Type: Research Article

Intelligence Education for National Security and Public Safety Policy: A Comparative Analysis of Nigeria, South Africa, and Indonesia

Ngboawaji Daniel Nte[1] ✉, Vigo Agustine Teru[2], Nadiyah Melyliana Putri[3]

[1,2] Department of Intelligence and Security Studies, Novena University, Nigeria
[3] Faculty of Law, Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

✉ Corresponding email: profdnte@novenauniversity.edu.ng

Abstract *National security and public safet policy have become one of the important issues around the world. In some cases, the national security very close to how the State provides various instruments in maintaining national stability, including policies and laws. Nigeria, South Africa, and Indonesia are facing various challenges of national stability including various national security threats. For Nigeria, post-colonial hangs over and extended militarism created huge challenges for the democratisation of intelligence education and training, while in South Africa, centuries of repressive apartheid regime created institutional obstacles for a virile democratic intelligence education and training. This work therefore is a comparative analysis of intelligence education and training in Africa-Nigeria, South Africa, and Indonesia. Using a historiographic and content evaluative methods, the study was able to establish similar developmental trajectory of intelligence education and training in Nigeria, South Africa, and Indonesia and recommended the urgent need for extensive collaboration between the countries to develop*

a model of intelligence education and training to attenuate the pervasive national security and public safety threats challenges in the countries.

Keywords Intelligence Education, National Security, Public Safety Policy, National Resilience

1. Introduction

Post -cold war and the collapse of stringent political economic ideological leanings in the East created series of political transitions across the globe by allies and peripheral states. The transitions from militarism to liberal democracies, from repression to responsible governance and racist regimes to neo-liberal democratic templates all called for the adjustments in intelligence management in post-modern world. Part of this imperative reality underscores the sweeping global changes as the new normal. Most brutal regimes were quick to attempt some adjustments bearing the toga of liberalism, accountability and responsive governance reflective of the democratic dictates of the 20th and 21st centuries.

Arising from the above was the need to liberalise security albeit intelligence education. However, the harrowing events of September 11, 2001, accentuated the need to expand the frontiers of collective security and liberalisation of intelligence education. This is in admission of the involvement of the academia in this intricate trade and to further demonstrate democratic penetration in the United States. As the leader of the so-called free world, other countries queued in as part of the global effort to confront the menace of terror and public safety threats. While September 11 redefined the quest for liberalisation of intelligence education in colleges and universities in the United States, Nigeria's need for intelligence education emerged essentially by a combination of both external and internal factors. As part of the global community, the reverberations of global security

threats, the rise of extremism and threats by non-state actors, domestic terrorism, insurgency, banditry, Kidnappings and Hostage takings have all created magnified insecurity in the country culminating into national legislative response to introduce and manage intelligence and security studies in Nigerian universities. For the Republic of South Africa, the long history of centuries of brutal apartheid regime and fierce resistance of the majority back populace created severe public safety and security problems. The eventual collapse of apartheid and the emergence of black majority rule created the urgent need for greater security intelligence awareness, liberalisation of national intelligence and extensive intelligence reforms to accommodate the new political realities of the new South Africa. Needless to say, that the country is enmeshed in the quagmire of existential internal security threats and therefore the need to expand the frontiers of intelligence education in South Africa.[1]

Generally speaking, the role of education for the holistic wellbeing of humans, no matter the race, colour or language cannot be overemphasised. Education has been progressively so useful from the Stone Age till the current 21st Century and will continue to be so. In both developed and developing countries, institutions of learning have crystallised and made an upscale in their educational system/curriculum specifically on varigated research and developments (R&Ds) with various day-to-day improvements in technology needed in a largely dynamic world. Nations all over the world at different levels of development have relied

---

[1] Sandy Africa & Siyabulela Mlombile. "Transforming the intelligence Services: Some reflections on the South African experience." *Project on Justice in Times of Transition* (John F. Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University, 15 October 2001). Available online at <http://www.law.harvard.edu/programs/criminal-justice/south-africa.pdf>; Sandy Africa & Johnny Kwadjo, *Changing Intelligence Dynamics in Africa* (Global Facilitation Network for Security Sector Reform, University of Birmingham, UK, 2009). Available online at < http://epapers.bham.ac.uk/1526/1/AfricaKwadjo_-2009-_IntelligenceAfrica.pdf>

heavily on education as the pivot of societal progress and advancement. Interestingly, progress and advancement in post-modern world is predicated on peace, safety and security. However, the 21st century global security and safety realities present a frightening scenario dominated by monumental threats from non-state actors, criminals and the reign of terror. This necessitated the need to expand the frontiers of education via the liberalisation of intelligence education within the ambit of collective security.

Intelligence practices among nations/states or within nations/states are specific and aligned with the dictates of the type of political system, ideology and culture as regards to the views bothering such nation/state on national threats. Considering the progressive nature of today's world as it relates to the scale of crime, intelligence education in Nigeria is pseudo-quasi compared to other developed and developing countries such as South Africa. Looking at the scale of crime in Africa for instance in Nigeria where terrorism, cybercrime, kidnapping, small and light weapons trafficking (SALW), human and organ trafficking, including unresolved murder cases and trans-border crimes have represented a considerable challenge to law enforcement agencies, the military and the government respectively.[2] With so much day-to-day communication and

---

[2] Ryan Shaffer, *Internal Security Management in Nigeria: Perspectives, Challenges and Lessons* (New York, Palgrave Macmillan, 2019); E. O. Igwe, "Nigerian Borders and the Application of Forensic Intelligence: Issues, Challenges and Prospects", *Postgraduate Diploma Project*, (Novena University, Ogume, 2018); E. O. Igwe, "Biometric Fingerprint Investigation and Crime Management in Nigeria: A Case Study of Nigeria Immigration Service (NIS), Bayelsa State", *Thesis* (Novena University, Ogume, 2019); Ngboawaji Danielt Nte, "Kidnapping, Hostage Taking and National Security Threats in Nigeria: A Synopsis". *Mustang Journal of Business and Ethics 2*, No. 1 (2011): 21-32; Ngboawaji Daniel Nte, "The Changing patterns of Small and Light Weapons (SALW) Proliferation and the Challenges of National Security in Nigeria". *Bangladesh e-Journal of Sociology 1*, No. 1 (2011): 5-23. *See also* Ngboawaji Daniel Nte Urowayinor Kelita Esq, Bribena Kelvin Enokie, and Onyeka Bienose, "Cyber Crime Management Among

commercial activities taking place via the Internet (IoT), various threats keep increasing, targeting the sovereignty of Nigeria as a nation for instance, its citizens, businesses and government agencies rapidly through communication gadgets.

