

Professional-Competence-Based Model of Classroom Action Research Training Management for Islam Religion Education Teachers of Senior High School

Nur Cholid^{1✉}, Masrukhi², Rusdarti², Ari Tri Sugito²

¹ Universitas Wahid Hasyim Semarang, Indonesia

² Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Article Info

Article History:
Received 20 November 2017
Accepted 27 December 2017
Published 1 June 2018

Keywords:
training management model, classroom action research, professional competence.

Abstract

A number of efforts have been made to improve the quality of teachers, such as providing training on curriculum, methods of learning, and further study for those who have not completed their undergraduate program. However, these efforts do not seem to be maximally successful in improving the quality of the learning process and outcomes. Therefore, training is needed in order to improve the professional competence of the teachers through classroom action research training. This research aimed to yield a product, that is the management model of classroom action research training for Islam Religion Education Teachers of Senior High School in Semarang City which is packaged in the form of a classroom action research management training manual for teachers as guidebooks for instructors and trainees to improve their professional competence. This study utilized a Research and Development approach which was preceded by a qualitative descriptive method. This method was used as a preliminary to obtain data on how to implement the training that has been running for this. A preliminary study revealed what the problem was with the training. The results show that the development of the management model of classroom action research training was carried out in accordance with the development procedures which include preliminary research, analysis, production/development, and revision, while the product was evaluated in accordance with the development of evaluation procedures.

© 2018 Universitas Negeri Semarang

✉ Correspondence:
JL. Menoreh Tengah X / 22, Sampangan, Gajahmungkur,
Sampangan, Gajahmungkur, Kota Semarang, Jawa Tengah 50232,
Indonesia
E-mail: nurcholid@unwahas.ac.id

p-ISSN 2085-4943
e-ISSN 2502-4469

INTRODUCTION

Educators are professionals who must have minimum qualifications and certification in accordance with the level of teaching authority, physically and spiritually healthy, and have the ability to realize the goals of the national education. In particular, Law Number 20 the Year 2003 on the National Education System contains a new paradigm on national education. In addition, Government Regulation No. 19 of 2005 on National Education Standards requires educators to have academic qualifications and competence as learning agents, physically and mentally healthy, and have the ability to realize the national education objectives. This demand suggests that teachers take the critical use of science seriously.

In other words, teachers are expected to have the knowledge and understanding of the profession of a good teacher so that they become a figure that has the character and professionalism. Thus, Roche's (1989) view that "I've never seen a good school without a good teacher" can come true. In fact, from various studies to date, the teachers' quality is suspected to be still unsatisfactory in both the mastery of scientific substances and the competence in teaching and learning. The mastery of subject matter is considered less profound. In addition, their competence in organizing educational learning is still theoretical. The issue of the low teacher quality cannot be separated from the global challenges and the hardly inevitable changes of the national situation. Both of these factors have implications for the need to improve the teachers' quality standards to achieve the national and international standards so as to produce qualified graduates who have strong characters.

Several efforts have been made to improve the teachers' quality, such as providing training on learning methods, curriculum, and further studies for teachers who have not completed their undergraduate degree. However, these efforts do not seem to be maximally successful in improving the quality of the learning process and outcomes. This is caused by the habit of the

teachers when they have completed the training, which is 'back to their habit' (the result of the informal interview with the supervisor of Islamic Religion Education School (PAIS) in Semarang City). Teachers return to school and teach in the old manner so that the training that has been given is useless because the knowledge gained is not applied in school. Based on these habits, the training materials need to be changed by providing classroom action research training to the teachers; the teachers are given the opportunity to reflect on the learning process that has been done so that they are aware of the mistakes they make and problems they face and consciously seek solutions to their own problems.

According to Joni (1998), the ability to conduct classroom action research is a representation of the professional and holistically paedagogic competence that can improve the quality of the students' learning process and results, which is one of the characteristics of the teacher's professionalism. This is in line with Shahin and Samea (2010, p. 213) in "Developing the models of service quality gaps: a critical discussion", Haslinda (2009) in "The effectiveness of training in the public service", and Ismail (2009: 216) in "Competency-based teacher education (CBTE): A training module for improving knowledge competencies for resource room teachers in Jordan" explaining that training can measure the effects of the training modules in improving the knowledge competence. On the other hand, the results of the interviews with the Chairman of the Deliberation of Subject Teachers of Islam Religion Education for Senior High School (MGMP-PAI SMA) Semarang, the supervisor working group (POKJAWAS) of the Islam Religion Education (PAIS) and the teachers who had attended the training, it was found that, from the training provided, the teachers were not provided with adequate opportunity to study in a systematic and controllable manner about the various learning problems faced in their everyday life. The teachers were poorly trained on how to diagnose the learning problems, to find out the main causes of the problems, and to

