Strategies and creativity used by fansubbers in subtitling *Hot and Young Seoul Trip X NCT LIFE* to overcome language barriers

Syafira Ilyas Damayanti1,2, Rudi Hartono2

1,2English Department, Faculty of Languages and Arts, Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

**Abstract**

This research focuses on the subtitling strategies and creative subtitling used in translating the Korean variety show *Hot and Young Seoul Trip X NCT LIFE* (2018) into Indonesian and the impact of fan subtitles to overcome language barriers. In order to draw more understanding, qualitative content analysis was applied to describe the subtitling strategies and creative subtitling used by the fansubbers in producing Indonesian subtitles. An online survey was conducted to determine the impact of the subtitling from the fans' perspective. The research findings on subtitling strategies were obtained from 1599 data and showed that there were eight strategies applied in this research. Among those strategies, transfer with 1434 data found is the most used strategy, followed by imitation, dislocation, expansion, paraphrase, transcription, condensation, and deletion. Then, the creative subtitling used in the work using different colors, fonts, and punctuation that is influenced by field (topic), tenor (relationship), and mode (circumstances). The online survey results prescribe that the subtitles of the fan help the audience overcome language barriers by producing translated audiovisual content into their language. Therefore, the fansubbers' decision to combine subtitling strategies and creative subtitling helps the foreign audiences overcome language barriers.

© Copyright 2021

**INTRODUCTION**

Language is essential in everyone's lives because people use language to communicate with others by expressing messages from one person to another, if the meaning behind a message is not delivered correctly to the receiver, then the two people will have misunderstanding. Here, translation came as one of the strategies to overcome the language barrier because a good translation has to transfer the message from the source language to the target language well (Hudi et al., 2020), so it could help the people who find difficulties in understanding the meaning due to different dialects and languages.

Korean wave that is happening around the world brought by musicians from South Korea has a massive impact on people who like listening to music. According to Roman (2018), Hallyu or Korean Wave has become a truly global phenomenon as the idea that South Korean pop culture has grown in prominence to become a major driver of global culture. There are so many contents given by the musicians to communicate and get closer with their fans from all around the world. The problem arises when foreign fans who
do not understand Korean want to know the content of conversation and information given by their favourite musicians and creating a new phenomenon called fansubbers was born because their fans decided to create subtitles by translating the conversation of their favorite musicians from Korean into several languages, especially English and Indonesian, so that the fans from all around the world who only understand English or/and Indonesian can enjoy the content given by their favorite musician.

In regard of the creative activity in fansubbing culture, as one of audiovisual translation product by amateur translator, fansubtitles was known to have an aesthetic styles, e.g., the use of different colors, fonts and punctuation that is influenced by field (topic), tenor (relationship) and mode (circumstances) and rich of cultural and social condition awareness, i.e. fandom environments, ethical and legal beliefs (Dwyer, 2012; Wongseree, 2016).

Considering the growth of fansubbing culture in digital media, fansubtitles acts an audiovisual product that has a unique way in contributing to overcome language barriers. Almeida and Costa (2014) and Zanon (2006) revealed that fansubtitles considered as the most efficience way to activating their cognitive skill in foreign language acquisition because by reading the subtitles, the language learner can enhance their language learning process by combining the visual, text and also information they gained.

However, as a new type of audiovisual translation this fansubbing culture phenomenon and their impact for the society, especially in overcoming language barriers has not received much attention in the academic field. Therefore, this research will focuses on (1) identifying the subtitling strategies used by fansubbers in translating “Hot and Young Seoul Trip X NCT LIFE”; (2) identifying the creativity in subtitling used by fansubbers in translating their subtitles, and (3) investigating the impact of Indonesian subtitles made by fansubbers in overcoming language barriers.

METHODS

To draw a more qualitative understanding of practising creative subtitling in the audiovisual product, the researcher used qualitative content analysis for this research. By using qualitative content analysis, the researcher’s goal is to prevent any bias regarding the researcher’s opinion and gain trustworthiness to support the arguments from the research finding are make sense and “worth paying attention to”, so the readers can find that the research is meaningful and useful (Long and Johnson, 2000; Bengtsson, 2016; Lincoln and Guba, 1985; Elo et al., 2014; Holdford, 2008).

