

Type: **Research Article**

Green Tourism Regulation on Sustainable Development: Droning from Indonesia and China

Abdul Kadir Jaelani¹✉^{ID}, Muhammad Jihadul Hayat²^{ID}, Resti Dian Luthviati³^{ID}, Sholahuddin Al-Fatih⁴^{ID}, M. Misbahul Mujib⁵^{ID}

¹ Faculty of Law, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Indonesia

² Faculty of Law and Syariah, Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga Yogyakarta, Indonesia

³ Program Study of Demography and Civil Registration, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Indonesia

⁴ Faculty of Law, Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang, Indonesia

⁵ Zhongnan University of Economics and Law, China

✉ jaelaniabdulkadir@staff.uns.ac.id

ABSTRACT

For more than five decades (since 1972), the world has increasingly directed its attention toward sustainable development, one of which encompasses the domain of green tourism. Indonesia and China stand as two nations committed to the Sustainable Development Goals and green tourism. Nevertheless, it remains uncertain whether the legal framework on green tourism in both countries has achieved



comprehensiveness and the extent of its implementation's effectiveness. This article aims to explore the regulations on green tourism in Indonesia and China, along with their respective impacts. Drawing on a statute approach, this article argues that Indonesia has established multiple levels of regulations concerning green tourism as a part of its commitment to sustainable development and China. In practice, both Indonesia and China have implemented these regulations, leading to discernible positive effects on societal welfare. However, conventional regulatory overlap persists in Indonesia, and the implementation appears less than optimal. In another context, China adopts a streamlined regulatory framework and appears to have achieved greater effectiveness in the implementation of green tourism.

Keywords: Green Tourism, Impact of Regulation, Sustainable Development, Law and Policy

INTRODUCTION

Green tourism entails preserving and appreciating a region's natural environment and cultural heritage, alongside adopting environmentally friendly techniques.¹ The United Nations World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) recognizes that the tourism sector is a leading industry and a key driver for regional development and improved well-being of communities. According to UNWTO data from 2013, the tourism sector contributed 9% to the global GDP, created 1 out of every 11 jobs, and accounted for USD 1.4 trillion in

¹ Roqaye Mousavi, "The Role of Green Tourism as a Marketing at Destinations," *Journal of Tourism & Hospitality* 10, No. S5 (2021): 1–6,

global exports, equivalent to 5% of total global exports.² In the trajectory of Indonesian tourism policy, the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy (*Kemenpar*) reported in 2014 that 2008 the tourism sector in Indonesia contributed Rp. 153.25 trillion or 3.09% of Indonesia's total GDP. Subsequently, in 2009, the contribution of tourism increased from 3.09% to 3.25%. During the period from 2010 to 2014, tourism's contribution included 4% to the National GDP (ranking 4th nationally in foreign exchange earnings after oil and gas, coal, and palm oil), with the employment of 10.13 million workers and generating national foreign exchange of 10 billion USD. This was due to the tourism sector's ability to attract 9.4 million international tourists and stimulate 250 million domestic tourist trips with expenditures totaling 177 trillion rupiahs. Based on this data, it is not implausible that tourism in Indonesia could become one of the world's best. According to the World Economic Forum (WEF) in 2009, Indonesia's tourism competitiveness was ranked 81st out of 133 countries. This ranking can be attributed to Indonesia being the world's largest archipelagic nation. With its rich cultural heritage and abundant natural diversity, encompassing high levels of genetic, species, and ecosystem diversity, the tourism sector in Indonesia is undoubtedly a priority in its development.

Sustainable or green tourism is essential, but optimizing economic, social, and environmental advantages is difficult.³ Thus, tourism groups must actively address these issues to shift the

² Edgell, David L. "International Sustainable Tourism Policy." *The Brown Journal of World Affairs* 22, No. 1 (2015): 25-36.; Daniel Scott and Stefan Gössling, "What Could the next 40 Years Hold for Global Tourism?," *Tourism Recreation Research* 40, No. 3 (2015): 269-85.

³ Qadar Bakhsh Baloch et al., "Impact of Tourism Development upon Environmental Sustainability: A Suggested Framework for Sustainable Ecotourism," *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 30, No. 3 (2023): 5917-30.

business toward higher sustainability.⁴ The Data showed that tourism boosts green economic growth in high-income Asian economies. However, this green economic growth is unaffected by tourism.⁵

The phenomenon of tourism amplifies the significance of the green economy as a potential sector for the nation within the economic domain. Tourism has turned 'the green' into a financial resource, yet this by no means guarantees a commensurate positive impact on sustainability in environmental conservation. On the contrary, tourism threatens the 'greenness' level. If left unchecked, ecological degradation looms ahead. In this context, regulation emerges as a structural approach that must be established as the foundation for tourism management to ensure the attainment of sustainable values or, at the very least, to mitigate the risk of 'non-green' outcomes. Regulatory issues in Indonesia are not a new concern, but the regulation of green tourism is a relatively recent focus for the Indonesian government. It can be argued that despite Indonesia being a nation of laws, the legal framework governing the green economy and its corresponding practices are not as effective as those observed in developed countries.

Meanwhile, when we examine the constitution, it is evident that every individual has the right to a good and healthy environment. This is stipulated in Article 28H, paragraph (1) of the 1945 Constitution of Indonesia. This article states that "every person has the right to live prosperously both materially and spiritually, to reside, to have a good and healthy environment, and to obtain health services."⁶ The term "every person" referred to in this article pertains

⁴ Freya Higgins-Desbiolles, "The 'War over Tourism': Challenges to Sustainable Tourism in the Tourism Academy after COVID-19," *Journal of Sustainable Tourism* 29, No. 4 (2020): 551–69.

⁵ Yunfeng Shang et al., "The Impacts of Energy Resource and Tourism on Green Growth: Evidence from Asian Economies," *Resources Policy* 81 (March 2023): 103359.

⁶ Zulkifli Aspan and Ahsan Yunus, "The Right to a Good and Healthy Environment: Revitalizing Green Constitution," *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science*, 343 (2019:), 12067; Arifin Maruf, "Legal Aspects of Environment in Indonesia:

to Indonesian citizens. This means that having a good and healthy environment is a fundamental right guaranteed in the constitution. This is where green tourism becomes an integral part of constitutional provisions. Although this justification may seem weak, it is noteworthy that the norms of Article 28H have later been enshrined in Law No. 32 of 2009 concerning Environmental Protection and Management, which serves as the primary basis for environmental management in Indonesia. Lower-level regulations, such as Government Regulation (PP) No. 22 of 2021 on the Implementation of Environmental Protection and Management, derive their authority from this law.

Furthermore, Stella Alvianna et al. conducted a study to examine and analyze various aspects of tourist behavior related to the sustainability of green tourism. The researchers aimed to evaluate the connections between tourist behavior and their level of environmental responsibility. The survey was conducted in Batu City, encompassing a sample size of 300 individuals. The findings indicate no significant impact of Green Tourism Perception (GTP) on Environmentally Responsible Tourism Behavior (ERTB). Similarly, the direct effect of GTP on ERTB was also found to be insignificant. However, it is worth noting that the relationship between GTP and ERTB could become significant if mediated by the Intention of Participation in Green Tourism (IPGT).⁷

According to the abovementioned research, John Tribe and Brendan Paddison assert that the formulation of a destination strategy holds significant importance for future tourism development. Further development and subsequent implementation of a contemporary critical tourism strategy are necessary. The research findings identify numerous aspects of conventional management practices deemed

An Efforts to Prevent Environmental Damage and Pollution,” *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System* 1, No. 1 (2021): 2807–12.

⁷ Stella Alvianna et al., “The Role of Green Tourism Perception, Environmental Concern and Intention of Participation in Green Tourism on Environmentally Responsible Tourism Behavior,” *Jurnal Manajemen dan Kewirausahaan* 10, No. 1 (2022): 79–87.

adequate. However, they also highlight significant instances of suppressed information, exclusions, and concealed prejudices. The findings suggest the importance of expanding strategic perspectives to promote tourism focused on delivering value and increasing visitor numbers while prioritizing sustainability through various commitments.⁸

Tourism engenders favorable impacts for every nation that fosters its growth. Indonesia is no exception. According to data from the Ministry of Tourism and Creative Economy for the year 2022, the number of foreign tourist arrivals in Indonesia has exhibited an ascending trend. This increase has had a discernible effect on the tourism sector's contribution to the country's Gross Domestic Product (GDP) and foreign exchange reserves. In the year 2020, the tourism sector's contribution to Indonesia's GDP stood at a modest 5.05%, while in 2021 it escalated to 5.60% and 6.05% in 2022. Consequently, the government has instituted an array of policies aimed at the development of tourism destinations to augment employment opportunities within the tourism sector. One such policy entails the promotion of halal tourism through Ministerial Regulations and Regional Regulations pertaining to Halal Tourism. This implies that in the Indonesian context, green tourism is not the only trend but is concurrently intertwined with a tourism brand that aligns with religious principles.⁹

In certain contexts, religious-based tourism regulation has become a noteworthy discourse within the domestic tourist (owing to the Muslim majority). However, in other contexts, this religion-based tourism branding is perceived to have limited influence on the enthusiasm of international tourists. Such branding is not considered to have a substantial impact on the development of the tourism sector,

⁸ John Tribe and Brendan Paddison, "Critical Tourism Strategy," *Annals of Tourism Research* 98 (2023): 1–13.

⁹ R Hendrik Nasution, Ricky Avenzora, and Tutut Sunarminto, "Analisis Kebijakan Dan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan Ekowisata Di Indonesia.," *Media Konservasi* 23, No. 1 (2018).

given that these regulations necessitate the certification and labeling of halal tourism pillars by the Indonesian Ulema Council (MUI), which is not in line with Article 4 of Law Number 33 of 2014 on Halal Product Assurance, which only mandates certification for products.¹⁰

By way of illustration, data from the Central Statistics Agency (BPS) indicates that the revenue generated by three provinces (NTB, Riau, and Bali) from taxes and levies in the hotel and restaurant sector was notably low in 2021. Meanwhile, the tourism sector's contribution to the national Gross Domestic Product (GDP) reached 6.05% in 2022. However, this sector falls short of significantly contributing to job creation and fails to meet the Ministry of Tourism's target of generating 5 million jobs. In addition to these issues, the development of tourism destinations in NTB, Riau, and Bali is not accompanied by effective environmental preservation practices. Consequently, there is an escalating crisis in biological resource depletion, diminishing forests, limited water resources, erosion and soil degradation, sedimentation, coastal abrasion, and coral reef damage. This is exemplified in one of the destinations within the Mount Rinjani National Park area. Data from the Ministry of Environment and Forestry for the year 2021 reports that 53% of the ecosystem within the national park was contaminated by approximately 250 tons of plastic waste.