conduct systematic, controllable, programmed, and sustainable therapy on their learning problems. In other words, fewer teachers are given the opportunity to reflect on their own learning process. As mentioned above, the training model is a traditional training whose stages are the instructor transferring knowledge about the CAR to the participants and subsequently the preparation of the CAR proposal. Such a model has not been able to fully train the teacher's reflective skills and the competence of planning CARs to improve the quality of their learning.

By looking at the weaknesses of the existing training, it is necessary to develop a classroom action research training model capable of providing opportunities for teachers to practice reflecting on the implementation of their own classroom learning activities. The absence of a training model capable of combining knowledge acquisition of CAR (received knowledge) and empirical knowledge (previous experiential knowledge) i.e. real problems in the classroom, to support the reflective ability to seek a training model capable of providing direct and real experience, which not only emphasizes to the theoretical aspect alone but also provides opportunities for teachers to have applicative competencies that are capable of producing competent and professional teachers. Training activities should be structured on the basis of correct and theory-based training activities, including planning, implementation, and evaluation either in the form of products or test results, and follow-up.

Based on the background above, it is necessary to develop a way of solving the problem of how to develop a model of CAR training management for teachers of Islamic High School Education. The purposes of this study are (1) to analyze the factual model of training management for teachers of Islamic high school education in Semarang City that has been running so far; (2) to design a hypothetical model of CAR training management based on the professional competencies for teachers of Islamic High School education in Semarang City; (3) to describe the final model and

effectiveness of the developed training management model, which is CAR training for Islamic High School Islamic Education Teachers in Semarang City to develop professional competence. Theoretically, the results of this study contribute to the development of science, especially the development of CAR training management model to improve the professional competence of Islamic Religion Education Teachers.

METHODS

This research employed the Research and Development (R&D) model of Borg & Gall (2007, p. 590). The stages of this study include (1) preliminary study and model design, (2) model development, and (3) model validation (Sukmadinata, 2006, p. 179). Data were drawn using interview techniques, documentation, observation, questionnaire, and pre-test and post-test assessments. The data were tested for their reliability and validity and analyzed using interactive, qualitative, quantitative, and experimental model. The model was validated by experts and practitioners. The model was tested in a limited trial involving 15 teachers and an extended trial involving 35 high school teachers of Islam Religion Education in Semarang City. In detail, the stages of the research and development design in accordance with the opinion of Borg & Gall (2007, p. 590) are as follows. a) The preliminary study covering literature review, field study, and description and analysis of the current findings/models. Activities undertaken at this stage include (1) analyzing the training management model which includes planning, organizing, implementing, and evaluating that has been implemented by the teachers of the Islamic Religious Education and their staff; (2) analyzing the curriculum contents of the Islamic education subjects; (3) analyzing the sub-subject matters; (4) reviewing on-the-ground practice to observe the implementation of the training documents and discussing it with practitioners to obtain information on the constraints in seeking alternative solutions; (5) describing and

analyzing the model. b) Development phase covering the activities including (1) preparation of the design of CAR training management model based on improvement of the Islam Religion Education teachers' professional competence; (2) preparation of training tools; (3) Focused Group Discussion (FGD); (4) consultation with experts and practitioners; (5) model revision; (6) hypothetical modeling; (7) limited and extended trials. The subjects of the trial in this study involved 15 teachers as subjects in the limited trial and 35 teachers as the subjects in the expanded trial. The data drawn from their source consists of quantitative and qualitative data. This research was preceded by the qualitative descriptive method as the first step of the research. The qualitative descriptive method used in the preliminary research to get data about how the implementation of education and training that has been running for this. Through preliminary study can be known what problems arise in the implementation of education and training that has been running it. In addition to the data about the problem, the researchers will also know the potential owned by the research subjects. c) Stage Validation of CAR training management model based on the improvement of professional competence for teachers of Islamic High School Education conducted by using one group pretest-posttest design experimental design (Borg & Gall, 2007). The purpose of this design is to test the effectiveness of the model and the validation of conceptual models that have been generated empirically. The effectiveness of conceptual models developed is tested so that it can be an empirical or feasible model. The training model is validated after either a limited or extended try out trial. The test results are used to revise and validate the developed training model. Design of validation and model evaluation using "the one-shot case study" or evaluation process that stresses the assessment of the training model that aims to (a) compare the competence level of the participants before and after the training so that it can be known whether the training model is more efficient and (b) know what participants

have mastered and which competencies they have not mastered.

