

The Implementation of Multicultural Values in The Educational Institution

Slamet^{1✉}, Masrukhi², Haryono², Wasino²

¹ History Department, FPIPS-IKIP Veteran Semarang Indonesia

² Postgraduate Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Article Info

Article History:

Received 22 December 2016

Accepted 3 January 2017

Published 24 February 2017

Keywords:

*multicultural values,
educational institution.*

Abstract

Education that is charged with multicultural values is a staged-educational process that can be used as a binder and a bridge to accommodate differences, such as ethnicity, language, culture, gender, region, and religion in a multi-cultural society in order to create intelligent, wise, and polite personality in dealing with diversity issues. Multicultural education should continue to be understood comprehensively, so it is not stagnant only limited to discourse, and ultimately can be implemented in harmony and without any negative effects. It is this basis that causes multicultural education urgent for immediate implementation in educational institutions, so it is necessary to comprehensively study various aspects of life so that there is a synergy between the academic community and the society of a nation-state. This study employed a research and development (R & D) design from Borg and Gall, while the design of the model was adopted from the development of McKenny. The research procedure was based on the ten-phased design from Borg and Gall that has been modified into three phases, namely (1) a preliminary study; (2) the development of the design; and (3) testing the feasibility of the product. Based on the conclusion, this study recommends that multicultural education is a new discourse of education in Indonesia, but the urgency of its implementation is very high; the multicultural education curriculum can be implemented through each level of education, the student program and in the process of habituation through daily learning both within the school and in the family. Multicultural education can be inserted through the planting of multicultural values into the curriculum or learning activities which are responsively multicultural by promoting respect for differences: racial, ethnic, cultural, religious, and territorial between the community members; and no less important is that multicultural education discourse can be implemented within the scope of the family, as the smallest social institution in the community which is most effective learning media in the process of internalization and transformation of values, as well as the socialization of family members.

© 2017 Universitas Negeri Semarang

✉Correspondence:

Jl. Pawiyatan Luhur IV No.17, Bendan Duwur, Gajahmungkur,
Kota Semarang, Jawa Tengah 50233, Indonesia
E-mail: slametikpvetmsg@yahoo.com

p-ISSN 2085-4943

e-ISSN 2502-4469

INTRODUCTION

The implementation of multicultural education in the world of education is believed to be the real solution to the conflict and disharmony in the society, especially those that often occur among Indonesians communities who are in reality plural. In other words, multicultural education can be an alternative means of solving socio-cultural conflicts.

The cultural spectrum of the communities in Indonesia that is very diverse has become a challenge for education in order to deal with these differences into an asset, not a source of conflict. Currently, multicultural education has two major responsibilities, namely to prepare the Indonesia nation to face the foreign cultures in the era of globalization; and 'unite' the nation itself which comprises a variety of ethnic groups, cultures, religions, territories, and so forth.

Education of nationality and ideology has been widely given in Universities, but multicultural education has not been given the right proportion. Therefore, as educational institutions each of the schools and universities can develop multicultural education model in accordance with the principles of autonomy of the educational institutions. According to the writer, multicultural education should be more emphasized on nationality and moral subjects, such as History, Civics, and religion, in addition to other subjects.

Basically, the prior learning models related to nationality are already there. However, it is still inadequate as a means of education in order to appreciate the differences of race, culture, ethnicity, religion, language, region, and other diversities. It was seen from the appearance of conflicts occurring in the reality of the life of the nation at this time. It shows that the understanding of tolerance is still very much lacking.

Until now, the number of students who understand something that is behind the culture of a nation is still very little. According to Sutarno (2007), the community knows more about the stereotypes of an ethnic group than it knows something that is actually owned by the

ethnic group itself. In the context of multicultural education discourse, it is essential to understand the meaning behind the reality of the culture of an ethnic group. Therefore, the implementation of multicultural education can be considered being successful when within the students' mind there formed a mutually tolerant attitude to life, instead of hostility and conflict caused by differences in cultures, races, ethnicities, languages, territories, customs and so forth.

According to Stephen Hill, the Director of the Representative of the UN Agency for Education, Science, and Culture: UNESCO for the region of Indonesia, Malaysia, the Philippines, and Timor Leste, multicultural education can be considered successful if the process involves all elements of the society. In concrete terms, this education not only involves teachers or the government alone but all elements of the society. It is due to the multidimensional aspects of life covered in multicultural education.

