

## Urban Transportation Innovation: Implementation of the “Biskita Trans Pakuan” Bus Transportation Policy as an Effort to Improve Mass Transportation in Bogor City 2021-2022

Bintang Avroditha Nebula Sangga Buana Susanto Putri\*<sup>1</sup>, and Moh. Aris Munandar<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1,2</sup> Political Science Program, Universitas Negeri Semarang, Semarang, Central Java, Indonesia

### Article Info

#### Article History

Submitted 17 July 2023

Accepted 21 October 2023

Published 1 November 2023

#### Keywords

policy implementation; public transportation innovation; biskita bogor

### Abstract

Massive transportation management is needed to overcome traffic problems that are common in big cities, such as congestion. Bogor itself is famous for its traffic jams as a result of the booming number of city transportation or public transportation, especially in the central area of Bogor. The Central Government together with the Bogor Government presented an urban transportation innovation program in the form of reducing and converting public transportation (angkot) into “BisKita Trans Pakuan Bogor” buses to overcome this traffic jam problem. This study aims to examine how the “BisKita Trans Pakuan” bus transportation policy is implemented. This research focuses on how the Bogor Government implements the “BisKita Trans Pakuan” bus program from planning to public policy evaluation. This study uses a mixed method or mixed method exploratory sequential design which begins with collecting and analyzing data in the form of qualitative, which in the next stage with the collection of quantitative data to strengthen the research results. The main weight of this study is on qualitative data. Sources of data are taken through data collection techniques such as interviews, observation, questionnaires, and documentation. A data validity test was carried out by data triangulation. Data analysis techniques are carried out in several ways, namely data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion. The results of this study show that the Bogor City Government is utilizing the “BisKita Trans Pakuan” BTS program to reduce congestion by converting urban transportation that crowds the SSA line (one-way system) resulting in traffic jams almost every day.

## INTRODUCTION

Transportation plays an important role in people's lives. This is because transportation is related to community mobility, production activities, consumption, to distribution. A good transportation system will shorten travel time which has implications for time and cost efficiency as well as an impact on reducing the prices of goods and services. Thus, the mobility of people will increase. In line with that, the geographical position of Bogor City which is very close to thenational capital makes it a strategic potential for economic growth and services, a national activitycenter for industry, trade, transportation, communication, and tourism. Like sugar in the Jabodetabek area, the City of Bogor is able to invite rapid urbanization that makes the City of Bogor an attractive area for migrants as an alternative settlement and livelihood. The density and population that continues to increase will add to the government's tasks, one of which

is to provide public transportation facilities that are more mass in nature because public transportation is a very vital public facility.

Based on the results of the 2020 Population Census, the population of Bogor City, West Java will reach 1.04 million people in 2020. In detail, 529.24 thousand people, or 50.74% are male, while 513.83 thousand people, or 49.26% are women (Central Bureau of Statistics, 2022). That is, population growth in the city of Bogor is so fast. Several attempts have been made by the Bogor City government to solve transportation problems in Bogor City, where the number of public transportation is so large, one of which is by not extending the operational period permits for angkot that are no longer roadworthy. It should be noted that since 2016, the Bogor City Government has implemented a one-way system (SSA) on the Otista, Juanda, Jalak Harupat, and Pajajaran roads or around the Bogor Botanical Gardens and Palace area. Inefficient public transportation routes result in route overlap where one road can be passed by more than four types of angkot, in this case on Jalan Ir. H. Juanda around the Bogor Botanical Gardens or in other

\* E-mail: [avrodithaaneb@gmail.com](mailto:avrodithaaneb@gmail.com)

Address: Universitas Negeri Semarang, C4 Building 1st Floor  
Sekaran, Semarang 50229, Central Java, Indonesia

words a one-way system route (Chrisgerson, et al. 2012: 160). This causes congestion on the Bogor Citycenter road which has an impact on other regional routes.

