

### Innovative Journal of Curriculum and Educational Technology 8 (2) (2019): 51 – 58



https://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/ujet/article/view/31339

## The Effectiveness of GIST (Generating Interaction between Schemata and Text) and KWL (Know, Want to Know, Learned) Strategies on Students English Literacy towards Learning Motivation

Aep Saepudin<sup>1</sup>, Sri Sulistyorini<sup>2</sup> & Yuli Utanto<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup> Universitas Swadaya Gunung Jati, Cirebon, Jawa Barat, Indonesia <sup>2</sup> Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

#### **Article Info**

# History Articles Received: May 2019 Accepted: June 2019

Published: November 2019

Keywords: english literacy, GIST strategy, KWL strategy, learning motivation

DOI

https://doi.org/10.15294 /ijcet.v8i2.31339

#### **Abstract**

Reading and writing abilities give the benefit for improving knowledge on integrated English information, where the information is needed to support in this era. It encourages the integration of learning strategies to improve the ability of English literacy. The research has purposed to (1) analyze the effectiveness of learning strategies in the ability of English literacy, (2) analyze the motivational learning influences the student towards English literacy ability, (3) analyze English literacy ability uses GIST strategy and KWL strategy towards learning motivation. The research method used a mix method (quantitative and qualitative) with concurrent embedded research design. The research population was the eight classes of SMPN 1 Lebakwangi. Analyzing the results showed that using GIST strategy was more effective on English literacy than KWL strategy; GIST strategy assisted the students in sorting and selecting vocabularies for classifying the important information so that it could conclude information to facilitate the understanding. The benefit of this research was to support as a reference in the learning of English literacy and to add the insight for improving English literacy ability to integrating GIST strategy and KWL strategy in the learning activity. Moreover, the use of learning strategies promoted students for critical thinking in processing and developing information that was appropriated to them.

© 2019 Universitas Negeri Semarang

p-ISSN 2252-7125 e-ISSN 2502-4558

#### **INTRODUCTION**

Education is a foundation in building a nation, where education makes people a maintainer able to manage and optimize the potential resources in a nation. Hamalik (2014) stated that education as a process has interconnectedness in development. It makes education an effort in accelerating the development of human potential (Sa'ud, and Makmum, 2007).

The curriculum becomes a part of an effort to improve the quality of education. A curriculum is several subjects that must be pursued and studied by students (Hamalik, 2014). It is supported in the statement Glatthorn, Boschee, and Whitehead (2009) stated that curriculum is the plans made for learning in the schools, usually retrievable documents of several levels, and actualization of those plans in the classroom. It makes the curriculum as a guideline that there are subjects for support in the planned learning and have a structural arrangement.

The change of curriculum occurs at all times. It is reasonable as one of the processes for improving the quality of education. According to O'Connor (1993) as cited in Prawiradilaga (2014) explained that there are three traits of change, namely routine, improvement, and innovative. Three traits are fundamental to how the changes supporting the improvement of quality of education in terms of approach or method in the learning process.

The essential for implementing the curriculum in the school is the learning process itself, which can provide significant changes for students if the implementation is professionally implemented (Utanto, Sukirman, and Maretta, 2017). Curriculum 2013 is a scientific approach. The implementation of Curriculum 2013 emphasizes activity-based learning, which emphasizes the assessment of the process (Sulistyorini, Hardjono, Harmanto, and Astuti, 2015).

In the era of globalization increasingly give the competition more stringent and competitive, so that every individual is expected to increase the competence for the creation of superior human resources. Along with the times, the main thing is to get information by having an awareness of the culture of reading and writing to deepen the information contained in a text either magazines, newspapers, books or others.

The reading and writing abilities provide benefits for a person to improve knowledge in interpreting the meaning or content of a writing. In additional, literacy ability can sort and choose useful information or not for themselves. This reality is seen when the information such as circulating news is not properly interpreted, so it can lead the other meanings that are conducted to interpretations in the information.

Implementation of literacy is not fully enforceable. Moreover, students have not been motivated in reading and writing. It makes the student decreased the motivation, especially in English. English literacy has a role for students in determining, acquiring, and developing information. When students are motivated with specific experience for a particular purpose, students have a very good readiness to learn Holdaway, (1993); United States Agency for International Development (2014).