Post-Apartheid South Africa is not left out in the insecurity and public safety debacle characterised by exponential crime rates manifesting in contact crimes (attempted murder and sexual offences, common assault and robbery), contact-related crimes (arson and malicious injury to property), other serious crimes (shop-lifting, aggravated robbery such as hijackings, robbery at residences and banks) and crimes detected as a result of police action or active policing (road blocks and raids involving possession of illegal possessions of firearms) and these were also security issues affecting the territories of South Africa.[3] The crime rate within the South African territory demanded the use of intelligence-led policing to deal with the challenges of high and violent crimes through crime prevention and crime intelligence practice. This therefore gave light to the establishment of Crime Intelligence Academy in Pretoria by the South African Police Services for an ambient training for its members working within that field.[4]

According to Isa and Nte (2019) intelligence education, though being considered quite as a new field of intellectual inquiry and scholarly debate; studies

---

Students". *JILS (Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies)* 5, No. 2 (2020): 295-334. https://doi.org/10.15294/jils.v5i2.34005; Ucheawaji Nathaniel Nte, Ngboawaji Daniel Nte, Bribena Enokie, and Onyeka Bienose, "DNA Profiling and the Challenges of Crime Management in Nigeria: The Case of The Nigeria Police Force". *JILS (Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies)* 4, No. 2 (2019): 189-216. https://doi.org/10.15294/jils.v4i2.29446.

[3] BusinessTech, "South Africas crime stats for the first three months of 2021 - everything you need to know", *Online* (May 14, 2021) Retrieved online from. <https://businesstech.co.za/news/government/490627/south-africas-crime-stats-for-the-first-three-months-of-2021-everything-you-need-to-know/>

[4] M. A. Van den Berg, "Nexus between Intelligence Education and Intelligence Training: A South African Perspective". *Journal of Strategic Studies 8*, No. 3 (2015): 162-172.

in intelligence is indeed a stimulating discipline having high potential reliance for future development; in Nigeria, studies in intelligence education became imperative from various stakeholders calls via conferences and seminars with a motion adopted for need for the introduction of security and intelligence in higher institutions of learning by a member of the House of Representatives tilted: "Urgent Need to Introduce Security and Intelligence Studies in Nigerian Institutions of Higher Learning". He further stated that a member of the House of Representative opined that the Nigerian tertiary institutions especially the universities' curriculum lack security and intelligence studies components even in the face of contemporary national security and public safety challenges. Consequently, the national assembly mandated the Committee on Education of House of Representative to ensure the introduction of intelligence and security studies as an academic programme in higher institutions of learning across the country.

In the Republic of South Africa, the establishment of intelligence studies within the civilian educational setting was initially slow; and most employments were solely given to experienced military and police officers within their ranks. It was observed, that though the South African Defence Force (SADF) was the only indigenous military institution with the monopoly of command and control of intelligence education and training within the Division of Military Intelligence (DMI), there were extensive foreign training of officers sent to Britain, France, Germany and America and later deployed to a Military Intelligence College establishment within the Radcliff Observatory at Fort Klapperkop, Pretoria where intelligence training is conducted.[5]

Furthermore, in Indonesia context, national resilience and security is recognized as a condition of the dynamics of the nation in the form of resilience in

---

[5]   Van den Berg.

seeking resilience, and national strength in facing all forms of challenges, obstacles, and threats both from within and outside, directly and indirectly that threaten the integrity and also the survival of the nation and state. National security is not only about state military issues, but also touches on aspects of religion, economy, socio-culture, politics and so on. All matters relating to national security have become one of the issues that require systematic and comprehensive control in all aspects of life.[6]

The 1945 Constitution of Republic of Indonesia expressly stipulates the obligation of citizens to participate in efforts to defend the country. This is stated in Article 27 paragraph 3 of the 1945 Constitution which reads, every citizen has the right and is obliged to participate in efforts to defend the country.[7] In addition, it is further regulated in Article 9 paragraphs (1) and (2) of Law Number 3 of 2002 concerning National Defense which states that efforts to defend the country can be realized through several systems of implementing national defense, either through education, community, and scope of work.[8]

2. Method

The study adopted historical design which is qualitative and explorative in nature to ascertain and examine whether intelligence education and its pursuit academically in non-military institutions of learning contributes beneficially to

---

[6] Udin Sarifudin Winataputra, Dasim Budimansyah, Sapriya Sapriya, and Winarno Winarno, *Buku Ajar Mata Kuliah Umum Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan*, (Direktorat Jenderal Pembelajaran dan KemahasiswaanKementerian Riset, Teknologi, dan Pendidikan TinggiRepublik Indonesia, Jakarta, 2016).

[7] Republic of Indonesia, "Undang Undang Dasar Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 1945", *The 1945 Constitution of Republic of Indonesia*.

[8] Republic of Indonesia, "Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 3 Tahun 2002 Tentang Pertahanan Negara", *Law Number 3 of 2002 concerning National Defence*.

national security policies, economic and developmental objectives of Nigeria, South Africa, and Indonesia respectively. Consequently, the research tries to ascertain if there are common challenges and hindrances in the pursuit of intelligence education in Nigeria, South Africa, and Indonesia. The work collected literatures on intelligence education in a logical and systematic manner from online databases based on specific inclusion criteria. This is to make for coherence and substantial objectivity expected of most social science research enterprise. In other words, the study relied extensively on secondary sources of data, such as textbooks, journal articles, magazines, newspapers, official documents, and internet materials as sources of data for analysis.

3. Result & Discussion

A. National Security and Intelligence Education: Various Theories and Practices in the 21st Century

Scholars believe that lack of intelligence education within a polity can significantly contribute to national security threat. This argument is hinged on the supposition that public service providers, public/civil servants, policy makers and indeed political consultants who received education in civil universities could have twisted intelligence perception which can impede intelligence –led policy decisions and ultimately national security.