Expected changes in the context of multicultural education are not within the justification of numbers or statistics which are cognitively oriented as achievement tests commonly implemented in educational practices in this country, but more than that, within the creation of comfortable, peaceful, and tolerant conditions in public life, and without frequent conflicts caused by cultural differences and racial intolerance. In fact, there are some people who say that the results of multicultural education can not be determined with certain time standards. So in the context of education in Indonesia, it is time to pay greater attention to multicultural education. Indirectly, it can provide solutions to a number of social problems faced by Indonesia in the future. Moreover, Indonesia is one of the largest multicultural countries in the world. This fact can be seen from the socio-cultural and geographical conditions which are diverse and extensive. This diversity certainly can cause a variety of problems, such as corruption, collusion, nepotism, poverty, violence, environmental

destruction, separatism, and the loss of a sense of humanity to respect the rights of others, it's all a part of the multicultural real form.

The multicultural issue in this country is like a fire in the husk, which one day could arise due to political, religious, social, and cultural tensions, allowing the conflict to resurface. The cause of such conflict is very diverse but mostly is due to political, ethnic, religious, and cultural differences. Some of the cases have occurred in the country involving community groups, university students, and even high school pupils due to differences in political or social differences.

It is the rise of such problems that ultimately became protracted conflict and has not been completely overcome especially the one related to social and cultural issues. Therefore it takes a special strategy to solve the problem through a variety of fields: social, economic, cultural, and educational. Accordingly, education containing multicultural values offers an alternative through the implementation of strategy and concept of education based on the utilization of the diversity that exists in the society, particularly that of the learners such as the diversity of ethnicity, cultures, languages, religions, social status, gender, abilities, ages, territories, and so forth.

The description above can give impetus to educational institutions in implanting attitudes and values to the students in order to respect others' cultures, religions, ethnicity, races, regions, and gender differences. Hopefully, the implementation of education charged with multicultural values will help the learners to understand, accept and respect other people of different ethnic, cultural and personality value. Through the cultivation of the spirit of the multicultural values at school, it is expected to be the medium of training and awareness for young people (students) in accepting differences.

The objective of this research is for institutions to implement education charged with multicultural values which are considered important in giving knowledge and insight to help the development of thought and personality and also train the learners' sensitivity in dealing

with the symptoms and social problems that occur in the environment. Besides, It is also for the learners to have sensitivity in dealing with the symptoms and social problems that are rooted in ethnic, racial, cultural, religious, regional, and values differences that occur in their communities.

METHODS

This study employs a research and development (R & D) design introduced by Borg and Gall and another design of the procedural model developed by McKenny. The procedure of this study is based on ten schemes of Borg and Gall in Sugiyono (2012), which has been modified into three phases, namely: (1) preliminary studies; (2) development of the design; and (3) testing the feasibility of the product.

The preliminary studies have been done by spreading instruments on needs to 35 high school history teacher in the district of Kudus. The design of the training management model of developing materials containing multicultural values (PBA-BNM) was based on a literature review, the results of a preliminary study on the training of learning materials development over the years, and the needs analysis of the training expected by high school history teachers. The study of literature for this research includes the current study of training management for high school history teachers which was considered as the referential framework for the development of the training management model of materials development containing multicultural values (PBA-BNM) to be implemented in the learning processes at school.

The planning stage carried out in the development of training models includes 1) identification of needs; 2) setting goals; 3) development program; (4) development of materials; 5) development of evaluation tools; and (6) developing guidelines and training manuals. The training organization phase consists of the following activities: 1) personnel organization; 2) formulating a training management task; 3) specifying the requirements

for trainees; 4) obtaining procedures and working mechanisms. The PBA-BNM training phase was implemented by means of face to face interaction, including 1) preparation; 2) pre-training activities; 3) implementation of the training; 4) the final activity of training/evaluation. The evaluation phase of training is conducted before, whilst, and after training. The development of training evaluation device consists of 1) the evaluation prior to training or pre-test; 2) program evaluation; 3) instructor evaluation; 4) evaluation of training participants. Meanwhile, the product feasibility is assessed by three experts: 1) expert/specialist in material development training; 2) experts/specialists in educational management; 3) an experts/ specialists in history and multicultural education.