Furthermore, there have been violations in the utilization of land functions, particularly within local conservation areas (coastal zones), leading to land-use alterations. Numerous physical infrastructure buildings supporting tourism have been erected along the coastlines, especially in the destination development regions of NTB, Riau, and Bali, which contravene the spatial planning policies established by the government. These issues have resulted in a deterioration of environmental quality of these three provinces, posing a significant threat to the sustainability of these areas as tourist destinations.

¹⁰ Aal Lukmanul Hakim, "Dissecting the Contents of Law in Indonesia on Halal Product Assurance." *Indonesia Law Review* 5, No. 1 (2015): 88-103

Henceforth, there is a pressing need for responsible tourism development through the formulation of participatory, responsive, and aspirational regulations aimed at achieving sustainable tourism. The development of sustainable tourism is underpinned by at least three reasons. First, a moral imperative exists as a foundation for safeguarding the availability of natural resources for future generations. Second, an ecological rationale guides the development of ecologically-based economic activities. Third, an economic rationale serves as the basis for ensuring sustainable well-being across generations. From the various tourism-related facts mentioned above, it is abundantly clear that Indonesia's tourism context represents a vital national asset with significant promise for domestic development. However, it is evident that the government's policies in regulating this sector have proven to be ineffective.

This article is a comparative legal study that adopts the statutory approach as the primary standpoint of inquiry. It aims to compare Indonesia and China's tourist and environmental laws in a broader context. The study investigates the ability of both nations' tourism and environmental policies to promote sustainable tourism and achieve environmental justice.¹¹ To comprehensively compare and contrast how the two nations address tourism and environmental issues, this study collected data by investigating both primary sources (regulations) and secondary sources (literature written by other scholars) from both Indonesia and China.¹² To ensure a thorough investigation, this study also examines various elements that could impact the comparability of the legal systems between the two

¹¹ Iqbal Iqbal and Hilmi Rayhannafi, "Legal Politics toward Natural Energy: Natural Gas Utilization in Indonesia," *Journal of Sustainable Development and Regulatory Issues (JSDERI)* 1, no. 1 (2023): 25–30.

¹² Leo Jimmi Agustinus, F. X.Adji Samekto, and Budi Ispriyarso, "Towards a Fairer Future: Examining Environmental Permits in Indonesia and Sweden Through the Lens of Sustainable Development and Equity," *Journal of Law and Sustainable Development* 11, No. 2 (July 2023): e284.

nations. These elements encompass political, economic, social, cultural, human resource, and technological disparities.¹³

GREEN TOURISM & SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS

Tourism has emerged as a thriving industry, substantially impacting various facets of a country's economy and society. This sector contributes significantly to foreign exchange earnings and plays a pivotal role in employment generation, enhancing transportation infrastructure, fostering social globalization, fueling economic growth, and promoting overall welfare.¹⁴ The discourse surrounding post-corona economic green recovery has garnered considerable attention from experts, leading to a concerted focus on ecotourism or green tourism policy.¹⁵ The tourism industry's environmental consciousness assists the international community in achieving sustainable development objectives.¹⁶

¹³ M Zaid et al., "The Sanctions on Environmental Performances: An Assessment of Indonesia and Brazil Practice," *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System* 3, No. 2 (2023): 236–64.

¹⁴ Yunfeng Shang et al., "Role of Green Finance in Renewable Energy Development in the Tourism Sector," *Renewable Energy* 206 (April 2023): 890–96.

¹⁵ Xiao Bai et al., "Measuring China's Green Economic Recovery and Energy Environment Sustainability: Econometric Analysis of Sustainable Development Goals," *Economic Analysis and Policy* 75 (September 2022): 768–79.

¹⁶ Linhai Zhao et al., "Enhancing Green Economic Recovery through Green Bonds Financing and Energy Efficiency Investments," *Economic Analysis and Policy* 76 (December 2022): 488–501.

Since Quebec declaration in 2002, in the context of national ecotourism development, the aspects of regulation and policy have indeed become critically important for examination as the foundational orientation for all stakeholders in implementing tourism development in various regions. The challenges in ecotourism development lie in the overlapping management, policy disharmony, legal regulations, and sectoral egos within each ministry responsible for ecotourism development. In the realm of ecotourism development, at least four ministries possess authority in management and the formulation of policies and legislation pertaining to ecotourism. These ministries include the Ministry of Environment and Forestry, the Ministry of Tourism, the Ministry of Home Affairs, and the Ministry of Maritime Affairs and Fisheries. Nevertheless, within the dynamics of tourism and ecotourism regulation in Indonesia, it can be said that it has not yet maximally emphasized the space for the objectivity of knowledge and the application of sustainable visions. Furthermore, the presence of indications of political aspects in the formulation and implementation of ecotourism development concepts also plays a significant role in shaping regional regulations.¹⁷

Green tourism laws advocate and facilitate sustainable tourism practices. The majority of tourism laws place significant emphasis on environmental protection, focusing on waste reduction, water conservation, and the promotion of renewable energy sources. The concept of ecotourism is subject to regulation, involving measures such as mandating hotels to utilize energy-efficient appliances and lighting, imposing restrictions on single-use plastics, implementing visitor quotas in certain areas, and offering incentives to encourage the adoption of sustainable practices by businesses. Consequently, these tourist policies are designed to optimize benefits while

¹⁷ Nasution, Avenzora, and Sunarminto, "Analisis Kebijakan Dan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan Ekowisata Di Indonesia."

mitigating potential drawbacks.¹⁸ Green tourism development should involve tour operators, travel agencies, hotels, tourists, and community hosts.¹⁹

According to WTO, green tourism can support sustainable growth and serve as a model because environmental economics considers sustainable deterioration market failure. Openness promotes innovation.²⁰ Sustainable tourism practices must be implemented to preserve a sustainable tourist habitat for future generations. The diverse cultural landscapes, resources, and culture may also promote tourist satisfaction and repeat visits.²¹ Ethical tourism promotes human rights and sustainability.²²

Sustainable tourism involves the management of all resources in a manner that effectively meets the requirements of various stakeholders while simultaneously preserving the system's cultural integrity, biodiversity, ecological elements, and overall vitality. The sustainable development goals (SDGs) aim to end poverty, protect the environment, and achieve global prosperity. Policymakers, academia, practitioners, and other tourism stakeholders use policy and strategic

¹⁸ Sarah Schönherr, Mike Peters, and Kir Kuščer, "Sustainable Tourism Policies: From Crisis-Related Awareness to Agendas towards Measures," *Journal of Destination Marketing & Management* 27 (2023): 100762.

¹⁹ Nimi Markose, Bindu Vazhakkatte Tazhathethil, and Babu George, "Sustainability Initiatives for Green Tourism Development: The Case of Wayanad, India," *Journal of Risk and Financial Management* 15, No. 2 (2022): 1–13.

²⁰ Emad Al Dein Al Fahmawee and Omar Jawabreh, "Sustainability of Green Tourism By International Tourists and Its Impact on Green Environmental Achievement: Petra Heritage, Jordan," *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites* 46, No. 1 (2023): 27–36.

²¹ Huang Yuedi et al., "Analysis of Tourism Sustainability Synthetic Indicators. A Case Study of Aragon," *Heliyon* 9, No. 4 (2023): 1–26.

²² Cok Dian Laksmidewi, "The Legal Implications of Signing the Unwto Framework Convention on Tourism Ethics for the Sustainable Tourism Development in Indonesia," *International Journal of Law Reconstruction* 6, No. 2 (2022): 197.

engagement principles to collaborate.²³ However, the function of the strategy remains significant in the context of tourism growth, involving the formulation of strategies related to the establishment of green tourism regulations.²⁴ Green innovation adoption (GIA)—in which also known as ecological, environmental, or sustainable innovation—emphasizes the conservation of resources and enhancement of the environment through technological advancements. Existing empirical studies on green innovation have concentrated predominantly on GIA measurement and its spatiotemporal deductive feature description.²⁵ On the basis of this information, a number of researchers investigated the influencing factors of GIA to identify the most effective enhancement strategies.²⁶

The term "Green tourist" has been utilized in various contexts throughout history. One of the conceptual approaches currently under development by stakeholders to bolster sustainable tourism is "Alternative tourism." Sustainable tourism encompasses an orientation that acknowledges the economic value of the present and future, the environmental implications, meeting support, the environmental industry, and the welfare of local communities.²⁷ Sustainable tourism and ecotourism are inseparable. Green tourism appeals to all tourism industry actors because people care more about

²³ Birendra KC, Aditya Dhungana, and Tek B. Dangi, "Tourism and the Sustainable Development Goals: Stakeholders' Perspectives from Nepal," *Tourism Management Perspectives* 38 (2021): 100822.

²⁴ Tribe and Paddison, "Critical Tourism Strategy."

²⁵ Yuhuan Sun, Wangwang Ding, and Guangchun Yang, "Green Innovation Efficiency of China's Tourism Industry from the Perspective of Shared Inputs: Dynamic Evolution and Combination Improvement Paths," *Ecological Indicators* 138 (May 2022): 108824.

²⁶ Dianxi Hu et al., "The Effect of Global Value Chain Position on Green Technology Innovation Efficiency: From the Perspective of Environmental Regulation," *Ecological Indicators* 121 (February 2021): 107195.