According to Cristescu, it is well known that only an adequate intelligence can guarantee the success of decision and policy making; governmental policy makers shall be able to make relevant internal political or diplomatic intercessions, only if they assimilate the information regarding the global security and political context and try to adapt it to the strategic situation, risks, threatening or existent opportunities. The liberalisation of intelligence education will therefore engender

public trust and remove security apathy and consolidate high level intellectual development needed to evaluate complex national security issues, and this can only be achieved in civil universities.[9]

While it is axiomatic to emphasise a cooperative relationship between the intelligence community and the academia in Africa, it is instructive to review such attempts in Europe where the template incorporates the setting up of independent open-source reservoir. This will be mutually beneficial to the intelligence community by supplementing internal analysis and the academia by encouraging the inclusion of intelligence content in teaching in the social sciences and ultimately stimulate collective interest in nexus between intelligence and statecraft in contemporary world. Secondly, it will liberalise collective security and dialogues within the intelligence and security sector thirdly, social scientists will be able to test security and intelligence laden theories with adequate analytical discourses by scholars and policy makers (Bowmann, 2008).

In the same vein, intelligence education will in no small measure help in developing intelligence paradigms over time in line with the dynamics of the emerging discipline. This can be achieved via the application of analytical methodologies available in the social science research domain to understand the intricacies of the nature and dynamics of intelligence including structure, history, successes and failures.[10] This will provide the basis for critical evaluation of the

---

[9]   Claudia Cristescu, "Intelligence Studies in Higher Education. Designing an Intelligence Studies Curriculum for the Romanian Civilian Universities", *TOJNED: The Online Journal of New Horizons in Education* 1, No. 1 (2011): 1-43. https://www.tojsat.net/journals/tojned/volumes/tojned-volume01-i01.pdf#page=5

[10] Loch K. Johnson, ed. *Handbook of Intelligence Studies*. Vol. 1. (London, Routledge, 2007). *See also* Robert J. Sternberg, and Scott Barry Kaufman, eds. *The Cambridge Handbook of Intelligence*. (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2011).

body of knowledge and upgrade analytical skills that can match the ever-mutating security threats.

In the further context, it is incumbent on the government to ensure that the citizens are safe and protected from both external and internal security threats. Within the spheres of national security intelligence, states including Nigeria and the Republic of South Africa have institutional intelligence communities design to counter espionage, terror, and subversion from within and without. Most time separate agencies are created to handle external and internal threats. However, for a heavily networked 21st century efforts are geared towards interagency collaboration and fusion of intelligence management operations with the ultimate goal of ensuring national security and public safety. At the level of law enforcement intelligence, using the police involves using intelligence acquired in protecting the citizens against any internal violence while that of the military is protecting the citizens and the nation against external aggression. The Nigerian insecurity situation is one that have posed a very serious threat to the national and international community. Nigeria is no longer a new name in the media as regards to insecurity especially in contemporary times.

Nigeria has quite a high incidence of heinous criminal activities such as sales of arms and its trafficking, cross-border illegal movements, money laundering, auto theft/hijack, burglary, contrabands shipment, biohazardous substances and the increase in cybercrime activities. These challenges have in one way or the other affected the economy of the nations and its development in such a way that it has created a lacuna in the day-to-day activities of the law enforcement agencies and can be attributed to a lack of proper intelligence education.[11]

---

[11] E. O. Igwe, 2018. *See also* Ngboawaji Daniel, Paul Eke, and Kinikanwo Anele. "Rural Intelligence Gathering and the Challenges of Counter Insurgency: Views from the Niger Delta." *Bangladesh e-Journal of Sociology* 7, No. 1 (2010): 21-32; C. Obi, and U. Nwachukwu,

The quest for a functional intelligence education in South Africa and Nigeria began with a radical push to expand the scope of issue -based education and to accommodate the dynamics of liberal democratic penetration and collective security ethos. In the same vein, just like other countries in Africa, Nigerian push for intelligence education in non-military universities encapsulated a rather 'brutal' reformation and generalist approach with links to several departmental fields such as law, technology, sociology, and psychology. This is to provide a veritable platform for a good governance, better reformation of law enforcement and tackling security challenges using appropriate human resource and technologies within a complex social system. In the case of the Republic of South Africa, the government is not only rejigging its security architecture but very much interested in expanding the scope of intelligence management to include using technology such as Artificial intelligence (AI) to mitigate national security threats. Indeed, this has equally elevated the glaring importance of intelligence education to South African citizens in the areas of job creation and social protection, economic development and by extension good governance. Conversely the information technological penetration in Nigeria remains largely low and undermines that aspect of intelligence education as it affects cyber security, data mining, big data analysis and the entire gamut of Internet of Things (IoT) in intelligence and national security management.

Africa's drive for a virile intelligence education appears to be stalled by the challenges of governance and inconsistences in statecraft. The result is the poor run noticeable in murky and ineffectual counter terrorism/insurgency efforts

---

"Intelligence Failure and Insecurity in Nigeria: A Challenge to Development". *Proceedings of the International Conference on Sustainable Development*, *University of Abuja 8*, No. 6 (2011): 162-171; Ogbonnaya O. Onovo, "Intra-agency Intelligence Gathering and Sharing for Effective Crime Control: Perspective from the Police", in *Crime and Policing in Nigeria: Challenges and Options*, by E.E.O. Alemike, and I.C. Chukwuma, eds. (Lagos, Cleen Foundation, 2004).

across the continent and Nigeria in particular. For the Republic of South Africa, the trend is largely the same, high crime rates and public safety threats are rampant in the face of seemingly large budgetary allocations. While these observations are not peculiar to just the continent and the two countries under review, the facts remain that much more is achievable given a sustainable intelligence education template for Africa and Asia. What is therefore needful is the political will and commitment to design, implement and sustain a template on the continent and Nigeria, South Africa, and Indonesia in particular.

B. Intelligence Education in Africa: Nigeria versus South Africa

Decades ago, insecurity graduated from criminal gangs (gangsterism) or street urchins, which metamorphosed into armed robbery groups, violent election thugs, and other thugs involved in land disputes causing chaos amongst two neighbouring communities of inter and intra states. Today we are faced with the impregnable threats of non-state actors, insurgencies, domestic and international terrorism, urban crime, financial crimes and many other public safety and national security threats. These security challenges though not in the same measure apply to Nigeria and the Republic of South Africa. More so, the apparent challenges of governance and the intractable stunted democratic growth on the continent seems to have greatly undermined human security in ways that have exacerbated national insecurity in both countries alike.