The chaotic condition of Bogor City's public transportation requires public transportation innovations to create efficiency in people's mobility. The central government's subsidy program through Buy The Service (BTS) is the first round for the progress of transportation in Bogor City. One of the programs that sparked was realizing the policy of subsidizing mass public transport from the central government for the Bodetabeka area through the BTS scheme which was then implemented in the City of Bogor which presented a mass public transportation service with the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) concept called "BisKita Trans Pakuan". Referring to the Regulation of the Minister of Transportation of the Republic of Indonesia Number PM 9 Tahun 2020 Pasal 10 ayat 2a, this BTS (Buy The Service) scheme, the central government provides subsidies by paying all operational costs carried out by operators providing services. Companies that become operators are selected through auction activities and have the obligation to meet all the minimum service standards set in order to receive subsidies. In line with that, the Jabodetabek Transportation Management Agency (BPTJ) of the Ministry of Transportation together with the Bogor City Government officially launched the BisKita Trans Pakuan service. BisKita Trans Pakuan is here as a mass public transportation service with the Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) concept in Bogor City. This mass transportation service is a joint effort between the Jabodetabek Transportation Management Agency (BPTJ) and the Bogor City Government through a subsidy based on the Buy The Service (BTS) scheme and carries the concept of Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) which is much better than conventional transportation.

Handling transportation problems in Bogor City, especially the realization of "BisKita Trans Pakuan" is an important step in efforts to improve the quality of mass transportation services. The presence of BisKita is a new innovation in mass transportation planning in Bogor City. This has the effect of reducing congestion at the worst point in Bogor City, namely the SSA route that surrounds the Bogor Botanical Gardens and the Presidential Palace. In addition to reducing congestion, people's mobility has also become efficient because BisKita Trans Pakuan bus routes reach various areas in Bogor City. However, the Bogor City Government's program, in this case, the reduction and conversion of angkots into "BisKita Trans Pakuan" buses, has created a new paradox where many of the affected angkot drivers no longer work as urban transport drivers and also suffer material losses. The research was conducted so that the government can improve the quality of mass transportation in Bogor City to meet the needs of the community. Based on the background and existing problems, the researcher's question arises, namely How is the BisKita Trans Pakuan Bus Transportation Policy Implemented in Bogor City from 2021 to 2022?

### Theoretical Framework

Implementation is an important activity of the entire regulatory or policy planning process. Good policies

have clear, realistic goals, as well as relevant and complete information. However, without good implementation, a good policy formulation will only become an insignificant document in people's lives. In general, the term implementation in KBBI means execution or adjustment. The term implementation is usually associated with an activity carried out to achieve a certain goal. Policy implementation is needed as an important stage that progresses from policies in the form of laws, regulations, statutes, or other forms of products. According to Suharno (2008:187) the implementation of public policy is the government's effort to carry out one of its main tasks, namely providing public services to the community. On the other hand, implementation is a complex phenomenon that can be understood as a process, an output, or as an impact. Winarno (in Meter, Horn. 1974: 447) limits implementation as actions taken by individuals or government and private groups directed at achieving the goals set in previous policy decisions. In other words, these actions include efforts to turn decisions into operational actions within a certain time to achieve a change.

Van Meter and Van Horn make a distinction between what is meant by policy implementation, and policy achievement, and what generally refers to the impact of the policy (Winarno, 2013: 150). A policy may be implemented effectively but fail to have a material impact because the policy is not structured properly. Therefore, the kinds of decisions and the implementation process will vary depending on the nature of the policy embodied.

On the other hand, according to George Edward III's Policy Implementation Theory (1980), policy implementation is a crucial process because no matter how good a policy is, if it is not properly prepared and planned for its implementation then what is the goal of public policy will not be realized, and vice versa. Therefore, to achieve policy objectives, policy formulation and implementation must be well-prepared. Edward stated that there are four crucial factors in implementation, namely: Communication, Resources, Attitudes, and Bureaucratic Structure (Winarno, 2013).

### METHODS

The approach used in this study is a mixed method. Mixed methods research design is a procedure for collecting, analyzing, and "mixing" qualitative and quantitative methods in a study or series of studies to understand problems in research (Creswell, 2012). This approach is carried out in combination with the aim of providing a better understanding of the problems and research questions. The design used in this research is The Exploratory Sequential Design. In this exploratory design the first stage begins with collecting and analyzing data in the form of qualitative, then in the next stage with collecting quantitative data to strengthen the research results. The main weight of this research strategy is on qualitative data. **QUALITATIVE**

The first stage of data collection in this study was in the form of qualitative research which was carried out to obtain information and examine how the implementation of the "BisKita Trans Pakuan" transportation policy was carried out by means of observation, interviews, and documentation.