²⁷ Muh Nuh Ilyas et al., "Application of Green Tourism in the Mount Rinjani National Park Area to Support Sustainable Tourism," *International Journal of Green Tourism Research and Applications* 4, No. 1 (June 2022): 16–22.

nature conservation and sustainable tourism. Green tourism capitalizes on people's desire to travel without harming the environment.²⁸

Tourism is often seen as a source of foreign exchange and economic growth. To take a proper example, China has a major carbon finance market. Tourism is becoming an important economic tool for regions with few other options. Preserving historic rural regions and traditional rural lifestyles, especially in developing nations, is a global priority.²⁹ Due to the country's vast size, wealthy agricultural resources, beautiful scenery, and ancient traditions China's rural areas have a lot to offer as tourist destinations.³⁰ Furthermore, sustainable tourism is a key to meeting Kyoto Protocol goals, because it reduces global warming. Tourism is closely related to environment; however empirical evidence on the linear link between tourism and ambient air health is scarce and inconsistent.³¹

According to some studies, the consumer pricing index reduces China's tourism industry's green efficiency in the short and long term. Recommended practical policies include enhancing executive regulations and promoting market information transparency, implementing green fiscal policies, promoting the construction of green hotels and eco-friendly tourist accommodations, embracing sustainable practices in the globalization of tourism, fostering

²⁸ Ariyanto Ariyanto, "Green Tourism Management for Sustainable Tourism Development in the Age of Disruption," *Jurnal Multidisiplin Sahombu* 2, No. 1 (July 2022): 23–28.

²⁹ Zeng Hailiang, Ka Yin Chau, and Muhammad Waqas, "Does Green Finance and Renewable Energy Promote Tourism for Sustainable Development: Empirical Evidence from China," *Renewable Energy* 207 (May 2023): 660–71.

³⁰ Long Liu et al., "Impact of Power on Uneven Development: Evaluating Built-Up Area Changes in Chengdu Based on NPP-VIIRS Images (2015–2019)," *Land* 11, No. 4 (March 2022): 489.

³¹ Xiao Guang Yue et al., "The Role of Green Innovation and Tourism towards Carbon Neutrality in Thailand: Evidence from Bootstrap ADRL Approach," *Journal of Environmental Management* 292 (August 2021): 112778.

innovation during the operational phases, i.e., innovation, adaptation, and stabilization (IAS), and encouraging eco-tourism regionalism.³² Green finance is a significant factor in enhancing the level of tourism's sustainability; thus, the present study focuses on the moderate impact of green finance on health expenditures, technological innovations, and carbon emissions in Indonesia and China.

Previous research studies have indicated that numerous sustainable tourism concepts depend on an in-depth understanding of the collective costs and benefits. For instance, the tourism industry delivers advantages for local communities but also engenders adverse environmental, social, and cultural consequences. As a result, researchers have directed their attention to strategies aimed at decreasing the harmful effects of tourism on the localities that serve as hosts.³³

Qadar Bakhsh Baloch and others have authored several research investigations. This research is an empirical investigation examining the correlation between tourism development and environmental appropriateness to propose a framework for sustainable ecotourism. The suggested framework proposes an integrative balance between the interests of businesses and the environment, aiming to sustain ecological systems. A modest level of government support and policy interventions achieve that balance. The research population comprises several stakeholders in the tourism industry, including travelers, representatives from local communities, civil administration members, hotel owners, and tour operators operating within the designated area. The study findings indicate that a significant portion of the population gains socio-economic advantages from tourist development, such as increased employment opportunities, new businesses, infrastructural enhancements, and

³² Shang et al., "Role of Green Finance in Renewable Energy Development in the Tourism Sector."

³³ Mustafa Rehman Khan et al., "Sustainable Tourism Policy, Destination Management and Sustainable Tourism Development: A Moderated-Mediation Model," *Sustainability* 13, No. 21 (2021): 1–22.

overall economic growth. Nevertheless, it has been observed that the condition of natural capital and the environment is progressively deteriorating as a result of excessive land exploitation, encroachment by other cultures, and the adverse effects of traffic congestion, solid waste accumulation, improper waste management, and carbon emissions on air and water quality. The paper proposes a theoretical framework for the development of sustainable ecotourism. This framework emphasizes the importance of government policies that encourage the successful conservation of natural resources and the environment while also considering local populations' economic viability and social well-being.³⁴

From the sustainability perspective, previous research studies have indicated that numerous sustainable tourism concepts depend upon an in-depth understanding of the collective costs and benefits involved. For instance, the tourism industry delivers advantages for local communities but also engenders adverse environmental, social, and cultural consequences. As a result, researchers have directed their attention to strategies aimed at decreasing the harmful effects of tourism on the localities that serve as hosts.³⁵

A number of research investigations have been authored by Baloch and others. It is suggested framework proposes an integrative balance between the interests of businesses and the environment, aiming to sustain ecological systems. That balance is achieved by a modest level of government support and policy interventions. The research population comprises several stakeholders involved in the tourism industry, involving travelers, representatives from local communities, civil administration members, hotel owners, and tour operators operating within the designated area. The study findings indicate that a significant portion of the population gains socio-economic advantages from tourist development, such as increased

³⁴ Baloch et al., "Impact of Tourism Development upon Environmental Sustainability: A Suggested Framework for Sustainable Ecotourism."

³⁵ Khan et al., "Sustainable Tourism Policy, Destination Management and Sustainable Tourism Development: A Moderated-Mediation Model."

employment opportunities, the establishment of new businesses, infrastructural enhancements, and overall economic growth. Nevertheless, it has been observed that the condition of natural capital and the environment is progressively deteriorating as a result of excessive land exploitation, encroachment by other cultures, and the adverse effects of traffic congestion, solid waste accumulation, improper waste management, and carbon emissions on air and water quality. This framework emphasizes the importance of government policies that encourage successful conservation of natural resources and the environment, while also considering the economic viability and social well-being of local populations.³⁶

Furthermore, Alvianna et al. conducted a study with the objective of examining and analyzing various aspects of tourist behavior in relation to the sustainability of green tourism. The researchers aimed to evaluate the connections between tourist behavior and their level of environmental responsibility. The survey was conducted in Batu City, encompassing a sample size of 300 individuals who have visited the aforementioned city. The findings indicate that there was no significant direct impact of Green Tourism Perception (GTP) on Environmentally Responsible Tourism Behavior (ERTB). Similarly, the direct effect of GTP on ERTB was also found to be insignificant. However, it is worth noting that the relationship between GTP and ERTB could become significant if mediated by the Intention of Participation in Green Tourism (IPGT).³⁷

According to the abovementioned research, Tribe and Paddison assert that the formulation of a destination strategy holds significant importance in the context of future tourism development. Further development and subsequent implementation of a contemporary critical tourism strategy is necessary. Their research findings identify

³⁶ Baloch et al., "Impact of Tourism Development upon Environmental Sustainability: A Suggested Framework for Sustainable Ecotourism."

³⁷ Alvianna et al., "The Role of Green Tourism Perception, Environmental Concern and Intention of Participation in Green Tourism on Environmentally Responsible Tourism Behavior."

numerous aspects of conventional management practices that are deemed effective. However, they also bring attention to significant instances of suppressed information, exclusions, and concealed prejudices. The findings suggest the importance of expanding strategic perspectives to promote tourism focused on delivering value and increasing visitor numbers while prioritizing sustainability through various commitments.³⁸

The UN has convened world summits for over 40 years and created the most comprehensive sustainable development framework. Sustainable development “meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their needs.” Sustainable development investigates the implementation of strategies to attain a society that integrates people, the environment, and progress. The model of three circles is described as the “common three-ring sector view of sustainable development”.³⁹

Tourism generates enormous economic benefits for the world's nations. Unfortunately, the increasing environmental cost of tourism activities has caused the industry to experience an undeniable effect of global climate change and its enormous financial benefits. The notion of sustainable development has emerged as an issue that influences the leisure industry. Tourism destinations have encountered a problem with sustainability, indicating the need for tourism protection.⁴⁰ Policymakers should evaluate SDG efforts more holistically by using people's well-being as the primary tourism industry performance metric. Putting resident well-being at the center of tourism policy requires better measures and data and embedding well-being into government decision-making culture and machinery

³⁸ Tribe and Paddison, “Critical Tourism Strategy.”

³⁹ Susana Diaz-Iglesias, Alicia Blanco-Gonzalez, and Carmen Orden-Cruz, “Theoretical Framework for Sustainability, Corporate Social Responsibility and Change Management,” *Journal of Sustainability Science and Management* 16, No. 6 (2021): 315–32.

⁴⁰ Xiao Juan Li, “Green Innovation Behavior Toward Sustainable Tourism Development: A Dual Mediation Model,” *Frontiers in Psychology* 13, no. June (2022): 1–14.

so that well-being outcomes are systematically reflected in economic decision-making. The well-being lens can be utilized ex-ante (policy development) or ex-post (policy evaluation) and updated as better statistics and SDG-wellbeing linkages are discovered.⁴¹

Sustainable tourism goals include sustainable development destination uniqueness, brand building, and positioning strategy. Sustainability improves consumer experiences, value generation, destination image, performance, customer satisfaction, inclination to return, and word of mouth. Attractive destinations are surrounded by nature. Tourists regularly consider and take new environmental and social steps to preserve the natural, cultural, and social background. Tourism shapes views, attitudes, and experiences. Practice-based sustainable tourism inspires visitors to act responsibly.⁴² Green economies vary by industry. Responsible tourism promotes sustainable green tourism. Responsible and ecological tourism can be combined for long-term destination development. The destination's economy is under consideration. Consistent economic development was needed to sustain the goal financially.⁴³

In fact, SDGs are problematic in each country. Tourism harms the environment, even though it has the biggest economic potential. Tourism depends on the environment. Thus, various environmental policies protect the ecosystem for future generations. Tourism's impact on climate change has expanded with sustainability concerns. The tourism industry's response to climate change policy and the lack of user-friendly tools to assess travelers' greenhouse gas emissions.⁴⁴

⁴¹ Larry Dwyer, "Tourism Contribution to the SDGs: Applying a Well-Being Lens," *European Journal of Tourism Research* 32, No. 2022 (2022): 1–20.

⁴² Garyfallos Fragidis, Kyriakos Riskos, and Iordanis Kotzaivazoglou, "Designing the Tourist Journey for the Advancement of Sustainable Tourist Practices," *Sustainability* 14, No. 15 (2022).

⁴³ Markose, Tazhathethil, and George, "Sustainability Initiatives for Green Tourism Development: The Case of Wayanad, India."