Consequently, this study seeks to provide answers on history of intelligence education in the two countries, its educational impact and how can it mitigate security challenges within Nigeria and South Africa especially in the 21st Century. The essence of this historical evaluation to provide a comparative template to assess the evolution and dynamics of intelligence education in Africa's two largest economies-Nigeria and South Africa. More so, it will further stimulate academic

discourses that will provide veritable policy thrusts that will sustain African brand of intelligence education.

In Nigeria, education systems development has not been quite an easy task towards implementing programmes such as intelligence education in its various institutions of learning. This might be as a result of backdrop or poor implementation of the educational system by the British colonial masters. According to Etim[12] the consequence of this backdrop in Nigeria education system is as a result of Nigeria changing its concepts to the European concepts of education, this formation surrounded the change. The British started a new system rather than transplanting the system in which Etim observed to be as a result of short-term leadership which did not last long and gave the nation independence suddenly thus creating a poor or inadequate preparation to start or cope and that includes financially. And therefore, the British were comparing various countries to which they colonized and their educational growth if there were successes and failures, and this made them reluctant to educate the Nigerian child and also discouraged in school building while the one they built involved collection of bribery and all underhanded to discourage interested individuals. The aforesaid historical challenge is worsened by the nebulous nature of security albeit intelligence education. Where liberal education is difficult to be extricated from the colonial vestiges, intelligence education suffers more from the fall out of neo-colonial claws and institutional and primordial biases aimed at protecting the status quo.

While there is centralization or nationally direct system of education system in South Africa. With the control of vocational and technical education and special

---

[12] James Edem Etim, "A Comparison of education systems in Nigeria and the United States of America" (1976). *Dissertations and Theses*. Paper 2275 Portland State University. https://doi.org/10.15760/etd.2272

schools centralized at national level through a government department, and that includes the provincial systems at the provincial level. Historically, Apartheid South Africa by 1910 has had the four self-governed colonies which had its own system of education, and its own ideas came together to form the Union of South Africa where the provincial system became basis of the legislative pattern. This political and economic arrangement shaped the educational system based on racial segregation of the apartheid regime.[13] The trend is so institutionalised that present realities reflect this in many ways.

According to an Amnesty report, the South African education system perpetuates inequality and as a result have failed many children, characterized by crumbling infrastructure, overcrowded classrooms and relatively poor educational outcomes.[14] It further highlights that South Africa has one of the most unequal school systems in the world and there is the need for the government to address various endemic failings in the system by complying with both its own constitutional and international human rights obligations with respect to education.

Regarding early developments on intelligence education and training in South Africa. The Dutch East India Company in 1786 established a training centre for military cadets (*Militaire Kweckschool*), to improve military knowledge and qualify military leaders. Though, the school did not reach the stage where it functioned properly nor focussed on any intelligence related training and closed soon afterwards. In 1910 and 1912 there was also the establishment of a military

---

[13] R. G. MacMillan, Education and a Centralization Policy in South Africa. *Symposium* (1960): 55-74. https://www.core.ac.uk/reader/188771430

[14] Amnesty International, "South Africa: Broken and unequal education perpetuating poverty and inequality", *Online Report*, 2020. Retrieved from <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2020/02/south-africa-broken-and-unequal-education-perpetuating-poverty-and-inequality/>

college in the South African Military School at the Old Presidency in Bloemfontein. Though this institution was not similar to military college as those in several parts of the world following the outbreak of the First World War, was closed and later re-established in 1920 as South African Military School. Initially, intelligence training in the early years of statutory intelligence took place under the auspices of the British Military Intelligence structures, this indeed continued from 1910 to the South African declaration as an independent republic in 1961.

According to van den Berg (2015) intelligence education and training was under the command and control of the then Military Intelligence that is within the former South African Defence Force (SADF). Several officers were sent abroad (America, Britain, France, and Germany) respectively on course after the establishment of the Division Military Intelligence in 1961. There was deployment of Division Military Intelligence (DMI) during 1975 to the Radcliff Observatory at Fort Klapperkop – Pretoria where Military owned Intelligence College was located which conducts intelligence training. The Army later established a specific intelligence corps in the year 1980 and subsequently an intelligence school in Kimberly in the same base as the Danie Theron Combat School, which was established in 1968 and a training wing called Eleventh Commando, established in 1973 later was disbanded in 1982.

The South African Intelligence School were provided training in collection, security, communications, and counterintelligence to military personnel the same year it was established. On the aspect of the South African Police Services, it received less, or no specific intelligence training attention compared to practices within the military environment; notwithstanding the detective branch of the police took part in experiencing the first established statutory intelligence service in South Africa and as van den Berg[15] puts it that there is very limited information

---

[15] M. A. Van den Berg, 2015.

available regarding intelligence related training. And the aspect of establishing intelligence training structures within the civilian intelligence in South Africa was totally slow and therefore intelligence training focused on intelligence tradecraft and was seemingly restricted only to members of National Intelligence Service (NIS). Though, as argued and observed by Mc Carthy[16], the initial focus within the civilian intelligence were solely on intelligence collection and investigation purposes having little or no focus on academic insight or scientific analysis and also that the practice of the former NIS was recruitment of graduates from various South African universities.[17]

With the introduction of National Qualification Framework (NQF) that is similar to various countries in the world, which aided the formation of the Department of Basic Education (DBE) splitting into two (i) Depart of Basic Education responsible for primary and secondary education while (ii) Department of Higher Education and Training serves the responsibility of higher diplomas to doctoral degrees respectively. It could be said that intelligence education changed strategically following the aftermath of democratic elections that took place in 1994, intelligence training of South African internal service (NIA) and external service (SASS) were mainly obtained from the Intelligence Academy later inaugurated to SANAI as an independent training institute after restructuring in 2003 under the Intelligence Ministry.

With the establishment of South African Qualification Authority (SAQA) to oversee various developments and implement the National Qualification Framework (NQF) activities, intelligence training and education became a limelight (van den Berg, 2015). It is an observable challenge that the South African

---

[16] J. P. McCarthy, "Commanding joint and coalition operations". *Naval War College Review 46,* No. 1 (1993): 9-21.