As the main instrument of the research, the researcher will observe, collect and analyze the data collected. The researcher, as data observer and collector, all of the data were gained from watching the show Hot and Young Seoul Trip X NCT Life with the subtitles created by the Indonesian fansubbers NEOCITYSUB and from the original creator of the show. As an analyzer, the researcher classified and calculated the data found and collected in a data tabulation as supporting instrument.

Purposive sampling was applied in order to gain trustworthiness to support the arguments by spreading an online questionnaire to collect some voices from the suitable participants that are especially has the knowledge or experienced with the phenomenon of interest discussed in the researcher’s study.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Subtitling Strategies

As one of audiovisual translation products, subtitling strategies proposed by Gottlieb (1992) come as the bridge to help the audience to learn and understand the cultural patterns from the source language into the target language.

The table below is showing the data tabulation by applying Gottlieb’s (1992) subtitling strategies by classifying the the dialogues and on-screen text in the form of spoken words, phrases, clause and sentences shown in the first of six episodes of Hot and Young Seoul Trip X NCT Life.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1. Subtitling Data Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>p-ISSN: 2252-6323</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>e-ISSN: 2721-4540</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
According to Table 1, it shows that there are a total of 1599 data collected, and eight translation-subtitle strategies was used in the six episodes of Hot and Young Seoul Trip X NCTLife. The most frequent used strategy was transfer with 1434 data found and the least used strategy was deletion with only 1 data found.

**Expansion**

Expansion in this subtitling strategy means giving additional information in the target language when the words in the source language need more explanation due to cultural differences and those words cannot be replaced in the target language.

**Example 1:**

SL Yuta : Myun Se Jeom!
TL Yuta : Myun Se Jeom! (Toko Bebas Pajak) (Duty Free Shop)

From the example, fansubber using expansion strategy because they added an extended meaning of the (SL) and (TL) from Korean language mentioned by the speaker. The fansubber add more meaning in some scene in their work because the speakers are playing a word chain game, so due to the cultural differences between Korean and Indonesian, the fansubbers added more meaning alongside with the unfamiliar phrase, so their audience will not confuse with the meaning behind those foreign phrases.

**Example 2:**

SL Yuta : This way?
TL Yuta : Cara ini? Bukan~ (Like this? I think, no~)

Meanwhile, in example 2, the TL utterance translated version from SL “This way” into “Cara ini? Bukan~” refers to the speaker's visual expressions so that the audiences could grasp the speaker's intended. The reason why fansubbers using an expansion strategy to translate their work is to educate the audiences and make every phrase stated by the speaker livelier and giving local Indonesian vibes by adding more explanation.

**Paraphrase**

In subtitling strategy, paraphrase was applied when the translator gives more manner of expression from the source language into the target language, usually called as in other words.

**Example 1:**

SL Winwin : It’s so awesome!
TL Winwin : wahgelaseh (awesome)

Based on the data example above, the researcher identifies that the fansubbers modifies the expression expressed by the speaker in TL by using language-specific expression because the fansubber was using the TL ‘wahgelaseh’ instead of ‘keren banget’ in translating SL ‘awesome’.

**Example 2:**

SL Display Text: [Emotional boy]
TL Display Text: [Pria yang mudah baperan] (the man who’s gotten emotional easily)

It also can be seen on example 2 that the fansubbers translated 'emotional' into 'baperan' instead of ‘terbawa perasaan’ into their work.

Even though the fansubbers decided to insert the Indonesian slang instead of its literal meaning, the meaning from the expression stated in TL conveys the same meaning and function, they also make the expression expressed by the speakers more relevant, lively and friendly towards their target audiences.

**Transfer**

Based on Gottlieb's (1992) subtitling strategies, the transfer is a strategy that is directly translating the meaning from the source language into the target language completely because this strategy is used to maintain the structure in source language remain complete, correct and has a neutral discourse.