⁴⁴ Alex Baumber, John Merson, and Chris Lockhart Smith, "Promoting Low-Carbon Tourism through Adaptive Regional Certification," *Climate* 9, No. 1 (2021): 1–22.

IMPACT OF GREEN TOURISM REGULATION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN INDONESIA

Green tourism policies affect the green economy, thus understanding it is important. Green economic resurgence requires several stimulants. Tourism could boost green growth. "Ecotourism" or "green tourism" refers to eco-friendly tourism.⁴⁵ Sustainable development safeguards biodiversity, environmental integrity, and tourism destinations' sociocultural fabric. Green economy advocates investing protected area profits towards local livelihoods and employment. Tourism may drive the green economy to success and long-term growth. Green tourism can support local economies that benefit all stakeholders and distribute socio-economic gains fairly.⁴⁶

Economic development involves the green economy. "Green" in "green economy" refers to environmental protection. Tourism is crucial to promoting a green economy. Collaboration between green economy growth and regulation accelerates the shift from conventional to green. The Indonesia Green Economy Model (I-GEM) requires four macro metrics to evaluate its transition to a green economy. Four indications are pro-growth, pro-poverty, pro-employment, and pro-environment. Sustainable development elements must match macroeconomic goals like GDP growth and GDP growth per capita.⁴⁷ Indonesia's green economy-related tourism

⁴⁵ Hanzhi Zhang et al., "Promoting Eco-Tourism for the Green Economic Recovery in ASEAN," *Economic Change and Restructuring* 56, No. 3 (2023): 2021–36.

⁴⁶ Diego R. Toubes and Noelia Araújo-Vila, "A Review Research on Tourism in the Green Economy," *Economies* 10, No. 6 (2022).

⁴⁷ Muhammad Noor, Cahyadi Eko, and Dian Eka Rahmawati, "Proceedings of the International Conference on Sustainable Innovation on Humanities, Education, and Social Sciences (ICOSI-HESS 2022)," *Proceedings of the International Conference on*

legislation are: a. Law No. 10 of 2009 on Tourism, b. Government Regulation (PP) on the National Tourism Development Master Plan for 2010–2025, c. Regulation of the Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy/Head of the Tourism and Creative Economy Agency on Hygiene, Health, Safety, and Environmental Sustainability Standards and Certification of the Tourism Sector during the Handling of the Corona Virus Disease Pandemic 2019.⁴⁸

Bali is one of the regions in Indonesia where the concept of green tourism has been implemented. *Tri Hita Karana* is implemented in Bali's green tourism practices. *Tri Hita Karana* is universal and the basis for achieving physical and mental happiness.⁴⁹ Social harmony activities apply the principle. The Law on Environmental Protection and Management No. 32 of 2009 (hereinafter as UUPPLH), Government Regulation (PP) No. 27 of 2012 (Environmental Permits), and Ministry of Environment Regulation No. 17 of 2012 (AMDA) protect and promote Bali's ecotourism. Any careless or lawbreaking culprit may face administrative, civil, and criminal penalties. Tourism management may cause a loss. In that situation, it will allude to Kraenburg and Vegting's idea of *faute personnelle and faute de service* which means officials whose acts produced losses should pay for them. UUPPLH No. 32 of 2009 governs the government's environmental management actions that contradict Bali's community participation. Article 85, Article 86, and compensation, ecological restoration, and other courts authorize outside conflict resolution. The Bali Provincial Regulation limits government accountability for environmental law choices that conflict with community

Sustainable Innovation on Humanities, Education, and Social Sciences (ICOSI-HESS 2022), 2022, 416–26.

⁴⁸ L. D. Nugroho et al., “Legal Policy of Implementation Green Economy in the Tourism Sector to Realize Sustainable Tourism and Environment,” *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science* 1181 (2023).

⁴⁹ Eli Jamilah Mihardja et al., “Forest Wellness Tourism Destination Branding for Supporting Disaster Mitigation: A Case of Batur UNESCO Global Geopark, Bali,” *International Journal of Geoheritage and Parks* 11, No. 1 (2023): 169–81.

expectations. Environmental group members can be sued under UUPPLH No. 32 of 2009 Articles 91 and 92. Article 93 lets anyone challenge a government decision administratively.⁵⁰

Sustainable tourism improves land management, environment, and economics. Ecotourism regulations must be environmentally beneficial for the government to maximize its potential and impact. Green tourism promotes respect for nature and the environment to encourage sustainable tourism based on indigenous knowledge.⁵¹ Ecotourism's contribution to sustainable tourism should be increased given Bali's large number of foreign tourists. REDD++ divides tourism. High-income, well-educated tourists enjoy nice, well-maintained nature facilities. Low-income, low-education tourists favor family-friendly destinations. Values, interests, and preferences have changed, creating eco-conscious tourists and fast-growing market. Environmental awareness must be promoted. Tourists need these features for ecotourism and REDD+.⁵²

Ecotourism emerges as a crucial component for park tours in Indonesia, particularly in the national parks, as it holds the potential to significantly contribute to conservation efforts and rural development. The multifaceted benefits of ecotourism include bolstering conservation initiatives, enhancing biodiversity, and promoting sustainable resource management. Moreover, its positive impact extends to strengthening local communities, providing both immediate and indirect economic advantages, and fostering a heightened awareness of the imperative need for natural resource preservation. Despite these considerable advantages, concerns persist

⁵⁰ I Nyoman Putu Budiarta, I Nyoman Gede Sugiarta, and A.A. Sagung Laksmi Dewi, "Environment Law-Based Rural Tourism Regulations in Bali," *Journal Equity of Law and Governance* 2, no. 1 (2022): 1–8.

⁵¹ Anak Agung Sagung Laksmi Dewi, Mella Ismelina Farma Rahayu, and Anak Agung Ngurah Adhi Wibisana, "Green Tourism in Sustainable Tourism," *Jurnal Dinamika Hukum* 23, No. 1 (2023).

⁵² Gayoung Choi et al., "Ecotourism Market Segmentation in Bali, Indonesia: Opportunities for Implementing REDD+," *Land* 9, No. 6 (2020): 1–15.

regarding the unequal distribution of benefits derived from ecotourism, prompting a call for further investigation into this aspect. Addressing these disparities is essential to ensuring a more equitable and sustainable outcome for both conservation and rural development initiatives associated with Indonesian national parks.

It is important to note that while ecotourism plays a significant role, it should not be viewed as the sole solution for achieving conservation and rural development goals within national parks. A comprehensive understanding of the sustainability dynamics requires additional research and investigation.⁵³

The roots of ecotourism in Indonesia trace back to mangrove parks such as the Ayah Mangrove Forest in the Kebumen Regency of Central Java. Recognizing the ecotourism potential within the Ayah Mangrove Forest, efforts can be made to integrate mangrove-based ecotourism with ongoing conservation projects. The support of the local community is evident, especially among residents of the Ayah Mangrove Forest, further emphasizing the positive reception and potential success of ecotourism in the region.⁵⁴

Examine the impact of Law No. 10 of 2009 on Kelapa Beach to understand its implications for tourism. The law mandates that all stakeholders utilize and develop tourism resources, with local government agencies being responsible for managing each asset and regional resource. Law No. 10 of 2009 empowers local governments with control over tourist resources, a principle exemplified by the successful implementation of the Tuban Beach Tourism Development Policy. George Edward III's success theory serves as a framework for evaluating this accomplishment. Effective communication

⁵³ Renny Indira Anggraini and Budhi Gunawan, "Ecotourism Development in National Parks: A New Paradigm of Forest Management in Indonesia," *E3S Web of Conferences* 249 (2021): 1–5.

⁵⁴ Ratih Nur Afifah et al., "Ecotourism Development as a Community-Based Conservation Effort in Ayah Mangrove Forest, Kebumen, Central Java, Indonesia," *Asian Journal of Forestry* 7, No. 1 (2023): 37–44.

underscores the collaborative success between POKDARWIS, Kelapa Beach MSMEs, and the government.⁵⁵

Recognizing the pivotal role of environmental legislation in Indonesia's sustainable development goals, there is a need to fortify existing laws, foster partnerships with institutions, and actively advocate for environmental issues. The achievement of sustainable growth in Indonesia necessitates a harmonious collaboration between the government and society. This cooperative approach is paramount not only for Indonesia but also for other nations committed to environmentally conscious practices, as sustainable development remains a cornerstone of their shared objectives.⁵⁶

Indonesia requires enhanced regulations for green tourism to foster sustainable development. The foundation of sustainable tourism lies in the robust support provided by Indonesia's green tourism laws. The allure of nature tourism in Indonesia is undeniable, offering an exhilarating experience. Sustainable development, with its substantial economic, environmental, and social impacts, is intricately linked to the progression of tourism. The evolution of tourism aligns with the three important dimensions of modern sustainable development. Adapting to the dynamic shifts in economic, social, and environmental systems is imperative for the tourism sector. Effective sustainable tourism policies play a pivotal role by not only empowering local communities but also ensuring that the activities within tourist destinations are managed and controlled, meeting both the needs of tourists and the broader objectives of sustainability.⁵⁷

⁵⁵ Lik Sriyah and Rudy Handoko L B Wirawan, "Overview of Public Policy in Improving Tourism at Kelapa Tuban Beach," *Public Policy and Administration Research* 11, No. 2 (2021): 31–36.

⁵⁶ Baren Sipayung et al., "Environmental Law Enforcement in Indonesia in Terms of the Concept of Sustainable Development," *Jurnal Hukum dan HAM Wara Sains* 2, no. 03 (2023): 197–203.

⁵⁷ Khan et al., "Sustainable Tourism Policy, Destination Management and Sustainable Tourism Development: A Moderated-Mediation Model."

UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) for 2030 emphasize fair and comprehensive economic growth, renewable energy consumption, and technology innovation as climate change countermeasures (SDGs 7, 8, and 13) ⁵⁸. According to the World Tourism Organisation (UNWTO), by 2030, there will be 2 billion more foreign visitors than there are now, which would generate \$2 billion USD in yearly global income ⁵⁹. These numbers show that the tourism sector significantly influences global economic growth.⁶⁰ Tourism has transformed. Many factors cause these changes. Global warming raises environmental awareness, encouraging change. Tourism Village links green tourism to IT use. Information technology affects green tourism sustainability.⁶¹

Green tourism combines outdoor activities in environmentally intact natural areas with visits to scientific, educational, cultural, and cognitive places. However, this activity maintains and improves environmental potential and population well-being. Conservation areas, which aim to preserve biodiversity, have become major land use in recent decades. Green tourism promotes environmental stewardship in natural settings.⁶²

⁵⁸ Asif Raihan, Said Ibrahim, and Dewan Ahmed Muhtasim, “Dynamic Impacts of Economic Growth, Energy Use, Tourism, and Agricultural Productivity on Carbon Dioxide Emissions in Egypt,” *World Development Sustainability* 2 (June 2023): 100059.