The second stage of data collection in this study was

in the form of quantitative to strengthen the results of research on the implementation of transportation innovation policies in the form of public perceptions of the presence of "BisKita Trans Pakuan". The quantitative stage requires a population and sample because it will determine the results and validity of the research. The people of Bogor City who have used the BisKita Trans Pakua bus transportation are a population element that is the entire subject to be measured. Meanwhile, in taking the research sample using a simple random sampling technique which is a random sampling of the population. The unknown population's formula is used in this study to determine the number of samples to be collected. This formula is used because the total population in this study is not known with certainty.

The Likert scale is used to measure attitudes, opinions, and perceptions of a person or group of people about social phenomena (Sugiyono, 2018). With a Likert scale, the variables to be measured are translated into indicators. The answers to each instrument item using the Likert Scale have a gradation from very positive to very negative. Then with the questionnaire data collection technique which was then given to 100 respondents, it could be analyzed by calculating the average answer based on the suspension of each answer from the respondent.

## RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

### Bogor Urban Transportation

As we know, apart from being nicknamed the City of Rain, Bogor City is also attached to the nickname of the City of a Million Angkot. This is not without reason, but in the city of Bogor, there are too many types of public transportation. One route can be passed by various types of angkot where this results in mass transportation inefficiencies. In addition, inadequate road capacity exacerbates the condition. To support the statement that the City of Bogor has various types of public transportation and a large number of them can be seen in Table 1.

However, to support people's mobility in carrying out their daily activities, fast and inexpensive public transportation is definitely needed. No doubt people still choose to use public transportation. The role of government is needed to overcome this problem. In 2016, the Bogor City Government implemented the One Way System (SSA) on the Otista, Juanda, Jalak Harupat, and Pajajaran roads or around the Bogor Botanical Gardens and Palace areas, in other words, the central area of Bogor City. This is intended by the Bogor City Government to increase the capacity of the main roads (around KRB). In addition, SSA is also carried out to increase the capacity of supporting (alternative) roads.

The implementation of SSA provides benefits in the form of increasing travel time which results in saving travel time and increasing the safety of road users, namely drivers, and pedestrians. However, the implementation of the SSA in Bogor City also adds to the problem of congestion in the center of Bogor City. The traffic jam was exacerbated after the Bogor City Government narrowed the width of the road around the Bogor Botanical Gardens for a sidewalk widening project. The width of the road is not proportional to

the amount of transportation that passes on the SSA route, as is the case with many angkot routes that pass through the SSA route. Until now, it has been observed that in 2022 the congestion around the SSA route cannot be said to have improved.

**Table 1.** Types of public transportation

No	Route Code	Routes	Fleet Amount
1	01-AP	Cipinang Gading -- Perumahan Yasmin	93
2	02-AP	Warung Nangka -- Bogor Trade Mall	180
3	03-AP	Cimahpar -- Bogor Trade Mall	180
4	05-AP	Ciheuleut -- Bogor Trade Mall	155
5	08-AP	Taman Pajajaran -- Bantarkemang -- Terminal Merdeka	122
6	09-AP	Baranangsiang Indah -- Pasar Baru Bogor	55
7	10-AP	Cimanggu Permai -- Pasar Anyar	202
8	13-AP	Mutiara Bogor Raya -- Bogor Trade Mall	153
9	14-AP	Sukasari -- Pasir Kuda -- Terminal Bubulak	122
10	15-AP	Terminal Merdeka -- Situgede	105
11	16-AP	Salabenda -- Pasar Anyar	171
12	18-AP	Villa Mutiara -- Pasar Anyar	50
13	19-AP	Bina Marga -- Tanah Baru -- PO-MAD/Ciluar	59
14	21-AP	Mulyaharja -- Lawang Sakateng/ Bogor Trade Mall	56
15	22-AP	Terminal Bubulak -- Kencana	40
16	23-AP	Taman Griya Kencana -- Pasar Anyar	37
17	24-AP	Pondok Rumput -- Pasar Anyar	51
18	25-AP	BTM -- Taman Kencana -- Warung Jambu	97
19	30-AP	Pabuaran -- Terminal Merdeka via BNR	140
20	02-AK	Sukasari -- Terminal Bubulak	386
21	03-AK	Terminal Baranangsiang -- Terminal Bubulak	286
22	07-AK	Terminal Merdeka -- Ciparigi	158
23	09-AK	Sukasari -- Ciparigi	112
24	21-AK	Terminal Baranangsiang -- Ciawi	150
Jumlah			3.161

Source: Dinas Perhubungan Kota Bogor, 2022.