[17] M. A. Van den Berg, 2015.

educational system could not provide core intelligence education except the intelligence training that is only restricted only to SAQA/NQF which offers certificates, national certificates and diplomas specifically to military intelligence, crime intelligence and civilian intelligence officers (intelligence community) and their provisions or outputs scale are limited entities; therefore this programme specifically centred on skills training rather than on intelligence education on a normative level.

Comparatively, intelligence education in Nigeria and South Africa has adequately shown that their acceptance and adaptations are quite different. Looking at the 21st Century world today, the Nigerian education is still faced with the likelihood of poor accessibility to sustainable development strategies as regards to the field of knowledge, technology, innovations, and development. There has been not much difference in the progress made so far in the Nigerian education system from its inception and now, this view is outlined in the sluggish funding, training, and adaptability to technology driven ideas required to improve its education intelligently. Some scholars are of the view that there is a retrogressive movement in terms of the philosophy and quality of education in Nigeria. If the philosophy of colonial education was to ensure dominance and sustenance of the imperial powers of Europe, Post –colonial education should therefore focus on liberation and sustainable development of Independent Africa as she heads to the post- modern-cum fourth industrial revolution. A cursory evaluation of African educational trajectory negates indices of progress and development. In addition to this, the intricate nature of the dynamics of intelligence education in a significantly multicultural, multiracial and ethno-religiously divided country like Nigeria and South Africa has impugned greatly the quality of intelligence education. This is because the core of the success of intelligence management is rooted essentially in national interest and unbridled

patriotism. Where this is lacking due to primordial and sectional interests, the intelligence educational knowledge so acquired will remain largely questionable. This is one of the banes of intelligence education in most transitional democracies in Africa and indeed Nigeria and the Republic of South Africa.

Security and public safety threats have significantly mutated and worsened in complexity in Africa. Criminal activities have embraced high technology and have become a sophisticated tool to orchestrate and perpetrate their negative and evil plans. For instance, in Nigeria most criminal elements who perform these criminal activities did not acquire their educational knowledge from any institution. Knowledge acquisition from the streets (outside the classroom) have generated negative activities such as the breaking/hacking of people's bank accounts, phishing of emails, hacking social media accounts, and have degenerated to financial laundering, terrorism and its sponsorship, job scamming, tracking humans for kidnapping, ritual killing and human organ trafficking across borders. All these contemporary challenges require actionable intelligence education and training within a liberalised educational space and template. This will accentuate collective security and promote national security in post-modern world. In essence, intelligence and security education has played pivotal role in transforming the role of South African law enforcement agencies in tracking the activities and movement of criminal elements who engage in heinous crimes especially against citizens and have been helpful in apprehending them. This is against the backdrop of the apparently limited threats to South African national security from external sources in this post-apartheid era.

This work's main purpose is to compare intelligence education in Nigerian and South African institutions of higher learning, which requires comprehensive restructuring to meet the contemporary security needs of the 21st century. More so, the entire gambit of intelligence management and law enforcement in

national/homeland security in Africa remain enmeshed in peculiar historical and socio-political idiosyncrasies.

In Nigeria, there is this great challenge amongst the members of the intelligence community over crass brutality and extreme suppression of dissent voices in protecting the regime. In some instances, the requisite loyalty is divided between ethnicity, religion, and political affiliations. These sentimental attachments erode credible intelligence analytics with faulty products. This reality does not preclude intelligence education in civilian universities where possibilities of tainted intelligence courses delivery to students, public officers and even agents in training. In the same vein, the management of criminal intelligence in Nigeria is fraught with a lot of challenges. Law enforcement in Nigeria especially with the Nigeria Police Force is a very thorny issue. Police brutality and exponential corruption and extortion by officers and men of the Police Force has created a nauseating image and damaged credible criminal intelligence management in the country. Citizens in Nigeria see law enforcement officers as foes and oppressors that should be sabotaged. The famous EndSars protest that erupted in Nigeria in 2020 epitomizes the failure of policing and law enforcement in Nigeria. It clearly shows the intelligence and security training gap in law enforcement in Nigeria.[18]

---

[18] To discuss at this issue, please *also see* Oputa Andrew Tariye, "Security and Human Rights Under the Regime". *Journal of Law and Legal Reform* 2, No. 1 (2021): 83-96. https://doi.org/10.15294/jllr.v2i1.41007; Justine Tever Gberinyer, Ikechukwu Okoro, and Eric Adishi, "An Evaluation of Relevance of Criminal Intelligence Management and Implications for Security and Public Safety in Benue State, Nigeria". *Indonesian Journal of Advocacy and Legal Services* 4, No. 1 (2022): 91-122. https://doi.org/10.15294/ijals.v4i1.56426; Olagoke Oluwafemi Awotayo, and Olawale Olufemi Akinrinde, "Religious Conflicts and Arms Proliferation in the Security Law Reform". *Journal of Law and Legal Reform* 3, No. 1 (2022): 17-38. https://doi.org/10.15294/jllr.v3i1.49238; Nduka Lucas Oluka, "Covid-19, Global Crisis and the Challenges of Human Security Management in Nigeria". *Indonesian Journal of Advocacy and Legal Services* 4, No. 1 (2022): 161-194. https://doi.org/10.15294/ijals.v4i1.56427.

The Republic of South Africa has her share of faulty law enforcement arising from poor training and education especially in intelligence studies to guide the strategic, tactical, and operational efficiency of law enforcement officers. The Marakana Mine shooting in the country bears the hallmark of classical operational intelligence failure in the country and reinforces the need of a review of intelligence and security education in the country.