⁵⁹ Asif Raihan and Almagul Tuspekova, “The Nexus between Economic Growth, Energy Use, Urbanization, Tourism, and Carbon Dioxide Emissions: New Insights from Singapore,” *Sustainability Analytics and Modeling* 2 (2022): 100009.

⁶⁰ Asif Raihan et al., “How Tourism Affects Women’s Employment in Asian Countries: An Application of GMM and Quantile Regression,” *Journal of Social Sciences and Management Studies* 1, No. 4 (December 2022): 57–72.

⁶¹ Ni Luh Ayu Kartika Yuniastari Sarja et al., “Developing Green Tourism-Based Model of Information Technology Utilization in Tourism Villages,” *International Journal of Applied Sciences in Tourism and Events* 5, No. 2 (December 2021): 153–65.

⁶² Heni Krisnatalia, Nurdina Prasetyo, and Mochammad Ainan, “Creating A Green Tourism Experience Through Development of Tourism Package As A Tourism Destination Marketing Strategy: The Case of Kertayasa Tourism Village,” *International*

Ineffective policy implementation is frequently the outcome of conflicting policies relating to the management of multi-sectoral, multi-level, and multi-actor forest uses⁶³. Indonesian urban greening programs have struggled to provide enough good green space, needing a better approach. The policy is assumed to impede Indonesia from fully supplying and exploiting green open space. Local to global laws and regulations require green open space. Due to the complexity of the public policy structure governing green open space, law enforcement activities must be integrated and thorough.⁶⁴ This period harms society and the environment. Because nature improves health, relaxation, and environmental services, people are more aware of it. Natural resources are used for survival. Natural resource use may cause conflict. A good dispute resolution should conserve environmental aspects, generate economic benefits, and encourage stakeholder participation.⁶⁵

Cultural tourism defines the essence of green tourism in Bali, where discussions on settlement and environmentally conscious hotels intersect. The symbiotic relationship between these elements extends benefits to various stakeholders, ensuring the sustained viability of the hotel business. The advantages derived from environmentally responsible practices not only contribute to business survival but also align with the evolving priorities of contemporary

Conference On Research And Development (ICORAD) 1, No. 2 (December 2022): 217–23.

⁶³ Dwi Amalia Sari et al., “Evaluating Policy Coherence: A Case Study of Peatland Forests on the Kampar Peninsula Landscape, Indonesia,” *Land Use Policy* 105 (June 2021): 105396, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2021.105396>.

⁶⁴ Mohammad Zaini Dahlan et al., “Review of Urban Greening Policy in Indonesia: A Case Study in Jakarta Province,” *International Journal on Livable Space* 6, no. 1 (January 2023): 21–28, <https://doi.org/10.25105/livas.v6i1.10678>.

⁶⁵ Y. Prihayati and T. O. Veriasa, “Developing Green Tourism to Create the Sustainable Landscape: Evidence from Community-Based Coffee Tourism (CbCT) in Puncak, Bogor, Indonesia,” *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science* 879, no. 1 (October 2021): 012027, <https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/879/1/012027>.

enterprises. Factors such as environmental considerations, revenue generation, and enhanced productivity have gained prominence as critical drivers for business growth. Given the prominence of Jimbaran Bali as a sought-after tourist destination and the escalating competitiveness in the hotel sector, proactive management strategies are essential. Implementing green hotel initiatives emerges as a strategic imperative to foster sustainable tourism, catering to the evolving expectations of conscious travelers while simultaneously positioning the business for long-term success.⁶⁶

Scuba diving tourism in Bali has increased significantly, as seen by the number of companies involved, the size of the tourist market, and the number of developed diving tourism locations. The diving tourism industry's rapid rise has caused coral reef devastation, local community exclusion, and a marginal impact on the local economy, nature conservation, and cultural preservation.⁶⁷ The concept of power relations is inseparable from the comprehension of tourism policy design. Policy formulation is influenced by various actors, participant characteristics, authority, and power, as well as how they manipulate and control one another to influence the outcome.

The local community as the host is a key actor in comprehending sustainable tourism management. Local knowledge-based tourism initiatives will contribute to the resilience of small-scale entrepreneurial tourism enterprises during a period of uncertainty in the tourism enhancement industry.⁶⁸ Even though there are new job

⁶⁶ Abdul Rokip et al., "Green Tourism Implementation to Create an Environmentally Friendly Accommodation," *Jurnal Bali Membangun Bali* 3, No. 2 (August 2022): 157–66.

⁶⁷ I Ketut Sudiarta, I Made Suwitra, and I Ngurah Suryawan, "Evaluation of the Implementation of Ecotourism Principles in the Operation of Diving Tourism in Bali, Indonesia," *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science* (2147- 4478) 11, No. 4 (June 2022): 432–38.

⁶⁸ B O Y Marpaung, Dwira Nirfalini Aulia, and Eric Witarsa, "Evaluation of Tourism Policies Towards Sustainable Development," *Journal of Politics and Law* 14, No. 4 (May 2021): 1.

opportunities and increased environmental conservation efforts, planning and developing green tourism in villages leads to an unequal distribution of economic benefits due to conflicts within society, unequal opportunities for local community participation in tourism, and mismatches in meeting individual needs for sustainable community development ⁶⁹. It is essential to increase consumer awareness of the operation of green tourism institutions and their competitive advantages in order to establish this trend. Legal support and developed training facilities (how to be profitable in this industry, promoting travel companies, the value of certification, etc.) must be prioritized.

GREEN TOURISM REGULATION ON SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT IN CHINA: GLANCE COMPARISON

Explore the evolution of Chinese green tourism regulations, beginning with the landmark 1989 Environmental Protection Law, which laid the foundation for environmental governance. Notably, in 2015, China implemented the New Environmental Protection Law (NEPL), surpassing its predecessor by emphasizing information sharing, public engagement, and imposing more stringent sanctions. The NEPL marked a significant shift towards environmental order and surpassed other incentive-based regulatory approaches. In April 2019, China's National Development and Reform Commission and the Ministry of Science and Technology proposed the establishment of a market-oriented green technology innovation system, further aligning the country with sustainable practices. The NEPL's comprehensive scope and guidelines make it a robust framework for

⁶⁹ Rucitarahma Ristiawan and Guillaume Tiberghien, "A Critical Assessment of Community-Based Tourism Practices in Nglanggeran Ecotourism Village, Indonesia," *Journal of Indonesian Tourism and Development Studies* 9, No. 1 (February 2021): 26–37.

environmental regulation, surpassing alternative strategies. Substantiated by compelling evidence, the NEPL has demonstrated its capacity to stimulate green innovation. Furthermore, financial literacy emerges as a crucial factor influencing investor behavior in the context of these regulations. Investors considering environmentally responsible investments may be influenced by their level of financial literacy, impacting their tolerance for financial risks. A micro-mechanism analysis reveals that companies in high-pollution industries can alleviate financial constraints posed by the NEPL through increased investment in green innovation, showcasing the law's potential to drive positive change in the business landscape.⁷⁰

Chinese Law Environmental laws have several reasons. Environmental crimes have increased as China's laws and penalties have strengthened. China's industrial structure hasn't improved despite rapid economic growth. China faces the most environmental strain due to its large annual pollution and anticipated backward production potential.⁷¹ China's regulation is urgent and China's Environmental Code is rare. Chinese socialism has entered a new age after 40 years of rapid progress through reform and opening up. China's environmental laws make a good Environmental Code. Since the reform and opening up, China's environmental protection laws, administrative regulations, and guidelines have grown to hundreds, covering all sectors of the environmental movement. China's Environmental Code conceals. International expertise and academic research back it. China's ecological code can draw from several countries' codifications.⁷²

⁷⁰ Wen Chen and Ying Wu, "China's New Environmental Protection Law and Green Innovation: Evidence from Prefecture-Level Cities," *Complexity* 2021 (2021).

⁷¹ Michael Greenstone et al., "China's War on Pollution: Evidence from the First Five Years," *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 2021.

⁷² Kai Xu & Guangdong Tian, "Codification and Prospect of China's Codification of Environmental Law from the Perspective of Global Environmental Governance" *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 19, No. 16 (2022).

China promotes tourism. Tourist governance is complicated globally so local governments and other administrative divisions were founded by the Chinese government in 2018. The Ministry of Culture and Tourism (MTC) had full authority to negotiate, bargain, exchange, and create harmonious cultural and tourism policies. As travelers, facilities, and activities increase, tourism-driven economies struggle. Sustainable development should not replace beauty in the tourism business. The General Office of the State Council of China issued "The Outline for National Tourism and Leisure (2013-2020)" in 2013 to promote tourism while conserving the environment, society, and population.⁷³ National Tourism and Leisure, SDGs, and design methods are described. The Chinese government recognized tourism's potential to help accomplish sustainable development goals in the future. The Chinese government's environmental and inequality efforts are commendable. Most "sustainable policies" address design issues; therefore, examining them emphasizes design's importance⁷⁴ of China Ecotourism's Justification. China has many challenges promoting ecotourism. China's problem is rural development and ecotourism. Chinese issues include thousands of eco-rural tourist destinations. Many tourist destinations blindly follow development. Most rural ecotourism destinations in China need brand awareness and design scenic support facilities. China's rural ecotourism destinations need more environmental awareness and Inheritance of Local Cultural Heritage.⁷⁵ China's tourism economy and eco-environmental stress reveal geographical level variations and weak agglomeration features, creating regional imbalance. Eastern tourism economic development is higher than in

⁷³ Chen Haibo et al., "Tourism and Sustainable Development in China: A Review," *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 27, No. 31 (2020): 39077–93.

