Effects of Perlocutionary Hate Speech Media on National Discourse in 2021 on YouTube by Joseph Paul Zhang

Eva Rafiqoh ✉, Rustono Rustono, Tommi Yuniawan

Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Article Info	Abstract
	According to the Ministry of Technology and Information, the broadcast on Joseph Paul Zhang's YouTube channel contains hate speech. The hate speech has an effect on its listeners. Therefore, this study aims to examine the positive and negative effects of hate speech on the Joseph Paul Zhang channel. This study uses a descriptive-qualitative methodology and note-taking technique. The results of the study found positive effects, namely happy, calm, and relaxed effects, and negative effects, namely deceiving, embarrassing, upsetting, scaring, humiliating, prejudiced, and inviting people to do bad things.

✉ Correspondence address:
Gedung A Kampus Pascasarjana
Jl. Kelud Utara III, Semarang, Indonesia
E-mail: eva.76rafiqoh@students.unnes.ac.id

INTRODUCTION

Nowadays, practically all human actions are assisted by technology that makes them easier. This is known as the "digital era." However, there are both good and bad effects of the digital age on human activity. The positive effect is that the availability of technology facilities in a variety of disciplines, including education, economics, cultural, and society, facilitates human activities. Technology's bad side effect is its potential to produce hate speech that attempts to make social conditions unconditional.

With the use of information technology to spread messages of hatred against particular ethnicities, religions, and races that are bigoted, extremist, and even inspire acts of terrorism, hate speech is a term to describe behavior towards haters or haters in cyberspace. Other people or organizations (Jubany and Roiha, 2015).

In addition, Cohen-Almagor (2011) argues that hate speech is defined as an act of hostility or malicious speech directed at a person or group of people because of some of their actual or perceived innate characteristics.

Bachari (2019) investigates hate speech on Facebook directed at the Indonesian President in terms of identity, ties to the Indonesian Communist Party (PKI), support for China, and laws that repress the President's Islamic group.

Media content produced by online users is typically made outside of professional routines and practices and is instead produced by active, interactive, and creative audiences that can affect each other as well as global institutions. According to Searle (1985), speech serves as a communicative action in addition to containing linguistic information.

There are factors that motivate communication actions, namely building relationships with partners, popularity, fame, and self-expression, and they can also be used to build business networks. Some content that is deliberately made will cause interaction in the form of various responses from the internet community.

The public's response to hate speech has an effect. In linguistics, speech effects are studied in pragmatics as types of perlocutionary speech. Perlocutionary speech acts in pragmatics. Rustono (1999:38) states that perlocutionary speech acts are speech acts whose utterances are intended to influence the speech partner.

Wijana (1996: 19) argues that a perlocutionary act is a sentence or utterance that has a prelocutionary act or effect on the interlocutor or listener. Perlocutionary effects are divided into two categories, namely positive and negative effects. Haryadi (2003: 271) suggests the effects of perlocutionary speech. Perlocutionary speech refers to the impact or effect produced by someone's speech on the listener. In the context of classification based on their impact, perlocutionary utterances can be divided into two categories, namely positive effects and negative effects.

Positive effects are speech effects that have a positive impact on the speech partner; these positive effects include relief, encouragement, fun, laughter, and so on. The positive effects caused by listeners can be in the form of positive emotions, namely being happy, relaxed, calm, and so on (Safari & Nofrans, 2012). The positive effect is related to the psychological factors of speakers that have an impact on their positive emotions.

In addition to the positive impact, the perlocutionary effect also has a negative impact, namely an effect that is bad or not good for the speech partner. Effects that have a negative impact include deceiving, embarrassing, annoying, frightening, humiliating, and so on. Negative emotions are destructive to both yourself and others. Nitin et al. (2012) explained that another form of negative emotion is hostile emotion (flaming).

Negative effects of hate speech According to Biere (2018), we also have types, namely hate and impolite language. Rokhman and Petuguran (2019) also identified types of hate speech, namely in the form of insults, defamation, blasphemy, unpleasant acts, provoking, inciting, and spreading fake news.

According to Goleman (2000), negative emotions are individual feelings that are perceived as unpleasant (fear, worry, anxiety, hatred, anger) and that excessively can make individuals act and assume negatively about themselves and others. When we feel these negative emotions, everything becomes negative, unpleasant, and troublesome.

