ACCURACY OF ENGLISH-INDONESIAN SCANLATION OF DETECTIVE CONAN MANGA AS COMPARED TO ITS JAPANESE-INDONESIAN TRANSLATION

Vina Darissurayya

English Department. Faculty of Languages and Arts. State University of Semarang

Abstract

Popularity of scanlated manga urged me to do this research. There are three main problems in this study: (1) to find out how the accuracy of English-Indonesia manga scanlation, (2) to find out differences between online manga (scanlated manga), and printed manga (Indonesian officially published manga) and (3) to find out whihc more accurate between both compared to original Japanese manga. At the end, I found that that although the scanlation of detective Conan manga is accurate but the printed manga was more accurate. Still, further research needed to analyze scanlation more detail. As readers of manga, we should be smarter by reading printed manga rather than online manga. This way we will get the better translation and also we can give our appreciation toward the author.
INTRODUCTION

In the era of technology, translation is no longer exclusively owned by professionals. People become more concerned with translation even they can produce their own works despite the fact that they are not expert in that field. This situation results in the existence of ‘unofficial’ translators. They work voluntarily, or unpaid. The works they chosen are often fictional, like movies and comics.

This phenomenon makes me interested in analyzing a translation product of ‘unofficial’ translators. The product here is a Japanese comic; or better known as manga. Mangas are popular culture throughout the world. A news article by Richard Susilo (2013) mentioned that in a television program, NTV Sekai Banzuke (World’s Rank), Indonesia placed 2nd for the biggest manga readers in the world.

Unfortunately, although the popularity of manga keeps increasing, the industry itself is suffering. The cause is piracy. The existence of ‘unofficial’ translators interferes official industry of manga because fans of manga can easily read their desired manga via internet. Readers prefer reading manga online than buying it officially because of two reasons: (1) reading manga online is free of charge, so it is cheaper than buying it, (2) online manga releases manga faster than the one officially published.

Larson (1984) states, that translation is basically a change of forms. The forms here refer to surface structure of a language, parts which are observable by human senses. The steps of translation are reading the source text as well as comprehending it. Without translators’ knowledge and understanding of the source text, it will not be possible to produce a good translation. In translating, translators will also face another problem called translatability, the possibility of certain text to be translated. Still, translators can make some adjustment as long as he or she understands what the purpose of the text is (Munday and Hatim, 2014). Translation is an important process of replacing and reproducing the messages from a text in a source language into a target language. The most important point of translation is finding the equivalence.

The process of scanlation is almost the same as common translation. The following chart summarizes the complete process of scanlation (Ratti, 2013: 49).
My early observation, it is rare for Indonesian scanlation group to scanlate from original Japanese mangas. They usually take the work from English scanlated version and translate it into bahasa. It happens because many translators in the group do not understand Japanese, so it is difficult for them to translate from original version. This circumstance shows that Indonesian scanlation group does not have direct connection with Japanese. This situation raises doubts on the accuracy of the translation. That is why I want to know the quality of English-Indonesian scanlation of a manga, in this case is Meitantei Conan (Detective Conan), by Indonesian fans. Then, I also want to compare this scanlation with the official published one in order to know where the differences occur. The last, I would like to know the quality of those differences if it is compared to the original Japanese version.

METHOD

This study is a qualitative descriptive research. In this study, I investigate the accuracy of English-Indonesian Detective Conan manga scanlation as well as how if it is compared to official translation of Japanese-Indonesian. I also want to know which one is more accurate if compared to Japanese version. The data consisted of three languages, Japanese, English and, bahasa and only simple sentences were used. The result of the analysis will be described to answer the problems stated in question statements.

The object of the study is a manga entitled Detective Conan which was written by Gosho Aoyama. I chose 3 chapters from the manga, chapter 809-chapter 811. The data were taken from The English scanlation chapter 809-811 were taken from http://mangafox.me/manga/detective_conan/.

The Indonesian scanlation chapter 809-811 were taken from http://mangaku.web.id/detective-conan-bahasa-indonesia-terbaru/. The original Japanese manga volume 77 was taken from http://rawcs.net/3084.html. The printed version was taken from “Detective Conan” volume 77 published by Elex Media Komputindo, Gramedia Group.