⁷⁴ Emanuele Giorgi et al., "Sustainability and Effectiveness of Chinese Outline for National Tourism and Leisure," *Sustainability* 12, No. 3 (2020): 1–30.

⁷⁵ Wang Rui, Xu Menglin, and Fang Yiliang, "A Review of the Design and Enhancement of Pastoral Culture Creativity in Chinese Rural Ecotourism," *Applied Mathematics and Nonlinear Sciences* 2022 (2023): 1–9.

central and western areas; Most provinces needed to optimize decoupling in space under local policy orientation and regional economic development limits, therefore decoupling was always unsustainable and unsatisfactory.⁷⁶ Domestic tourism is the primary contributor to tourism development in China; therefore, destination marketing strategies in low-carbon areas may choose to emphasize domestic demand.⁷⁷

Ecotourism complements green economics. A green economy boosted economic growth. Well-managed ecotourism destinations may balance business growth and environmental sustainability. Tourism-environment conundrum indicates both must thrive to survive. Tourists' careless behavior hurts the ecology and bio-ecosystem. Ecotourism is commercially, ecologically, and socially sustainable. Socio-culturally unacceptable ecotourism damages residents.⁷⁸ 14th Five-Year Plan (2021–2035) includes a tourism sector-specific development plan. In addition, the country has had successful ecotourism experiences (e.g., Kanas Lake, Mount Kawa Karpo, Changqing National Nature Reserve, and Changbai Mountains) over the past decade, which is insufficient given China's vast geographical area. Endogenizing ecotourism culture is China's golden policy for promoting environmentally friendly tourism.⁷⁹

Impact ecotourism appeared regulation new environment. Coal mining and arid temperatures with poor upkeep destroy the environment, making tourism more harmful than beneficial. Tourism,

⁷⁶ Xiaohua Qin and Xing Ming Li, "Article Evaluate on the Decoupling of Tourism Economic Development and Ecological-Environmental Stress in China," *Sustainability* 13, No. 4 (2021): 1–20.

⁷⁷ Yu Teng, Adam Cox, and Ioannis Chatziantoniou, "Environmental Degradation, Economic Growth and Tourism Development in Chinese Regions," *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 28, No. 26 (2021): 33781–93.

⁷⁸ Baloch et al., "Impact of Tourism Development upon Environmental Sustainability: A Suggested Framework for Sustainable Ecotourism."

⁷⁹ Yuan Chen, Jie Zhang, and Hui Chen, "An Economic Analysis of Sustainable Tourism Development in China," *Economic Change and Restructuring*, No. 0123456789 (2023),.

one of the world's major industries, hurts the environment, especially during peak seasons. Tourism is interesting, so China should continue its tourism sector countermeasures, such as expanding bio-energy, energy-saving vehicles for transport, pollution tax, green innovation technology, etc. Trade's environmental impact should be highlighted, and if necessary, significant laws and restrictions should be adopted to mitigate it.⁸⁰ Environmental measures lowered tourism carbon emissions. China's tourism industry's carbon emissions are regulated. Supervisory management-based environmental regulation mainly influenced tourism carbon emissions, followed by market incentives, command, and control. Tourism industry carbon emissions were regulated regionally. Command, supervision, market incentives, and public participation affected eastern China's tourism carbon emissions. Public environmental regulation discourages. Carbon emission reduction and tourism carbon emission monitoring should involve the public.⁸¹

China's green industry is affected by regulation. Input–output efficiency is negative for industrial GTFP and advanced industrial greening. China must boost GTFP for sustainable growth. Taxation, emissions trading, and other market mechanisms help governments manage the environment. These environmental regulations will pass society's environmental consumption cost to the production firm, shrink its production border to society's ideal production boundary, internalize external problems, and reduce pollution.⁸² Moderate

⁸⁰ Shengdong Zhu et al., “Environmental Impact of the Tourism Industry in China: Analyses Based on Multiple Environmental Factors Using Novel Quantile Autoregressive Distributed Lag Model,” *Economic Research–Ekonomika Istrazivanja* 35, No. 1 (2022): 3663–89.

⁸¹ Qiao Chen, Yan Mao, and Alastair M. Morrison, “Impacts of Environmental Regulations on Tourism Carbon Emissions,” *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 18, No. 23 (2021).

⁸² Guihuan Yan, Liming Jiang, and Chongqing Xu, “How Environmental Regulation Affects Industrial Green Total Factor Productivity in China: The Role of Internal and External Channels,” *Sustainability* 14, No. 20 (2022).

environmental legislation can internalize business pollution and stimulate innovation. The enterprise's strategy and environmental policies determine its impact on innovation. Industrial businesses' environmental responsibility boosts green technology. Manufacturing companies' principal response to environmental laws and regulations, corporate environmental responsibility, has spurred green technology innovation.⁸³

The conclusion is that green tourism regulations in China have several new codes to improve and absorb potential tourism without sacrificing the sustainable development environment in China regulation to improve ecotourism, like tourism subsidies. Resident tourism subsidies boost tertiary industry output and drive out secondary industry output, enhancing national economic growth. Resident tourism subsidies can also help the fair transition by attracting workers from high-energy-consumption industries to the service sector. Resident tourism subsidies will dramatically reduce emissions.⁸⁴

CONCLUSION

Indonesia's regulatory framework for green economy tourism is governed by several legal policies, including Law No. 10 of 2009 on Tourism, the Government Regulation (PP) outlining the National Tourism Development Master Plan for 2010–2025, and the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism and Creative Economy addressing Hygiene, Health, Safety, and Environmental Sustainability Standards and Certification of the Tourism Sector during the Corona Virus Disease Pandemic in 2019. While these regulations underscore Indonesia's recognition of the importance of green tourism

⁸³ Yuanyang Wang et al., "Environmental Regulation, Environmental Responsibility, and Green Technology Innovation: Empirical Research from China," *PLoS ONE* 16, No. 9 September (2021): 1–21.

⁸⁴ Leyi Zheng et al., "The Impacts of China's Resident Tourism Subsidy Policy on the Economy and Air Pollution Emissions," *Sustainability* 15, No. 10 (2023): 1–16.

governance, there appears to be a challenge of partial effectiveness, with instances of overlap among them. In the realm of green tourism, it becomes evident that Indonesia may benefit from legal reform or, at the very least, regulatory simplification. The current scenario suggests a need for a more streamlined approach to address domestic issues comprehensively. Recognizing that sustainable tourism relies heavily on Indonesia's green tourism policies, the nation could explore avenues for enhancing the coherence and efficacy of its regulatory landscape. Drawing a parallel to China's approach, where the 1989 Old Environmental Protection Law was succeeded by the 2015 New Environmental Protection Law (NEPL), there is a deliberate effort to bolster green tourism regulations. China's strategy involves introducing new codes, such as tourism subsidies, aimed at improving and attracting potential tourists without compromising the country's commitment to sustainable development. Indonesia might consider similar measures to refine and fortify its green tourism regulations, ensuring a more effective and harmonized approach toward environmentally conscious tourism practices.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The authors would like to thank Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology for the granted supports 2023. This research was funded by Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology of the Republic of Indonesia 2023.

REFERENCES

Afifah, Ratih Nur, et al. "Ecotourism Development as a Community-Based Conservation Effort in Ayah Mangrove Forest, Kebumen, Central Java, Indonesia." *Asian Journal of Forestry* 7, No. 1 (2023): 37–44. <https://doi.org/10.13057/asianjfor/r070105>.

- Agustinus, Leo Jimmi, F. X. Adji Samekto, and Budi Ispriyarso. "Towards a Fairer Future: Examining Environmental Permits in Indonesia and Sweden Through the Lens of Sustainable Development and Equity." *Journal of Law and Sustainable Development* 11, No. 2 (July 2023): e284. <https://doi.org/10.55908/sdgs.v11i2.284>.
- Alvianna, Stella, Syarif Hidayatullah, Irary Windhyastiti, and Umu Khouruh. "The Role of Green Tourism Perception, Environmental Concern and Intention of Participation in Green Tourism on Environmentally Responsible Tourism Behavior." *Jurnal Manajemen Dan Kewirausahaan* 10, No. 1 (2022): 79–87. <https://doi.org/10.26905/jmdk.v10i1.8022>.
- Ariyanto, Ariyanto. "Green Tourism Management for Sustainable Tourism Development in the Age of Disruption." *Jurnal Multidisiplin Sahombu* 2, No. 1 (July 2022): 23–28. <https://doi.org/10.58471/jms.v2i1.394>.
- Aspan, Zulkifli, and Ahsan Yunus. "The Right to a Good and Healthy Environment: Revitalizing Green Constitution." In *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science* 343 (2019): 12067. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/343/1/012067>
- Bai, Xiao, Kuan Ting Wang, Trung Kien Tran, Muhammad Sadiq, Lam Minh Trung, and Khurshid Khudoykulov. "Measuring China's Green Economic Recovery and Energy Environment Sustainability: Econometric Analysis of Sustainable Development Goals." *Economic Analysis and Policy* 75 (September 2022): 768–79. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eap.2022.07.005>.
- Baloch, Qadar Bakhsh, Syed Naseeb Shah, Nadeem Iqbal, Muhammad Sheeraz, Muhammad Asadullah, Sourath Mahar, and Asia Umar Khan. "Impact of Tourism Development upon Environmental Sustainability: A Suggested Framework for Sustainable Ecotourism." *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 30, No. 3 (2023): 5917–30. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-022-22496-w>.
- Baumber, Alex, John Merson, and Chris Lockhart Smith. "Promoting Low-Carbon Tourism through Adaptive Regional Certification."