Data about the condition and needs of the training model was analyzed using a descriptive percentage technique, evaluated using the Likert scale questionnaire that has been modified. The closed questionnaire was analyzed using mean analysis techniques. Data from the open questionnaire and recording of the focused group discussion (FGD) were analyzed using qualitative descriptive analysis techniques.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

The results of this research and development can be seen from the three perspectives, i.e. ontological, epistemological, and axiological. Ontologically, multicultural values implant a caring attitude, wanting to understand the recognition of minority groups as part of a wider community. With the basic view that is not only rooted in the structure of racial inequality, the paradigm of multicultural education uplifts the minority groups from various perspectives, such as those of ethnic, racial, social, territorial, religious, cultural, and language. This kind of paradigm encourages the growth of research on ethnic studies which in turn will find a place as a forum of curriculum containing multicultural values from early childhood education up to higher education.

However, based on the instruments of history teachers' needs, the training management model of material development for history teachers have been implemented poorly. This is due to (1) During planning, need analysis is only done on a group of teachers in MGMPs and the material does not correspond with the competencies expected by the teachers; (2) the training instructors are merely among teachers who are not professional in their field; (3) the planning, organizing, and evaluation of the training programs rely heavily on the local education office program so that the program created often can not be implemented; (4) The training facilities are not in accordance with good training standards; and (5) there is no follow up activity in training.

Epistemologically, through these activities, it is believed that training that is based on the activity needs will result in new knowledge. The training management model of material development was developed on the basis of data from actual conditions during the training that was conducted, literature review, research results, and training needs analysis for high school history teachers. Among them are as follows. (1) Based on the training needs questionnaire it was known that the training needs of materials development for high school history teachers are very high; (2) Based on the results of the needs analysis, a training model of material development charged with multicultural values (PBA-BNM) for high school history teachers was developed. It was eligible to apply. Currently, the teaching materials expected by high school history teachers are effective, in the sense of easily understood and implemented. The early form of training management model developed includes 1) planning analysis (requiring 3 steps); 2) organization (3-steps planning); 3) implementation (2-step development and 4-step implementation); 4) evaluation (3 steps). The level of accuracy of the conceptual training management model of material development charged with multicultural values for high school history teachers is considered being valid, after the limited try-out to 35 high school history

teachers in Kudus regency of Central Java province.

Axiologically, this study was associated with the study of the values or dignity and actions in the training activities, in order to obtain the form or the training model. The final form of the development of the training management model of material development charged with multicultural values for high school history teachers is a model resulted from the development that has been validated by experts/specialists and has been tested through the individual test, group test, and limited test. The final form of the training management model of material development charged with multicultural values for high school history teachers. Based on the limited test results it was found that the training management model PBA-BNM was feasible because it has a level of effectiveness.

In Indonesia, although it is still a discourse, multicultural education that is relatively new is known as an approach that is considered necessary for a heterogeneous society, especially during the autonomy and decentralization era. The multicultural education developed is in line with the development of democracy which is run as a counter to the policy of decentralization and regional autonomy. If it were implemented carelessly the nation would plunge into national disintegration.

The education model of in Indonesia and in other countries shows the diversity of objectives implementing strategies and means to achieve them. The addition of information on cultural diversity is a model of multicultural education that includes the revisions or learning materials and including the revision of textbooks. Despite being in question, this business has started to open the eyes of some people about the importance of a new perspective on differences, so that the humanitarian tragedy would not happen again. Indonesia still needs the many efforts to revise the textbooks in order to accommodate contributions and inclusive participation of citizens with different backgrounds. Indonesia

also requires learning materials that are capable of resolving protracted conflicts in various regions.

The other model is that multicultural education is not merely a revision the learning material, but a reform of the learning system itself as pointed out by Mahfud (2011). Affirmative action in the selection of students to teacher recruitment in America is one of the strategies to make improvements to structural imbalances towards minorities. Another example is the "school intermingling" model of Iskandar Muda in Medan, which facilitates the interaction of learners from different cultural backgrounds and develops foster care programs across the groups, and also numerous workshops conducted at schools and in the wider communities to improve social sensitivity and tolerance as well as reduce prejudice among groups. In order to realize these models, multicultural education in Indonesia needs to use a combination of the existing models, so as stated by Garcia (2002) that multicultural education can include three types of transformation, namely (1) the transformation of self; (2) the transformation of school and learning process; and (3) the transformation of society.