### Implementation Of Reduction Transportation Innovation

The Bogor City Government is trying to reduce the level of congestion on the SSA line which is the heart of Bogor City. The Mayor of Bogor, Bima Arya Sugiarto initiated the "Angkot Reform" policy to solve the problems of mass transportation management in Bogor City. The Bogor City Government is focusing on fixing congestion on the SSA route because the area around the Bogor Palace is the main route that is connected to other roads and/or Bogor City areas. The number of angkot fleets in Bogor City will be gradually reduced with the concept of converting three angkot units into one bus. This is where the mass transpor-



tation innovation in Bogor City was born, namely BisKita Trans Pakuan. Various programs such as rerouting (merging routes), reduction (rejuvenation) to conversion (three public transportation to one bus).

In the context of urban transportation policy, the presence of BisKita Trans Pakuan is a pull policy. This means that this policy is intended to attract public interest to reduce the use of private vehicles and switch to public transportation. Subsidies in the form of Buy The Service (BTS) are a decision by the central government to provide support regarding policies that pull policies (bptj.dephub, 2021). In general, local governments face limitations in providing mass transit services with good service standards. Therefore the Central Government is present to provide support in the form of BTS subsidies. The Buy the Service scheme for mass transportation is a mechanism for purchasing mass transportation by the central government, in this case, the Ministry of Transportation to operators with an auction mechanism based on Minimum Service Standards. In other words, the government only focuses on evaluating the performance of services run by operators. Previously, the central government used a bus procurement scheme to be handed over and managed by the regional government. Unfortunately, the system is not very developed because there is no adequate subsidy pattern. Therefore, finally, the central government made changes to the subsidy mechanism by purchasing services (Buy The Service) to 3rd parties, in this case, private and regional companies as transportation operators.

This scheme is regulated through Minister of Transportation Regulation Number 9 of 2020 concerning Subsidies for Urban Public Passenger Transport, which was later amended by PM Number 2 of 2022. In addition, BTS is a development of the previous government program, namely Bus Rapid Transit. In this scheme, the government subsidizes up to 100 percent of the operating costs of mass transit vehicles by applying a set minimum service plus a profit set by the operator. In this program, public transport fares are free because they are subsidized by the government. This system is also expected to improve public transport services. The BTS scheme is a pull-and-push strategy. The pull strategy is carried out by the central government by providing bus needs and licenses to operators who meet minimum service standards and imposing sanctions on operators who violate minimum service rules. While the push strategy is the obligation of the local government to encourage people to want to switch from private vehicles to use public transportation.

The Bogor City Government has begun to make transportation arrangements, one of which is by reducing the number of public transportation in Bogor City. Based on data that researchers obtained from the Bogor City Transportation Service, until 2022 the number of public transportation in Bogor City will be 3,161, which is less than in 2020, which was 3,412 units. However, the Bogor City Government did not completely eliminate public transportation, but gradually the angkots that passed the Bogor City center route were replaced with BisKita buses. This is in line with the transportation management program in Bogor City, namely Rerouting (merging routes), Reduction (rejuvenation), and converting three public transportation into

one bus. In the conversion process, as an initial stage, the revocation of route permits for 147 units of public transportation was replaced by 49 units of medium-sized buses. The angkots were then scrapped, some were blackmailed and were not allowed to operate to pick up passengers. The main road for Bogor City is precisely on the SSA (one-way system) route, namely on the Otista, Juanda, Jalak Harupat, and Pajajaran roads or around the Bogor Botanical Gardens and Palace area. The SSA route is a hotbed for angkots in Bogor City and is prone to traffic jams. It is this Bogor City-centric pattern that raises the congestion problem in Bogor City. This is why the Bogor City government wants to maximize transportation arrangements by gradually eliminating public transportation using the SSA line.

It should be underlined that the implementation of this program requires collaboration between the government, transportation operators, public transportation drivers, and the community to achieve maximum success. The hope is that the conversion program and reduction of public transportation to BisKita buses will be an effective solution to reduce traffic jams in the city of Bogor. Until 2024, the Bogor City Government will continue to reduce the number of angkots that are no longer fit for operation so that there are not too many angkots operating in the city center.