To analyse the accuracy, I used accuracy indicators proposed by Nababan et. al 2012. There are 3 categories, accurate, less accurate and inaccurate. I asked help from lecturers from English Department and Japanese Department to rate English-Indonesian scanlation and Japanese-Indonesian translation respectively. Here is the instrument:

Table 1
Instrument to Rate Translation Accuracy

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Indicators</th>
<th>Result</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>The meaning of words, phrases and clauses from source language are translated accurately into target language; without any distortion.</td>
<td>Accurate Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Some meanings of words, phrases, and clauses have been accurately translated into target language. However, there exist some meaning distortions which disturb message unity.</td>
<td>Less Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>The meanings of words, phrases and clauses from source language are not translated accurately into target language.</td>
<td>Inaccurate Translation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

1. The Accuracy Analysis of English-Indonesian Scanlation of Detective Conan Manga Case of Froth Steam and Smoke

a. Accurate Translation

The first assessor, English department lecturer, found 428 dialogues belonged to this accurate group. It was 72.8% from the whole data while The second rater found 428 accurate data. It was 72.8% from the total data found. The translator mostly used literal translation method and literal technique of translation. In this scanlation accurate translations mostly came into being because the source texts’ grammatical pattern was similar to target texts’ grammatical pattern like the examples below:

ST File 809 Traces of Having Been in The Room
TT File 809 Jejak Pernah Berada di Ruangan
BT File 809 Traces of Having been in The Room

The first example was the chapter’s title. As can be seen, the form of both source text and target text were similar. The translator did not need to adjust anything, he only translated the words and phrases according to its functions, like the way literal translation method was. In the first example, the translator also translated tenses of ST (source text) by adding the word “pernah” to replace the present perfect tenses.

ST You sure have a lot of them…
TT Kau punya banyak, ya…
BT You have a lot, don’t you…

The source text contained impressed feeling of the speaker with the use of “sure”. The translator successfully conveyed this feeling by replacing “sure” into “ya” at the end of the sentence. In addition he also removed “them”, referred to the keys owned by Mr. Sodesaki, from the translation. Here he did not only use literal technique but also compensation and reduction. If the translator only used literal technique the translation would be “Kamu sungguh punya kunci banyak.” (You really have many keys)”, readers would not be able to get the feeling of the speaker.

b. Less Accurate Translation

The first assessor found that 6.4% of the dialogues in this study were not translated accurately. There were 38 data belonged to this category. In addition, the second rater found 39 data belonged to inaccurate translation. It was 6.6% from the whole text. Here is one of the examples:

ST It’s not like I’m a kid after all…
TT Sepertinya aku bukan anak kecil…
BT It seemed I am not a little kid…

The translation above belonged to inaccurate translation. Text actually had the purpose to show that the speaker’s strong argument stating that she was not a kid. However, it was translated into “It seemed I am not a little kid” which was not filled with confidence of the speaker. The target text will be accurate if it was translated into “Lagipula aku kan bukan anak kecil”. If “Sepertinya aku bukan anak kecil” was translated into English, it would be “It seems that I am not a kid.” The message was not the same as the one stated in the source text.

c. Inaccurate Translation

In this category, the first rater found about 38 data or 6.4%. Not much different, the
second rate found 39 dialogues or 6.6% from the whole data belonged to this category. The following is the example:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ST</th>
<th>It went out…</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>TT</td>
<td>Tidak mau keluar…</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BT</td>
<td>It didn’t want to come out…</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The sentence above was translated inaccurately. “It went out” in this context belonged to a cigarette. The speaker, Mr. Sodesaki, was desperate because his lit cigarette had gone out so it would be difficult for him to proof his alibi. If it was translated into “tidak mau keluar” or “it didn’t want to come out” readers will not be able to understand the meaning behind the dialogue. The appropriate translation should be “sudah mati”, which meant that the cigarette went out, “rokoknya sudah mati (the cigarette went out)”. It will be more correct in Indonesian language.

2. The Differences Found in Comparing the Scanlated Version and the Official Version of Detective Conan Manga

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OM</th>
<th>Akulah yang akan mengirimmu ke kuburamu terlebih dahulu.</th>
<th>I will send you to your grave first</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>Akan kubuat kau merasakan pembalasanku</td>
<td>I will make you get my revenge</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the first example, the sentence was found in an e-mail sent by the victim before he passed away. This e-mail contained a challenge to its reader. The preceding sentence in this e-mail was “if you can kill me, come and try it”. The message found in online Manga was that the sender (president Katsumoto) swearing that he would kill the one who dare trying to kill him while the published version implied that the sender want to take a revenge to the reader if he/she dare to do something to them. Although generally the purpose of the sentences was to threaten its reader but the sentences were too different. Sending to grave in OM (online manga) meant to kill, so before the e-mail target can kill him, president Katsumoto promised that he will kill him first. On the other hand, the sentence’s implication in PM (published manga) was president Katsumoto would take action if the e-mail target indeed killed him. The situations were not the same.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OM</th>
<th>Karena aku yang melupakan sesuatu, aku akan bisa pulang sendiri dan mengambilnya sendiri</th>
<th>Since I was the one who forgot thing, I can go back alone and take it alone.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PM</td>
<td>Biar aku sendiri yang mengambil barangku yang ketinggalan</td>
<td>Let me alone who take my left good.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The keywords for the first example were left, alone, go back. In OM the sentence was longer than the PM version. The sentence on OM described in the detail the condition of the speaker at that time. She explained the reason why she had to go back by herself. The second sentence did not explain her reason but only her purpose of going back. In addition the OM sentence did not ask for permission while the PM gave asking permission vibe. That was why those sentences were considered different even though it had same keywords.