The data were analyzed using (1) descriptive data analysis techniques and (2) statistical analysis techniques. To describe the research data obtained from the questionnaire filled by the respondents using the criteria of the quantitative description consisting of four categories, that is very good (3.28-4.00), good (2.52-3.27), less good (1.76-2.51), and not good (0.00-1.75). The test for effectiveness was used to determine the effectiveness of the final management model of CAR training in improving the professional competence of the teachers of Islamic High School Education in accordance with the established minimum criteria (KKM) of 75. Thus, the participants who score <75 are included in the category of incompetent.

As for the descriptive analysis technique, the researchers lead to understand and interpret meaning according to what subjects are examined based on the social interaction and it is not according to the researchers' formulation (Imam, 2009). In qualitative research, there are several ways to test the validity of the data. There are four criteria for measuring the validity of the data, i.e. credibility, transferability, dependability, and confirmability (Moleong, 2007).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Results

The following is the analysis results of the need for classroom action research training.

Based on Table 1. it can be inferred that the need for classroom action research training as a whole shows that the need level for classroom action research training with a mean score of 3.71 is very high.

Table 1. Mean Scores of Training Needs for CAR

NO	Required elements to be assessed	Average	Score	Criteria
1.	Training materials	3.66	4	Very good
2.	Instructor's competence	3.74	4	Very good
3.	Training management	3.71	4	Very good
Average score		3.71	4	Very good

Source: Research Data (processed 2016)

Meanwhile, the training model development begins with an evaluation of the model as mentioned in Table 2.

Table 2. Expert Assessment of CAR Training Model.

No	Aspect	Mean score
1	Rational of Model	4.00
2	Assumption of Model	4.00
3	Phases of management functions	3.67
4	Instructor's tasks	3.92
5	Trainee's tasks	3.67
6	Implementation of Model	4.00
7	Visualization of model	3.75
Average		3.86

Source: Research Data (processed, 2016).

The assessment of the expert team on the overall CAR training model shows that the level of assessment is very good with the average score of 3.86. This level of assessment is a reflection of the overall assessment of the CAR training that can be used for training the Islamic High School Education teachers.

The CAR training manual is an instruction manual containing training and training management models. A guide to the CAR training model that has been developed is entitled "Classroom Action Research Training

Guide". In general, the evaluation results from the education management experts, i.e. Islamic High School Education experts, and training experts indicate that the CAR Training Handbook is conceptually good and worthy of use as a guideline for conducting classroom action research for Islamic High School Education teachers. The results of the training materials assessment can be seen in Table 3.

Table 3. Expert Assessment Score on the CAR Material Guideline.

NO	Aspect	Average	Criteria
1	Suitability of the materials for the training	4.00	Very good
2	Systematics of training materials	3.25	Very good
3	Relevance of materials to the students' needs for their future	4.00	Very good
4	Availability of supplementary materials	3.75	Very good
5	Limitation of the materials	3.75	Very good
Average		3.75	Very good

Source: Research Data (processed 2016).

The results of the assessment by experts/practitioners show that the training material conceptually has an average grade of 3.75 in the very good category and is suitable for use by the trainees as a CAR training material. The participants' assessment of the training model is presented in Table 4.

Assessment of participants on the CAR training model included in the category is very good. This is based on the final score of 3.44.

The final outcome of the CAR Training Model development is a training model that aims to enable participants to develop knowledge and skills to implement CAR from the title formulation to the CAR proposal process. This result differs from the model used