### **Trans Pakuan Public Perception of the Presence of Biskita Trans Pakuan Bus**

The presence of the BisKita Trans Pakuan mass transportation in Bogor City aims to provide reliable public transportation services to the community such as security, comfort, safety, and punctuality so that people's mobility can run effectively. In the policy implementation stage, the proactive attitude of the community can influence problem-solving. Without community support, good public policy will not be able to solve the problem. Community involvement in public policy is needed so that a public policy is right on target and in accordance with public needs. Analysis of data on the perceptions of the people of Bogor City on the presence of the BisKita Trans Pakuan bus in this study is a descriptive analysis in which each answer uses a list of tables and numbers using a Likert scale. The Likert scale is used to measure attitudes, opinions, and perceptions of a person or group of people about a person's phenomena (Soegiyono, 2018). Variables to be measured on a Likert scale will be translated into variable indicators and then these indicators will be used as measuring points for compiling instrument items in the form of statements. Therefore, to measure people's perceptions, researchers compiled 10 statements with a total of 100 respondents. Respondents who were taken to measure the public's perception of the presence of Biskita Trans Pakuan Bogor City were Bogor City residents who had used BisKita Trans Pakuan transportation. The total number of respondents taken was 100 respondents and categorized based on gender, age, and occupation.

### **Data Analysis of Public Perception of Biskita Trans Pakuan**

Analysis of people's perceptions using the parameters and the results of the questionnaire answers from 100

**Table 2.** The perception of the people of Bogor City towards the presence of the BisKita Trans Pakuan bus

Indicator		SS	S	RG	TS	STS	JML	Score (%)
Bus effectiveness	Frequency	43	42	12	3	0	100	4,25
	Quantity	215	168	36	6	0	425	
Number of buses	Frequency	4	23	37	24	12	100	2,833
	Quantity	20	92	111	48	12	283	
Bus operating s chedule	Frequency	4	18	48	22	8	100	2,88 4
	Quantity	20	72	144	44	8	288	
Bus stop conditions	Frequency	13	22	40	24	1	100	3,22
	Quantity	65	88	120	48	1	322	
Bus route	Frequency	14	34	28	19	5	100	3,336
	Quantity	70	136	84	38	5	333	
Bus fare	Frequency	63	24	10	3	0	100	4,47
	Quantity	315	96	30	6	0	447	
Bus facilities	Frequency	28	49	18	4	1	100	3,99
	Quantity	140	196	54	8	1	399	
Bus safety	Frequency	18	46	29	7	0	100	3,75
	Quantity	90	184	87	14	0	375	
Bus driver	Frequency	36	31	23	7	3	100	3,9
	Quantity	180	124	69	14	3	390	
Bus application	Frequency	2	14	17	23	44	100	2,07
	Quantity	10	56	51	46	44	207	
TOTAL								34,69

respondents who have been obtained by researchers. In this study, the variables studied were the perceptions of the people of Bogor City towards the presence of the BisKita Trans Pakuan bus which is described in several indicators including: 1) Bus effectiveness 2) Number of bus fleets 3) Bus operational schedule 4) Condition of bus stops 5) Bus routes 6) Bus fare 7) Bus facilities 8) Bus safety 9) Bus driver and 10) Bus application. The Likert scale is used to measure attitudes, opinions and perceptions. In the previous presentation, we can find out the percentage of public perceptions based on variable indicators.

The average calculation of the results of the questionnaire answers shows that the public knows about the existence of the BisKita Trans Pakuan BTS bus program. The presence of the BisKita Trans Pakuan bus helps people's mobility when viewed from indicators of bus effectiveness. However, as a whole, the community is not satisfied with BisKita Trans Pakuan Bogor City. It can be seen from Table 4.3 above which shows the average score obtained is 34.69%, where the score obtained is included in the low category.

### BisKita Trans Pakuan Operational Obstacles

The presence of BisKita is indeed a new innovation in mass transportation planning in Bogor City. But in reality, it is not that easy. The Bogor City Government's program, in this case, the reduction and conversion of angkots

to BisKita Trans Pakuan buses has created a new paradox, namely the fate of bus drivers whose angkots are withdrawn and then converted into buses. Based on the Bogor City Government's plan, some angkot drivers were accommodated as BisKita Trans Pakuan bus drivers, however, in reality, this did not work out that way. In addition, the existence of BisKita, which is still free, has had an impact on the decrease in the number of angkot passengers and has affected the total income of angkot drivers.

In addition, the absence of special lanes like Transjakarta resulted in BisKita Trans Pakuan buses experiencing gateway and headway (arrival time) problems. It is hoped that in the near future, there will be handling so that BisKita Trans Pakuan gateway and headway problems can run optimally so that service operations to the community can also be maximized.