Cultural literacy has a role in determining and managing information through the learning process. According to Zuchdi and Budiasih (2001) as cited in Modul USAID Prioritas (2014) revealed that the reading ability is obtained through the preliminary reading process that influences the further reading ability.

Furthermore, PISA (Programme for International Student Assesment) assessed the sustainability aspect of a student literacy program. The results of the survey issued by PISA in 2015 stated that reading in Indonesia was at the bottom 10 or in the order of 64 from 72 participating countries. The following year was 2016; there was a study from Central Connecticut State University that had a research title of Worlds's Most Literate Nations. It showed that they were not too different results from other studies for Indonesia. The research showed that Indonesia was in position 60 from 61 countries. Indonesia was positioned one level above Botswana as the lower-positioned country. From several surveys above, the results of literacy in

Indonesia were still low compared with other participating countries.

Based on the research results expressed by Zin, Wong, and Rafik-Galea (2014) declared that the main problem in critical reading could not identify the purpose of the writer. The students feel difficulties understanding the information contained in the text. The students must be able to reflect and evaluate the information, where they can access, select, translate, and integrate the information.

Supporting for improved literacy capabilities has not been adequate, research results by Tyanasari (2017) stated that the teacher's understanding in learning literacy was not good, there were no literation team and less supporting facility. Lie, and Azman (2010), the English literacy curriculum is needed as a pedagogic and literacy oriented approach. In Abidin (2017) research, they found that literacy abilities were still low due to use of less precise approaches or models in the learning process to use integration approaches and models for improving English literacy ability.

The conditions existing require steps for overcoming every problem to improve the ability of English literacy. The purpose of this research is to analyze the effectiveness of GIST strategy and KWL strategy in the ability of English literacy integrated into a module. It is facilitated for integrating English literacy into the learning process. The use of both learning strategies as a way to improve learning motivation so that the motivation and use of learning strategies can improve students' English literacy ability.

#### **METHODS**

This research used a mixed method. Mix method is planned research that combines quantitative methods and qualitative methods to analyze data before, during, and after (Creswell, 2016) whereas the design of this research used concurrent embedded, namely a research method that combined two quantitative methods and qualitative methods unbalanced portion.

The research used two classes of experiment class 1 and experiment class 2. Two

experimental classes got treatments by providing a learning strategy. The treatments to determine the effectiveness of the strategy in English literacy ability were in term the motivation to learn with the ARCS model (Attention, Relevance, Confidence, Satisfaction).

Experimental class 1 used GIST strategy, while experimental class 2 used a KWL strategy. Two classes of research experiments used the pretest-post-test two treatment design method. Meanwhile, the population of this research was all students in the eighth grade at SMPN 1 Lebakwangi, Kuningan. To determine the influence of learning strategies on English literacy ability, this research used the instrument test such as pretest and posttest, and the non-test instrument with observation, interview guidelines, and questionnaire.

#### **RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

## The Effectiveness of Implemented the Learning Strategy towards English Literacy Ability

Analyzing the effectiveness of learning strategies in the ability of English literacy need to calculate the pretest and post-test data. There were three prerequisite tests for analyzing the effectiveness, namely the average test, the classical completeness test, and improved test. Three tests determined the student's ability on English literacy appropriate to use the standard score was 72.

The first had analyzed the effectiveness of the learning strategy by testing the average each class. The purpose of this test was to determine the students reached the standard score of 72. The results of the average test used *one t sample t-test* as follows.

 Table 1. The Average Test Results

Class	t	đf	Sig	Mean difference
Experimental 1	5.748	27	0.000	6.714
Experimental 2	2.182	29	0.037	2.933

Based on table 1, the results showed the experimental class 1, namely 0.000 < 0.05, and then analysis results for experimental class 2, namely 0.037 < 0.05. It was obtained the results that English literacy ability in experimental class

1 and experimental class 2 had been reached the standard score was 72 as criteria required.