in Semarang City, which is still conventional, has not been focused on CAR scientific material, is still part of the other training, the determination of the trainees with direct appointment, the instructor prepared is not in accordance with the heterogeneity of the participants, supported by standard training tools, manuals are still general, organizing contains schedules and training materials. In addition, the guidelines for participants and instructors do not exist; the material module is just a presentation handout Powerpoints made by the instructor and the evaluation of the training program is not complete, only the evaluation of the participants and the instructor, and the participants' impression of the training followed. The training time is relatively short so that the research yielded minimal products. In contrast, the CAR training model as a result of development has been beneficial for Islamic High School Education teachers; training materials have been focused on writing CAR scientific papers; participants come from the Islam Religion Education Teachers of Senior High Schoolin Semarang city; there is the main instructor; the implementation of the training has been completed with training tools, training manuals, module of training materials, syllabus contained in the book of training tools; during a thorough evaluation exercise. The training model used so far is a simple one but it meets the minimal elements to be able to conduct the training. Therefore, the training model was developed by adopting the stages of the ADDIE and In-On-In models packaged within the IPO mindset. The CAR training model is specifically designed for Islam Religion Education Teachers of Senior High Schoolto have specific characteristics of the teacher, participants, and instructors. The purpose of this training model is to get closer to the abilities that Islam Religion Education Teachers of Senior High Schoolhave as participants with the skills to be learned so that the trainees will not face the gaps and have difficulties in learning the teaching materials given. This CAR training model has been tested and proven to produce products in the form of scientific papers and CAR proposals.

Table 4. Participant Assessment of the CAR Training Model (Limited and Test Expanded)

N O	Aspects to be assessed	Mean score			Category
		(UcT)	(UcD)	Total	
1	Training materials	3.25	3.52	3.38	Very good
2	Instructor's competence	3.27	3.59	3.43	Very good
3	Management	3.47	3.54	3.50	Very good
Mean score		3.33	3.55	3.44	Very good

Source: Research Data (processed 2016)

Discussion

Table 1 indicates that the need for CAR training shows that the level of training requirement with an average score of 3.71 is very high. This level of need is an overall reflection of the need for CAR training for the Islam Religion Education Teachers of Senior High Schoolin Semarang City. Its development in the formal learning should be embedded in the curriculum objectives, outcomes, and instructional strategies for learning programs (Adnan et al., 2012). The description is in accordance with the opinion of Eugene & Mckenna (2000), Sutrisno (2009), and Nawawi (1997), that training is needed to support competence, help master knowledge and skills, and develop attitude to project positive energy from the perspective of quality performance that can increase their loyalty to work.

The above findings are in line with Edmons (1994: 57) research that the concept of a training system approach can be characterized in the input-process-output paradigm. The components included in the input are requirements analysis that includes (1) training materials, (2) HR (participants and instructors), (3) training programs, (4) training facilities and media, and (5) training management. The components included in the process are the activities of the training management functions

that include the design of training model design, model development, training implementation, guidance, evaluation, and follow-up. The components covered in the output are the achievement of the established competencies in the form of a report on research proposal writing. The above results are in accordance with Amaliyyah's research (2013: 6) that research on a Training management system can be seen with the input-process-output approach. The inputs include the determination of training needs that cover potential participants, faculty, administrators, funds, facilities, infrastructure, curriculum, library books, laboratories, and learning tools both hardware and software. The process includes the management of training, the management of training programs, and the management of teaching and learning activities using various methods. The output is graduates who have the competence of work that has made progress in accordance with the standards of the expected progress so as to yield sets of products. The CAR training given to the Islam Religion Education teachers of senior high school is designed to improve their skills in writing CAR scientific works so that prior to the implementation of the training, needs analysis, training planning, implementation, and evaluation are required. This is in the opinion of Notoatmodjo (2009, pp. 19-23) that the training process consists of several stages namely (1) determination of needs, (2) implementation, and (3) evaluation.

The review of the development results by the expert team as a whole shows that the model was very good with the average score of 3.86. The results of this assessment as a whole reflect the form of CAR training that can be used for training for Islam Religion Education teachers of senior high school. The results of the expert team's assessment in accordance with the research results Iswara (2005) that training can improve knowledge management functions, commitment to the profession, and skills. This is in accordance with the opinion of Saondi and Suherman (2010, pp.71-82) that teacher training and development is an important factor in human resource development in education;

training not only adds knowledge but also improves work skills. Thus, training increases work productivity. The development of the teaching profession has a functional relationship and influence on teacher performance because it strengthens the professional ability of teachers in carrying out the work so that the result of expert/practitioner assessment to the CAR training model can be used as the hypothetical model of training model to be the final model which has a very high feasibility value because it is easy to understand, especially on the implementation of training. The CAR training model for Islam Religion Education teachers of senior high school is a final training model resulting from the development process in an effort to improve teachers' knowledge, skills, attitudes and abilities in writing scientific papers as part of the teacher's obligations in sustainable professional development.