### Operational Opportunities Of Biskita Trans Pakuan

Returning to the main essence of BisKita Trans Pakuan, namely encouraging development and improvement in the transportation sector in the city of Bogor. The existence of the Biskita Trans Pakuan Bus in Bogor City has several opportunities that can be a successful implementation of this policy program, including: **In terms of population density:** Bogor City has a fairly dense population. Thus, there is great potential for increased demand for affordable and

efficient public transport services. **Traffic Density:** As we know, Bogor City is facing quite serious traffic congestion problems, especially in the downtown area or main roads. The BisKita Trans Pakuan bus can help reduce the number of angkots and private vehicles, thereby reducing congestion and providing a reliable transportation alternative. **Angkot Conversion Potential:** Converting angkot to BisKita Trans Pakuan buses can improve service quality, increase passenger capacity, and reduce pollution from the booming number of angkots. **Government Support:** Support from the Central Government and Bogor City Government is very important in implementing this program, including in terms of budget allocation, route planning, and necessary infrastructure improvements. **Public Awareness:** People are increasingly aware of the importance of using sustainable mass transportation. The BisKita Trans Pakuan bus that can provide comfort, and it will encourage people to switch from private vehicles to public transportation passengers.

**Increasing Regional Income:** If the BisKita Trans Pakuan bus BTS program is successfully implemented, it can provide the potential for increased revenue for transportation operators and BUMD (Regional Owned Enterprises). The provision of reliable and efficient transportation services attracts more passengers and increases revenue if the BisKita Trans Pakuan bus program has fixed fares.

Policy implementation is one of the stages of public policy between the formation of policies and the consequences of policies for the people they influence (Winarno, 2014). George Edwards stated that there are at least four factors that influence policy implementation, including communication, resources, disposition or tendencies, and bureaucratic structure.

## Communication

Communication becomes an essential thing that influences the implementation of public policy and determines the success of achieving the goals of implementing public policy. According to Edwards (Winarno, 2014) the first requirement for effective policy implementation is that those who carry out decisions must know what they have to do. Information that is known by decision-makers can be obtained through good decisions. The issue of consistency is also another aspect of communication regarding implementation instructions. Inconsistent communication can have a negative impact on policy implementation. Some of the things that Edwards meant, among others:

Transmission. Channeling good communication will be able to produce a good implementation as well. Problems often occur in the distribution of communication, namely, there is misunderstanding (miscommunication) caused by the many levels of bureaucracy that must be passed in the communication process, so that what is expected is distorted in the middle of the road. Communication received by policy implementers must be clear and not confusing or unambiguous. Orders given in the implementation of communication must be consistent and clear to set or execute. If the orders given often change, it can cause confusion for implementers in the field.

## Resources

Resources are positioned as input in the organization as a system that has economic and technological implications. Implementation orders may be passed in a careful, clear, and consistent manner, but if implementers lack the resources needed to carry out policies, then implementation tends to be ineffective. Important sources in terms of resources include staff, information, authority, and facilities (Winarno, 2014). Policy resources are essential for effective policy implementation. From the results of observations and interviews, researchers assessed that in terms of resources for Bapedda Bogor City in carrying out detailed orders and also for the long term. This indicates that the staff themselves have the skills to support implementation.

## Disposition or Tendencies

If the executors have a positive tendency or attitude or there is support for policy implementation, then there is a high probability that policy implementation will be carried out according to the initial decision, and if vice versa, when the implementer's attitude is negative or refuses to implement the policy because of a conflict of interest, then policy implementation will face serious obstacles. Through the results of interviews with informants implementing the BisKita Trans Pakuan program and observations, the researchers assessed that the negative trend still existed so the implementation was slightly less effective. The reason is that, as the researchers previously explained, there are bus stops with poor facilities and there are locked stops so that prospective passengers cannot enjoy public facilities which are their rights.