- Climate* 9, No. 1 (2021): 1–22. <https://doi.org/10.3390/cli9010015>.
- Budiarta, I Nyoman Putu, I Nyoman Gede Sugiarta, and A.A. Sagung Laksmi Dewi. "Environment Law-Based Rural Tourism Regulations in Bali." *Journal Equity of Law and Governance* 2, No. 1 (2022): 1–8. <https://doi.org/10.55637/elg.2.1.4158.1-8>.
- Chen, Qiao, Yan Mao, and Alastair M. Morrison. "Impacts of Environmental Regulations on Tourism Carbon Emissions." *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 18, No. 23 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph182312850>.
- Chen, Wen, and Ying Wu. "China's New Environmental Protection Law and Green Innovation: Evidence from Prefecture-Level Cities." *Complexity* 2021 (2021). <https://doi.org/10.1155/2021/5566357>.
- Chen, Yuan, Jie Zhang, and Hui Chen. "An Economic Analysis of Sustainable Tourism Development in China." *Economic Change and Restructuring*, No. 0123456789 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10644-023-09512-w>.
- Choi, Gayoung, Jongmin Kim, Made Yaya Sawitri, and Sue Kyoung Lee. "Ecotourism Market Segmentation in Bali, Indonesia: Opportunities for Implementing REDD+." *Land* 9, No. 6 (2020): 1–15. <https://doi.org/10.3390/LAND9060186>.
- Dahlan, Mohammad Zaini, Budi Faisal, Sofia Chaeriyah, Ina Winiastuti Hutriani, and Mira Amelia. "Review of Urban Greening Policy in Indonesia: A Case Study in Jakarta Province." *International Journal on Livable Space* 6, No. 1 (January 2023): 21–28. <https://doi.org/10.25105/livas.v6i1.10678>.
- Dewi, Anak Agung Sagung Laksmi, Mella Ismelina Farma Rahayu, and Anak Agung Ngurah Adhi Wibisana. "Green Tourism in Sustainable Tourism." *Jurnal Dinamika Hukum* 23, No. 1 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.20884/1.jdh>.
- Diaz-Iglesias, Susana, Alicia Blanco-Gonzalez, and Carmen Orden-Cruz. "Theoretical Framework for Sustainability, Corporate Social Responsibility and Change Management." *Journal of Sustainability Science and Management* 16, No. 6 (2021): 315–32. <https://doi.org/10.46754/jssm.2021.08.025>.

- Dwyer, Larry. "Tourism Contribution to the SDGs: Applying a Well-Being Lens." *European Journal of Tourism Research* 32, No. 2022 (2022): 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.54055/ejtr.v32i.2500>.
- Edgell, David L. "International Sustainable Tourism Policy." *The Brown Journal of World Affairs* 22, No. 1 (2015): 25–36.
- Fahmawee, Emad Al Dein Al, and Omar Jawabreh. "Sustainability of Green Tourism By International Tourists and Its Impact on Green Environmental Achievement: Petra Heritage, Jordan." *Geojournal of Tourism and Geosites* 46, No. 1 (2023): 27–36. <https://doi.org/10.30892/gtg.46103-997>.
- Fragidis, Garyfallos, Kyriakos Riskos, and Iordanis Kotzaivazolou. "Designing the Tourist Journey for the Advancement of Sustainable Tourist Practices." *Sustainability* 14, No. 15 (2022). <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14159778>.
- Giorgi, Emanuele, Tiziano Cattaneo, Minqing Ni, and Renata Enríquez Alatríste. "Sustainability and Effectiveness of Chinese Outline for National Tourism and Leisure." *Sustainability* 12, No. 3 (2020): 1–30. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su12031161>.
- Greenstone, Michael, Guojun He, Shanjun Li, and Eric Zou. "China's War on Pollution: Evidence from the First Five Years." *SSRN Electronic Journal*, 2021. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3764874>.
- Haibo, Chen, Emmanuel Caesar Ayamba, Thomas Bilaliib Udimal, Andrew Osei Agyemang, and Appiah Ruth. "Tourism and Sustainable Development in China: A Review." *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 27, No. 31 (2020): 39077–93. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-020-10016-7>.
- Hailiang, Zeng, Ka Yin Chau, and Muhammad Waqas. "Does Green Finance and Renewable Energy Promote Tourism for Sustainable Development: Empirical Evidence from China." *Renewable Energy* 207 (May 2023): 660–71. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.renene.2023.03.032>.
- Hakim, Aal Lukmanul. "Dissecting the Contents of Law in Indonesia on Halal Product Assurance." *Indonesia Law Review* 5, No. 1 (2015): 88–103. <https://doi.org/10.15742/ilrev.v5n1.135>
- Higgins-Desbiolles, Freya. "The 'War over Tourism': Challenges to

- Sustainable Tourism in the Tourism Academy after COVID-19." *Journal of Sustainable Tourism* 29, No. 4 (2020): 551–69. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09669582.2020.1803334>.
- Hu, Dianxi, Jianling Jiao, Yunshu Tang, Xiaofei Han, and Huaping Sun. "The Effect of Global Value Chain Position on Green Technology Innovation Efficiency: From the Perspective of Environmental Regulation." *Ecological Indicators* 121 (February 2021): 107195. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2020.107195>.
- Ilyas, Muh Nuh, I Putu Astawa, Gede Ginaya, and Ni Made Rai Erawati. "Application of Green Tourism in the Mount Rinjani National Park Area to Support Sustainable Tourism." *International Journal of Green Tourism Research and Applications* 4, No. 1 (June 2022): 16–22. <https://doi.org/10.31940/ijogtra.v4i1.16-22>.
- Indira Anggraini, Renny, and Budhi Gunawan. "Ecotourism Development in National Parks: A New Paradigm of Forest Management in Indonesia." *E3S Web of Conferences* 249 (2021): 1–5. <https://doi.org/10.1051/e3sconf/202124903010>.
- Iqbal, Iqbal, and Hilmi Rayhannafi. "Legal Politics toward Natural Energy: Natural Gas Utilization in Indonesia." *Journal of Sustainable Development and Regulatory Issues (JSDERI)* 1, No. 1 (2023): 25–30.
- KC, Birendra, Aditya Dhungana, and Tek B. Dangi. "Tourism and the Sustainable Development Goals: Stakeholders' Perspectives from Nepal." *Tourism Management Perspectives* 38 (2021): 100822. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tmp.2021.100822>.
- Khan, Mustafa Rehman, Haseeb Ur Rehman Khan, Chen Kim Lim, Kian Lam Tan, and Minhaz Farid Ahmed. "Sustainable Tourism Policy, Destination Management and Sustainable Tourism Development: A Moderated-Mediation Model." *Sustainability (Switzerland)* 13, No. 21 (2021): 1–22. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su132112156>.
- Krisnatalia, Heni, Nurdina Prasetyo, and Mochammad Ainan. "Creating A Green Tourism Experience Through Development of Tourism Package As A Tourism Destination Marketing Strategy:

- The Case of Kertayasa Tourism Village." *International Conference On Research And Development (ICORAD)* 1, No. 2 (December 2022): 217–23. <https://doi.org/10.47841/icorad.v1i2.40>.
- Laksmidewi, Cok Dian. "The Legal Implications of Signing the Unwto Framework Convention on Tourism Ethics for the Sustainable Tourism Development in Indonesia." *International Journal of Law Reconstruction* 6, No. 2 (2022): 197. <https://doi.org/10.26532/ijlr.v6i2.17685>.
- Li, Xiao Juan. "Green Innovation Behavior Toward Sustainable Tourism Development: A Dual Mediation Model." *Frontiers in Psychology* 13, No. June (2022): 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.930973>.
- Liu, Long, Zhichao Li, Xinyi Fu, Xuan Liu, Zehao Li, and Wenfeng Zheng. "Impact of Power on Uneven Development: Evaluating Built-Up Area Changes in Chengdu Based on NPP-VIIRS Images (2015–2019)." *Land* 11, No. 4 (March 2022): 489. <https://doi.org/10.3390/land11040489>.
- Liu, Qin, Ying Zhu, Weixin Yang, and Xueyu Wang. "Research on the Impact of Environmental Regulation on Green Technology Innovation from the Perspective of Regional Differences: A Quasi-Natural Experiment Based on China's New Environmental Protection Law." *Sustainability* 14, No. 3 (2022). <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14031714>.
- Markose, Nimi, Bindu Vazhakkatte Tazhathethil, and Babu George. "Sustainability Initiatives for Green Tourism Development: The Case of Wayanad, India." *Journal of Risk and Financial Management* 15, No. 2 (2022): 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.3390/jrfm15020052>.
- Marpaung, B O Y, Dwira Nirfalini Aulia, and Eric Witarsa. "Evaluation of Tourism Policies Towards Sustainable Development." *Journal of Politics and Law* 14, No. 4 (May 2021): 1. <https://doi.org/10.5539/jpl.v14n4p1>.
- Maruf, Arifin. "Legal Aspects of Environment in Indonesia: An Efforts to Prevent Environmental Damage and Pollution." *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System* 1, No. 1 (2021): 2807–12. <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v1i1.4>.

- Mihardja, Eli Jamilah, Sofia Alisjahbana, Prima Mulyasari Agustini, Deffi Ayu Puspito Sari, and T. S. Pardede. "Forest Wellness Tourism Destination Branding for Supporting Disaster Mitigation: A Case of Batur UNESCO Global Geopark, Bali." *International Journal of Geoheritage and Parks* 11, No. 1 (2023): 169–81. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijgeop.2023.01.003>.
- Mousavi, Roqaye. "The Role of Green Tourism as a Marketing at Destinations." *Journal of Tourism & Hospitality* 10, No. S5 (2021): 1–6. <https://doi.org/10.35248/2167-0269.21.s5.003>.
- Murhadi, Werner Ria, Fidelia Rahayu Kencanasar, and Bertha Silvia Sutedjo. "The Influence of Financial Literacy and Financial Interest on the Financial Risk Tolerance of Investor in Indonesia." *Journal of Law and Sustainable Development* 11, No. 2 (July 2023): e310. <https://doi.org/10.55908/sdgs.v11i2.310>.
- Nasution, R Hendrik, Ricky Avenzora, and Tutut Sunarminto. "Analisis Kebijakan Dan Peraturan Perundang-Undangan Ekowisata Di Indonesia." *Media Konservasi* 23, No. 1 (2018).
- Noor, Muhammad, Cahyadi Eko, and Dian Eka Rahmawati. "Proceedings of the International Conference on Sustainable Innovation on Humanities, Education, and Social Sciences (ICOSI-HESS 2022)." *Proceedings of the International Conference on Sustainable Innovation on Humanities, Education, and Social Sciences (ICOSI-HESS 2022)*, 2022, 416–26. <https://doi.org/10.2991/978-2-494069-65-7>.
- Nugroho, L. D., S. R. Melati, I. Wahyuliana, A. Pawestri, and L. F. Kurniawan. "Legal Policy of Implementation Green Economy in the Tourism Sector to Realize Sustainable Tourism and Environment." *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science* 1181 (2023). <https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/1181/1/012018>.
- Prihayati, Y., and T. O. Veriasa. "Developing Green Tourism to Create the Sustainable Landscape: Evidence from Community-Based Coffee Tourism (CbCT) in Puncak, Bogor, Indonesia." *IOP Conference Series: Earth and Environmental Science* 879 (October 2021): 012027. <https://doi.org/10.1088/1755-1315/879/1/012027>.