The content and delivery of knowledge in intelligence education in every country is a function of the educational policies of each country. Consequently, discourses of what should constitute intelligence education, where should it be domiciled and above all who should teach intelligence are rife. While this is not the objective of this study, it is needful to give a brief insight to guide Nigerian and South African academia in the quest to institutionalise intelligence studies as a fairly fledgling discipline on the continent. Western nations like the United States, Canada, UK and France have made variegated efforts in establishing Intelligence and Security Studies as academic units, disciplines or departments. The philosophy of intelligence education also varies amongst these countries. The United States situates it in the Political Science fields of study and the methodological thrust is driven by theoretical deliberations as opposed to the UK where it history and case studies driven. Other western countries mount the intelligence studies programme within the liberal arts, humanities and social sciences comprising history, politics, sociology, psychology and criminal justice. These underscores the highly multidisciplinary nature of the emerging discipline vis a vis the peculiar history and geo-politics of the country.[19] For the continent of

---

[19] Stafford T. Thomas, "Assessing current intelligence studies." *International Journal of Intelligence and Counter Intelligence* 2, No. 2 (1988): 217-244; Michael S. Goodman, "Studying and Teaching About Intelligence: The Approach in the United Kingdom". *Studies in Intelligence* 50, No. 2 (2006): 57-65; Kobi Michael, and Aaron Kornbluth. "The Academization of Intelligence: A

Africa, given the inherent developmental challenges in educational and democratic development and the inescapable imperative of intelligence education, a generalist approach is advocated in view of the limited qualified human resources and apathy towards intelligence education by the policy makers and politicians.

Intelligence education successes and failures hinges essentially on the content and quality of delivery. Decisions are largely based on experience and principle. The value of every degree is the reputation of the institution, hence, the greatest obstacle to any organization or institution revolves around dishonesty, injustice/nepotism and ethnoreligious sentiments etc especially in multi-racial and multi-ethnic societies like Nigeria and South Africa. To this end, this work is geared towards ameliorating the apparent inaccessibility to quality and sustainable intelligence education amongst non-military institutions, alter the popular thinking that training of officers in in-house intelligence skills programme is preferable above comprehensive intelligence education, to enable collaboration/ synergy, understanding and hence strengthen the relationship between scholars, academic institutions and intelligence agencies on mitigating/ rejigging security architecture and thus fostering a robust national security in Nigeria and South Africa respectively.

This is because it has been proven that poor recruitment of graduates with intelligence education background into security organizations such as the intelligence community, military, police, immigration, customs, and other security agencies has become a major challenging factor experienced and tensions generated from this faulty employment strategy for instance has indeed

---

Comparative Overview of Intelligence Studies in the West." *Cyber, Intelligence, and Security* 3, No. 1 (2019): 117-140.

contributed to the slow pace of intelligence education development amongst the two countries. In the same vein, technology have slowed the pace of the growth of knowledge in the field of intelligence education within South African intelligence education in spite of various collaborative efforts to create intelligence education in higher institutions of learning. So far in the republic of South Africa, none of the civil universities have introduced and managed intelligence and security education at the undergraduate levels. The only option to acquire an academic qualification on intelligence is at the postgraduate level of masters or doctoral degrees within International Relations, Political Science or Security Studies.

C. Intelligence Education and National Resilience in Indonesia: Some Legal and Policy Perspectives

The 1945 Constitution of Indonesia expressly stipulates the obligation of citizens to participate in efforts to defend the country. This is stated in Article 27 paragraph 3 of the 1945 Constitution which reads, every citizen has the right and is obliged to participate in efforts to defend the country. In addition, it is further regulated in Article 9 paragraphs (1) and (2) of Law Number 3 of 2002 concerning National Defense which states that efforts to defend the country can be realized through several systems of implementing national defense, either through education, community and scope of work.

Based on this, it can be said that defending the country is one of the steps that can be used in improving the quality of national resilience in Indonesia which can be done through educational institutions. This is one of the initial steps or foundations used in an effort to strengthen the attitude and character of the younger generation in building and shaping the nation's noble values. One of them is through the National Defense Education Education (PPBN) which is used as

advice in shaping the spirit of nationalism in the younger generation. PPBN is implemented in stages[20], namely:

1) The first stage, the implementation is carried out in elementary and secondary school education and education outside school such as scouting.

2) The second stage is also an advanced stage, the implementation of which is at state universities in the form of Citizenship Education.

At the university level itself, in this case, a student besides his academic status, he also holds the status of a good citizen and also educated (smart and good citizen) for the life of the nation and the state of Indonesia. In its implementation, all law campuses in Indonesia have implemented a citizenship education curriculum in their learning system. This is in line with Law Number 12 of 2012 concerning the will that citizenship courses be compulsory subjects that must be strictly applied by universities.[21]

However, can the implementation of state defense as an effort to improve the quality of the spirit of nationalism for national resilience education be limited to curricular citizenship education in universities? in its implementation in Article 35 paragraph (4) of Law Number 12 of 2012 it is stated that as referred to in article (1) regarding the implementation of a higher education curriculum that can be carried out through curricular, co-curricular, and extra-curricular activities. So that the implementation of state defense efforts as a form of national resilience education system in universities, is not only limited to formal education in classrooms. However, it can be implemented externally through an organization or Student Activity Unit.

---

[20] "Implementasi Bela Negara," *LSM SPADA INDONESIA*, 2021, retrieved from <https://lmsspada.kemdikbud.go.id/mod/page/view.php?id=86538>.

[21] Republic of Indonesia. "Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 12 Tahun 2012 Tentang Pendidikan Tinggi", *Law Number 12 of 2012 concerning Higher Education*.

One of the examples above is commonly known as the student regiment. Almost all campuses in Indonesia have a Menwa as a forum for students to take part in efforts to defend the country as a form of implementation of the universal people's defense and security system (*Sishamkamrata*) which is one aspect of national security.[22]

This is in line with Article 30 paragraph (1) of the 1945 Constitution which reads "*that every citizen has the right and is obliged to participate in every state defense and security effort*". In this case, what is meant by citizen is all Indonesian citizens without exception, including students in it. And since the enactment of Law Number 23 of 2019 concerning Management of National Resources for National Defense, Menwa in Indonesia has been re-established as one of the laws governing the management of national resources involved in the implementation of national defense.[23]

Basically, this organization is one of the forums used to instill the spirit of nationalism and national ideology to students as Agents of Change and Social Control. However, in its development, the main role and purpose of this student regiment organization is often misused by several individuals. In practice, it is often contrary to the main goal of the existence of menwa for students. For

---

[22] It is also emphasized that as one of the efforts to maintain the existence of a country, the presence of the military in an order of national and state life is absolute. The determination to protect and defend the country from all threats - both symmetrical and asymmetrical - that can disturb the sovereignty and peace of the nation is an obligation of all citizens without exception. *See also* Ricky Dermawan Fauzi, "Role of Regional Autonomy in the Indonesian National Defense and Security System (SISHANKAMRATA)". *Journal of Law and Legal Reform* 2, No. 1 (2021): 15-38. https://doi.org/10.15294/jllr.v2i1.4090

[23] Faisal Ahmadani and Sundawan Salya, "Urgensi Pilot Project Penataan Dan Pembinaan Resimen Mahasiswa Indonesia Indonesian Student Regiment Arrangement and Development Pilot Project Urgency," *Socia: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial* 18, No. 2 (2021): 92, https://doi.org/10.21831/socia.v18i2.41942.

example, in 2021, the virtual world was enlivened by cases of deaths of students while carrying out Menwa training in one of the universities in Indonesia. There are several facts that stick out in this case, the victim with the initials G has no history of illness and bruises were found in the body and based on the autopsy results show that G died as a result of blunt force violence.