## Bureaucratic Structure

The organizational structure in charge of implementing policies has a significant influence on policy implementation. Aspects of the organizational structure are the Standard Operating Procedure (SOP) and fragmentation. In the service standards of the Bogor City Bapedda, basically, those who wish to submit development proposals in locations around their domicile in particular and in the City of Bogor, in general, can participate in conveying the aspirations of the Musrenbang which will be carried out in each kelurahan. To channel these aspirations, the person concerned can make a proposal in each RT through an RT deliberation which will later be recorded and will be continued at the sub-district level (musrenbang). After completing the recapitulation at the kelurahan, it will proceed to the sub-district level. Furthermore, the recapitulation of community proposals at the sub-district level will be sorted by priority and reviewed directly by the Regional Government in the OPD forum. At this event, representatives of sub-districts and the private sector met with the Regional Government (Local Government Agencies/Organizations) to discuss these proposals. In the final stage, namely the City-level musrenbang, the proposals that have been reviewed by the Regional Government, in this case, the OPD in charge, are ready to be reviewed and recorded in the Musrenbang results document as material for preparing the Regional Government Work Plan. By coordinating the submission and implementati-



on of the program carried out by Bapedda Bogor City, it is clearly structured.

## CONCLUSION

The implementation stage is the most important thing in implementing the policy. A policy is considered good if the benefits can really be felt by the community. The Bogor City Government's program in the form of reducing and converting public transportation to BisKita Trans Pakuan buses has helped unravel the problems of mass transportation in Bogor City. Basically, the Buy The Service (BTS) program departs from the desire to reduce congestion, one of which is by optimizing the use of mass transportation. The central government, in this case, BPTJ under the auspices of the Ministry of Transportation, is collaborating with the Bogor City Government to launch a BTS subsidy scheme in the form of BisKita Trans Pakuan and organized by PT Kodjari Tata Transport operator based on service standards set by the government. In this case, the Bogor City Government is taking advantage of the BisKita Trans Pakuan BTS program to reduce congestion by converting urban transportation that crowds the SSA route, causing traffic jams almost every day. The number of urban transportation from 3,412 to 3,161 units carried out through the 3:1 Conversion Program totaled 108 Urban Transport Units to 49 bus units. This has the effect of reducing congestion at the worst point in Bogor City, namely the SSA route that surrounds the Bogor Botanical Gardens and the Presidential Palace. In addition to reducing congestion, people's mobility has also become efficient because BisKita Trans Pakuan bus routes reach various areas in Bogor City.

The implementation of the BisKita Trans Pakuan bus was enthusiastically welcomed by the people of Bogor City. However, for the entire BisKita Trans Pakuan service it is still relatively low at 34.69%. However, the views of the community in addressing the implementation of the BisKita Trans Pakuan BTS bus policy as a whole feel quite helpful. The presence of BisKita is a new innovation in mass transportation planning in Bogor City. But in reality, it is not that easy. The Bogor City Government's program in this case the reduction and conversion of public transportation to BisKita Trans Pakuan buses has created a new paradox where many of the affected angkot drivers no longer work as urban transport drivers and also suffer material losses. The presence of BisKita Trans Pakuan, which has no fare, creates unhealthy competition because passengers tend to prefer BisKita buses compared to public transportation. Because of that, the Bogor City Government plans to impose BisKita Trans Pakuan bus fares.

## SUGGESTION

The people of Bogor City can participate in making changes by not driving private vehicles and switching to using the BisKita Trans Pakuan bus transportation. It is hoped that future researchers will examine the BisKita Trans Pakuan bus transportation innovation in more depth before and after the implementation of the BTS policy. Meanwhile, in the long term, the Bogor City Government can monitor the implementation of the BisKita Trans Pakuan bus program to ensure effectiveness and pay more attention

to the fate of city transport drivers who are affected by the presence of BisKita Trans Pakuan in Bogor City.