Analyzing the second prerequisite test was calculated the classical completeness test from two classes. This test was to determine each student's completeness in achieving the standard score. Score value  $z_{0,5-\alpha}$  calculated with  $z_{0,5-\alpha}$  = The result showed only  $z_{0.45} = 1.64.$ experimental class 1 reached the classical completeness test, where  $z_{calculated}$  reached 1.73 that was bigger than 1.64 as the criteria value to reject H<sub>0</sub>. Whereas the experimental class 2, namely  $z_{calculated}$  reached 0.63 was smaller than 1.64 as the criteria value to reject H<sub>0</sub>. Based on the results, it could explain that there were different proportion for students completeness by using learning strategies. The use of GIST strategy in experimental class 1 could reach English literacy ability with percentage 75%. Whereas using KWL st of ofrategy in experimental class 2 could not reach English literacy with percentage 75%.

The use of GIST strategy can sort and select the vocabulary needed to be ably classifying important information so that it can infer the information to make it easier to understand. Referring to the research results from Johari, Mukhaiyar, and Rozimela (2013) states that GIST provides students with the opportunity to work together, to stimulate students creatively, and to stimulate students with prior knowledge. It is added by Octavia, and Wilany (2018) and Putri (2012) state that GIST is a strategy for identifying essential vocabulary and collecting information into the conclusion to make it easier to understand the information.

The third analyzing was to determine the improvement in treatments that had been given in the learning. The results of the improvement test as table 2.

**Table 2**. The Improvement Test Results

t Af sig		cia	Mean difference	Standard error	95% Confidence Interval of the difference	
ι	uı	sig	ivicali ulliciciice	difference	Lower	Upper
2.122	56	0.038	0.07857	0.03703	0.00439	0.15275

The result of table 2 showed the significant value of 0.038 was smaller than 0.05. In the other hand, the results explained that there was a difference in increasing English literacy ability using GIST strategy and KWL strategy.

Based on the results of analyzing was gained from preparation in the preparing learning device as a supporting tool for conducting the learning to develop the students thinking to improve the ability of English literacy. The research by Prawiyogi, Rosalina, and Rahman (2018) states that the improvement occurred from started the learning plans until the evaluation. The student learning results occurred improvement from the role of teachers to prepare and to implement the learning process (Yulianingtyas, Julia, and Djuanda, 2016).

The use of GIST strategy was more effective than the KWL strategy for students' English literacy. GIST strategy gives schema toeliminate unnecessary words; it uses for determining, processing, and developing information. Bartlett (2008) states that the vision

of literacy program affects to pedagogic students in the classroom and relates to the guidance of literacy outside. Added by Khuzaemah, Herawati, and Ummi (2018) states that student literacy ability can able to use language to get knowledge and transformation knowledge.

## Learning Motivation Influences Student English Literacy Ability

Learning motivation becomes a variable analyzing that it can give influence on English literacy ability. This research analyzed two experimental classes about influence learning motivation. The results of analyzing for experimental class 1 on table 3.

**Table 3**. Model Summary of Regression for Experimental Class 1

	-		
R	R square	Adjusted R square	Std. the error of the estimate
0.784	0.615	0.601	3.90662

The results of regression for experimental class 1 showed score *R square*, namely 0.615 or percentage equality of 61.5%, which meant the students' motivation for learning was affected on English literacy ability. Then percentage of 38.5% was influenced by other factors whereas the results analyze experimental class 2 as table 4.

**Table 4**. Model Summary of Regression for Experimental Class 2

R I	Daguara	Adjusted	Std. the error
	R square	R square	of the estimate
0.751	0.564	0.548	4.94970

The results of regression for experimental class 2 showed score *R square*, namely 0.564 or percentage equality of 56.4%, which meant the students' motivation for learning was affected on English literacy ability. Then percentage of 54.6% was influenced by other factors.

Based on the tabel 3, two experimental classes obtained motivation influence towards English literacy ability. There were difference motivation influence with students' English literacy for two classes, where the experimental class 1 had reached percentage 61.5% and experimental class 2 had reached 56.4%. The results could be assumed that there was difference motivation influence of students towards English literacy by using GIST and KWL strategy.

The role of learning motivation in the learning process is closely related to student learning outcomes. It is important to present clear the purposes for students to understand what is expected of them because the goal of knowledge is related to success in learning (Keller, 2010; Maeng, and Lee, 2015). Student confidence can be improved by reducing anxiety and developing realistic expectations (Keller, 2010; Maeng, and Lee, 2015). Therefore, teachers should focus on making learning objectives that students can understand and impress students, which makes students have the opportunity to plan, to develop, and to evaluate the learning.