**Example 1:**

SL Display Text: [Yuta & Mark's Kayak almost tilted from the beginning]
Based on the data example above, the text was translated literally in formal language from English into Indonesian every words were translated similarly, both in structural and also the meaning.

**Example 2:**

SL Display Text : [Staggers at the important moment]

TL Display Text : [Sempoyongan di momen penting~]

In example 2, it can be seen that besides using formal language, the fansubbers also using non-formal language into their work. Even though the fansubbers uses non-formal language, the meaning behind the sentences has no different meaning from the formal language.

According to the examples above the dialogue and on-screen text were translated literally from English into Indonesian, and there is no additional meaning nor deletion added in the clause because the fansubbers translated the dialogue literally and and every phrase was translated similarly, both in structural and also the meaning.

**Imitation**

Imitation strategy was done when the translator just rewriting the source language into the target language, so it produce an identical expression in the target language.

**Example 1:**

SL Kun: No way Mark go!

TL Kun: Nggak, Mark duluan. (No way, Mark should go first!)

**Example 2:**

SL Display Text: [Coex Artium, Gangnam-gu, Seoul]

TL Display Text: [Coex Artium, Gangnam-gu, Seoul] (Coex Artium, Gangnam-gu, Seoul)

According the examples above, it can be seen that the fansubbers did not modifies the SL into TL because it refers to the name of people, like the name of one of NCT’s member ‘Mark’ and places or tourist attraction, like the capital city of South Korea, ‘Seoul’, so the fansubber did not have to translate it.

**Transcription**

In subtitling strategy, transcription is applied by rewriting certain words in the target language because this strategy is dealing with unusual terms, nonsense language or alien language, and third language from the source language.

**Example 1:**

SL Yuta : Gururu

TL Yuta : Gururu

Based on the example above, there is no such word like ‘gururu’ in English ‘Oxford’ Dictionary and Japanese ‘Jisho’ Dictionary because Yuta, the Japanese member of NCT spoke this utterance. That word also did not appear in Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia.

This happened because the fansubbers was rewriting the phrases from SL into TL because of those phrases above use either non-sense or third languages.

**Example 2:**

SL Lucas : Bbari Bbari boo

TL Lucas : Bbari Bbari boo

Furthermore, in example 2, ‘Bbari Bbari boo’ that was spoken by Lucas is just making up Korean words for fun, so it has no real meaning behind it because the phrase ‘Bbari Bbari boo’ is a pun from the Korean version of rock, paper, scissors game called ‘Gawi Bawi Bo’. The fansubbers was rewriting the phrases as the way it sound from SL into TL, and in this case, the fansubbers are mostly re-writing South Korean style romanization (Korean spoken word).

**Dislocation**

Based on Gottlieb’s (1992) subtitling strategies, dislocation strategy is dealing with the special effects in the source language that pays more attention rather than the translation content.

**Example 1:**

SL Mark : Winwin you go

TL Mark : Winwin Hyung kamu duluan! (Winwin, you can go first!)
It can be seen on the example above that the fansubbers was inserting South Korean style romanization language as a special effect in their work. The researcher assumes the reasons behind the use of adding South Korean style romanization in TL because the fansubbers wants to make the sentences spoken by the members look more acceptable and polite in TL because of the TL culture is still uphold the value of politeness. From the example above the translator in SL just mentioning the name of member ‘Winwin’ without ‘bro’ even though the opposite speaker ‘Mark’ is younger than him, so the TL fansubbers decided to translate the utterance into ‘Winwin Hyung’ or ‘Brother Winwin’ to make it more polite and acceptable just like in Indonesian culture.

Example 2:

SL  Display text : [Older, but cuter than youngers]

TL  Display text : [Lebih tua, tapi lebih imut dari para maknae] (Older, but cuter than the youngers)

Moreover, the researcher assumes that the fansubbers decided to change the words ‘youngers’ into Korean language ‘maknae’ instead of translated it as ‘termuda’ because the fansubbers knew that their audiences are already familiar with those popular Korean language and culture as the members always said that word in every chances.