Generally, based on evaluation results with education management experts, Islam Religion Education experts, and training experts, the CAR Training Handbook is conceptually good and worthy of use as a guide for conducting classroom action research for Islam Religion Education teachers of senior high school. This Handbook is one of the most important training tools as a guide to achieve the goals of CAR training. This training guide is very useful in training implementation to understand the nature of classroom action research training.

Books Training materials based on the assessment by experts/ experts/practitioners indicate that the training materials are conceptually good and worthy of use by the trainees as classroom action research materials although there are some things that need to be improved as inputs and suggestions. The assessed training materials are considered to be good because as one source of learning is very supportive of the training process. The contents of the book have been in line with the essence of the training materials of CAR training. This is in accordance with the opinion of Soemarman (2010: 45) that the principle of learning that emphasizes the importance of the process and

the availability of appropriate teaching materials according to need. This is in accordance with Olofsson & Lindberg (2006) opinion that teacher training has a positive effect on the quality of the training peseta both individually and socially. The same thing was found by Soemarman (2010) which states that the training module is a teaching material that is compiled as a whole and systematically in the form of the manuscript that pays attention to things as the following. (1) The module must contain complete information; (2) the module helps the trainee understand the training materials, learn them, and complete the task or practice the exam required by the module; (3) the contents of the module are divided into fragments according to their subtopics; (4) modules are prepared based on outline of learning content and training planning with reference to syllabus, competency standard, and basic competence.

In the implementation of the CAR training management model, limited and extended trials show that the training management model, as a result of this development, is more easily understood and implemented by Islam Religion Education teachers of senior high school. Implementation of this training model provides real experiences to training organizers (MGMP) and trainees (Islam Religion Education teachers of senior high school) in understanding CAR training materials. The above description is in line with Simamora's (2006) opinion, which states that training is a series of activities designed to improve the skills, knowledge, and experiences that lead to a change of attitude. Training is directed to help trainees improve their competence. This CAR training is also a series of well-managed activities to help Islam Religion Education teachers of senior high school improve their knowledge, provide experience in making scientific work, bring positive attitude changes, and enhance research spirit that leads to the improvement of teacher competence.

The final results of this training model include the steps of the ADDIE and In-On-In models that are packaged within the IPO mindset. The results of this study indicate that

(1) the factual model that has not been designed based on needs analysis, there is no planning of participants, materials, instructors, and time, and has not been effective in improving the professionalism of teachers so the ability of teachers to write scientific papers is still low; (2) hypothetical model of training validated by expert experts and through FGD-1 eligible for use in pilot training; (3) after the trial and FGD-2 obtained the final model that is suitable to be applied in the training. The classroom action research training management model has a high level of effectiveness and is easy to implement. It is recommended that the government provide adequate facilities for the interest of developing teacher competence through sustainability, fair and equitable training activities. In addition, it is necessary to develop the competency of teachers of Islamic High School Education, both initiated by MGMP Islamic Religious High School and others to create a sense of fairness in selecting training programs.

CONCLUSION

Based on the description above, conclusions can be drawn as follows. (1) The factual Model of the classroom action research training management for Islamic High School teachers is supported by sufficient planning, inter alia, by determining the training objectives of improving the competence and professionalism of Islam Religion Education teachers supported by training programs with guidelines and training modules. However, the guidelines are still general while the material modules have not been standard as they are still handouts and Powerpoint presentations created by the instructor. Handbook for participants and instructors does not exist. Training activities are supported by instructors consisting of core teachers, lecturers, and supervisors. Participants do not yet have sufficient competence to conduct classroom action research; training materials are still general; the infrastructure and training media used are sufficient. Evaluation of training activities in the form of assessment of participants and instructors that include

participants' satisfaction on training activities; (2) the Hypothetical Model of the Classroom Action Research Training Management for Islam Religion Education teachers is based on expert and practitioner validation results, FGD-1 practitioners, and peers. The model is eligible for use in training activities. This is evident from the validation of the model that provides an average score of 3.41 that is in very good category, the result of device validation with the average of 61.73 is in very good category, the instrument validation result provides an average score of 3.59 is in very good category. The mplementation of the training is characterized by a profession in the field of Islam religion education and is implemented in accordance with the strategies and scenarios that have been designed. The evaluation on the implementation of the training includes evaluation of training model, training program, and attitude assessment of trainees; (3) the final model of classroom action research training for the Islam Religion Education Teachers proved to be appropriate for the Islam Religion Education teachers to improve their professionalism. This is evident from the training participants' responses to the training model as indicated by the use of the training model with the cumulative average score of 3.59 (very high), there is the practicality of using the training model with the cumulative average score of 3.56 (very high), the cumulative average score of 3.55 (very high). The training activities can yield products in the form of class action research proposals; (4) The Effectiveness of the final model of the classroom action research training management for Islam religion education teachers is very effective in improving the competence of the Islam Religion Education teachers. This is shown from the results of the pre-test and post-test withthe t-arithmetic which is higher han the t-table or $23.886 > 2.05$ at the level of significance by 0.000.