Learning motivation should be given in the learning activity, so it will encourage for every student to get better learning outcome. Using metacognition strategy helps the student to understand the information, Samadi, and Davaii

(2012) explained that metacognition strategy helps students develop understanding of the learning.

The analysis explanation above supported by the research of Johari, Mukhaiyar, and Rozimela (2013) states that the use of GIST strategy can improve student's learning motivation. According to Roehlkepartain (2012) and Tejkalova (2009), one of the ways to increase motivation is to create an interesting class. To create this, the use of GIST strategy using schema that can make a trigger for the students to be motivated in learning, so it would make the interesting class for students. It can lead the curiosity, desire, and encouragement in achieving the achievement (Wahyuni, Djatmika, and As'ari, 2018).

From the analysis has been explained above that experimental class 1 has got better influence learning motivation towards the students English literacy ability. Motivation increasingly becomes the students motivated and interested in learning, so it gives students stimulate to do the activities in learning (Alfiyana, Sukaesih, and Setiati, 2018). It is in line with the research results from Stefany (2016) stated that the motivation with the ARCS model showed better results in learning.

Teachers encourage to motivate students by facilitating successful and effective language learning (Hüseyin, 2016). In other words, motivating the students can improve the ability of English literacy by determining, processing, and developing information. It is increasing the student involvement during teaching literacy information (Reynolds, Roberts, and Hauck, 2017).

## Analyze of English Literacy Ability with GIST Strategy and KWL Strategy towards Learning Motivation

The ability of English literacy relates to the motivation of learning students. The results of the analyzing are collected that students' English literacy ability in both classes have different outcomes. Experimental class 1 using GIST strategy, the students got a better understanding in the use of charts 5W1H. Whereas for the KWL

strategy, students are required to understand the three columns K-W-L.

The use of both strategies above is a strategy of metacognition, according to Shunk (2014) stated that the strategy of metacognition find the basic idea, determine information, form associations or descriptions, use the technique of remembering, and organizing material. Ellis, Denton, and Bond (2014) mentions that the categories of metacognition are such as planning, monitoring, and evaluation, including the modeling, achieving objectives, checklists, diagrams, organizational graphs, and exercises. The learning of metacognition includes visual learning, which can help students to remember (Medina, 2008) and to relate the information (Pressley, and McCormick, 2007).

The role of visualizations in learning can improve students' cognitive abilities. encourages students to be more motivated in the ability of English literacy. When learning used the GIST strategy with the schema and questions chart 5W1H. It gave students' interest to answer the questions in writing the summary. While using the KWL strategy, used three columns that could give stimulate for students to divide or classify based on those columns. The results of the GIST strategy had a better impact for improving English literacy than the KWL strategy. The existence of these charts and schemes as visualization that made students interested, remembered and connected the information using GIST strategy.

Visualization in learning encourages the students to be motivated and attracted in learning. Research by Philominraj, Jeyabalan, and Vidal-Silva (2017) stated that visualization of learning is crucial because it helps focus attention and helps language in the classroom more real and alive. Suppoterd by Gilakjani research (2012) explains that visual learning uses and obtains information through images and graphs during learning.

#### **CONCLUSION**

There is a difference effectiveness of GIST and KWL strategies on students' English literacy

ability. Based on the analysis of research results showed that the use of GIST strategy was more effective than KWL strategy. The effectivness analyzed with three tests, namely the average, classical completeness test and the improvement both strategies. The influence of motivation to learn using GIST strategy was better improving students' English literacy ability compared to the KWL strategy. The factors of both the learning strategies used scheme and columns. Those are visualized to foster the students' interest in the learning process and increasing the ability of English literacy.

#### **REFERENCES**

Alfiyana, R., Sukaesih, S., & Setiati, N. (2018).

Pengaruh model arcs (attention, relevance, confidence, satisfaction) dengan metode talking stick terhadap motivasi dan hasil belajar siswa materi sistem pencernaan makanan. *Journal of Biology Education*, 7(2), 226-236.