Condensation

Based on Gottlieb's (1992) subtitling strategies, condensation means shortening meaning in the source language by reducing unimportant utterance to solve the line limitation problem.

Example 1:

SL  Display text : [Finally arrived bumping into Lucas’ Kayak]

TL  Display text : [Akhirnya mereka tiba!] (They are finally arrived!)

Based on the examples above, the fansubbers is omitting some words in the sentences, it can be seen that the fansubbers translated the SL “Finally arrived bumping into Lucas’s Kayak” into “Akhirnya mereka tiba,” it was seen on the example that the fansubbers did not translate “Bumping into Lucas’s Kayak” into TL (Indonesian) “(dengan) menabrakkan diri dengan Kayak milik Lucas” to make the sentencing brief.

Example 2:

SL  Display text : [Perfect chemistry]

TL  Display text : [Sempurna!] (Perfect!)

The same method also implied in example 2, the translator just translated the SL “Perfect chemistry” into “Sempurna” instead of “Keserasian yang sempurna” because the fansubbers omitted the word “perfect”.

Even though the fansubber decided to omitted some word from the sentences, but the words that were excluded has the least important words, so it did not affect the actual meaning from the sentences.

Deletion

The deletion strategy in Gottlieb’s (1992) subtitling strategy is used to delete some parts in the source language into the target language because it is not important and usually contains repetition and question tag.

Example:

SL  Mark : What? Come on! What?

TL  Mark : What?

In translating the example above, the fansubbers deleted the SL “Come on! What?” which means (in literal meaning) “Ayolah! Apa?” from the translation. The translator does this because those words contain expressions that are somewhat already represented from the first word ‘What’ in the sentences, so that is why the fansubbers decided to did not translate those words, but the use of this deletion strategy in this part did not lose the semantic meaning from the utterance spoken by the speaker.

Creative Subtitling in Fansubbing Culture

The rapid development of culture and technology in this globalization era like nowadays has made a couple of people more creative in creating a new culture where they are no longer act
as viewers, but they also act as active viewers who are also participating in the making new creative content that they are fond of. Fan subtitle culture is the real example of active viewers who worked as content creators, which are amateur subtitlers or translators, as they are involved in the producing and distributing subtitles of the programs they are fond of.

In this study, the researcher wants to find an affirmation about subtitles made by fansubbers takes a big part in overcoming language barriers for foreigners by analyzing subtitling strategies used by fansubbers in translating Indonesian subtitles of Hot and Young Seoul Trip X NCTLife and to support the researcher’s argument, the researcher has conducted an online survey by applying purposive sampling as the research sampling method. The online survey paper aims to gain another perspective and evidence about fan subtitling culture and activities and also their impact in overcoming language barriers for foreigner from the fans of Korean culture and content, e.g., Korean variety shows, audition programs, food programs, and many more. The data that has been collected according to Figure 1 shown below will be used as supporting arguments.

Figure 1. Reasons Why the Audiences Like Fansubtitles

**Unique Approach**

As one of the creativity, the things that stands out from the fan subtitling activity in Audiovisual Translation (AVT) are the use of fonts, colors, and text positioning that usually done by the fansubber as freely as they want. The use of audiovisual in fan subtitles culture of Korean programs added some values to the subtitles because those creativity makes the subtitles look like has some charm, more aesthetic and functional, so fan subtitles, at the same time, can also enhance the viewing experience for the fansubtitles’ audiences. Pérez-Gonzáles (2007) stated that the different colors and fonts in fansubtitles were used to make the emotion and relationships between the speakers in the program livelier and also influenced by variables of **field** (what is the topic), **tenor** (the relationship between the speakers) and **mode** (the emotions and circumstances shown) that can be seen in every scene.

**Figure 2. Feedback Scale on How Entertain is Subtitle Made by Fansubber**

Figure 2 reveals that most of the respondents agree that the use of font, colors, and text positioning in fansubbers work add more entertain sense for them when they are watching the subtitles made by the fansubbers because those words in the on-screen text will add more humor or emotion into the act.