Unpleasant emotions and situations that a person is experiencing might have an impact on their thoughts and actions while interacting with other people.

Based on this background, this study examines the positive and negative effects of hate speech on the Joseph Paul Zhang channel. Rahma (2021): Kominfo downgraded shows on the Joseph Paul Zhang channel because they contained hate speech. The hate speech in this study is taken from discourse in the Joseph Paul Zhang channel.

According to Alwi (2003), discourse is a series of interlocking sentences so that a harmonious meaning is formed between the sentences. Deese (1984: 72) in his book Thought into Speech: the Psychology of a Language Deese regarding discourse. This definition states that discourse is a set of propositions that are interconnected to produce a sense of cohesion for listeners or readers.

Joseph Paul Zhang's discourse is a national discourse. This analysis can provide insight to the public about the types of perlocutionary hate speech; thus, the community can still have an opinion by considering the impact of utterances that contain hate speech.

Theoretically, the results of this research are expected to be useful as a contribution to linguistics, especially pragmatics, and more specifically perlocutionary science. In addition, it can also be a means of expanding perlocutionary studies in Indonesian and other language families.

Then practically, the benefits of the results of this research are that they can add insight and understanding about the effects of hate speech and become a means of making it easier for readers or researchers to understand the effects of perlocutionary science in Indonesian. In addition, it can be useful to enrich literature studies in Indonesia, especially in the pragmatics field which focuses on perlocutionary. This research can also be used as a reference for further research related to perlocution.

METHODOLOGY

There are two approaches used in this study, namely the theoretical approach and the methodological approach. The theoretical approach used is pragmatic and methodological, namely a descriptive research type. Sudaryanto (2015) suggests that descriptive research is research conducted based on existing facts or phenomena that empirically live in the speakers, and the results of recording are in the form of exposure to the data as it is.

According to Djajasudarma (2012: 77), the concentration of studies in pragmatics that must be considered are (1) linguistic studies, (2) speech pragmatic studies, (3) discourse pragmatic studies, and (4) cultural pragmatic studies. This study uses a pragmatic study approach, which refers to the context directly. The study in this study is The Perlocutionary Effect of Hate Speech on the Joseph Paul Zhang Youtube Channel National Discourse in 2021. The results of the data analysis on hate speech responses are presented in qualitative form.

The research design is qualitative descriptive research. The purpose of this design is to find the effect of hate speech on Joseph Paul Zhang's YouTube channel in national discourse in 2021. Moleong (2007) suggests that qualitative descriptive research is research that aims to understand the phenomenon of what is experienced by research subjects and how to describe it in the form of words and language in a natural context and method.

The form of the research is descriptive because the purpose of this study is to examine the effects of hate speech on Joseph Paul Zhang's YouTube channel on national discourse. The subject of this research is Joseph Paul Zhang's YouTube channel, while the object is the proposition of hate speech on Joseph Paul Zhang's YouTube channel about national

discourse. Meanwhile, the focus of this research is on the types of perlocutionary speech, namely the negative and positive effects of hate speech on Joseph Paul Zhang's YouTube shows.

The data in this study are in the form of propositions about hate speech from the Joseph Paul Zhang channel which contain types of perlocutionary hate speech. The data sources for this research are 3 shows entitled 2024 Indonesia Akan Bubar, Anti Natal Anti Pancasila, and MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Indonesia, with a duration of 2 hours 50 minutes 36 seconds respectively, 3 hours 03 minutes 00 seconds, and 2 hours 50 seconds minutes 36 seconds on Joseph Paul Zhang's YouTube channel in the National Discourse in 2021 for 7 months, from July - December 2021.

For this study, both formal and informal methods were used in presenting research data. The research technique used is a documentation technique, namely a data collection technique by studying documents to obtain data or information related to the problem under study (Sugiyono, 2017). The use of formal methods to present data on types of hate speech on the YouTube channel Joseph Paul Media Zhang in the 2021 national discourse In addition, the use of informal methods is intended to describe the results of a descriptive analysis of types of perlocutionary hate speech on Joseph Paul Zhang's YouTube channel in the 2021 national discourse.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This chapter discusses the types of perlocutionary hate speech on Joseph Paul Zhang's YouTube channel in the national discourse in 2021. Types of perlocutionary hate speech based on effects are divided into two categories: positive effects and negative effects presented in the form of descriptions. In addition, this chapter discusses three broadcast titles, 2024 Indonesia Bakal Bubar, Anti Natal Anti Pancasila, dan MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Pancasila.