Retrieved from

https://journal.unnes.ac.id/sju/index.php/uj be/article/view/24287

Central Connecticut State University. World literate nation.

https://webcapp.ccsu.edu/?news=1767&data

Ellis, A. K., Denton, D., & Bond, J. B. (2014). An analysis of research on metacognitive teaching strategies. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *116*, 4015-4024. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1877042814009008">https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1877042814009008</a>

Gilakjani, A. P. (2012). Visual, auditory, kinaesthetic learning styles and their impacts on english language teaching. *Journal of Studies in Education*, 2(1), 104-113. Retrieved from <a href="http://www.macrothink.org/journal/index.p">http://www.macrothink.org/journal/index.p</a> <a href="http://www.macrothink.org/journal/index.p">hp/jse/article/view/1007</a>

Glatthorn, A. A., Boschee, F., & Whitehead, B. M. (2009). *Curriculum leadership: strategies for developmen and implementation*. California: SAGE Publication Inc.

Hamalik, O. (2014). *Kurikulum dan pembelajaran*. Jakarta: PT Bumi Aksara.

Hüseyin, ÿz. (2016). Metacognitive awareness and academic motivation: a cross-sectional study in teacher education context of turkey. *Procedia - Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 232, 109-121. Retrieved from

### https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1877042816312678

- Johari, I., Mukhaiyar, & Rozimela, Y. (2013). The effect of generating interaction between schemata and text (gist) strategy and motivation on students' reading comprehension of hortatory exposition text at sma 3 padang. *Journal English Language Teaching (ELT), 1*(1), 79-88. Retrieved from <a href="http://ejournal.unp.ac.id/index.php/elt/article/view/4550">http://ejournal.unp.ac.id/index.php/elt/article/view/4550</a>
- Khuzaemah, E., Herawati, L., & Ummi, H. U. (2018).

  Literacy education model using the scientific approach (model pendidikan literasi menggunakan pendekatan saintifik). *Indonesian Language Education and Literature*, 3(2), 227-239.

  Retrieved from
  - http://www.syekhnurjati.ac.id/jurnal/index.php/jeill/article/view/2630/0
- Lie, K. Y., & Azman, H. (2010). Tahap literasi dalam bahasa inggeris di kalangan belia di institut belia kebangsaan. *GEMA Online® Journal of Language Studies*, 10(1),35-51. Retrieved from <a href="http://ejournal.ukm.my/gema/article/view/125">http://ejournal.ukm.my/gema/article/view/125</a>
- Maeng, U., & Lee, S. M. (2015). Efl teachers' behavior of using motivational strategies: the case of teaching in the korean context. *Teaching and Teacher Education, 46,* 25-36. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0742051X1400136X">https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0742051X1400136X</a>
- Medina, J. (2008). Brain rules: 12 principles for surviving and thriving at work, home, and school. Seattle, WA: Pear Press.
- Octavia, V. & Wilany. E. (2018). The use of generating interaction between schemata and text (gist) strategy towards students' reading comprehension. *Cahaya Pendidikan*, 4(1), 13-22. Retrieved from
  - https://www.journal.unrika.ac.id/index.php/journalcahayapendidikan/article/view/1278
- Philominraj, A., Jeyabalan, D., & Vidal-Silva, C. (2017). Visual learning: a learner centered approach to enhance english language teaching. *English Language Teaching*, 10(3), 54-62. Retrieved from
  - https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ1130032
- Prawiradilaga, D. (2014). *Wawasan teknologi* pendidikan. Jakarta: Prenada Media Group.
- Prawiyogi, A. G., Rosalina, A., & Rahman. (2018).

  Pengaruh metode gist terhadap kemampuan membaca pemahaman dan kemampuan menulis eksposisi siswa sekolah. *Metodik Didaktik*, 14(1), 38-44. Retrieved from

- http://ejournal.upi.edu/index.php/MetodikDidaktik/article/view/11814
- Pressley, M. & McCormick, C. B. (2007). *Child and adolescent development for educators*. New York: Guilford Press.
- Putri, A. D. P. S. (2012). The effect of 'gist' and learning style toward reading comprehension of grade xi students at sma dwijendra bualu in academic year 2011/2012. *Jurnal Pendidikan dan Pembelajaran Bahasa Indonesia*, 1(1), 3-7. Retrieved from
  - http://oldpasca.undiksha.ac.id/ejournal/index.php/jurnal bahasa/article/vie w/277
- Reynolds, K. M., Roberts, L. & Hauck, J. (2017).