In this case, to avoid all forms of irregularities and maladministration in its implementation, special legitimacy from the campus or related agencies is needed as the person in charge of the activities of Menwa, the campus must be more responsive in shading, reviewing and supervising all forms of activity in it. This is in accordance with the Minister's Joint Decree (SKB III) in 2000, which stated that Menwa was under the guidance of the university concerned as a Student Activity Unit, no longer under the guidance of the Ministry of Defense.[24]

In addition, it requires restrictions on all forms of activity that lead to all forms of actions that have the potential to injure, injure, or even potentially kill other people, in other words, all existing activities must remain based on humanity. And written rules are also needed which are not only limited to regulating the imposition of sanctions on persons but must be able to close all gaps that have the potential to cause problems.

4. Conclusion

Conclusively, intelligence education in essence is not about the provision of real and actual intelligence tradecraft training in institutions of higher learning

---

[24] Humas Kemenko Polhukam RI, "Deputi Bidkor Kesbang : Menwa Dapat Menjadi Tombak Kesadaran Bela Negara Di Lingkungan Mahasiswa," 2018, retrieved from <https://polkam.go.id/deputi-bidkor-kesbang-menwa-dapat-menjadi-tombak-kesadaran-bela-negara-di-lingkungan-mahasiswa/>.

rather the university programmes strive towards contributing deep down knowledge of national security issues to students be they civilians and intelligence community agents, and the applications of intelligence strategies towards accurate preparedness against future threats and mitigating any resulting challenges amidst the populace, and for an effective and efficient statecraft functioning of security and intelligence organizations. It also prepares students ahead whose aim is to further practice careers professionally in the intelligence community sector or in a security intelligence outfits, or perhaps in private sectors.

5. Declaration of Conflicting Interests

The authors state that there is no conflict of interest in the publication of this article.

6. Funding Information

None

7. Acknowledgment

None

8. References

Africa, Sandy & Johnny Kwadjo, *Changing Intelligence Dynamics in Africa* (Global Facilitation Network for Security Sector Reform, University of Birmingham, UK, 2009). Available online at < http://epapers.bham.ac.uk/1526/1/AfricaKwadjo_-2009-_IntelligenceAfrica.pdf>

Africa, Sandy & Siyabulela Mlombile. "Transforming the intelligence Services: Some reflections on the South African experience." *Project on Justice in Times*

of Transition (John F. Kennedy School of Government, Harvard University, 15 October 2001). Available online at <http://www.law.harvard.edu/programs/criminal-justice/south-africa.pdf>.

Ahmadani, Faisal, & Sundawan Salya, "Urgensi Pilot Project Penataan dan Pembinaan Resimen Mahasiswa Indonesia," *Socia: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial* 18, No. 2 (2021): 92-102. https://doi.org/10.21831/socia.v18i2.41942.

Amnesty International, "South Africa: Broken and unequal education perpetuating poverty and inequality", *Online Report*, 2020. Retrieved from <https://www.amnesty.org/en/latest/news/2020/02/south-africa-broken-and-unequal-education-perpetuating-poverty-and-inequality/>

Awotayo, Olagoke Oluwafemi, and Olawale Olufemi Akinrinde, "Religious Conflicts and Arms Proliferation in the Security Law Reform". *Journal of Law and Legal Reform* 3, No. 1 (2022): 17-38. https://doi.org/10.15294/jllr.v3i1.49238.

BusinessTech, "South Africas crime stats for the first three months of 2021 - everything you need to know", *Online* (May 14, 2021) Retrieved online from. <https://businesstech.co.za/news/government/490627/south-africas-crime-stats-for-the-first-three-months-of-2021-everything-you-need-to-know/>

Cristescu, Claudia. "Intelligence Studies in Higher Education. Designing an Intelligence Studies Curriculum for the Romanian Civilian Universities", *TOJNED: The Online Journal of New Horizons in Education* 1, No. 1 (2011): 1-43. https://www.tojsat.net/journals/tojned/volumes/tojned-volume01-i01.pdf#page=5

Etim, James Edem. "A Comparison of education systems in Nigeria and the United States of America" (1976). *Dissertations and Theses*. Paper 2275 Portland State University. https://doi.org/10.15760/etd.2272

Fauzi, Ricky Dermawan. "Role of Regional Autonomy in the Indonesian National Defense and Security System (SISHANKAMRATA)". *Journal of Law and Legal Reform* 2, No. 1 (2021): 15-38. https://doi.org/10.15294/jllr.v2i1.4090.

Gberinyer, Justine Tever, Ikechukwu Okoro, and Eric Adishi, "An Evaluation of Relevance of Criminal Intelligence Management and Implications for

Security and Public Safety in Benue State, Nigeria". *Indonesian Journal of Advocacy and Legal Services* 4, No. 1 (2022): 91-122. https://doi.org/10.15294/ijals.v4i1.56426.

Goodman, Michael S. "Studying and Teaching About Intelligence: The Approach in the United Kingdom". *Studies in Intelligence* 50, No. 2 (2006): 57-65.

Humas Kemenko Polhukam RI, "Deputi Bidkor Kesbang : Menwa Dapat Menjadi Tombak Kesadaran Bela Negara Di Lingkungan Mahasiswa," 2018, retrieved from <https://polkam.go.id/deputi-bidkor-kesbang-menwa-dapat-menjadi-tombak-kesadaran-bela-negara-di-lingkungan-mahasiswa/>.