1. Types of Perlocutionary Effects

1.1. Types of Perlocutionary Effects Positives on Impression entitled *2024 Indonesia Bakal Bubar*

Types of perlocutionary positive effects on the show entitled 2024 Indonesia Akan Bubar, with a duration of 2 hours, 50 minutes, and 36 seconds, found positive effect data, namely happiness and calm. The broadcast shows that there is a positive effect that is happy, relaxed, and calm. A description containing perlocutionary types has a positive effect on the show entitled 2024 Indonesia Akan Bubar as follows:

Data Number : (1)
CONTEXT : PUTHEH SPEAKING PARTNERS OF THE JPZ REPORT THE RESULTS OF AID DISTRIBUTION FROM DONATIONS
Speech : " Terima kasih sama Tanjung **ucapan terima kasih kepada donatur** yang telah membagikan sebagian rezekinya lewat tamaris Pancasila.

In the discourse fragment (1), there is an utterance that contains the type of perlocutionary utterance that has a positive effect, namely happiness, namely making the speech partner happy to hear the results of the successful distribution of aid. In addition, a positive effect was also found in data number 2.. The explanation is as follows:

Data Number : (2)
CONTEXT : Joseph Paul Zhang's OPINION THAT ELECTIONS SHOULD LEAD TO PEACE AND MOVE TOGETHER
Speech : " lebih baik banyak **mengarah kepada perdamaian Mbak**. Jadi ini lucu Pak makanya kita kita dalam hal ini kan udah harus atau teman-

teman yang diluar gara2 bergerak bersama-sama"

In the discourse fragment (2), it is a perlocutionary speech with a positive effect on calming the speech partners because it invites them to hold elections towards peace and move together.

1.2 Types of Perlocutionary Effects Positive on Impression entitled *Anti Natal Anti Pancasila*

Types of positive effects on the show entitled Anti Natal Anti Pancasila with a duration of 3 hours, 3 minutes, and 00 seconds In the broadcast entitled Anti Natal Anti Pancasila, positive effect data were found, namely happiness and calm. The description of perlocutionary types has a positive effect on the show entitled Anti Natal Anti Pancasila in the form of a description.

The broadcast shows several types of perlocutionary positive effects, namely happiness, pleasure, relaxation, and calm. Discourse analysis containing perlocutionary types has a positive effect on the show entitled Anti Natal Anti Pancasila, which is described as follows:

Data Number : (3)
CONTEXT : JOSEPH PAUL ZHANG FEEL THE INDONESIAN SOCIETY SHOULD RESPECT EACH OTHER
Speech : "**kita di negara NKRI Negara Kesatuan Republik Indonesia harus menghargai** satu tanyain tadi Bagaimana menghargai agama lain itu tidak tertampung di Pancasila

In the discourse fragment (3), there is a speech that has a positive effect, which is to make people happy; that is, Indonesian people must be able to respect one another.

Data Number : (4)

CONTEXT : M ROBERT ONE OF THE PARTICIPANTS OF ZOOM REVEALED THAT CHRISTMAS WAS A GIFT FOR HUMANITY
Speech : " esensi nya disini **merayakan sesungguhnya Hai Natal dimana kita memperingati hadiah yang terbesar setelah Tuhan berikan kepada seluruh umat manusia** Yaitu keselamatan itu sendiri

In the discourse fragment (4), there is an utterance that creates a positive perlocutionary effect, which is to calm the speech partners, namely the zoom participants, by saying that Christmas is a gift for all mankind.

1.3 Types of Perlocutionary Effects Positive on Impression entitled *MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Pancasila*

Types of positive perlocutionary effects on the show entitled MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Pancasila last 2 hours, 50 minutes, and 36 seconds. In the broadcast entitled MUI Wants Jihad Against Pancasila, positive effect data were found, namely being happy and calm. The description of the types of positive perlocutionary effects in the show entitled MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Pancasila is explained with a description.