- Qin, Xiaohua, and Xing Ming Li. "Article Evaluate on the Decoupling of Tourism Economic Development and Ecological-Environmental Stress in China." *Sustainability* 13, No. 4 (2021): 1–20. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su13042149>.
- Raihan, Asif, Said Ibrahim, and Dewan Ahmed Muhtasim. "Dynamic Impacts of Economic Growth, Energy Use, Tourism, and Agricultural Productivity on Carbon Dioxide Emissions in Egypt." *World Development Sustainability* 2 (June 2023): 100059. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.wds.2023.100059>.
- Raihan, Asif, and Almagul Tuspekova. "The Nexus between Economic Growth, Energy Use, Urbanization, Tourism, and Carbon Dioxide Emissions: New Insights from Singapore." *Sustainability Analytics and Modeling* 2 (2022): 100009. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.samod.2022.100009>.
- Raihan, Asif, Liton Chandra Voumik, Shohel Md. Nafi, and Bapon Chandra Kuri. "How Tourism Affects Women's Employment in Asian Countries: An Application of GMM and Quantile Regression." *Journal of Social Sciences and Management Studies* 1, No. 4 (December 2022): 57–72. <https://doi.org/10.56556/jssms.v1i4.335>.
- Ristiawan, Rucitarahma, and Guillaume Tiberghien. "A Critical Assessment of Community-Based Tourism Practices in Nglanggeran Ecotourism Village, Indonesia." *Journal of Indonesian Tourism and Development Studies* 9, No. 1 (February 2021): 26–37. <https://doi.org/10.21776/ub.jitode.2021.009.01.04>.
- Rokip, Abdul, Ni Gst Nym Suci Murni, Ni Putu Manik Prihatini, I Wayan Nurjaya, and I Dewa Gede Ari Pemayun. "Green Tourism Implementation to Create an Environmentally Friendly Accommodation." *Jurnal Bali Membangun Bali* 3, No. 2 (August 2022): 157–66. <https://doi.org/10.51172/jbmb.v3i2.233>.
- Rui, Wang, Xu Menglin, and Fang Yiliang. "A Review of the Design and Enhancement of Pastoral Culture Creativity in Chinese Rural Ecotourism." *Applied Mathematics and Nonlinear Sciences* 2022 (2023): 1–9. <https://doi.org/10.2478/amns.2021.2.00330>.
- Sari, Dwi Amalia, Chris Margules, Han She Lim, Febrio Widayatmaka,

- Jeffrey Sayer, Allan Dale, and Colin Macgregor. "Evaluating Policy Coherence: A Case Study of Peatland Forests on the Kampar Peninsula Landscape, Indonesia." *Land Use Policy* 105 (June 2021): 105396. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.landusepol.2021.105396>.
- Sarja, Ni Luh Ayu Kartika Yuniastari, I Putu Krisna Arta Widana, Putu Adi Suprpto, and Tyas Rahajeng Pamularsih. "Developing Green Tourism-Based Model of Information Technology Utilization in Tourism Villages." *International Journal of Applied Sciences in Tourism and Events* 5, No. 2 (December 2021): 153–65. <https://doi.org/10.31940/ijaste.v5i2.153-165>.
- Schönherr, Sarah, Mike Peters, and Kir Kuščer. "Sustainable Tourism Policies: From Crisis-Related Awareness to Agendas towards Measures." *Journal of Destination Marketing & Management* 27 (2023): 100762. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jdmm.2023.100762>.
- Scott, Daniel, and Stefan Gössling. "What Could the next 40 Years Hold for Global Tourism?" *Tourism Recreation Research* 40, No. 3 (2015): 269–85.
- Shang, Yunfeng, Yi Lian, Hui Chen, and Fangbin Qian. "The Impacts of Energy Resource and Tourism on Green Growth: Evidence from Asian Economies." *Resources Policy* 81 (March 2023): 103359. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.resourpol.2023.103359>.
- Shang, Yunfeng, Lingrou Zhu, Fangbin Qian, and Yani Xie. "Role of Green Finance in Renewable Energy Development in the Tourism Sector." *Renewable Energy* 206 (April 2023): 890–96. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.renene.2023.02.124>.
- Sipayung, Baren, Indah Dwiprigitaningtias, Rahmat Joko Nugroho, and Bartolomeus Bernard. "Environmental Law Enforcement In Indonesia in Terms of the Concept of Sustainable Development." *Jurnal Hukum dan HAM Wara Sains* 2, No. 03 (2023): 197–203. <https://doi.org/10.58812/jhhws.v2i03.253>.
- Sriyah, Lik, and Rudy Handoko L B Wirawan. "Overview of Public Policy in Improving Tourism at Kelapa Tuban Beach." *Public Policy and Administration Research* 11, No. 2 (2021): 31–36. <https://doi.org/10.7176/ppar/11-2-05>.

- Sudiarta, I Ketut, I Made Suwitra, and I Ngurah Suryawan. "Evaluation of the Implementation of Ecotourism Principles in the Operation of Diving Tourism in Bali, Indonesia." *International Journal of Research in Business and Social Science* 11, No. 4 (June 2022): 432–38. <https://doi.org/10.20525/ijrbs.v11i4.1803>.
- Sun, Yuhuan, Wangwang Ding, and Guangchun Yang. "Green Innovation Efficiency of China's Tourism Industry from the Perspective of Shared Inputs: Dynamic Evolution and Combination Improvement Paths." *Ecological Indicators* 138 (May 2022): 108824. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2022.108824>.
- Teng, Yu, Adam Cox, and Ioannis Chatziantoniou. "Environmental Degradation, Economic Growth and Tourism Development in Chinese Regions." *Environmental Science and Pollution Research* 28, No. 26 (2021): 33781–93. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-12567-9>.
- Toubes, Diego R., and Noelia Araújo-Vila. "A Review Research on Tourism in the Green Economy." *Economies* 10, No. 6 (2022). <https://doi.org/10.3390/economies10060137>.
- Tribe, John, and Brendan Paddison. "Critical Tourism Strategy." *Annals of Tourism Research* 98 (2023): 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.annals.2022.103511>.
- Wang, Yuanyang, Yanlin Yang, Chenyu Fu, Zengzeng Fan, and Xiaoping Zhou. "Environmental Regulation, Environmental Responsibility, and Green Technology Innovation: Empirical Research from China." *PLoS ONE* 16, No. 9 September (2021): 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0257670>.
- Xu, Kai, and Guangdong Tian. "Codification and Prospect of China's Codification of Environmental Law from the Perspective of Global Environmental Governance." *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health* 19, No. 16 (2022). <https://doi.org/10.3390/ijerph19169978>.
- Yan, Guihuan, Liming Jiang, and Chongqing Xu. "How Environmental Regulation Affects Industrial Green Total Factor Productivity in China: The Role of Internal and External Channels." *Sustainability* 14, No. 20 (2022).

<https://doi.org/10.3390/su142013500>.

- Yue, Xiao Guang, Yiyi Liao, Shiyong Zheng, Xuefeng Shao, and Jing Gao. "The Role of Green Innovation and Tourism towards Carbon Neutrality in Thailand: Evidence from Bootstrap ADRL Approach." *Journal of Environmental Management* 292 (August 2021): 112778. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2021.112778>.
- Yuedi, Huang, Victoria Sanagustín-Fons, Araceli Galiano Coronil, and J. A. Moseñe-Fierro. "Analysis of Tourism Sustainability Synthetic Indicators. A Case Study of Aragon." *Heliyon* 9, No. 4 (2023): 1–26. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2023.e15206>.
- Zaid, M, M. Musa, Fadhel Arjuna Adinda, and Lambertson Cait. "The Sanctions on Environmental Performances: An Assessment of Indonesia and Brazil Practice." *Journal of Human Rights, Culture and Legal System* 3, No. 2 (2023): 236–64. <https://doi.org/10.53955/jhcls.v3i2.70>.
- Zhang, Hanzhi, Qiang Liang, Yu Li, and Pengpeng Gao. "Promoting Eco-Tourism for the Green Economic Recovery in ASEAN." *Economic Change and Restructuring* 56, No. 3 (2023): 2021–36. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10644-023-09492-x>.
- Zhao, Linhai, Ka Yin Chau, Trung Kien Tran, Muhammad Sadiq, Nguyen Thi My Xuyen, and Thi Thu Hien Phan. "Enhancing Green Economic Recovery through Green Bonds Financing and Energy Efficiency Investments." *Economic Analysis and Policy* 76 (December 2022): 488–501.
- Zheng, Leyi, Junfeng Liu, Qiong Yang, Yuqing Wang, Ying Liu, Xiurong Hu, Jianying Hu, et al. "The Impacts of China's Resident Tourism Subsidy Policy on the Economy and Air Pollution Emissions." *Sustainability* 15, No. 10 (2023): 1–16. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su15108351>.
- Zhu, Shengdong, Yuting Luo, Noshaba Aziz, Abdul Jamal, and Qingyu Zhang. "Environmental Impact of the Tourism Industry in China: Analyses Based on Multiple Environmental Factors Using Novel Quantile Autoregressive Distributed Lag Model." *Economic Research-Ekonomika Istrazivanja* 35, No. 1 (2022): 3663–89. <https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2021.2002707>.

Declaration of Conflicting Statements

The author(s) stated that this work is original and has not been previously published in another journal or publication. The author(s) also declared that there is no conflict of interest in the publication of this article.

Funding Statement

This research was funded by Ministry of Education, Culture, Research and Technology of the Republic of Indonesia 2023.

Open Data Statement

All data and information in this article were available without any restriction

Reproducibility Statement

The author(s) stated that reproducibility of this article should be based on the Copyrights notice of this Journal under license a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International (CC BY-SA 4.0).