## REFERENCES

- Abidin, Zainal. 2012. *Kebijakan Publik*. Jakarta: Salemba Humanika.
- Agustino, Leo. 2016. *Dasar-Dasar Kebijakan Publik*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Al-Hafis, dkk. 2013. *Aktor Pelaksana Pengelolaan Transportasi Publik Perkotaan Studi Kasus Bus Trans Metro di Kota Pekanbaru*. 16 (4), 171-178.
- Antara. Sistem subsidi jadi babak awal kemajuan transportasi BodeTABEKA. <https://www.antarane.ws.com/berita/2560661/sistem-subsidi-jadi-babak-awal-kemajuan-transportasi-bodeTABEKA>. Diakses pada 5 Juli 2022.
- Badan Pusat Statistik Kota Bogor, 2020
- Biro Komunikasi dan Informasi Publik Kota Bogor, 2021.
- BPTJ Dephub. <https://bptj.dephub.go.id/layanan-biskita-transpakuan-bogor-bagian-dari-program-subsidi-pemerintah-pusat>. Diakses pada 1 Juli 2022.
- Chrisgerson, dkk. 2012. *Kebijakan Perencanaan Angkutan Massal di Kota Bogor*. 1 (2), hlm. 159-166.
- CNNIndonesia. 2021. Konversi Angkot Jadi Trans Pakuan Dilakukan Bertahap di 4 Rute. <https://www.cnnindonesia.com/nasional/20211101162056-20-715117/konversi-angkot-jadi-trans-pakuan-dilakukan-bertahap-di-4-rute>. Diakses pada 23 Juni 2022.
- Creswell, John. 2012. *Research Design Pendekatan Kualitatif, Kuantitatif dan Mixed*. Jakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Dinas Perhubungan Kota Bogor.
- DishubKotaBogor. <https://dishub.kotabogor.go.id/welcome/perencanaan>. Diakses Pada 24 Juni 2022.
- Gunawan, Imam. 2013. *Metode Penelitian Kualitatif. Teori dan Praktik*. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara.
- Hurit, Kamilus. 2017. *Transportasi secara Umum*. Erlangga: Jakarta
- Iman, dkk. 2019. *Analisis Keberlanjutan Angkutan Umum Penumpang Berbasis Jalan (Studi Kasus di Kota Bogor)*. 21 (1), 75-90.
- Mulyadi, Deddy. 2015. *Studi Kebijakan Publik dan Pelayanan Publik Konsep dan Aplikasi Proses dan Kebijakan pelayanan publik*. Bandung: Alfabeta.
- Murtejo, Tedy. *Kajian Rerouting Trayek Angkutan Umum Perkotaan: Studi Kasus di Kota Bogor*.
- Pasardana. 2021. Resmi Meluncur, Kota Bogor punya BisKita Trans Pakuan. <https://pasardana.id/news/2021/11/3/resmi-meluncur-kota-bogor-punya-biskita-trans-pakuan/>. Diakses pada 23 Juni 2022.
- Peraturan Daerah Kota Bogor Nomor 10 Tahun 2019
- Peraturan Menteri Perhubungan Republik Indonesia Nomor PM 2 Tahun 2022 Tentang Perubahan Atas Peraturan Menteri Perhubungan Nomor PM 9 Tahun 2020 Tentang Pemberian Subsidi Angkutan Penumpang Umum Perkotaan.
- Peraturan Menteri Perhubungan Republik Indonesia Nomor PM 9 Tahun 2020 Tentang Pemberian Subsidi Angkutan Penumpang Umum Perkotaan.
- Peraturan Menteri Perhubungan RI Nomor PM 9 Tahun 2020
- Rudor, Chrisgerson. 2012. *Kebijakan Perencanaan Angkutan Massal di Kota Bogor*. 2 (1), 159-166.
- Sani, Z. (2010). *Transportasi (Suatu Pengantar)*. Jakarta: UI-Press.
- Sinaga, dkk. 2019. *Implementasi Kebijakan Angkutan Umum Massal Berbasis Bus Rapid Transit (BRT) Dalam Mewujudkan Sistem Transportasi Publik Perkotaan Yang Berkeadilan dan Berkelanjutan di Provinsi DKI Jakarta*. 3 (2), 203-220.
- Suharno. 2008. *Prinsip-prinsip Dasar Kebijakan Publik*. Yogyakarta: UNY Press.
- Tempo.co. Purna Tugas, Kepala BPTJ Bersyukur Bisa Wujudkan Subsidi Angkutan Massal. <https://metro.tempo.co/>

read/1534775/purna-tugas-kepala-bptj-bersyukur-bisa-wujudkan-subsidi-angkutan-massal. Diakses pada 5 Juli 2022.

Waluyo. 2007. *Manajemen Publik (Konsep, Aplikasi, Dan Implementasi) Dalam Pelaksanaan Otonomi Daerah*. Bandung: Mandarmaju.

Winarno, Budi. 2014. *Kebijakan Publik: Teori, Proses, dan Studi Kasus*. Jakarta: Center of Academic Publishing Center.

<https://ppid.kotabogor.go.id/asset/images/web/files/keterbukaan-informasi-publik-tahun-2021.pdf>.

<https://ppid.kotabogor.go.id/asset/images/web/files/keterbukaan-informasi-publik-tahun-2021.pdf>.