Developing multicultural education in a society that is full of problems among groups faces huge challenges. Multicultural education is by no means limited to "celebrating diversity" alone, especially if the existing order of society is still full of discrimination and racist. It can also be questionable whether it is possible to ask learners who in their daily life experience discrimination or persecution because of their skin color or differences from the dominant culture? In such conditions, a more precise multicultural education is directed as an advocate for creating a tolerance and free tolerant society.

Required Policies

Some aspects that are key to implementing multicultural education within the school structure is the absence of policies that impede tolerance, including the absence of an

insult to race, ethnicity, culture, region, religion, and gender. Education should foster sensitivity to cultural differences, which among other things include clothing, music, favorite foods and other aspects that are structurally have differences. Moreover, it also provides the freedom for students to celebrate the religious holidays and strengthen the children's behavior in order to feel fully involved in the democratic decision-making (Freire, 2010).

Discussion

Perspective of Multicultural Education in Indonesia

Considering the above description, the policies need to be realized in the process of multicultural education are: (1) no longer limited to equate the view of education with schooling or multicultural education with the formal school program. A broader view of education as the transmission of culture frees educators from the assumption that the primary responsibility to develop cultural competence among learners is not solely in the hands of teachers; there are even more parties responsible because the school program should be associated with informal learning outside of school; (2) avoiding the view that equates culture with ethnic groups. That is, there should be no longer need to associate culture solely with the ethnic groups as has happened during this time. Traditionally, educators associate culture only with social groups which are relatively self-sufficient rather than the number of people who continuously and repeatedly engage one another in one or more activities. In the context of multicultural education, this approach is expected to inspire the authors of multicultural education programs to eliminate the tendency to look at the students stereotypically according to ethnic identity and improve exploration for greater understanding of the similarities and differences among students of different ethnic groups; (3) for the development of competence in a "new culture" usually require interaction initiatives with people who already have the competence; it can even be seen more clearly that the efforts to support the ethnically separate schools are antithetical to the

purpose of multicultural education. Maintaining and expanding the group solidarity inhibit socialization of a new culture. Education for cultural and multicultural pluralism can not be identified logically; (4) improve the competence of multicultural education in some cultures. The culture to be adopted is determined by history and circumstances surrounding the environmental conditions; and (5) the possibility that education (in and beyond school) increases awareness of competence in some cultures (Naim and SAUQI, 2008).

Such awareness will then distance itself from the concept of bi-cultural or dichotomy between indigenous and non-indigenous. Such dichotomy restricts individuals to fully express their cultural diversity. This approach increases the awareness of multiculturalism as a normal experience for humans. This kind of awareness also means that multicultural education potentially avoids the dichotomy and develops a better appreciation through the learners' cultural competency.

Implementation of Multicultural Concepts in Educational Curriculum

As a pluralistic country in terms of religion, ethnicity, culture, territoriality, Indonesia requires the concept of multicultural education so that it becomes a principle for strengthening the national identity. Citizenship, Religion, and History Subjects that have been taught from primary school to university level need to be refined to include multicultural education, such as local culture among regions so that the younger generation is proud as a member of the Indonesia nation that can further enhance the sense of nationalism. This implies that multicultural education is values education that should be implanted to students as potential citizens. It is deemed necessary, so that the learners have the multicultural perception and attitude, and can coexist in the diversity of the nature of culture, religion and language, respecting the rights of every citizen regardless of their ethnic majority or minority, not glorifying a territory better than those of the other persons, and can be together to strengthen

the nation so as to be considered in a strong global arena.

Hasan (2000) suggests that the society and nation Indonesia has a social and cultural diversity, political aspirations and economic capability. Diversity has a direct impact on the ability of teachers to implement the curriculum, the ability of schools to provide learning experience and ability of the learners in the process of learning and processing information into something that can be translated as a result of learning. Diversity becomes an independent variable that has contributed significantly to the success of the curriculum, both as a process and as a result. Therefore, the development of the curriculum by using a multicultural approach to development should be based on four principles, namely: (1) cultural diversity is the basis for determining the philosophy; (2) the basis of cultural diversity in developing various components of the curriculum, such as objectives, content, process, and evaluation; (3) culture in the educational unit from primary education up to higher education so that a learning resources and objects of study should be used as part of the learners' activities; and (4) the curriculum acts as a medium in the development of regional and national culture.