REFERENCES

Adnan Y.M., & Daud, M.D. (2012). Importance of soft skill for Graduates in The Real Estate

- Programmes in Malaysia. *Journal of Surveying, Construction, and Property*, 3(2).
- Amaliyyah. (2013). *Tinjauan Penyelenggaraan Diklat dari Aspek Input-Proses-Output dibalai Latihan Pertanian*. Bandung; Widya Iswara Dinas Pertanian Jawa Barat.
- Bloom, B.S. (2001). *Major Categories in the Taxonomy of Educational Objectives..* Available at <http://faculty-washington.edu/krumme/guides/bloom>.
- Borg, W.R., Gall, M.D., & Gall, J.P. (2007). *Educational Research: An Introduction, Eighth Edition*. New York: Logman.
- Bridges, D. (1990). The character of discussion: A focus on students. In W. Willen (Ed.) *Teaching and Learning through Discussion*, 15-28.
- Devi,R., & Shaik.N. (2012). *Evaluating Training & Development Effectiveness-A Measurement Model*. *Asian Journal of Management Research*, (2), 722-723.
- Edmons, G.S., Robert. C.B., & Prachee, M. (1994). A Conceptual Framework for Comparing Instructional Design Models. *Journal ETR & D*, 42(4), 55-72.
- Faisal Talib, et al. (2010). The relationship between total quality management and quality performance in the service industry: A theoretical model. *International Journal of Business, Management and Social Sciences*. 1(1), 113-128.
- Faisal Talib. (2010). Pareto analysis of total quality management factors critical to success for service industries. *International Journal for Quality research*, 4(2), 4-10.
- Gede, A.A. (2008). Pengembangan kompetensi guru dalam upaya meningkatkan kemampuan profesionalismenya. *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pengajaran. (Special Ed.)*, 41, 4-10.
- Hairul, N.I. (2009). Competency Based Teacher Education (CBTE): A training module for improving knowledge competencies for resource room teachers in Jordan. *European Journal of Social Sciences*, 10(2).
- Haslinda. A. (2009). The Effectiveness of training in the public service. *American Journal of Scientific Research*, 39-51
- Heinze A & Reiss. K. (2007). Mistake-handling activities in the mathematics classroom: Effects of an in-service teacher training on students' performance in geometry. In Woo, J. H., Lew, H. C., Park, K. S., & Seo, D. Y. (Eds.). *Proceedings of the 31st Conference of*

- the International Group for the Psychology of Mathematics Education, 3, 9-16.
- Ian, G., Ann, Bill, H.A., & Jame, W. (2001). Beginning teachers becoming professionals through action research. *Educational Action Research Journal*, 9 (1), 109-131.
- Kunlasomboona, N., Wongwanicha, S., & Suwanmonkhaa, S. (2015). Research and development of classroom action research process do enhance school learning. Faculty of Education, Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok Thailand: *Procedia-Social And Behavioral Science* 171. 1315-1324.
- Liu, H. (2014). Excellent mentor teachers skills in mentoring for pre-service teachers. *International Journal Education*, 6, 3-11
- Olofsson & Lindberg. (2006). Whatever happened do the social dimension aspect of learning in a distance-based teacher.
- Saondi, & Suherman. (2010). *Etika Profesi Keguruan*. Bandung: Refika Aditama
- Shahin A & Samea, M. (2010). Developing the models of service quality gaps: A critical discussion. *Journal Macrothink Institute: Business Management and Strategy*, 1 (1), E2.
- Soemarman, T. (2010). *Maximizing Training*. Malang: Diamo
- Velada, R., Caetano, A., & Lyons, D. M. (2007). The effects of training design, individual characteristics And Works Environment on transfer on Training, *International Journal Training And Development*, 11(4), 238-245.