speaking in English, but the analysis results in student's checklist five students who use Bahasa Indonesia. (Classroom observation #2, 131020) and (Classroom observation #3, 201020). In students' observation checklist revealed 89% of the students could practice their explanation skills.

In inference skills, the students practiced inference skills to conclude the short story by using their language. They made a summary. Then they could conclude the short story and presented the summary in their presentation. (Classroom observation #2, 131020) and (Classroom observation #3, 201020).

In evaluation skills, the students practiced in evaluating what other students' said. From the analysis result, five students cannot give evaluations to other students because their explanation skills are not good enough, so they do not try to provide rebuttals/evaluations (Classroom observation #2, 131020) and (Classroom observation #3, 201020). In students' observation checklist revealed 89% of students practice the evaluation skills.

The last, in self-regulation skills, the students examined and re-corrected what has been presented. The students could review and reformulate if the students have made some mistakes, but from each student's observation checklist, the result showed that five students cannot practice their self-regulation skills. Again. This was hampered because their ability to explain something was not optimal, not to recall what they said. (Classroom observation #2, 131020) and (Classroom observation #3, 201020).

Based on classroom observations and students' observation checklist result using Facione's theory (2011), we revealed some factors that are needed to be included in the implementation of critical thinking skills in students' presentation, as follows:

1. Students' awareness
   First of all, awareness was the ultimate thing that the students should entrench in themselves. In the class showed, They were getting aware that critical thinking skills are an essential aspect of being mastered. One of the benefits was they could comprehend the task, condition, situation, and thought. It became critical to assist them in knowing the background and existing skills, indicating they find activeness, learning style, and usually solving the task competently. Nevertheless, students' awareness determines their use of critical thinking skills.

2. Students' activeness
   Activeness was one factor that the students should fulfill to implement each skill in critical thinking skills by Facione. From classroom observation and student's observation checklist, they actively argued, conveyed reasons, made decisions, conducted discussions, provided feedback, and delivered their presentations. Students' activeness fostered their use of their critical thinking skills in their presentation. It could develop their communication competencies. Students were actively engaged in implementing critical thinking skills in their presentations. It allowed students to follow the sidetrack and see problems that may be important. Therefore students' activeness attributing their critical thinking skills to their future presence.

3. Students' learning styles
   Learning style was one of the essential elements in implementing critical thinking skills. They realized their learning preferences would help them discover the advantages and disadvantages of each learning style and how they can use it effectively in using critical thinking skills in their presentation.

Based on the findings and discussion above, we were convinced that this study supports other findings that previous researchers have carried out. However, Amin and Adiansyah (2018) did not mention the complete aspects behind that since they conducted a survey study. It can be admitted this study tends to follow most research that found students had a good
perception in their use of critical thinking skills in their presentation. To use critical thinking skills, not only use perseverance and patience (Tosuncuoglu, 2018), students need to prepare several important things to use their critical thinking skills.

In addition, Theoretically, critical thinking skills are fundamental to be implemented in higher education students. Critical thinking skills were also important when students do presentations. In presentations, students must present the analysis results orally where skills relate to one another to be used properly. Practically, the lecturer emphasized giving students challenging tasks that encourage them to use their critical thinking skills. Ensure the courses and activities are practical, achieve the learning outcome, and improve methods to develop critical thinking skills. Pedagogically, the implementation of critical thinking skills in students' presentations needs a student-lecturer relationship. The lecturer plays the main role in providing clear guidance and conducts exciting activities that can help them achieve the goal of the learning processes.

CONCLUSIONS

The results of the current research have indicated that (1) Students positively perceived the use of critical thinking skills in their presentations. They believed that critical thinking skills could help students enable their presentation, English skills, and performance. (2) Students' plan in their use of critical thinking in their presentation involving some plans; first, formulating the schema to be conducted in how their act/plans use their critical thinking skills, second, preparing each skill of critical thinking skills deals with the theory of critical thinking skills from Facione (2011), and the last is practicing. (3) The implementation of critical thinking skills need to combine three elements, they were students' awareness, activeness, and learning styles.

Based on the observation, results, and discussion of this research, there were some methodological limitations in this study. First, the number of participants constitutes a small sample size and therefore not statistically representative of the population. Thus, the findings cannot serve as a basis for statistical generalization. Second, we regret not including specific points of questions in a questionnaire and interviews. It took a long time to concise the data. A need for further research may explain what measures were taken to avoid bias which is essential to gain particular findings that emerged in the research question and revise the specific method for gathering the data.

REFERENCES