The multicultural education on the elementary and secondary education can be implemented in a comprehensive manner through Citizenship, Religion and History education, which can be done through empowerment of the curriculum slots or the addition and expansion of the competence of learning outcomes in the context of developing morals and manners, possessing the intensity to foster and develop harmony among religious communities with an emphasis on a variety of basic competencies, as described above. Then deductive approach should be implemented with relevant studies, which is later developed into religious norms, the rule of law, ethics, and social norms. Multicultural education through the learning process must be conducted comprehensively, starting from the planning and curriculum design through the insertion process, enrichment and/or strengthening of the various

existing competencies, designing a learning process that can develop the attitude of the learners to be able to respect the rights of others regardless of their background: race, religion, language, culture, and region (Gollnick, 2003).

Referring to the discussion above and in accordance with the standards of competence, the following basic competencies can be developed.

1. Becoming citizens who accept and respect differences: ethnic, religious, linguistic, gender, and culture in the structure of society;
2. Becoming citizens who can work together among multi-ethnic, multicultural and multi-religious in the context of the development and strength of the nation;
3. Becoming citizens who are able to respect the rights of individual citizens regardless of their background: ethnicity, religion, language and culture in all sectors of social, educational, economic, political and other aspects, even to preserve the language and develop the learners' culture;
4. Becoming citizens who give opportunities to all citizens to represent ideas and aspirations in governmental institutions (legislative and executive);
5. Becoming citizens who are able to develop a fair attitude and a sense of justice regardless of their background: ethnicity, religion, language, region, and culture.

Such competencies are expected to produce output or graduates who are not only competent disciplines at any educational institution or the occupied areas, but the output should also be able to apply the values of diversity in understanding and appreciating differences. Multicultural values can be internalized by an educator both in the classroom and in daily activities.

Implementation of Multicultural Education in Learning Process

Strategies and methods of learning management is an important aspect in the implementation of multicultural education. Parekh (2008) defines learning management as

"practices and procedures that allow teachers to teach and learners to learn". Related to these practices and procedures, Garcia (2002) mentions three factors in the learning management, namely: (1) the physical environment; (2) the social environment; and (3) the teachers' style in teaching.

In addition to the physical and social environment, learners also require teachers' encouraging teaching style. The teachers' teaching style is a style of leadership or escort techniques used by teachers in the learning process. In the learning process, the teachers' leadership style is very influential for the learners whether or not there is an opportunity to share their opinions and make decisions. Teachers' leadership style revolves around the authoritarian, democratic, and free ones. Authoritarian leadership style does not provide opportunities for the learners to share their opinions. Everything taught by the teacher to the students is determined by the teacher. On the other hand, the democratic leadership style of the teachers provides opportunities for the learners to determine the material to be learned. Teachers who use the free leadership style give the opportunity completely to the students to determine the learning materials in the classroom. For the class with diverse cultural backgrounds of the learners, it seems better to suit to a teacher with democratic leadership style.

Through this democratic approach, teachers can use a variety of instructional strategies, such as dialogue, simulation, role playing, observation, and the handling of cases (Abdullah, 2003). Through dialogues teachers, for example, discuss the contribution of diverse cultures and people from other ethnic groups to live together as a nation. In addition, through dialogues the teachers can discuss the fact that all citizens of any cultural background are also able to collaborate with each other in creativity and innovation. Meanwhile, through simulations and role-playing, students are facilitated to portray themselves as people who have religious, cultural, territorial, and certain ethnic backgrounds in their daily life. In

particular opportunities, projects and committees are held together involving a variety of students from different religious, ethnic, cultural, and regional background, as well as different languages. Meanwhile, through observation and cases handling, learners and teachers are facilitated to stay a few days in a multicultural society. Learners are asked to observe the social processes that take place between existing individuals and groups, as well as to mediate when there is a conflict between them. By applying such learning strategies learners are assumed to have the insight and a deep understanding of the diversity in social life. Moreover, learners will have real experiences to immerse yourself in practicing the values of multicultural education in everyday life. Attitudes and behaviors that are tolerant, sympathetic and empathetic in turn will grow in each of the learners. Therefore, the learning process facilitated by the teacher is not only oriented to the cognitive, but also to the affective and psychomotor domains simultaneously.