Igwe, E. O. "Biometric Fingerprint Investigation and Crime Management in Nigeria: A Case Study of Nigeria Immigration Service (NIS), Bayelsa State", *Thesis* (Novena University, Ogume, 2019).

Igwe, E. O. "Nigerian Borders and the Application of Forensic Intelligence: Issues, Challenges and Prospects", *Postgraduate Diploma Project*, (Novena University, Ogume, 2018).

Johnson, Loch K. ed. *Handbook of Intelligence Studies*. Vol. 1. (London, Routledge, 2007).

LSM SPADA Indonesia. "Implementasi Bela Negara," *LSM SPADA INDONESIA*, 2021, retrieved from <https://lmsspada.kemdikbud.go.id/mod/page/view.php?id=86538>.

MacMillan, R. G. Education and a Centralization Policy in South Africa. *Symposium* (1960): 55-74. https://www.core.ac.uk/reader/188771430

McCarthy, J. P. "Commanding joint and coalition operations". *Naval War College Review 46,* No. 1 (1993): 9-21.

Michael, Kobi, and Aaron Kornbluth. "The Academization of Intelligence: A Comparative Overview of Intelligence Studies in the West." *Cyber, Intelligence, and Security* 3, No. 1 (2019): 117-140.

Nte, Ngboawaji Daniel, Paul Eke, and Kinikanwo Anele. "Rural Intelligence Gathering and the Challenges of Counter Insurgency: Views from the Niger Delta." *Bangladesh e-Journal of Sociology* 7, No. 1 (2010): 21-32.

Nte, Ngboawaji Daniel, Urowayinor Kelita Esq, Bribena Kelvin Enokie, and Onyeka Bienose. "Cyber Crime Management Among Students". *JILS (Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies)* 5, No. 2 (2020): 295-334. https://doi.org/10.15294/jils.v5i2.34005.

Nte, Ngboawaji Daniel. "Kidnapping, Hostage Taking and National Security Threats in Nigeria: A Synopsis". *Mustang Journal of Business and Ethics 2*, No. 1 (2011): 21-32.

Nte, Ngboawaji Daniel. "The Changing patterns of Small and Light Weapons (SALW) Proliferation and the Challenges of National Security in Nigeria". *Bangladesh e-Journal of Sociology 1*, No. 1 (2011): 5-23.

Nte, Ucheawaji Nathaniel, Ngboawaji Daniel Nte, Bribena Enokie, and Onyeka Bienose, "DNA Profiling and the Challenges of Crime Management in Nigeria: The Case of The Nigeria Police Force". *JILS (Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies)* 4, No. 2 (2019): 189-216. https://doi.org/10.15294/jils.v4i2.29446.

Obi, C., and U. Nwachukwu, "Intelligence Failure and Insecurity in Nigeria: A Challenge to Development". *Proceedings of the International Conference on Sustainable Development*, *University of Abuja 8*, No. 6 (2011): 162-171.

Oluka, Nduka Lucas. "Covid-19, Global Crisis and the Challenges of Human Security Management in Nigeria". *Indonesian Journal of Advocacy and Legal Services* 4, No. 1 (2022): 161-194. https://doi.org/10.15294/ijals.v4i1.56427.

Onovo, Ogbonnaya O. "Intra-agency Intelligence Gathering and Sharing for Effective Crime Control: Perspective from the Police", in *Crime and Policing in Nigeria: Challenges and Options*, by E.E.O. Alemike, and I.C. Chukwuma, eds. (Lagos, Cleen Foundation, 2004).

Republic of Indonesia, "Undang Undang Dasar Negara Republik Indonesia Tahun 1945", *The 1945 Constitution of Republic of Indonesia*.

Republic of Indonesia, "Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 3 Tahun 2002 Tentang Pertahanan Negara", *Law Number 3 of 2002 concerning National Defence*.

Republic of Indonesia. "Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 12 Tahun 2012 Tentang Pendidikan Tinggi", *Law Number 12 of 2012 concerning Higher Education*.

Shaffer, Ryan. *Internal Security Management in Nigeria: Perspectives, Challenges and Lessons* (New York, Palgrave Macmillan, 2019).

Sternberg, Robert J. and Scott Barry Kaufman, eds. *The Cambridge Handbook of Intelligence*. (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 2011).

Tariye, Oputa Andrew. "Security and Human Rights Under the Regime". *Journal of Law and Legal Reform* 2, No. 1 (2021): 83-96. https://doi.org/10.15294/jllr.v2i1.41007.

Thomas, Stafford T. "Assessing current intelligence studies." *International Journal of Intelligence and Counter Intelligence* 2, No. 2 (1988): 217-244.

Van den Berg, M. A. "Nexus between Intelligence Education and Intelligence Training: A South African Perspective". *Journal of Strategic Studies 8*, No. 3 (2015): 162-172.

Winataputra, Udin Sarifudin, Dasim Budimansyah, Sapriya Sapriya, and Winarno Winarno, *Buku Ajar Mata Kuliah Umum Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan*, (Direktorat Jenderal Pembelajaran dan Kemahasiswaan Kementerian Riset, Teknologi, dan Pendidikan Tinggi Republik Indonesia, Jakarta, 2016).

Author(s) Biography

Prof. Ngboawaji Daniel Nte is Professor and Head Department of intelligence and Security Studies, Novena University, Delta State Nigeria. His research interests are concerning Intelligence Studies, Global Studies, Security Law, Criminalistics, and Terrorism Studies. Some his works have been published at prominent international journals, such as Journal of Indonesian Legal Studies, Journal of International Diversity, Peace and Security Review, African Journal of

Criminology and Justice Studies, Franklin Business & Law Journal, and many more.

Vigo Augustine Teru is faculty member at the Department of intelligence and Security Studies, Novena University, Delta State Nigeria. His area of expertise concerning Security Law and Intelligence Studies, including Terorrism Studies and National Security. One of his works has been published is *A Comparative Analysis of Cyber Security Laws and Policies in Nigeria and South Africa* (Law Research Review Quarterly, 2022).

Nadiyah Melyliana Putri is an Undergraduate Law Student, Faculty of Law, Universitas Negeri Semarang. She is also active as researcher at Lex Scientia Research Unit and member of editorial team at Lex Scientia Law Review.