In the last research problems, fifty dialogues from printed manga were rated accurate while only 22 dialogues from online manga were given the same score. The differences were more than 50%. Moreover, the percentage of accurate translation found in printed manga was 41.7% from all data. There was only one datum that was given the same 3 score by both raters, data number 78.

The dialogue occurred was said by Conan after he saw detective Takagi yawning. In original Japanese, the meaning of the sentence was that Conan was wondering if detective Takagi was sleepy. If we translate "眠そう" (nemusou) literally, it will be “look sleepy”. In printed manga or Indonesian publish version, it was translated literally but in online manga it was translated as “tired”. It was similar to the English scanlated version. According to both raters "眠そう" can also be translated into tired, since both can be expressed to describe the reasons of detective Takagi’s yawn. That was why both translations were accurate. Unfortunately, this was the only dialogue that was given same scores despite its difference.

Although some data from online manga were more accurate than printed manga, the sentences were not so natural. In the following example the online manga was more accurate than printed manga, the sentences in printed manga were more natural.

OJ 高木刑事眠そうだね... You look sleepy detective Keiji, don't you?

OM Paman Takagi kelelahan, ya? Uncle Takagi, tired, don't you?

PM Kak Takagi ngantuk? Are you sleepy brother Takagi?

OM Kami hadir sebagai orang yang berhubungan dengan manajemen perusahaannya... We came as people related to that woman’s agency

PM Kami mengambil tempat di barisan orang-orang di kantor agensinya... We took place in the row of people in her agency company

However we came as people related to that woman’s agency

We came as people related to her management company...
From the original Japanese’s back translation it contained the information that the three suspects, Mr. Ogino, Mr. Sodesaki and Ms. Tsukihara, went to the actress' funeral hiding their identities. They even pretended to be the people from actress' agency. In online manga translation the word “agency” was changed into “management company”. Although it was translated into different word, the purpose was still the same. Both words referred to a company which managed the activities of actors and actresses. In addition, the information delivered by the online manga version was the same as the original Japanese version. On the other hand, in printed version was a less accurate translation. Even though the translation of “agency” was correctly used, the whole sentence did not deliver the same message as the original Japanese version. The printed manga version only explained that the three suspects sat next to people from the actress’ agency without stating the fact they were pretending to hide the fact they worked for the magazine which pushed the actress to suicide.

Another example was an accurate datum from printed manga:

```
OJ でも、興味があるのは殺しではなく謎解きの方がですけどね。

PM  Tetapi aku lebih tertarik pada pemecahan misterinya, bukan pembunuhan.

OM  Tetapi daripada pembunuhan, minantku yang sesungguhnya terletak pada pemecahan teka-teki…
```

Subaru told the sentence to Haibara. He meant to tell her that in spite of his well knowledge about murder, he was not interested in it. He did it only for the sake of his interest in solving mystery. Using almost similar grammatical pattern, the translation from printed manga successfully conveyed that message, no omission or addition of information. On the other hand, the translation from online Manga was less accurate. The reason lied on the use of “teka-teki (puzzle)” to replace ”謎解き(nazotoki)” or “mystery” in English. Even though “謎 (nazo)” can also mean riddle or puzzle, in this context it was not a good idea to use those word. It was because what Subaru meant was not only a piece of riddle but the accumulation of hints that found in the scene to solve a case so “mystery” would be more appropriate.

CONCLUSIONS

In conclusion, even though the translation of online manga which is translated from English is accurate it is still less accurate than printed manga. Moreover, even some online manga data are more accurate than printed manga, the language used in printed manga is more natural. There is the possibility that the translator of printed manga takes some consideration into naturalness of the language so he makes some adjustment in the translation which decreases its accuracy. Printed comic which is officially published and translated from the original Japanese version have more accurate data than the online comic if it is compared to original Japanese version.

I also have some suggestions to give for anyone who wants to use this study. The first suggestion is to do further analysis to
investigate the accuracy of Japanese-English scanlation of Detective Conan manga. The second one is to do the same analysis but with more raters to check if there will be any difference from this one and also what kind of techniques used in the translation process. At the end, the writer would like to suggest manga readers buying the original published version of manga rather than reading it online since online comics have many inaccuracies which make the messages of the manga itself gone. By reading online manga, you show your disrespect toward the original author.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

This research can be completed well because of the amount of support from many people. I would like to express my biggest thank to Dr. Issy Yulasri, M.Pd. who has provided me with careful input, guidance, and feedbacks. Furthermore, thanks to Drs. Laurentius Elyas Nugraha, MA., and Seful Bahri, S.Pd., M.Pd., who are my first and second examiners, for the meaningful corrections and suggestions. My special honor expressed to all my lecturers of English Department who had helped me in various ways. Thanks also to my friends who accompanied me in many situations.

BIBLIOGRAPHY