The broadcast shows that for several types of perlocution, the positive effects are happy, relaxed, and calm. Discourse analysis that contains perlocutionary types has a positive effect on the show entitled MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Pancasila, which is described as follows:

Data Number : (5)
CONTEXT : JPZ OPENED THE TOPIC OF DISCUSSION IN ZOOM BACK ABOUT

		PANCASILA LECTURE
Speech	:	"**Kami sangat bersyukur denganmu** Terima kasih telah dapat menyelesaikan sesi pertama dokter medsos dimana diakonia kami membagikan makanan untuk orang-orang yang membutuhkan dan para dokter membagi pengetahuannya berdiakonia pengetahuannya bagi kepentingan banyak orang. Berkatilah para diaken diaken kami dan berkatilah para dokter yang telah berdiakonia pengetahuan dilindungi lah mereka segala macam sakit penyakit.

In the discourse fragment (5), there is a speech that has a positive effect, which is to make the speech partners feel happy because they are made happy by the positive activities carried out, namely by distributing food to people in need.

Data Number	:	(6)
CONTEXT	:	JPZ DISCUSSED ABOUT HUMANITARIAN ACTIVITIES, namely FOOD DISTRIBUTION TO PEOPLE IN NEED, WHICH ACTIVITIES HAVE BEEN CONDUCTED IN VARIOUS REGIONS BY SUMMER MEMBERS.
Tuturan	:	"**Mendistribusikan 100 bungkus nasi sasaran kami tadi dari antara Jalan Raya Limo Jalan Raya meruyung Cinere pai Gandul dekat tol** itu

habis ashar itu kebanyakan adalah para pemulung yang bawa gerobak juga para badut badut jalanan para penggerak ondel-ondel sebagian besar ada pengamen dan sebagian gragih ada tukang-tukang ojek Terima kasih kami ucapkan bagi Yayasan bebas Pancasila.

In the discourse fragment (6), there is a perlocutionary utterance that has a positive effect, namely making the speech partners feel happy because they are made happy by the positive activities carried out, namely by distributing food to people in need.

2. Types of Perlocutionary Negative Effects

2.1 Types of Perlocutionary Negative Effects on Shows entitled *2024 Indonesia Bakal Bubar*

The broadcast entitled 2024 Indonesia Akan Bubar contains types of perlocutionary negative effects, namely deceiving, embarrassing, annoying, frightening, contemptuous, and prejudice. Discourse analysis containing perlocutionary types of negative effects on the broadcast entitled 2024 Indonesia Akan Bubar is described as follows.

Data Number	:	(7)
CONTEXT	:	JPZ OPEN THE TOPIC ABOUT INDONESIA WILL DISSOLUTION TODAY OUR THEME IS AS LONG AS ISLAM IS IN RULE READY WILL DISSOLUTION NOW ALREADY
Speech	:	"Hari ini Tema kita adalah selama **Islam berkuasa Indonesia siap bakal bubar**,"

In the discourse fragment (7), there are utterances that have a negative effect, namely creating fear in the speech partners because they are afraid that Indonesia will disband if Islam comes to power.

Data Number : (8)
CONTEXT : JPZ CONTINUING THE TOPIC OF THE CONVERSATION, IF A HUMAN AGE OF 78 YEARS OLD WAS THE TIME TO DIE, IT WAS THE SAME AS INDONESIA WOULD BE DISPOSED IF THE KHILAFAH RULED IN INDONESIA DON'T HAVE TO WAIT LONG.
Speech : "Nah itulah **saatnya Indonesia nanti bubar karena Islam berkuasa** kalau Islam masih berkuasa di Indonesia Indonesia bakal bubar enggak nunggu2 dengan enggak nunggu sampai 2030 2024 saja sudah bubar nanti ya kalau sampai Khilafah yang menang Indonesia bakal bubar"

In the discourse fragment (8), there are utterances that have a negative effect, namely creating fear in the speech partners because they are afraid that Indonesia will disband if the Khilafah rules Indonesia.