  Exploring motivation: integrating the arcs model with instruction. *Reference Services Review*, 45(2), 1-35. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10">https://www.emeraldinsight.com/doi/full/10</a>
  .1108/RSR-10-2016-0057
- Roehlkepartain, J. L. (2012). *Spark student motivation: 101 easy activities for cooperative learning.*Minneapolis: Search Institute Press.
- Sa'ud, U. S., & Makmun, A. S. (2007). *Perencanaan pendidikan*. Bandung: PT Remaja Rosdakarya.
- Samadi, M., & Davaii, M. (2012). A case study of the predicting power of cognitive, metacognitive and motivational strategies in girl students' achievements. *Procedia Social and Behavioral Sciences*, *32*, 380-384. Retrieved from <a href="https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1877042812000584">https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1877042812000584</a>
- Shunk, D. H. (2012). Learning theorities an educational perspetive, sixth edition. Translate by Eva Hamdiah, and Rahmat Fajar. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Stefany, E. M. (2015). Pengaruh strategi arcs (attention, relevance, confidence and satisfaction) terhadap motivasi belajar tik siswa di smp 4 negara. *Edutic Scientific Journal of Informatics Education, 1*(2). Retrieved from <a href="http://journal.trunojoyo.ac.id/edutic/article/view/1549">http://journal.trunojoyo.ac.id/edutic/article/view/1549</a>
- Sulistyorini, S., Hardjono, Harmanto, & Astuti, A. E. (2015). Pelatihan pengembangan penilaian otentik dan penulisan rapor sd kurikulum 2013 bagi guru-guru sd dinas pendidikan kecamatan gayamsari kota semarang. *Jurnal Abdimas*, *19*(1), 57-62. Retrieved from <a href="https://journal.unnes.ac.id/nju/index.php/abdimas/article/view/4704">https://journal.unnes.ac.id/nju/index.php/abdimas/article/view/4704</a>
- Tejkalova, L. (2009). Content and language integrated learning: strategies and motivation in clil. Saarbrucken: VDM Verlag Dr. Muller.

- United States Agency for International Development. (2014). *Pembelajaran literasi sd/mi di lptk.*Jakarta: RTI (Research Triangle Institute)
  International. Retrieved from
  <a href="http://www.prioritaspendidikan.org/id/media/view/detail/580/buku-sumber-untuk-dosen-lptk--pembelajaran-literasi-sd-di-lptk">http://www.prioritaspendidikan.org/id/media/view/detail/580/buku-sumber-untuk-dosen-lptk--pembelajaran-literasi-sd-di-lptk</a>
- Utanto, Y., Sukirman, & Maretta, Y. A. (2017).

  Surviving in the limitations: education implementation patterns in coast al communities. *Man in India*, 97(10), 163-175.

  Retrieved from <a href="https://www.researchgate.net/publication/318458171">https://www.researchgate.net/publication/318458171</a> Surviving in The Limitations Education Implementation Patterns in Coast al Communities
- Wahyuni, P. D., Djatmika, E. T., & As'ari, A. R. (2018). Pengaruh full day school dan gerakan literasi sekolah terhadap hasil belajar dengan mediasi motivasi belajar. *Jurnal Pendidikan: Teori, Penelitian, dan Pengembangan, 3*(5), 679-684. Retrieved from <a href="http://journal.um.ac.id/index.php/jptpp/article/view/11096">http://journal.um.ac.id/index.php/jptpp/article/view/11096</a>

- Yulianingtyas, A. R., Julia, & Djuanda, D. (2016).

  Penerapan metode gist (generating interaction between schemata and text) melalui teknik inside outside circle (ioc) untuk meningkatkan kemampuan menyimpulkan isi cerita anak. *Jurnal Pena Ilmiah*, 1(1), 181-290.

  Retrieved from <a href="http://ejournal.upi.edu/index.php/penailmiah/article/view/3031">http://ejournal.upi.edu/index.php/penailmiah/article/view/3031</a>
- Zin, Z. M., Wong, B. E., & Rafik-Galea, S. (2014).

  Critical Reading Ability and its Relation to L2

  Proficiency of Malaysian ESL Learners. 3L:

  Language, Linguistics, Literature®, 20(2), 43-54.

  Retrieved from

  <a href="http://ejournals.ukm.my/31/article/view/463">http://ejournals.ukm.my/31/article/view/463</a>