Furthermore, a democratic approach in the learning process with a variety of learning strategies put teachers and students to have equal status, because each member of the community of learners is equivalent. Each member has absolute rights and duties. The teachers and learners behavior should be guided by the interests of individuals and groups in a balanced manner. The rules in the classroom should be shared in order to protect the rights of teachers and learners. The rights of teachers in the learning process include: (1) assessing the learners as human beings and their rights as human beings; (2) knowing when to apply the teaching style: authoritarian, democratic, or free in order to improve the rights of the learners; (3) knowing when and how to implement civil disobedience, and (4) understanding the complexity of the rules for the majority and protecting minority rights. Meanwhile, the rights of learners include (1) determining civil rights and obligations; and (2) knowing how to use the rights and obligations their daily life (Garcia, 2002).

Bank (1993) also adds other multicultural competencies that must be possessed by teachers, namely (1) being sensitive to the behavior of ethnic learners; (2) being sensitive to the possibility of the controversy about teaching materials; and (3) using learning techniques to promote the integration of ethnic groups in learning. Cultural and character values include: religion, honesty, tolerance, discipline, hard work, cooperation, creativity, independence, democracy, curiosity, spirit of nationalism, patriotism, recognition of excellence, friendship, communication, loving peace, confidence, likes to read, caring for the environment, social care, and responsibility. Thus, multicultural education in which there are cultural values and character of the nation has a vital urgency to be implemented into the world of education, be it in the curriculum, in the learners' activities, and in the learning process.

CONCLUSIONS

Multicultural education as a new discourse of education in Indonesia, but the urgency of its implementation is very high. Given the phenomenon and the fact that is already so complex, its application is not only through formal education but also non-formal academic and non-academic education that can be implemented in the life of society and in family life. Formally, multicultural education can be integrated into the education system through curriculum ranging from early childhood to university. Multicultural education can be implemented through the curriculum at every level of education, student affairs programs and in habituation to the daily learning process both within the school and the family.

Multicultural education can be inserted in internalizing the multicultural values into the curriculum or learning activities which are responsively multicultural by promoting the respect for racial, ethnic, cultural, religious, and territorial differences among the community members.

No less important is the discourse of multicultural education that can be implemented within the scope of the family, as the smallest social institution in the community that is in the form of learning media and the most effective learning in the process of internalization and transformation of values, as well as the socialization of family members. The role of parents in implanting more responsive multicultural values by promoting respect and recognition of differences that exist in the children's surrounding environment or other family members is the most effective and elegant way to support the creation of a system of social harmony that is more equitable.

REFERENCES

- Abdullah, Aly. 2003. *Menggagas Pendidikan Islam Multikultural di Indonesia*, Pawaiyan, Volume 2(1).
- Banks, J. 1993. *Multicultural Education: Historical, Development, Dimension, and Practice*. Review of Research in Educationn, 2(7).
- Freire, P. 2010. *Pendidikan Pembebasan*, Jakarta: LP3S.
- Garcia, L. Ricardo. 2002. *Teaching in a Pluristic Society: Concepts, Models, Strategies*. New York: Harper & Row Publisher.
- Gollnick, M. Donna. 2003. *Multicultural Education in a Pluralistik Societ*. London: The Mosby Company.
- Hasan, S. H. 2000. *Multikulturalisme untuk Penyempurnaan Kurikulum Nasional*, *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan* Jakarta: DEPDIKBUD
- Mahfud, Ch. 2011. *Pendidikan Multikultural*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Naim, Ng & Sauqi, A. 2011. *Pendidikan Multikultural: Konsep dan Aplikasi*. Jogjakarta: Ar-Ruzz Media.
- Parekh, Bhiku. 2008. *Rethinking Multiculturalism: Keberagaman Budaya dan Teori Politik*. Yogyakarta: Kanisius.
- Sugiyono. 2012. *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif dan R&D*. Bandung: Alabeta.

- Sutarno. 2007. Pendidikan Multikultural. Transformatif untuk Indonesia. Jakarta: Jakarta: Departemen Pendidikan Nasional. Grasindo.
- Tilaar, H.A.R. 2002. Perubahan Sosial dan Pendidikan: Pengantar Pedagogik