2.2 Types of Perlocutionary Negative Effects on Shows entitled *Anti Natal Anti Pancasila*

The broadcast entitled Anti Natal Anti Pancasila shows the types of perlocutionary effects that are negative, namely deceiving, embarrassing, annoying, frightening, contemptuous, prejudiced, and inviting bad things. Discourse analysis containing perlocutionary types of negative effects on the show entitled Anti Natal Anti Pancasila is described as follows:

Data Number : (9)
CONTEXT : JOSEPH PAUL ZHANG OPEN THE TOPIC WITH THAT AT CHRISTMAS MUSLIMS SHOULD NOT SAY MERRY CHRISTMAS
Speech : Nek kamu menyebutkannya bahwa kamu tidak boleh mengucapkan Natal itu **membuat Indonesia pecah** itu membuat Hai kamu tidak menghormati Pancasila hal itu masalahnya kita menduduki apa-apa bodo amat ya ke nyumbang juga agak kok Iya Gan kalo lagi lebaran kita nyumbang

In the discourse fragment (9) there is an utterance that has a negative effect, namely creating prejudice against the speech partner because they are afraid that it will make Indonesian opinion split.

Data Number : (10)
CONTEXT : ACCORDING TO JOSEPH PAUL ZHANG THE CHURCH CONTRIBUTES TO THE CONSTRUCTION OF THE MOSQUE
Speech : luar biasa orang Kristen betapa Mulianya orang kesan betapa laknat **biadabnya**. orang Islam ya gan Natal pun kita nyumbang lo leak adalah beberapa gereja

In part (10) of the discourse, there is a speech that has a negative effect, namely insulting

Muslims because Muslims are considered barbaric because they are considered to have been given donations from Christians but did not wish them a Merry Christmas.

2.3 Types of Perlocutionary Negative Effects on Shows entitled *MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Pancasila*

The broadcast entitled MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Pancasila shows that the types of perlocutionary effects are negative, namely deceiving, embarrassing, annoying, frightening, insulting, prejudiced, and inviting bad things. MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Pancasila is described as follows:

Data Number : (11)
CONTEXT : BE CAREFUL WITH ISSUES REGARDING DOCTRINE NOT TO SUBJECT TO THE UUD OR PANCASILA.
Speech : **"keinginan sekelompok anak bangsa yang tidak menghendaki geologi Pancasila** dan memaksakan ideologi bahkan ideologi Pancasila dipersalahkan sebagai ideologi yang menghancurkan keberadaan keadilan sosial serta kesejahteraan anak bangsa Indonesia mereka merasa diperlakukan tidak adil.

In the discourse fragment (11) there are utterances that have a negative effect, namely causing anger or irritation to the speech partners because they were made angry because of the emergence of a group of young people who did not want Pancasila ideology and destroyed social justice and the welfare of the nation's children.

Data Number : (12)
CONTEXT : CONTINUE THE DISCUSSION RELATED TO THE EMERGENCE OF A GROUP OF CHILDREN WHO DO NOT WANT THE IDEOLOGY OF PANCASILA.
Speech : " ideologi bahwa saya pernah menyampaikan di bumi Persada ini tidak ada ideologi lain kecuali Pancasila ideologi agama tidak bisa mempersatukan bangsa Emangnya kalau bangsa ini pecah berlanjut nanti tidak termasuk anak cucunya ini enggak bisa dari oleh mereka dia mau hidup dimana-mana bahkan nanti cacat seumur hidup loh kehormatan mereka cacat seumur hidup mobil perjuangkan kayak papa nggak bisa karena bumi ini bukan booming miliknya mayoritas bumi ciptaan Tuhan makanya ini buku ini nanti akan kita sampaikan semua itu nggak ada siapa bisa menciptakan bumi bisa mayoritas muncul Hey bisa menciptakan pohon itu tubuh nggak mungkinlah warga suatu wilayah adalah gini sekelompok warga satu wilayah yang ingin memisahkan diri dari negara kesatuan Republik Indonesia berkali-kali

sudah saya sampaikan Halo **negara ini terpecah**.

In the discourse fragment (12), there are utterances that have a negative effect, namely causing fear to the speech partners because they are made afraid because if there is no Pancasila ideology, then a country will not continue and become divided.

CONCLUSION

The conclusions from this study found that there were positive and negative effects from three broadcast titles, namely 2024 Indonesia Bakal Bubar, Anti Natal Anti Pancasila, and MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Pancasila.

The 2024 Indonesia Bakal Bubar program found positive effects, namely the happy effect and the calm effect.

Positive effects, such as pleasant and calming effects, were also discovered in the title Anti Natal Anti Pancasila.

Then, a pleasant effect and a calming effect were discovered in the title of the MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Pancasila program.