Also, in translating fansubtitles, the fansubbers usually the fan translation has the freedom to translate their project; they can do anything with their own style for their project, for example using informal language and adding some additional information that is only known by the target fans of their work. In some chances, we can see fansubbers adding some Korean style Romanization, e.g., ‘Hyung’ (‘older brother’ addressed from a younger male into an older male) or mentioning someone’s real name instead of their stage name into their work.

**Potential Challenges Factors**
According to Figure 1, one of the reasons why the foreign fans of Korean content-loving fan subtitles produced by fansubbers are the short release time between the official release and the fansubbers's version.

In the case of the time available between Hot and Young Seoul Trip X NCTLife, the videos distributed by Visit Seoul TV in their YouTube channel is on July 23, 2018, and the NEOCITYSUB version is uploaded in their own YouTube channel the day after the official release or on July 24, 2018.

This matter also mentioned by Rush (2009), based on his research, the fansubbers need to produce their work in such a short time because the fansub need to gain recognition from the audience in the fan subtitling community.

Besides the airing time, in order to reach full engagement for their works, Wongseree (2016) explained that fansubbing culture also influenced by 'selected' un-knowledgeable programs that were requested by some fandoms or based on their favourite musicians. By producing some non-knowledgeable foreign programs into highly knowledgeable foreign program as their work, it can be seen that the fansubbers has made a significant contribution to the programs they produced to recognized both to the fans and also to non-fans.

Fansubtitles as a Tool to Overcome Language Barriers

In Figure 3, most of the respondents claimed that the accuracy from subtitles made by the fansubbers are quite accurate with the source language. It is also supported by the researcher's data about subtitling strategies found in fansubbers (NEOCITYSUBS) works, so it means that the translation quality from the subtitles produced by the fansubbers is worth to be read and has a low possibility to confuse the audiences. It shows that even though the fans did not understand Korean, they can also enjoy the programs and learn the Korean language from the subtitles provided by the fansubbers.

Based on Almeida and Costa (2014) research, it shows that watching a tv program that has been subbed is part of language acquisition. Besides, learning the meaning of the words, the audiences might also learning about the meaning of expressions and guessing the sentences that might be used in some situations. The audiences can also improve their capability in distinguishing the separate words of the spoken language, word pronunciation, and also experiencing in constructing the right and correct sentences from the source language.

Figure 4. Feedback Scale on How Useful Fansubtitle in Helping the Audiences Learning Korean

According to Figure 4, the respondents agree that fan subtitle made by fansubbers helps the audiences to learn about Korean, not just about the language, but also the culture as well because the fansubbers was usually inserting linear notes into their work. The use of linear notes in AVT is to provide the audiences with brief explanation and understanding that would be missed by the audience due to the cultural differences.
Based on Figure 5 it shows that the fansubbers’ linear notes are very helpful for the fans. In fansubbing culture case, the fansubbers are adding brief explanation of some information about something or some words in Korean that is not widely known by the foreign fans and also non-fans, so their audiences will not astound with the content that is being talked about in some scenes from the program because it has already explained from the subtitles.

The Role of Subtitling Strategies and Creative Subtitling in Translating an Audiovisual Product to Overcome Language Barriers

As the demand for Korean variety shows to be translated into various languages, there are also some growth in the fansubber group and the kind of content they produced. Fansubtitles as a creative work of audiovisual products from fansubber group has become a tool to overcome language barriers and based on the researcher in analyzing subtitling strategies “Hot and Young NCTLIFE X Seoul”, the researcher found out that subtitling strategies and creative subtitling as audiovisual products has a big role in overcoming language barriers for the foreign fans in understanding Korean culture and language content.

According to the Diagram 1, based on researcher’s findings. It can be seen that as a producer of Indonesian fansubtitles of “Hot and Young NCTLIFE X Seoul”, fansubbers were identified using Gottlieb (1992) subtitling strategies for translating the English subtitle into Indonesian subtitle. Fansubbers not only translating the words, phrases, clauses, sentences, paragraphs; the fansubbers also using different words, colors, punctuation and adding linear notes into their Indonesian subtitle in order to provide their audience in rich information about not only about the language, but also the culture as well so that the audience can overcome the language barriers.