In addition to information about positive impacts, the 2024 Indonesia Bakal Bubar program's title contained information about negative effects, including humiliating, bothersome, terrifying, and prejudice-inspiring effects.

Then, in the program entitled Anti Natal Anti Pancasila, it was discovered that there were negative impacts, including annoyances, frights, humiliations, prejudices, and attracting evil things.

Then, in the program entitled MUI Mau Jihad Melawan Pancasila, adverse effects including irritability and fear effects were discovered.

REFERENCES

Alwi, Hasan, dkk. (2003). *Tata Bahasa Baku Bahasa Indonesia (edisi ketiga).* Jakarta: Balai Pustaka

Bachari, Andika Dutha. (2019). " *Analysis of Form and Theme of Hate Speech Against President Joko Widodo on Social Media*: *A Forensic Linguistic Study*." 257(Icollite 2018):223– 26. doi: 10.2991/icollite-18.2019.49.

Biere, Shanita. (2018). " *Hate Speech Detection Using Natural Language Processing Techniques*." *Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam* 30.

Carney, Terrence. (2014). " *Being (Im)Polite: A Forensic Linguistic Approach to Interpreting a Hate Speech Case*." *Language Matters* 45(3):325– 41. doi: 10.1080/10228195.2014.959545.

Cohen-Almagor, R. (2011). *Fighting hate and bigotry on the Internet*. *Policy & Internet*, *3*(3), 1-26.

Deese, J. (1984). *Thought into speech: The psychology of a language*. Prentice Hall.

Djajasudarma, T. Fatimah. (2012). *Wacana & Pragmatik*. Bandung: Refika. Aditama.

Goleman, D. (2000). *Kecerdasan Emosional*. Gramedia Pustaka Utama.

Haryadi. (2003). Jenis, Efek, dan Fungsi Tuturan Perlokusi Mahasiswa Kuliah Kerja Nayata Universitas Negeri Semarang di Kabupaten Kendal. Tesis. Universitas Negeri Semarang

Jubany, *et.al.* (2015). *Backgrounds, Experiences and Responses to Online Hate Speech: A Comparative Cross-Country Analysis*. Spain: Universitat de Barcelona La Ligue de l' enseignement, France (M. Roturier, E-L. Gay & M. Schoger) CITTALIA, Italy (M. Giovannetti & C. Minicucci) UB, Spain (O. Jubany, M. Roiha, J. Bestard & A. Martínez) FDP, Romania (I. Codreanu), ROTA, UK (R-E. Preotescu).

Moleong, L. (2014). *Metodologi Penelitian Kualitatif. Edisi Revisi*. Bandung: PT. Remaja Rosdakarya.

Nitin, *et.al.* (2012). *Behavioural Responses and Proclivity of Facebook Users Towards Flaming. Issues in Information Systems*, *13*(1), 25– 39.

Rokhman & Petuguran. (2021). *Ujaran Kebencian. Kajian Pragmatik, Linguistik.* Unnes Press: Semarang.

Rahma, A. (2021). Kominfo *Takedown* Video Joseph Paul Zhang yang Mengaku Nabi ke-26). Tempo.co. Di ambil dari https://nasional.tempo.co/read/1454480/kominfo-takedown-video-joseph-paul-zhang-yang-mengaku-nabi-ke-26

Rustono. (1999). *Pokok-Pokok Pragmatik. S*emarang: CV IKIP Semarang Press.

Safaria, *et.al* (2012). Manajemen Emosi, Sebuah Panduan Cerdas Bagaimana Mengelola Emosi Positif dalam Hidup Anda.Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara.

Searle, J. R. (1985). *Expression and Meaning: Studies in the Theory of Speech Acts*. Cambridge University Press.

Sugiyono. (2017). *Metode Penelitian Kuantitatif, Kualitatif, dan R&D.* Bandung: Alfabeta.

Sudaryanto. (2015). *Metode Dan Aneka Teknik Analisis Bahasa: Pengantar Penelitian Wahana Kebudayaan Secara Linguis*. Yogyakarta: Duta Wacana University Press.

Surat Edaran Kapolri Nomor: Se/6/X/2015 tentang Penanganan Ucapan Kebencian (*Hate Speech*).

Wijana, I Dewa Putu. (1996). *Dasar-Dasar Pragmatik.* Yogyakarta. Penerbit Andi.