In order to gain trustworthiness to support the argument from the researcher’s research, the researcher will link some of the findings from the purposive sampling results and the researcher's work of audiovisual products from fansubber group has become a tool to overcome language barriers and based on the researcher in analyzing subtitling strategies “Hot and Young NCTLIFE X Seoul”, the researcher found out that subtitling strategies and creative subtitling as audiovisual products has a big role in overcoming language barriers for the foreign fans in understanding Korean culture and language content.
data about the subtitling strategies that has been
done previously and also providing some evidence
from the previous studies.

In accordance with researcher's finding on
online surveys result that can be seen in Figure 3
about “Feedback Scale on How Accurate is the
Translation from the Subtitles” and Figure 6 about
“Feedback Scale on How Understandable Fansubtitles
for Audiences”, we can see that most of the
respondents claimed that the subtitles produced by
fansubbers is accurate and understandable for the
audiences. Based on previous findings, the
accuracy of fansubtitles can be seen on the use of
subtitling strategies applied in “Hot and Young Seoul
Trip X NCTLife”. The researcher has been
successfully identified that there are 8 strategies
applied in fansubber work; these strategies not only
found in the dialogues between the speaker, but
also in the display text provided. Both in Hastuti
(2015) and this research found out that the
accuracy of the subtitling strategies depends on the
field (topic), tenor (relationship) and mode
(circumstances) because it relates with the real-
time situation and also cultural context.

As stated in Wongseree (2016) and Zanon
(2006), fansubber’s choice in including creative
subtitling in their work is very clever and maintain
a faithful translation because those display text, in
the terms of fonts, colors, punctuations and even
the linear note has a crucial role in providing
new information for the audiences and
language learners because it can enhance their
language learning process because when they are
reading the subtitles they are combining the visual,
text and also information they receives, so that they
have an active role in learning the language. This
statement was proven from the submission of
online surveys that can be seen in Figure 4 that
most of the respondent are agree that the
fansubtitles made by fansubbers help them in
understanding the Korean language and culture
better as the fansubbers frequently applying
creative subtitling such as adding some linear notes
and also using some different color, fonts and
punctuation into their work, so the audiences will
not engage in 'lost in translation' mode.

Furthermore, Jin and Aisyah (2017) in their
research about “K-Pop V Fansubs, V LIVE and
NAVER Dictionary: Fansubbers’ Synergy in
Minimizing Language Barriers” explained that
audiovisual translation especially fansubtitles
produced by the fans has a big impact in rendering
information for the foreign fans because as a social
product even though they are amateurs, but they
tried to deliver a good translation, so that language
barriers are minimized.

CONCLUSION

Based on the research findings and
discussions, it can be concluded that there are total
1599 data collected and eight subtitling strategies
applied in this research, those are expansion,
paraphrase, transfer, imitation, transcription,
dislocation, condensation and deletion. Amid
those strategies, transfer with 1434 data found is
the most used strategy because the fansubbers are
directly translating the meaning from source
language to target language.

In translating an audiovisual, the use of
creative subtitling in fansubtitle has often seen as
the use of different colors, fonts and punctuation
that is influenced by field (topic), tenor
(relationship) and mode (circumstances) to show
the emotional relationship between the speakers.
Another creative subtitling that can be found in fan
subtitles made by fansubber is the use of linear
notes to provide the audiences with brief
explanation and understanding that would be
missed by the audience due to the cultural
differences.

The use of subtitling strategies and creative
subtitling in producing fan subtitles play a big part
in overcoming language barriers for foreigners.
Fan subtitles act as an audiovisual product that has
a unique way of overcoming language barriers by
raising awareness of language learning for the
audiences because of the faithfulness in producing
fan subtitles, fansubbers tried their best to prevent
the ‘lost in translation’ tragedy to the audience
when they are enjoying the content they love.
Those findings indicate a simple and sincere act from fansubbers can also provide a positive contribution, not only for foreign fans but also for one and all.

REFERENCES


